

UCLA

UCLA Electronic Theses and Dissertations

Title

Recruitment and Retention of Faculty of Color in Southern California Independent Schools

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/00p2r33z>

Author

Dominguez, Rosa Ines Navarro

Publication Date

2015

Peer reviewed|Thesis/dissertation

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

Los Angeles

Recruitment and Retention of Faculty of Color
in Southern California Independent Schools

A dissertation submitted in partial satisfaction of the
requirements for the degree Doctor of Education

by

Rosa Ines Navarro Dominguez

2015

ABSTRACT OF THE DISSERTATION

Recruitment and Retention of Faculty of Color in Southern California Independent Schools

by

Rosa Ines Navarro Dominguez

Doctor of Education

University of California, Los Angeles, 2015

Professor Tyrone C. Howard, Co-Chair

Professor Eugene Tucker, Co-Chair

This qualitative study examined recruitment and retention of faculty of color in independent schools in Southern California. Seven administrator interviews captured the perspective of school leaders involved in hiring efforts at their schools, and nine faculty of color were interviewed to further explore themes that arose around recruitment practices and retention challenges in a faculty questionnaire completed by 84 respondents. The list of the highest priority factors candidates consider in choosing a school varies from person to person, but as a group the data show that faculty diversity, student diversity, and a commitment to professional development to allow for ongoing growth- on the personal and community level- are aspects of high value to candidates of color. Resilient candidates may still be successful at schools where they face challenges and cultural conflicts, but contentment and fulfillment happens only when a

majority of a candidate's personal values align with those of the school. Therefore the recruitment phase is critical in exploring this alignment, and support systems such as mentoring programs and faculty of color affinity groups are important in increasing retention after hiring. Ultimately a school's commitment to diversity has to be supported by the school leadership. School leaders must take proactive measures in creating ongoing conversations, education for the community to address misconceptions around diversity, articulation that diversity strengthens teams, and thoughtful recruitment and retention procedures and systems to truly live out their school's commitment to diversity.

The dissertation of Rosa Ines Navarro Dominguez is approved.

Sandra H. Graham

Janna Helena Juvonen

Tyrone C. Howard, Committee Co-Chair

Eugene Tucker, Committee Co-Chair

University of California, Los Angeles

2015

DEDICATION PAGE

I dedicate this manuscript to my parents, Juan Francisco Navarro and Candida Ines Navarro, who are a constant inspiration to me. Having immigrated to the United States fleeing the civil war in El Salvador thirty-three years ago, their values of hard work, education, and social justice have shaped who I have become, and will continue to influence how I live my life. Not only are they wonderful parents, but they also have continued to bless our family with becoming wonderful grandparents. Having become a new mom in the middle of the program, while still working full-time, I can now appreciate on a much deeper level the childhood memories I have of seeing them up late studying their nursing textbooks after a long workday. The sacrifices they made as young parents, and continue to make now, for their family will continue to impact generations to come. The achievement of completing this program on time is in great part due to their lifelong encouragement and support, including helping to take care of their baby granddaughter so that I can find the writing time on the evenings and weekends to complete the program on time. This degree is as much theirs as it is mine.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION PAGE.....	V
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	VI
LIST OF TABLES	VIII
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	IX
VITA	X
CHAPTER 1	1
PROBLEM STATEMENT & SIGNIFICANCE	1
BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON THE PROBLEM	4
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH DESIGN	6
THE RESEARCH SITE OR POPULATION(S)	7
SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH AND HOW I WILL ENGAGE WITH THE PUBLIC REGARDING FINDINGS	9
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	10
INTRODUCTION	10
TERMINOLOGY	10
THE ADVANTAGES OF HAVING TEACHERS OF COLOR IN INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS	11
BEST PRACTICES FOR INCREASED RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION OF TEACHERS OF COLOR.....	16
CHALLENGES EXPERIENCED BY TEACHERS OF COLOR IN INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS.....	19
RESEARCH GAP	22
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY	23
INTRODUCTION.....	23
RESEARCH DESIGN	23
STRATEGIES OF INQUIRY.....	24
<i>Sample Selection & Data Collection Methods.....</i>	<i>27</i>
<i>Design of Data Collection Tools.....</i>	<i>28</i>
<i>Data Analysis Methods.....</i>	<i>30</i>
ETHICAL ISSUES	31
RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY	31
SUMMARY.....	33
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS.....	34
RESEARCH QUESTION 1: ACCORDING TO ADMINISTRATORS, WHAT STRUCTURES AND PRACTICES, IF ANY, DO INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS USE TO EFFECTIVELY RECRUIT AND RETAIN FACULTY OF COLOR?	35
<i>Findings #1-3. Effective recruitment strategies as reported by administrators.....</i>	<i>36</i>
<i>Finding #4. Effective retention strategies as reported by administrators:.....</i>	<i>41</i>
RESEARCH QUESTION 2: WHAT FACTORS DO FACULTY OF COLOR CONSIDER IN CHOOSING TO WORK AT AN INDEPENDENT SCHOOL?	45
<i>Finding #5: Interview experience plays crucial role in forming faculty's opinion on the school environment and values.....</i>	<i>47</i>
<i>Finding #6: Administrator, student body, and faculty diversity conveys schools commitment to diversity.....</i>	<i>49</i>
<i>Finding #7: Candidates value curriculum flexibility and professional growth opportunities.....</i>	<i>52</i>
RESEARCH QUESTION 3: WHAT CHALLENGES REGARDING RETENTION DECISION, IF ANY, DO FACULTY OF COLOR ENCOUNTER AT INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS?	54

<i>Finding #8: Additional pressures and isolation associated with being underrepresented on campus.....</i>	<i>54</i>
<i>Finding #9: Lack of mentorship and opportunities to grow.....</i>	<i>60</i>
SUMMARY.....	63
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION	65
INTRODUCTION	65
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR INDEPENDENT SCHOOLS	67
<i>Recommendations for school practice around recruitment of faculty of color.....</i>	<i>67</i>
<i>Recommendations for school practice around retention of faculty of color</i>	<i>70</i>
LIMITATIONS	74
AREAS OF FUTURE RESEARCH	75
<i>The alumni faculty experience in independent schools.....</i>	<i>75</i>
<i>Specific ethnic group experience—Asian American vs. Latino vs. Multiracial</i>	<i>76</i>
<i>Impact of the intersectionality of other layers of identity with racial identity of teachers</i>	<i>78</i>
FINAL REMARKS	82
LIST OF APPENDICES	83
APPENDIX A: ADMINISTRATOR INTERVIEW PROTOCOL.....	83
APPENDIX B: FACULTY OF COLOR QUESTIONNAIRE.....	85
APPENDIX C: FACULTY OF COLOR INTERVIEW PROTOCOL	96
APPENDIX D: NAIS FACTS AT A GLANCE 2014-2015	98
APPENDIX E: CAIS FACTS AT A GLANCE 2014-2015	99
APPENDIX F: NAIS PRINCIPLES OF GOOD PRACTICE FOR EQUITY AND JUSTICE	100
APPENDIX G: RECRUITMENT EMAILS.....	101
APPENDIX H: FACULTY OF COLOR QUESTIONNAIRE RESULTS	105
REFERENCES	108

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. <i>Administrative Experience and Ethnic Background of Administrators Interviewed</i>	35
Table 2. <i>Ethnicity of Questionnaire Respondents</i>	45
Table 3. <i>Questionnaire Respondent Teaching Experience</i>	46
Table 4. <i>Professional and Ethnic Background of Teachers of Color Interviewed</i>	47
Table H1. <i>Question 3 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification</i>	105
Table H2. <i>Question 5-8 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification</i>	105
Table H3. <i>Most Important Factors Selected (Question 10a) In Choosing a School Site To Work At by Ethnic Self-identification</i>	106
Table H4. <i>Question 13-18 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification</i>	106
Table H5. <i>Question 20 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification</i>	107

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my committee co-chairs, Dr. Eugene Tucker and Dr. Tyrone Howard, for their guidance and encouragement. I would also like to thank my committee members, Dr. Janna Juvonen and Dr. Sandra Graham for their support in this process. And to the administrators and faculty who participated in this study, thank you for your time and dedication to making our independent schools inclusive spaces. I was privileged to learn from your experiences.

I also want to give a special thanks to Eileen Wasserman, a mentor and friend, for her gracious guidance and support in my professional journey. I would also like to thank my ELP cohort friends, an inspirational group of educators that I have been privileged to learn with, and to learn from, these last three years.

I would like to thank my family, for their love and encouragement, and especially my parents Juan and Candida, for helping take care of their granddaughter on the weekends while I worked on my dissertation. Thank you to my daughter Mariela, who attended the second year of classes inside me when I was pregnant, and brought me joy and motivation to finish during my third year. Finally a huge thanks to my husband, Carlos, whose love, patience, encouragement, and many daddy-daughter days made this accomplishment possible. I am blessed to have him as a supportive partner in life, and look forward to more family adventures with him and our little one.

VITA

1998-2002	B.S. Biological Sciences with Departmental Honors B.A. Spanish Stanford University Stanford, California
2002-2003	M.A. Education CA Professional Clear Single Subject Credential in Biology with Cross-cultural, Language, and Academic Development certification Stanford Graduate School of Education Stanford, California
2003-2004	Science Teacher Reseda High School, Los Angeles Unified School District Reseda, CA
2004-present	Science Teacher Campbell Hall North Hollywood, CA
2006, 2007	Mentor Teacher to Stanford Teacher Education Program graduate students Stanford Teacher Education Program, Summer School Science Teacher Buchser Middle School, Santa Clarified Unified School District San Jose, CA
2008-present	Director of Diversity, K-12 th Campbell Hall North Hollywood, CA
2009-present	Board Member Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools Los Angeles, CA

Publication:

E.A Davidson, K. Savage, L.V. Verchot, **R.I. Navarro**. Minimizing artifacts and biases in chamber-based measurements of soil respiration. *Agricultural and Forest Meteorology*. April 2002

CHAPTER 1

Problem Statement & Significance

Research suggests that the public school sector, more so than independent schools, has given more weight and attention to the lack, and in some cases, a decrease of teachers of color in their schools (Banks and Banks 1993; Gay 1993; Kemple, Murnane, Signer and Willett 1995, Achinstein 2010). As the nation's public school student population is becoming increasingly racially diverse, the teaching force continues to decrease in its diversity, becoming increasingly more European American (Branch, 2001, Achinstein 2010). A 2012 survey by the National Center for Education Statistics found that 82 percent of America's 3.3 million teachers were white, 8 percent were Latino, 7 percent were Black and 2 percent were Asian (Boser, 2014). The gap between teachers of color and students of color continues to grow (Boser, 2014). In California, 73 percent of students in public schools are nonwhite, but only about 29 percent of public school teachers are nonwhite (Boser, 2014). Educators who are role models from underrepresented groups are severely under-represented in the nation's schools, especially in urban areas where most students of color are served (Branch, 2001, Brown and Greenwood, 2010, Boser, 2014). Teacher turnover, especially within the first five years of entering, has already been a well-researched topic, and main causes and recommendations have been identified. The same trend in the notable gap of teachers from underrepresented groups, particularly compared to increasing student body diversity, is taking place in some independent schools. In addition to being underrepresented in independent schools, teachers of color may also experience feelings of isolation and stereotype threat that can lead to their turnover. Recommendations for reversing the trend include teacher education program reform, new teacher

mentorship, salary increases, cross-cultural communication training, to school culture changes (Achinstein, Ogawa, Sexton, & Freitas, 2010). Most of the research regarding student and faculty diversity has been about public schools. There appears to be a research gap on faculty of color recruitment and retention when it comes to independent schools, with only a handful of recent studies on related topics published in the last few years. This study examines what independent schools are currently doing to recruit and retain teachers of color. This qualitative research focuses on ways independent schools in the Los Angeles County area of Southern California are supporting faculty of color in their recruitment efforts, factors that faculty of color take into consideration when choosing to work at independent schools, current retention practices, and challenges to retention faced by faculty of color.

The National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS), has prioritized diversity efforts as a main goal for its member schools by including in its Principles for Good Practice for Equity and Justice encouragement to schools to dedicate resources to increasing and supporting diversity (e.g. religious, ethnic, racial, cultural, and socioeconomic diversity) of their students, staff, faculty, and administration (Appendix F). The 6th principle included in this document summarizes this commitment: “The school works deliberately to ensure that the board of trustees, administration, faculty, staff, and student body reflect the diversity that is present in the rapidly changing and increasingly diverse school-age population in our country.” Additionally, in talking to several independent school administrators at the independent school where I work as well as at other nearby independent schools, the value faculty of color bring to school communities is clearly acknowledged in strengthening faculty teams, and also in their connections with students. Administrators to whom I informally talked with were supportive of a study that would look at best practices in the recruitment and retention of faculty of color to their

schools. My study was designed to answer the following questions.

1. According to school administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do independent schools use to recruit and retain faculty of color?
2. What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school?
3. What are the formal and informal practices that faculty of color encounter at their schools that influence their decision to remain or leave employment?

NAIS conducted a national survey of diversity practitioners in independent schools. The findings from the NAIS 2014 Diversity Practitioner Survey indicated that 65% of current diversity practitioners stated that supporting diverse hiring practices was included in their duties and responsibilities. Additionally, in order to increase the ethnic diversity of the administrative leadership teams at independent schools, there needs to be viable candidates of color with independent school experience in the applicant pool, and particularly candidates for headships are preferred to have spent several years working in independent schools to be considered. The lack of ethnic diversity in independent schools faculty becomes especially important given the fact that nearly 70% of heads of school will retire within the next decade and there is a push for a greater representation of people of color in this important leadership position (Brown, 2012).

The micro-level problem in southern California independent schools is that the ethnic diversity of the faculty is not reflective of the diversity present in the student body and even less reflective of Los Angeles as a region. There has been a clear push in independent schools to attract a diverse student body, but in many cases there has been less commitment and success in hiring a racially and ethnically diverse faculty. The focus of my study is the southern California

region, which had not previously been studied as the available literature on independent schools is primarily focused on the east coast (Kane and Orsini, 2003).

As demographic trends point to an increase in the number of people of color in the general population, schools are feeling pressure by the market they serve to better reflect society in their teaching force. Additionally, faculty of color may have cultural knowledge from personal life experiences that may potentially contribute to learning outcomes in working with an increasingly diverse student population. This research topic is important to the general education field because of the trend of increased enrollment of students of color in independent schools. Nationally, students of color in independent schools have increased from 19.7% of total student enrollment in 2002-2003 to 29.0% in 2014-2015. During those same years, faculty diversity increased from 8.7% to 13.1% faculty of color nationally in NAIS schools (Appendix D). Therefore, as the student body in independent schools becomes more ethnically diverse schools are prioritizing the need to have a more diverse teaching force to better match the student body. Independent schools also realize that faculty diversity impacts enrollment sustainability, being that prospective families that value faculty diversity may consider that as one of the factors in their selection of schools to which they send their child. Therefore, for future enrollment stability, schools are mindful of community demographics and realize that having a diverse faculty will place them in a better position to attract more families.

Background Information on the Problem

In addition to difficulties that independent schools have in recruiting teachers of color, there is also the challenge of retaining them once they are hired. Kane's (2003) study of independent schoolteachers of color found that teachers of color were more inclined than white

faculty to change schools because of diversity issues such as underrepresentation and perceived alienation of colleagues, but there were similar and additional factors found in other research. Teachers of color reported the following reasons they would consider leaving their current independent schools: the opportunity to work in a school with more teachers and students of color (20%), job advancement (19%), feeling of isolation due to lack of ethnic diversity in the faculty (9%), and desire for more administrative support (8%) (Kane, 2003, p. 58).

Kane concluded that the "independent school world is making strides in diversifying their student bodies and their faculty and staff, but many schools (47%) still have only one or no teachers of color" (2003, p. 124). This lack of student and faculty diversity among independent schools may influence the departure of not only teachers of color but also all teachers who desire more diversity within their schools.

Some research describes teachers of colors in independent schools as trailblazers, giving the gift of themselves to students and faculty who may not otherwise have the opportunity for dialogue or fellowship with talented professionals of color. Through their voices and their presence on independent school campuses, faculty of color have the opportunity to educate, stimulate, and help eradicate misconceptions, stereotypes and racist notions about non-Europeans (Kane and Orsini, 2003).

The NAIS Data and Analysis for School Leadership (DASL) website has national and state level tables that include enrollment and faculty demographic statistics. During the 2014-2015 school year there were 13.1% teachers of color nationally across all NAIS schools, compared to 29.0% students of color (Appendix D). The California Association of Independent Schools (CAIS) statistics show that the CAIS schools average was higher than the national percentage being at 18.6% faculty of color out of total faculty during the 2014-2015 school year

(Appendix E). Comparatively, this same year the CAIS students of color as a percentage of total student enrollment was 37.6%, showing that though California has greater faculty diversity compared to the national percentage, statewide the faculty diversity is significantly behind student enrollment diversity (Appendix E).

Overview of Research Design

My qualitative study consisted of two data collection phases. The first phase was interviewing school administrators on hiring and retention practices they use and find effective, which informed the finalization of the questionnaire content for the second phase. The second phase included questionnaires of faculty of color to identify initial themes and further inform the faculty interview questions, and themes from the questionnaire were further explored in in-depth interviews with faculty of color representing a range of teaching experience and schools. The interviews helped to triangulate the major themes identified from the questionnaire. The California Association of Independent Schools (CAIS) offered its assistance and was a supporter of this research. Additionally, the professional development network known as the Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools (SoCal POCIS) is another one of my research sponsors as the focus of this study is southern California independent schools. I gathered data from faculty in different schools and identified common themes that supplied insight to the experiences of teachers of color in Southern California independent schools.

The questionnaire sent to faculty of color was confidential: there was an optional question at the end of the questionnaire that took respondents to a separate page where they could provide information if they were open to being contacted to be interviewed. Confidentiality was important for both administrators and the faculty, who may be more hesitant to participate and speak freely without it. To access faculty I asked administrators (whether they

agree to be interviewed themselves or not) to forward the questionnaire link to their faculty of color, and additionally reached out to different schools through some other email listservs (SoCal POCIS email list, and CAIS Heads of school email list). The questionnaire was relatively short taking no more than 10 minutes to complete. I set out to interview at least 8 teachers of color, and ended up with a total of 9 interviews. In selecting the teachers to interview I aimed to have a range of teaching experiences (novice and veteran teachers), as well as ethnic (African American, Latino, Asian American and Latino) and gender diversity represented in the group. To have wider representation, interviewees were also selected to represent different types of school (elementary, secondary, religious affiliation, non-religious affiliation). For the administrator interviews my goal was to recruit administrators from at least 4-5 different independent school schools in the Los Angeles area, representing both secondary and elementary schools, and I was able to complete 7 interviews.

To reach teachers of color at Los Angeles area independent schools I casted a wide net utilizing email lists via CAIS & SoCal POCIS. The wider net was necessary in getting enough participants and in gaining a wider perspective from faculty at different schools. The questionnaire was utilized to identify teachers willing to participate in individual interviews. The goal was to interview at least 8 participants representing at least five schools to better ensure confidentiality for faculty participants. Ultimately 9 teachers representing 8 different schools were interviewed.

The Research Site or Population(s)

The research population included independent schools in the Los Angeles area, all members of both the California Association of Independent Schools (CAIS) and some also being sponsoring schools of Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools (SoCal

POCIS). CAIS is an organization of approximately 200 elementary, middle and secondary schools in California. I contacted the forty CAIS schools that are also sponsoring schools of the non-profit Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools (SoCal POCIS). CAIS serves and strengthens its schools by setting standards of academic quality and ethical conduct, facilitating the professional growth of faculty, administrators, and trustees, and by promoting ethnic and socio-economic diversity (caisca.org). CAIS schools are also members of the National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS), which includes about 1,300 independent schools nationwide serving more than 700,00 students from pre-kindergarten through high school (parents.nais.org). NAIS defines independent schools as schools that provide high-quality and individualized education, having the freedom to select which academic and extracurricular program they will offer, and to offer these programs to the students who they feel most capable of serving well. Independent schools can be coeducational or single-sex. They can be day schools, boarding schools or combination day and boarding schools. They are supported by a combination of tuition payments, charitable contributions, and endowment revenues—not public funds. Finally, they're independently governed by a board of trustees as opposed to a public school board or charter school network. These schools have a reputation of being selective and providing rigorous academic programs preparing students to attend some of the top universities in the country. SoCal POCIS's mission includes “empowering diverse voices of people of color in independent schools, to ensure equity and inclusion for all” (www.socalpocis.org). Schools that belong to both organizations have committed to these values through their association with these organizations and therefore were more likely to have administrator and faculty willing to participate in this study.

Significance of the Research and how I will engage with the public regarding findings

My findings will inform practice by adding to the knowledge base about successful practices to recruit and retain teachers of color in independent schools. Particularly, there are key resiliency factors that can be determined from successful teachers that can serve to be helpful to independent school administrators in identifying potential candidates to hire. Additionally, as some of the research I've read thus far has stated, some of the disconnect between teachers of color and independent school is due to school cultures that are perceived to place a higher value on the dominant (white) culture and therefore create a feeling of alienation to teachers of color. I hope my findings will be used by independent school administrators to leverage changes in hiring practices, as well as in developing more inclusive school communities for faculty, and for students. Inclusion promotes social connection and therefore academic success (Astin, 1993).

I will share my findings with the participants and their respective schools. I expect to submit an article to the statewide CAIS newsletter and, hopefully, also to *The Independent School*, which is a national publication. Additionally, presenting a workshop at the annual CAIS conference and National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS) People of Color Conference would provide an excellent opportunity to present the findings directly to attendees. There is also a CAIS email listserv specifically for heads of school through which my findings can be shared statewide.

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

As demographic trends point to more people of color in the general population, there is potential value in independent schools reflecting the demographic makeup of society in their teaching force; such as faculty of color having cultural knowledge from personal life experiences that may potentially contribute to learning outcomes of an increasingly diverse student population. Additionally, independent schools may also want to address faculty diversity for their own enrollment sustainability because student and/or faculty diversity is one of the factors some families consider in making their enrollment decisions.

In this literature review I discuss four areas related to faculty recruitment and retention in independent schools. First, I present a general discussion of the advantages of more teachers of color in independent schools. Second, I discuss practices currently known to be effective for increasing teacher recruitment and retention. The review then focuses on the known challenges that teachers of color can experience in independent schools. Finally, the gap in the literature is underscored to show the importance of my study.

Terminology

In this literature review the terms *teacher(s) of color*, *student(s) of color* and *people of color* are used because they are more contemporary descriptions than the term *minority*, given shifting demographics in the United States. As Nieto (2000) explains, the term *people of color* describing groups such as African Americans, Asian Americans, American Indians, and Latinos, emerged from the communities themselves, and “implies important connections among the

groups and underlies some common experiences” (p. 30). Additionally, the National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS) also includes the groups Middle Eastern and Multiracial as people of color in the statistics schools are asked to report annually. However, the existence of connections does not equate to a uniform experience, and groups should not be seen as homogenous. For example, even within subgroups a single label, such as *Latino*, encompasses considerable variety. Any particular racial and/or ethnic demographic term fails to capture differences of socioeconomic class, national origin, immigration status, gender, language, etc. Although drawing conclusions about teachers of color from research on specific subgroups runs the risk of overgeneralizing that group, patterns that cut across subgroups can be informative and insightful in improving institutional policies and practices (Achinstein et. al., 2010).

In public school districts it is common for administrators and teachers to have a clear distinctions in the roles they play in their school sites. However, it is important to distinguish between the terms *administrator* and *faculty* in regards to independent schools, since it is common for administrators in independent schools, particularly at the secondary level, to also have teaching responsibilities and, therefore, are also be considered members of the faculty. According to NAIS, full-time faculty members are defined as individuals having at least a 50% teaching responsibility, which for secondary teachers would mean teaching at least three out of the usual five periods that make up a full teaching course load. This study employs the NAIS definitions in distinguishing between *administrator* and *faculty* respondents.

The Advantages of Having Teachers of Color in Independent Schools

Research has shown that nationally, K-12th schools have a lack, and in some cases, a decrease over time, of teachers of color in their schools (Banks and Banks 1993; Gay 1993;

Kemple, Murnane, Signer & Willett 1995; Achinstein 2010). Although the nation's public school student population is becoming increasingly racially diverse, the teaching force continues to decrease in its diversity, becoming increasingly European American (Branch, 2001; Achinstein 2010). Educators who are role models from underrepresented groups are severely under-represented in the nation's schools, especially in urban areas where most students of color are served (Branch, 2001; Brown & Greenwood, 2010). Teachers of color, specifically, are at risk for leaving the teaching profession early (National Commission on Teaching and America's Future, 2003), a documented fact that needs to be given critical attention if schools are to reflect the needs of the student population in the United States (Souto-Manning & Dice, 2007). The increasing diversity of classrooms and the lack of diversity among teachers is a disparity that cannot be afforded (Gay & Howard, 2000; Hodgkinson, 2002). Nationally, white teachers comprise approximately 80% of all teachers while minority students comprise approximately 40% of students (National Center for Education Statistics, 2005b; National Commission on Teaching and America's Future, 2003).

The NAIS Data and Analysis for School Leadership (DASL) website provides national data on faculty diversity in independent schools. Nationally, the median percentage of teachers of color for the 2013-2014 school year in looking at all types of schools was 9.6% while the mean was 13.7% of the whole faculty. When looking at just day schools (non-boarding) the median percentage of teachers of color was 12.0%. Regionally, the western states are the most diverse with median of 15.6% that year compared to the other geographic regions: east- 10.7%, mid-Atlantic- 10.9%, Midwest- 7.5%, New England- 8.7, southeast- 7.1%, and southwest- 9.3%. The national median percentage of teachers of color for the 2013-2014 school year in elementary

independent schools was 11.8%, slightly higher than the national median at secondary independent schools at 11.2%.

Astin (1993) addressed how students are affected by the diversity and multiculturalism campus policies and practices at their universities. His study involved 82 outcome measures on 25,000 students who entered college as freshmen in the fall of 1985 and were followed up four years later in 1989. Data allowed the researchers to determine how much each institution emphasized diversity and multiculturalism, and measures of each individual student's direct experience with diversity and multiculturalism. The study incorporated three types of environmental measures: institutional diversity emphasis (including commitment to increase the number of minority faculty), faculty diversity emphasis and student diversity experiences. The first two were determined from a faculty survey of 217 institutions. The first two environmental measure are substantially correlated ($r=.55$), which means that faculty who emphasize diversity issues in their teaching and research are likely to be found in institutions that also emphasize diversity and multiculturalism in their admission and hiring policies.

Astin's analysis addressed several pertinent questions:

- How are students' values and beliefs about other races and cultures affected by their institutions' policies on diversity and multiculturalism?
- What difference does it make in students' attitudes and behavior when their professors emphasize diversity issues in the classroom or in their research?
- How are students' academic progress and values affected by direct involvement in "diversity" experiences?

The findings showed that consequences for students who are associated with strong institutional emphasis on issues of diversity and multiculturalism include uniformly positive effects, not only on those outcomes that are relevant to the goals of general education –

heightened cultural awareness and satisfaction and reduced materialism—but also on the students’ commitment to promoting racial understanding. Though Astin’s study was conducted at colleges, the findings may reasonably be applied to K-12th settings in independent schools, which tend to be similar in their demographic makeup and college prep culture although the impact may vary depending on developmental age group of students. As college preparatory institutions, independent school secondary campuses often provide academic opportunities to strengthen academic readiness; therefore, Astin’s findings can also be applied to independent school K-12th students who we expect would also benefit from the same associated cognitive and affective development positive effects found in the college environment.

Astin also makes a strong case for how diversity promotes an inclusive learning environment for all students: “The fact that a strong emphasis on diversity enhances the student’s commitment to promoting racial understanding is of special interest, given that some critics have alleged that emphasizing issues of race and multiculturalism tends to exacerbate racial tensions on campus. Quite the opposite seems to be the case” (Astin, 2013).

Some studies indicate that teachers of color can produce more favorable academic results for students of color than white colleagues by setting and maintaining high academic expectations, engaging in culturally relevant pedagogy, developing caring and trusting relationships, serving as advocates, mentors, and cultural brokers, and working for social reform (Villegas & Davis, 2008; Villegas & Irvine, 2009). Although this is not meant to suggest that white teachers cannot be effective teachers for students of color, or that all teachers of color are effective with students of color, we cannot ignore the possibility that schools can better serve the academic needs of

students of color by increasing the presence of teachers of color through policies and practices that bolster their retention (Villegas & Irvine, 2009; Villegas & Irvine, 2010).

Amanda Datnow and Robert Cooper's (1997) qualitative analysis revealed that the formal and informal peer networks of African American students in predominantly White elite independent schools support these students' academic success, create opportunities for them to reaffirm their racial identities, and facilitate their adjustment to settings that otherwise can be difficult for Blacks to fit into. The concluding recommendation of their study was that "in addition to sponsoring Black student associations and increasing the enrollment of African American students in order to facilitate the development of strong peer groups, these institutions should recruit more African American faculty, increasingly reflect cultural diversity in their curricula, and more openly confront racial issues in their communities" (p.71, Datnow & Cooper, 1997). The authors connected the presence of having faculty of the same background as the students as having a positive impact on their ability to successfully "bridge the gap between the double lives that some of [the students] lead in and outside of school" (p. 71, Datnow & Cooper, 1997).

Imig and Imig (1987) observed, "If one accepts the proposition that the work force should reflect the ethnic and racial characteristics of the larger society, then the number of minority teachers is significantly out of line with the society at large.... Some suggest that ...the typical minority youngster could 'meet' only two minority teachers out of the forty teachers whom he or she encounters in twelve years of schooling. Significant interventions to address this problem need to be in the forefront of every policy maker's agenda" (p. 53).

Branch (2001) addressed the need for more teachers of color in K-12 public schools.

“Caring, concerned educators understand the importance of a diverse teaching force, desiring parity between school personnel and students of color” (p. 254, Branch, 2001).

Role models of color are severely insufficient in the nation’s schools, especially in urban areas where most students of color are served (Branch, 2001). As there are numerous groups of color and intricate differences among them, the reasons for the shortage of teachers of color are varied and complex. Regardless, the effects of this shortage are multifold as described in the following paragraph.

First, there is a lack of people of color participating in the knowledge-construction process for students in the public school system (reducing role models desperately needed by all students and European-American teachers), which could confirm early-formed impressions about the exaggerated intelligence of European American folk due to their overabundance in the profession (Branch, 2001). “Similarly erroneous assumptions about the intelligence of African Americans, Latinos, and other people of color may be reinforced merely by their absence as teachers in the nation’s classrooms” (Branch, 2001, p.258). A shortage of teachers of color also means there are fewer numbers of teachers who have the cultural frameworks from personal experience to make instruction culturally relevant for students of color; and fewer role models who can say, by their mere presence, “you can be a teacher” or other professional (Branch, 2001).

Best Practices for Increased Recruitment and Retention of Teachers of Color

Teacher turnover, especially within the first five years of entering, has already been a well-researched area, and main causes and recommendations have been identified. Teachers of color are more likely than white teachers to work in urban schools that serve high proportions of

students from low-income and racially and culturally nondominant communities (Achinstein et al., 2010). The potential importance of this pattern is reflected in two other research findings: (a) Urban schools often present conditions that reduce teacher retention rates, and (b) despite these challenges, teachers of color are more likely than white teacher to work and remain in urban, hard-to-staff schools (Achinstein et al., 2010).

Elfers, Plecki and Knapp's (2006) analysis of a longitudinal state database of all teachers from 1996 to 2003 and teacher surveys from a representative sample in Washington State provided more mixed results. Overall, they reported no sizable differences in retention rates by race or ethnicity. However, in a few districts where people of color represented at least 15% of the teacher workforce, retention rates varied by race with some districts retaining some racial groups better than others. Achinstein et al.'s (2010) literature review, determined that completed studies do not explain why teachers of color work and remain in schools with high percentages of students from low-income and racially and culturally nondominant communities, nor do they explain why white teachers are more likely to leave such schools. Achinstein et al. (2010) propose that this pattern might reflect teachers' preferences and commitments, "including the general tendency for teachers to gravitate toward their home communities," and reflecting "the humanistic commitments of teachers of color ...or a lack of mobility for certain sectors of the workforce" (p.94, Achinstein et al. 2010).

Recommendations for increasing teacher retention include teacher education program reform, new teacher mentorship, salary increases, cross-cultural communication training, and school culture changes (Achinstein et al., 2010). Preservice teachers should expect and witness culturally relevant pedagogies at work in their teacher education courses. Culturally relevant

pedagogies “not only addresses student achievement but also helps students to accept and affirm their cultural identity while developing critical perspectives that challenge inequities that schools (and other institutions) perpetuate.” (p. 260, Branch, 2001). Teacher educators can make their courses culturally relevant to students by showing them the impact of race, ethnicity, power, gender, and socioeconomic status on the development of professional knowledge and the choice of teaching methods and materials (Branch, 2001).

Talbert-Johnson and Beverly Tillman (1999) present the following resolutions to the issues and challenges discovered in their review of faculty diversity perspectives at the university level: “recruitment and retention of greater numbers of minority faculty, faculty mentoring programs, greater support for research related to campus equity issues, infusion of multicultural concerns more fully throughout teacher education curricula, reward systems that recognize research about diversity and the additional service expectations for minority faculty, strategies for facilitating colleagues’ self-assessment of their current attitudes and beliefs about minority populations, and development of more positive collegial relationships among faculty” (p. 203-204).

Pairing an entry-level faculty member with a more senior faculty mentor, has the potential to provide both mentor support (i.e.; helping junior faculty become familiar with the institution’s resources, procedures, and expectations) and the emotional support for dealing with the challenges to one’s personal and professional self-image when teaching in a majority white institution (Talbert-Johnson & Tillman, 1999). The findings above are significant to independent schools as potentially effective practices that schools can adopt to increase teacher retention of faculty of color, who are also underrepresented in a majority white faculty.

Challenges Experienced by Teachers of Color in Independent Schools

Unfortunately, nearly half of all teachers abandon the teaching profession by the end of their first five years (Ingersoll, 2002). Research has pointed to several reasons why teachers leave, including dissatisfaction with their jobs due to low pay, lack of support, and limited decision-making power (Ingersoll, 2003). Branch (2001) states that those who leave due to low salaries, usually do so within the first 5 years. Opportunities in business, engineering, and technology result in secondary teachers in math and science to be more likely to leave. In addition to the overcrowded classrooms, poor working conditions, and increased responsibilities all teachers face (the former two particularly in public schools), teachers of color face racism and its negative emotional, psychological, and physiological effects daily (Branch, 2001). Such attrition comes at a high cost to school communities and student achievement (Souto-Manning & Dice, 2007; Villegas & Lucas 2004). As such, the literature suggests that teacher education programs should prepare teachers to work with minority students and can address the problem of minority teacher retention by incorporating perspectives of teachers from diverse backgrounds into the curriculum (Villegas & Lucas, 2004). This inclusion of the diverse perspectives in teacher education preparation programs might also decrease the isolation and alienation often experienced by minority teachers (Villegas & Lucas, 2004).

Kane (2003) in a study of independent schoolteachers of color found that teachers of color were more inclined than white teachers to change schools because of diversity issues. Teachers of color reported the following reasons they would consider leaving their current schools (Kane, 2003, p.58): the opportunity to work in a school with more teachers and students of color (20%); job advancement (19%); feeling of isolation due to lack of ethnic diversity in the

faculty (9%); and desire for more administrative support (8%).

The Madsen and Mabokela (2000) qualitative study using intensive open-ended and follow-up interviews for data collection explored how the culture within an organization strongly influences how minorities will be treated by their European American counterparts. Three main themes were discussed in their findings: performance pressure, boundary heightening, and role entrapment.

Since the majority in an institution establishes the work norms, and regulations, people of color who are in the minority are expected to comply with the established uniform rules and regulations (Madsen and Mabokela, 2000). Strong organizational cultures provide cues on how to behave and establish reinforcing expectations to influence organizational members. Thus the majority culture constructs norms based on its own stereotypes and beliefs, resulting in barriers for minorities. Consequently, people of color are subjected to stereotypes, which may impede their professional advancement within the organization. This study first examined the performance pressures that the African American teachers experienced within their school environment and how they developed defense mechanisms to cope with their isolation and perpetual scrutiny of their abilities. Second, the analysis indicated that due to cultural differences between African American teachers and their European American counterparts, boundaries emerged with respect to their pedagogical approaches. Whereas the school culture supported more traditional pedagogical practices, which were not responsive to the academic needs of students of color, the African American teachers explored culturally relevant teaching strategies (Lanson-Billings, 1994). Finally, the analysis reveals the entrapment of African American

teachers into the role of the “Black expert.” That is, the professional expertise of the African American teachers was limited to dealing with those issues that related to minority concerns.

Madsen and Mabokela referenced Kanter’s (1977) study on “tokens in the work place” indicated that the relative number of culturally different people in a group are seen as critical in shaping interaction dynamics. (The authors acknowledged that the word “token” may carry negative and offensive connotations.) The first perceptual tendency is that the tokens have higher visibility than majority workers do, and as a result experienced performance pressure to ensure that they maintain the normative cues of the organization.

Talbert-Johnson & Tillman’s article explores the prominent issues “regarding color in the academy” (i.e. faculty diversity), highlights and describes the issues and proposes recommendations for overcoming obstacles mitigating the potential for minority faculty to influence their institution’s programs and practices. Minority faculty who teach in majority institutions are challenged to maintain their cultural identity (Talbert-Johnson & Tillman, 1999). The scarcity of minority representation on most campuses contributes to institutional and community expectations above and beyond the faculty members’ primary commitments. This climate creates high stress levels as minority faculty attempt to balance myriad competing demands for their time and expertise (Talbert-Johnson & Tillman, 1999). Their research uncovered that university administrators assume that minority faculty are best suited for specific tasks because of their racial background and their presumed knowledge of cultural differences. This “cultural taxation” may be manifested in different forms: being called upon to be the expert on matters of diversity within the institution; being called on, often frequently, to educate individuals in the majority group about the nature of diversity; and being appointed to numerous

committees with the rationale that representation is needed (Talbert-Johnson & Tillman, 1999). Additionally, minority faculty members consistently confront collegial perceptions suggesting that they are less competent, regardless of their credentials (Knowles & Harleston, 1997; Talbert-Johnson & Tillman, 1999).

Research Gap

Though there has been some research regarding recruitment and retention of teachers of color in the public schools, as well as research about the recruitment, retention and experiences of faculty of color in the university setting, there has been no research found that examines this important issue in Southern California independent schools. A research gap exists regarding faculty of color recruitment and retention in independent schools, with only a handful of recent dissertations focused on diversity related independent school topics published in the last few years. The last major multi-school study looking at recruitment and retention of faculty of color in independent schools took place in New York over a decade ago (Kane & Orsini, 2003). Therefore, another examination in this area of study, and particularly within this region of the country, is overdue. This qualitative study addressed the gap in the research and helped inform independent schools regarding the experiences of teachers of color in their schools. The findings, which will be shared with participating schools, will give insight to best practices that influence recruitment and retention of faculty of color.

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

Introduction

This study addressed the problem of the limited number of faculty of color in independent schools. My research identified recruitment and retention practices of independent schools that are perceived to be effective at increasing and maintaining faculty diversity by administrators and by teachers of color. In addition, I gathered data on the experiences of faculty of color in their schools to identify challenges and areas where further attention is needed to improve their retention.

I conducted a qualitative study involving interviews of school administrators, followed by questionnaires and follow up interviews of faculty of color from Southern California independent schools to gather data on best recruitment and retention practices for hiring and keeping faculty of color at their schools. The following research questions guided my study:

1. According to administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do independent schools use to effectively recruit and retain faculty of color?
2. What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school?
3. What challenges regarding retention decision, if any, do faculty of color encounter at independent schools?

Research Design

My design was qualitative, where initial school administrator interviews informed the finalization of the questionnaire for faculty of color, which in turn assisted in the identification of faculty participants for the final in-depth interviews as well as in the finalization of interview questions based on the questionnaire theme. The two-phase design was guided by the research questions starting with the school administrator interviews as the first phase. The questionnaires

for faculty of color, and interviews of selected faculty of color, constituted the second data collection phase. The faculty interviews allowed triangulation of the data, going more in depth with narrative examples, and reaffirming the data gathered from the questionnaires (Merriam, 2009). Given that any one campus may only have a small number of faculty of color, a broadly distributed questionnaire increased confidentiality by aggregating information across many sites. Individual interviews conducted in the second phase of data collection gathered more in-depth information regarding the initial themes identified in the questionnaire (Creswell, 2009; Maxwell, 2012; Merriam, 2009). Therefore, interviews provided more authentic and rich data than focus groups, as participants would be guaranteed confidentiality compared to a focus group discussion where they may feel self-conscious in sharing in front of other participants (Merriam, 2009). Additionally, one-on-one interviews eliminated the possibility of peer influence that may have risen in a focus group setting.

The study was guided by the social constructivist worldview (Creswell, 2009) in that the belief that a person's life experiences influence how they interpret conditions in their work environment. Faculty of color shared perspectives in the one-to-one interviews that supported those initially conveyed in the questionnaire. Interviews, in which faculty had the opportunity to share detailed information to construct an understanding of their experiences around recruitment and retention, was the most valuable method in answering the research questions (Creswell, 2009; Maxwell, 2012; Merriam, 2009).

Strategies of Inquiry

Faculty and administrators from Southern California K-12th independent schools, which are members of the California Association of Independent Schools as well as the sponsoring schools of Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools, were invited to

participate in my study. CAIS schools are also members of the National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS), which includes about 1,300 independent schools nationwide serving more than 700,000 students from pre-kindergarten through high school (parents.nais.org). NAIS defines independent schools as schools that provide high-quality and individualized education, having the freedom to select which academic and extracurricular program they will offer, and to offer these programs to the students who they feel most capable of serving well. Independent schools can be coeducational or single-sex. They can be day schools, boarding schools or combination day and boarding schools. They are supported by a combination of tuition payments, charitable contributions, and endowment revenues—not public funds. Finally, they're independent governed by a board of trustees as opposed to a public school board or charter school network. These schools have a reputation of being selective and providing rigorous academic programs preparing students to attend some of the top universities in the country. My focus on CAIS schools, and not other private schools such as religious institutions that are not in CAIS, was due to the existence of consistent guiding principles in being associated with the statewide association. In the initial development of this study, the Executive Director of CAIS, Jim McManus, indicated support for this study and reaffirmed the important need for more research in this area. On the CAIS website (www.caisca.org) the organization's mission statement, stated below, serves to highlight the unifying goals of the organization including promoting diversity within its schools:

“The California Association of Independent Schools (CAIS) is a non-profit organization of elementary, middle and secondary schools in California. The Association serves and strengthens its schools by setting standards of academic quality and ethical conduct, by providing for the professional growth of faculty, administrators, and trustees, and by promoting ethnic and socio-economic diversity.”

Therefore, having the support of the Executive Director helped me gain access to and participation from schools. Administrators and teachers of color from the schools that belong to both CAIS and SoCal POCIS, representing a range of school types and sizes, were asked to participate in the study.

The rationale for not limiting the population by school size or by grade levels served is that it would've made it more difficult to get a big enough respondent group size. Allowing all size schools the opportunity to participate increases the confidentiality of faculty, due to more schools participating and therefore an increase in numbers of faculty from any one gender and ethnic group, as well as the total number of perspectives contributed and provided a more accurate representation of the research population. My goal was to recruit at least 4-5 administrators to be interviewed, and I was fortunately able to get 7 administrators to volunteer to be interviewed. I first reached out by email to administrators from schools in my own professional network, and to schools that have a strong reputation for valuing diversity. I asked these administrators if they would be willing to be interviewed on their experiences with recruitment and retention of faculty of color, and/or willing to participate in the second phase of the study by sharing the faculty questionnaire with their faculty of color. Though I reached out to both men and women administrators, only female participants responded willing to participate in the initial interviews. Additionally I emailed the questionnaire to the SoCal POCIS listserv, asking participants to share it with other faculty of color at their schools. Then I reached out to school heads, via the CAIS email listserv, asking them to forward the faculty questionnaire to faculty of color in their schools. The communication was sent specifically to the heads of school, as their perspective and opinions as school leaders are most influential in creating school procedures and processes that may affect recruitment and retention. I focused on the Los Angeles

County area in Southern California due to the ethnically diverse population located in the region resulting in a greater rate of change in student demographics of independent schools. This change in student body demographics in turn presents a more urgent need to attend to intentional practices around supporting faculty diversity.

Sample Selection & Data Collection Methods

The main mode of data collection was computer-assisted self-interviewing, via the questionnaire link that was emailed to potential teacher of color respondents, and one-on-one interviews with school administrators and then with faculty of color representing a range of different schools. The online questionnaire (Appendix B) was made available for about a month. The data gained from the questionnaire was used for descriptive analysis and the open-ended responses were analyzed to determine themes in respondent experiences around effective recruitment and retention practices (research question #2 and #3). Additionally, individual interviews with faculty of color added a qualitative layer that allowed me to further explore the themes that came up in the questionnaire, particularly in gathering additional insights for the third research question. The goal of the initial administrator interviews, followed by the faculty questionnaires, was to gather sufficient initial insights and themes to the perceptions/experiences of faculty of color, which were further explored in the in-depth interviews with faculty of color.

In order to obtain the largest number of participants, I reached out to potential respondents in two different ways. The first approach was to contact all school heads, in Los Angeles County via the California Association of Independent School email listserv, and ask them to forward the questionnaire link to faculty at their school. An email from CAIS Executive Director, Jim McManus indicating support for the study helped garner support (Appendix G).

The advantage of focusing the interviewing phase of the study to Los Angeles County, rather than all southern California, was because it is a more diverse geographical area and there may be a higher urgency and commitment among independent schools in the County to increasing faculty diversity. According to the CAIS member directory, there are 68 independent schools in the greater Los Angeles area including 15 independent schools in the Pasadena area, totaling 82 independent schools in the L.A. County. The second approach to contacting faculty directly was through the Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools (SoCal POCIS) email listserv (Appendix G). Members were invited to complete the questionnaire. There are about 250 emails on this listserv, representing 40 schools in this network, most located within Los Angeles County.

At the end of the questionnaire, respondents were invited to self-identify if interested in participating in an individual interview. Due to the potential sensitive nature of the content, for the one-on-one interviews I was flexible as far as interview location; I met most interviewees at their work site, but some preferred to come to my campus or meet at a coffee shop off-site depending on their availability and where they felt most comfortable in talking. I scheduled one-hour blocks for each interview, but they averaged about 45 minutes in length. I was able to do all my interviews in person. My goal was to interview at least eight faculty of color representing at least five different schools, and I was able to interview nine faculty of color representing eight different schools. Teachers interviewed were given a \$25 iTunes gift card as an incentive and to thank them for their time.

Design of Data Collection Tools

In designing the questionnaire structure, I intentionally did not put the diversity related (demographic) questions first in the recruitment section and instead moved them later on in the

same section to achieve a more subtle approach in that being a lens of the study. The questionnaire questions were developed based on informative conversations with independent school principals, diversity practitioners, relevant topics identified in the literature review (Astin, 1993; Brown & Greenwood, 2010; Kane & Orsini, 2003; Madsen & Mabokela, 2000), and also my own experience as a faculty of color and an independent school administrator involved in diversity initiatives including the recruitment and retention of faculty. The questionnaire was finalized based on insights garnered from the administrator interviews (Appendix A). The questionnaire tool included fixed response (Likert-like scale) and open-ended questions as well, the latter focusing on experiences of faculty on campus (Appendix B).

The type of questions I asked in the interview were open-ended and focused on the interviewee's perceptions and personal experiences surrounding recruitment and retention. Therefore, questions examining what factors respondents considered in choosing their work site, what they have found as supportive structures, and questions that help to identify challenges transitioning to and within their worksites were asked (Appendix C). The questionnaire data informed the final drafting of the faculty interview questions to further expand on initial themes identified in the questionnaire. Interviews were recorded on two devices- my iPhone, as well as a digital voice recorder. Finally, since I collected personal stories and experiences, it was critical to ensure the confidentiality of all participants that were interviewed. Interviews were recorded and transcribed. Interviewee names were not asked for nor recorded during the interviews themselves. No personal identifying information was added to the digital recording files or to the typed out transcriptions, with interviewees being assigned a number code instead.

Data Analysis Methods

The administrator interviews were transcribed and coded to answer the first research question. Coding was a systematic approach consisting of first highlighting all the text relevant to the research question on the word document transcription, then transferring all administrator answers to the interview questions into an excel sheet, where the first column listed the question and then the following columns were dedicated to each interviewee's answers. This allowed for easy comparison across interviews. Identification of overall themes progressed by taking notes on the different type of answers, identifying general codes, and then through rereading and recoding identifying more specific code categories labels. Finally counting the frequency each general theme was mentioned led to identification of the most common themes. Findings from the administrator interviews informed final changes to the faculty questionnaire. An analysis of the questionnaire data included first determining the means for each questions, sorting by ethnicity and then determining the means for each ethnic group to assess for any large intergroup differences, and thereby identifying initial themes for the second and third research questions. These initial themes were further explored in the faculty interviews.

The second phase of analysis was looking at the data from the one-on-one interviews of faculty of color representing a range of different schools. Using the same process described above for the administrator interviews, the faculty interviews were transcribed and coded to identify patterns and themes capturing participant perspectives around their experiences in independent schools and, particularly, insights that informed recruitment and retention practices (Merriam, 2009). While determining themes from the interview data was mostly an intuitive process, it was also methodical and informed by the study's purpose, my orientation and knowledge, and the meanings shared by the participants (Merriam, 2009). The interview

transcript analysis was then compared to the questionnaire data, to see if the main themes that arose in the interviews support or contradict the questionnaire data results. This triangulation of data helped strengthen insights in answering the research questions.

Ethical Issues

Since this study is dependent on voluntary participation of adult participants, there was minimal risk of coercion of participants. It was made clear to administrators and faculty that school names and individual identities will not be disclosed in the dissertation findings nor in the summarized report of findings which will be provided to participating schools as appreciation for their involvement in the study. School data will be shared in aggregate form only, and pseudonyms were used when necessary. Therefore, the main ethical issue in this study is the need to keep the identity of the participants confidential when ultimately sharing findings. To do this, I did not record interviewee names in the transcription of the interviewees, but instead assigned a code number to each participant in the transcription and analysis phase. The code key was kept in a secure location and won't be shared in the final report to the participating schools.

Reliability and Validity

My role as Director of Diversity, tasked with leading diversity initiatives including supporting those around hiring and recruitment, in an independent school makes me an insider to this aspect of administrative work, but I was an outsider to the schools that were involved in the study. Therefore, it was important for me to enter interviews with a focus on observing and listening, and not of comparing other schools' hiring and recruitment efforts, and interviewee

experiences, to those at my work site. I entered all interactions related to this study in my graduate student researcher role and not as an administrator. With these schools, my role was as an outsider-researcher (Merriam, 2009). I needed to gain trust and buy-in in order to conduct my study and gain valuable data. Though sharing my position at an independent school may have created some credibility and trust for some participants; it could also potentially have created some hesitation if participants were suspicious of how the information may be shared within my own work site and/or networking circle. Therefore, clarifying the goals of the study, and my role as an outside-researcher, helped minimize my affiliation to my work site.

Having worked at my independent school for a decade now, I have gotten to know some faculty and administrators from other Los Angeles independent schools and over time some relationships have become friendships. In the cases where I interviewed people I already knew, I was consistent in clarifying that I was interacting with them in my researcher role during the interview and therefore approached our interviewee interactions as if I did not know anything about them. Structuring the interview in the same format with both people I already had a working relationship with and interviewees that I was meeting for the first time was important for data analysis. Consistency in the interview protocol was important in minimizing any impact previous interactions with interviewees may have.

My belief that having a more diverse faculty will positively benefit school communities is also something I needed to be mindful of in the data analysis phase in order to minimize any bias in interpreting findings that may subconsciously result otherwise. Finally, it was important for me to examine the characteristics of the schools and interviewees that ultimately participate in order to determine the degree of generalizability of the ultimate findings.

Summary

Using a qualitative analysis approach, this study identified recruitment and retention practices independent schools have in place that are perceived to be effective by administrators and also by teachers of color, as well as gathered data on the experiences of faculty of color in their schools to identified challenges and areas where further attention is needed to improve retention. Questionnaire and interview protocols were used to gain the necessary insights to effective recruitment and retention practices in answering the research questions. Triangulation of the questionnaire and interview data strengthened conclusions of common themes identified in the experiences of faculty of color working in independent schools. The next chapter will discuss the findings resulting from this study and the final chapter discusses next steps in strengthening recruitment and retention practices in our independent school communities.

CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS

People of color are underrepresented in the faculty of independent schools and as student demographics increasingly reflect a more ethnically diverse student body, and as research on diversity in workgroups has shown to lead to stronger teams, several schools have started to prioritize the need to increase faculty diversity. The purpose of this study was to identify best practices, as well as areas of further growth, in increasing faculty ethnic diversity in independent schools through recruitment and retention practices. The findings will be share with independent school leaders through the California Association of Independent School (CAIS) network.

This qualitative investigation sought to address the following research questions:

1. According to administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do independent schools use to effectively recruit and retain faculty of color?
2. What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work in an independent school?
3. What challenges regarding retention decision, if any, do faculty of color encounter at independent schools?

To answer these questions, I interviewed seven Los Angeles independent school administrators involved in faculty hiring at their schools, administered an online questionnaire to faculty of color aimed to gather their insights and experiences in independent schools, and interviewed nine faculty of color to delve deeper into the themes that arose from the questionnaire regarding experiences that impact their recruitment and retention. The findings from this study are presented in four sections in this chapter. The first three sections outline the findings organized by research question, with the first section summarizing the administrator interview data, and the second and third section presenting a synthesized analysis of the faculty

perspective gathered from the questionnaire and faculty interviews. The fourth section summarizes the findings.

Research Question 1: According to administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do independent schools use to effectively recruit and retain faculty of color?

Seven administrators, from seven different independent schools within the Los Angeles area, were individually interviewed. The group of administrators had a total of 126 years of administrative experience combined, ranging from four to forty years, and overall averaging eighteen years of administrative experience each (Table 1). Administrators represented different types of schools and also had different levels of involvement and influence on faculty hiring depending on their roles in the school (Table 1). Roles represented included head of school, assistant head of school, principal, and director of diversity. Schools represented also had a wide range of faculty diversity, with some schools considered having a high faculty ethnic diversity and others having a low faculty ethnic diversity for the southern California region.

Table 1.
Administrative Experience and Ethnic Background of Administrators Interviewed

Name	Type of School	Position in School	Ethnicity	Years of Experience
Darlene	Pre K-8 th	Head of School	African-American	40
Julianne	K-12 th	Division Head	African-American	15
Martha	K-12 th	Director of Diversity	African-American	4
Cynthia	9 th -12 th	Director of Diversity	Multiracial	13
Sara	K-12 th , Religious affiliation	Assistant Head of School	White	24
Lucinda	K-6 th	Principal	Latino	15
Kelly	9-12 th	Head of School	Middle Eastern	15

The analysis of the administrator interviews resulted in the following findings around effective recruitment and retention practices.

Findings #1-3. Effective recruitment strategies as reported by administrators

All seven administrators interviewed agreed that recruitment of faculty of color needs to be proactive in order to be effective. The following findings outline effective strategies described by administrators.

Finding #1: Proactively including candidates of color in applicant pools

Four of the seven administrators were at schools where there are proactive measures in place to include faculty of color in the search for each new faculty opening. No school shared that they had a quota to fill, nor did they suggest having one, but 100% of the administrators interviewed affirmed the need to deliberately include faculty of color in the applicant pool in order to progress to achieving greater ethnic diversity in final faculty hires.

Darlene, one of the most senior administrators interviewed, said “we look for the best qualified people, but we always look through a lens to continue to make sure that we balance the population in appropriate ways.” Julianne talked about her schools goal to have a diverse finalist pool, explaining that ultimately they find the candidates that they feel “are the best fit” *and* “have the goal of having a diverse candidate pool and taking the time to create that pool.” Echoing the value in creating a diverse candidate pool, Kelly said:

My way of thinking is that whenever there's an opening, we should always do a search, and then in particular, we need to make sure that we are looking carefully to build a pool of applicants that includes as many people of color as we can. Once we have a diverse pool of candidates, then we choose the right person. If we don't at least set ourselves up for the opportunity, then we're never going to become more diverse. That's really what this is. It's about the pool.

While the administrators quoted above described their school’s commitment to diversity as an understood goal, another administrator described that the goal was formalized in a communicated policy at her school. Sara outlined the policy at her school as requiring “all of the searches to have at least one candidate of diversity as a finalist or the search isn't closed, period.

Our principals and department chairs all are on board, and know that.” Additionally the three administrators that were at schools that did not currently have a goal or policy to include final candidates representing diversity, agreed that communication of such a goal or policy would be beneficial to moving faculty diversity efforts forward. For example, one of these administrators, Cynthia, felt that not having a clear priority to diversify faculty was due to a detrimental aspect of the school culture that valued colorblindness: “There's nobody saying, ‘Okay, in every department we want faculty of color.’ I think this is part of the challenge of being in this progressive, liberal community where they're still kind of cloaked and strangled almost by, or muffled by, this color blindness nonsense. I think we have a long way to go in regard to that.”

Finding #2: Expanding outreach efforts beyond the traditional methods

Administrators discussed the need to move beyond the main recruitment firms that are currently used by the majority of schools in the independent schools in the geographic area included in this study. Kelly, who is a woman of color, gave the following explanation of why just using the two recruitment firms focused on placing teachers in independent schools, narrows the diversity of candidates a school can reach:

I think we have to do a better job of moving beyond Carney-Sandoe and CalWest. I use them and found lots of teachers that way, but I think that for so many candidates of color, my experience at least, especially African-American candidates, we don't have a long history of having lots of African-Americans in independent schools. We don't have a long history of Latinos in independent schools. For me, I happened to go to an independent school. That's how I knew about the world of independent schools. But independent schools serve like 3%, 10% of the population in the US. It's a really small number of people who have those experiences.

Another administrator, Lucinda, explained that other ways schools limit their pool of applicants is by not taking the time, when “the priority is let's fill the position” and also missing out on great candidates when “they’re looking for elite university type of certificates and diplomas” and

overlooking the “incredible teachers produced at the Cal States, CSUNs.” Several administrators conveyed the need to be open to candidates that may be coming from “untraditional backgrounds” in order to diversify the candidate pool. Over half of the administrators interviewed discussed the connection between the underrepresentation of candidates in the main independent school hiring firms to the historical underrepresentation of people of color in independent schools, which limits personal knowledge of independent schools influential in teachers of color even knowing about career possibilities in them. Three of the seven administrators interviewed mentioned working with two other hiring firms that focus on outreach to people of color, Strategenius and Nemnet, but neither one has annual recruitment events in Southern California and tend to work more with candidates and schools from the east coast. The majority of administrators expressed a need for more local efforts. Kelly summarized this logic and the need for schools to collaborate on regional outreach efforts as follows:

For so many candidates of color that are out there, because their experiences, at least historically up to this point, have not been in independent schools. It is important for schools to explain what the differences are and try to do some outreach to get to know them a little bit more, so that they get to know us a little bit more and understand actually what we [people of color] can do in a school like this, which is exciting to me. I think we've got to do more on that end, like getting ourselves out there. I think we could probably do this more effectively if we were to join forces with other schools. If there was a consortium of those of us here in LA, for example, who wanted to band together and pool our resources to put together something that would allow us to do that kind of outreach to historically black colleges, for example, and the teacher preparation programs there, or any private or public colleges that have teacher preparation programs that we know also enroll a lot of students of color. That's where we should be going, but because we're all on our own in LA, too ... We're getting more collegial, but we haven't reached the Promised Land yet, I think we're on our own and our time and our resources are limited, so we just kind of keep going back and doing the same thing and expecting different results.

Another administrator echoed that independent schools need to widen their approach to the traditional ways of identifying qualified candidates by looking beyond the surface:

I feel like again, wider access to people, people who don't know about those placement agencies are out there. They're particularly within the Cal states that have amazing Ed programs; they're there and they're getting their master's in Ed, and they might be already looking for a job. The chance that they're a person of color is actually pretty high, right? If we're not doing that, then we're actually closing a door that we don't even know that's closed because we're not even finding the people. I think that's a major step, just looking beyond Carney-Sandoe and CalWest. Again, not to knock them, like they do a great job in what they're supposed to do but if we really want to say that we want to find more people of color, then we actually have to not just do the status quo. The other thing that we need to do is actually begin to read with depth and not just by glancing at the surface. What I mean by that is, often times as we look at résumés, we look at the "caliber of college or university" that a person attended as a way of determining that person's ability and/or worth at a job. Going to Harvard doesn't mean you're good and going to Cal State L.A. doesn't mean you're bad. We need to dissolve that in our hiring structure really very quickly. Again, a great college doesn't mean great teacher. Often, it might just mean better access and that could be better access because of parents, that could be better access because of luck. It could be better access because of a lot of things, but it doesn't mean better caliber of applicant.

Overall, administrators agreed that there is a need for schools to connect with candidates through avenues that have not been adequately explored yet, to market themselves better to a wider range of potential applicants, and at the same time hiring teams need to remain open-minded about minimizing biases against qualified candidates that may not have come through the traditional recruitment firms or those that have had limited to no independent school, or elite private university, experiences.

Finding #3: Recruitment to Retention

The majority of the administrators interviewed mentioned the importance of recruitment in setting the foundation for greater retention of faculty. The interview process not only allows schools to identify the strongest candidate, but also should be seen as the first orientation the candidate gets to the school culture. The onboarding process starts early in the interview phase and it is at this point that both candidates and schools are determining if there is a mutual connection.

Several administrators talked about the importance of the school's commitment to diversity being visible in the interview process. Beyond the usual inclusion in a school's mission statement, administrators talked about how a school's commitment needs to part of every day school life. Lucinda described how a school's level of commitment to diversity can be observed by what a candidate sees during their interview visit:

They have to see it in the hallways -You have to have it in your literature. You have to have it in your lifestyle. You have to have it in the culture of the school. It has to be visible so that when I come to the school and I visit, I go, 'Wow. I feel comfortable here.' If faculty comes on to a campus where there is absolutely no diversity, no commitment to anything, they see that too. Then they go, 'I don't want to come here. I don't want to work here. Not one person of color did I see - I didn't talk to anybody who knew anything about diversity. Never did I hear, you know, inclusion. Never did I hear any of the language that I'm accustomed to hearing.' It makes a big difference.

Julianne echoed the above sentiment:

If you want to recruit people of color, you need to think about what message you're sending to them. This is the place where they want to work. Again, as much as you're interviewing that person, they're also saying, "Do I belong here? Can I fit in here? Can I connect with this group of people? Can I bring my full self here?" Those are the kinds of things that people of color are thinking about.

Darlene spoke about emotional intelligence as a skillset her school tries to identify in the interview process, in identifying candidates that will transition well to their school:

School match becomes very important, readiness for independent schools, and the rigors of independent school on any teacher no matter their cultural background. They've got to be ready to teach in an environment where our customers or parents and students and they're paying a premium for something that other families get for free. We do have to think about customer service across the board. People's emotional maturity, and their attitudes, and their cultural competence, and their self confidence has a lot to do with how well they integrate into and transition into independent schools.

Though the above quote explains the importance of emotional intelligence for all candidates, regardless of background, administrators further highlighted how due to unique challenges faced by people of color in independent schools a candidate's personality characteristics may impact

their resiliency when facing microaggressions or feelings of loneliness at a school where they may be underrepresented. Darlene shared a story about a candidate of color who misinterpreted an interaction during her visit on campus and jumped to conclusions that the school was not a welcoming place instead of asking for clarification:

Part of the acculturation experience is being open during the onboarding process, during the interview, asking the questions you need to ask. Because if you don't have a voice, you're not going to make it here. There's too much intimacy in the environment and too much access across constituent groups if you can't speak up for yourself, you're not going to last on any issue. She wasn't a good fit. She was very bright, and very well educated, and talented, and would have been wonderful teacher for the school. If her first experience is one that she distrusts, you're starting at a deficit already.

Five of the seven administrators interviewed echoed the following sentiment by Darlene that explains how that initial interview visit is key in the onboarding process as follows: “When you hear about what people value and try and make sure that the values by which they live their lives are going to find consonance within the school and resonance.”

In summary, administrators gave examples of how the recruitment process, and the hiring process all build ultimately to retention. Schools have to take the steps in their hiring process to share their commitment with faculty of color and then once they're there, beyond first year orientations, schools need to continue to provide touchstones and support for faculty of color.

Finding #4. Effective retention strategies as reported by administrators:

Overall, there was one major finding that arose from the administrator interviews around effective retention of teachers of color. All seven administrators agreed that the orientation and mentoring process is a key retention practice.

Finding #4 Faculty mentorship and other formal and informal faculty support structures

All administrators interviewed discussed mentoring structures at their respective schools that are aimed to support new faculty in their first year. Though all administrators agreed that mentoring of new faculty is essential in providing guidance and increasing a successful transition in learning the school culture and expectations, the type of mentoring structures varied dramatically in formality between schools. Some schools have informal mentors assigned, where another faculty member is assigned as a resource for the new faculty member, while other schools had frequent mandatory meetings as a new faculty group with administrators or with their assigned mentor.

Mentors are key in helping new faculty learn and adjust to the school culture. Kelly gave an example of how she supports one of the new faculty of color at her school by meeting with her weekly “to onboard her” so she “can help her look ahead, help translate things for her.” She goes on to explain the reason she prioritizes making time to meet with her is that it is a new role at the school and “what she is navigating is so complex and could be fraught with a lot of problems” so the consistent meetings are aimed to support her success.

Additionally, 4 of the 7 administrators discussed giving regular feedback to new faculty in their first year as an important aspect of support in increasing retention. It is important that feedback structures are transparent and fair so that individual teachers don’t feel like they are being scrutinized more than others. Darlene summed up this sentiment as follows:

I think evaluate them regularly, openly, and honestly. Make sure that our hiring practices and our retention practices are even handed and transparent, that our personnel policies are transparent, circulated timely and that we ask people to avail themselves of the opportunity to review them periodically, so that they see that the rules for some are the rules for all.

Overall all administrators agreed that an orientation to the school culture and a mentoring structure to guide new faculty of color through their first year at a school is important in providing support for them. However, some administrators admitted that at times the assigned mentor is not always a good match and that, therefore, other informal mentoring relationships with experienced teachers and school administrators are important in fostering new faculty support.

Five of the seven administrators interviewed acknowledged the experience of underrepresented faculty of color being different from the majority in that often being one of a few faculty of color, or even the only one, can present an additional challenge in feeling connected to the school. Several administrators mentioned this in explaining that “someone needs to be checking in with new faculty of color, asking them about their needs” and not assume that their experience is that of the majority culture or even the same to others of the same ethnic group. Three administrators of color described affinity groups as another support structure for faculty of color. Affinity groups are supportive spaces for participants to process common experiences and reenergize. Cynthia described how they allow for “constant checking in” for new faculty of color and how sometimes the need for them is not always widely understood by others: “I see other teachers thinking they're getting special treatment, but the truth is I think it requires special treatment. The majority of the population doesn't recognize the sacrifices that our families of color and candidates of color make when they come to a white majority school.” Lucinda echoed this sentiment when she said: “I think the piece to me that I find is often missing is the lack of recognition that the experience of someone who is not part of the majority, is for the most part, hugely different from the majority's experience.” Additionally, in explaining how

colorblindness leads to lack of support for affinity groups at her school, Cynthia touched upon the need to recognize different experiences based on aspects of one's identity:

[The need for affinity groups] doesn't minimize the majority's experience, or say that the non-majority experience is any better than the other, but it deserves more attention because it's really different. It doesn't matter what the majority is, if mean if it's women, if the majority is women that man has a very different experience. If the majority is men, that woman is having a very different experience that needs to be, I think, tended to and acknowledged and then tended to, and I think that doesn't happen at our schools.

Similarly Kelly emphasized the need for administrators to recognize the experience of faculty of color is different in a majority white school than it is for a faculty member of the majority group.

This black male teacher, I don't want to assume that his experience here as a teacher is going to be exactly the same as other teachers in his department or otherwise, because he has a particular family that he has, he has his own personal history that he has, and part of that is influenced by the fact that he's a black man. It's a completely different experience, and being the only black man on the faculty right now, that's a very particular experience, and I want to know about that as much as I want to know about how he's done in developing his class this year. Both of those things are important, but we have to be able to talk about that explicitly, because every time we don't talk about it, and every time we don't ask about it, we are sending a message.

The quote above conveys that a lack of conversation or lack of support structures that recognize the different experience faculty of color have in majority white schools can imply a lack of value and understanding in supporting a diverse faculty. Affinity groups help address feelings of loneliness, and though, ideally, a school is able to have enough faculty of color to form a group at their own school there may at times be a need for regional gatherings to support faculty of color that may be the only one at their school site. Regional organizations like SoCal POCIS (Southern California People of Color in Independent Schools) and the national NAIS People of Color Conference (PoCC) create these multi-school opportunities for affinity group experiences. Overall numbers do matter, administrators agreed that though individual personalities play a role in how successful a teacher is in navigating challenges, the more faculty

of color there are at a given school the more likely faculty of color can find mentors of color, and also the more likely they will feel connected to the school as the pressure to have to represent a group is minimized.

Research Question 2: What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school?

The questionnaire was completed by 90 respondents, 84 of whom identified as people of color and the remaining six as white. Since the second and third research question focus on the perspectives of faculty of color, the findings were focused on the analysis of the 84 respondents that identified as people of color (Table 2) only.

Table 2.
Ethnicity of Questionnaire Respondents

Ethnic Self-identification*	Number of Respondents (total n=84)	Percentage of Respondents
Asian	23	27.4%
Black or African American	25	29.8%
Two or More Races	16	19.0%
Hispanic or Latino	17	20.2%
Middle Eastern	2	2.4%
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	1	1.2%
American Indian or Alaskan Native	0	0%

*Ethnic groups listed are based on the descriptors used by the National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS).

Of the 84 respondents, 28 (33.3%) were male, and 56 (66.7%) were female. There was a wide range of years of teaching experience, grade levels taught (Table 3) and academic departments represented in this group. Overall the group consisted of mostly experienced teachers, with over 80% having taught more than six years, and 59.5% having taught more 11 or more years.

Table 3.

Questionnaire Respondent Teaching Experience

Years of Teaching Experience	Number of Respondents (total n=84)	Percentage of Respondents
1-2	4	4.8%
3-5	10	11.9%
6-10	20	23.8%
11-15	19	22.6%
16-20	11	13.1%
Over 20	20	23.8%

The questionnaire results identified initial trends that were informative in finalizing the interview questions to further explore the experiences of faculty of color in independent schools. Overall averages of all respondents were compared to group averages of specific ethnic groups that had at least 15 respondents to examine if there were any differences between groups (Appendix H).

The questionnaire showed that faculty and student diversity are highly valued by faculty of color, overall as well as by individual ethnic groups (Table H2). However of several are several areas listed, they indicated least satisfaction with the actual faculty and student diversity at their current independent schools (Table H1). Additionally there was low satisfaction with the socioeconomic diversity of the student body (Table H1). Overall, over 25% of respondents selected the following among the top three factors they consider in choosing a school include: salary and benefits, professional development opportunities, the mission statement of the school, and student diversity (Table H3). The interview day experience, as indicated by was also a high factor in choosing a school (Table H3). Though respondents as a whole agreed with the statements about their schools providing a mentor to new faculty, and having a colleague on campus they can go to for advice, they were closer to neutral in agreeing that their school had effective structures in place to support new teachers (Table H4). There were no major trends in differences when comparing average responses between different ethnic groups, though the

Asian group did indicate slightly less observation, or experience, of microaggressions compared to the other three groups. The initial themes identified in the questionnaire phase were further explored during the faculty interviews. Nine faculty were interviewed, representing a range of years of teaching experience, gender, different school types and academic discipline (Table 4).

Table 4.
Professional and Ethnic Background of Teachers of Color Interviewed

Teacher	Department & Grade Levels currently teaching	Type of School*	Ethnicity (self-identified)	Gender	Years of Teaching Experience
Rebecca	World Language, 9 th -12 th	Religious affiliation, 9 th -12 th	Latino	Female	11
Edwin	Science, 7 th -12 th	7 th -12 th	Black & Multiracial	Male	10
Brynnen	Art, Elementary	Elementary	Multiracial	Female	4
Michelle	5 th grade	K-12 th	Multiracial	Female	26
Janice	3 rd grade	Elementary	Asian	Female	18
Charles	History, 9 th -12 th	Secondary	Black	Male	15
Mike	English, 7 th -12 th	Secondary	Black/Latino	Male	20
Daniel	Music, Elementary	Religious affiliation, Elementary	Multiracial	Male	27
Karen	History, 9 th -12 th	Religious affiliation, K-12 th	Latino	Female	22

*Elementary is K-6th, and Secondary refers to 7th grade and above. The religiously affiliated schools include Jewish and Episcopal day schools.

The major findings from the faculty interviews, showing that the most important factors considered by faculty of color in choosing to work at an independent school include their interview interactions, including final interview and campus visit; the school's commitment to diversity; and the perceived assessment of professional growth opportunities at a school.

Finding #5: Interview experience plays crucial role in forming faculty's opinion on the school environment and values

One hundred percent of the teachers interviewed discussed how during the final interview day interactions and the friendliness of community members they met on campus made an impression in deciding to work at their schools. As they visited schools they would ask themselves if this was a place where they could see themselves working. Additionally, four of the nine teachers interviewed discussed the inclusion of a demo lesson and/or the opportunity to meet students as an important aspect of their interview process experience. A representative statement that communicates the importance of a candidate's campus visit in determining their interest in working at that school is Charles' comment below:

I also was asking a lot of questions and just observing, because you can tell me one thing, we know that mission doesn't always match what's actually happens. I observed for myself in my sample classes that I got a chance to teach, and my conversations with students and other colleagues, walking around visiting other departments, looking at yearbooks and things of that nature. Just look to see if the pictures on the website, if it's representative of everything that I see on campus, and not over represented.

In addition to influencing candidates positively, a few teachers described negative interactions impacting their decision to not work at a school. Edwin, a science teacher, discussed how a negative interview interaction led him to conclude that a school was not where he wanted to go:

Once in a while, there will be an interview or a process where they haven't seen a picture of me, they haven't seen me, they've just seen my résumé; and they're not expecting a person of color I could actually tell when I sat down [for the interview], I was not the person they were expecting. The male interviewer was really, really clear that he was not expecting me as a black male to sit down at his desk and almost immediately looked at my résumé, looked at me, and was like, "Oh." They are expecting a white person. It actually comes across pretty clearly, and that was that sigh. The eyes get really big, the frown and furrow. I knew obviously from that moment, not only wasn't I going to get any further on that position, but also I actually didn't want to. If that was his take on me as a person, that says really to me, really bad things about where that school is and where that administration is in terms of who they're really looking for and what matters to them in terms of diversity, inclusivity, and social justice, all of those things. Immediately, I was like, I'm going to sit down and do this interview, but even if I get called back, I wouldn't take this job.

It is important to note that every interaction during the interview process, from the person at the front desk to the head of school, impacts a teacher's perception of the school. Michelle described how off putting interactions with the support staff at one school where she was pursuing a position sent her a vibe of not being fully welcomed:

I was pursuing an opening and it was a very cold white woman at the front desk who just wouldn't give me the time of the day. I just felt like she had no interest in helping me so I said okay I am out of here. I think it was everything, the eye contact, her attitude. She just was not interested. I can't remember if I just walked in and tried to give my resume or something I don't know but she was not welcoming at all, I just remember thinking okay not that school. Later I found out that that was a likeminded school that might have been a possibility but she blew it for me and for them.

Another important theme that came up several times in the teacher interviews was the impact of the composition of the interview team sending a message to candidates on the schools values. Seeing administrators and faculty of color involved in the hiring process sent a message to faculty of color that their voice matters at the school. Additionally, interviewing with someone that holds a position related to dealing with diversity initiatives and programming (i.e. Director of Diversity, Director of Multiculturalism, Diversity Coordinator) validates the importance and commitment of the school to this work.

Finding #6: Administrator, student body, and faculty diversity conveys schools commitment to diversity

The presence of administrators of color at a school sends a message to candidates of color that upward movement is a possibility at this school. Several teachers of color mentioned how impactful it was to be interviewed by a head or other administrator of color. Diversity in the school administration communicates that the school values diversity of perspectives and experiences in the leadership team. Brynne explained that "to have someone in power, in terms of administrative power, makes you feel safer as a teacher of color." Another teacher, Michelle,

described how she was specifically drawn to her first two schools because they had heads of color. Candidates see the presence of administrators of colors as an indicator of a deeper level of inclusion achieved by a school community, that people of color are respected as leaders. Rebecca summarized this perspective as follows:

Also I think that sometimes the people that you send out to recruit your school...they need to have representatives from the schools that are of color so that when you're interviewing with them you do relate to them and you can identify with them and feel a little more comfortable with the interview itself and in many ways I think that is almost like selling point. Because you see that there are teachers of color who are in positions of leadership at the school and therefore, obviously there is opportunity for growth.

88.1% of questionnaire respondents responded that they agreed or strongly agreed with the statement: *It is important for me to work at a school that values faculty diversity*. Teachers shared some of the reasons they selected the school they are currently at over others is that “diversity was just part of the landscape” and candidates could distinguish between authentic diversity versus insincere or inauthentic ways when it clearly not a larger piece of the school but an attempt to recruit specific candidates only. Karen, who has a background of working as a diversity practitioner in independent schools, described the difference in how she experienced this range in commitment to diversity during her interview process at different schools:

Having people of color be part of the interview process shows candidates that people of color have say in decisions, which, like I said, when I sat in an interview with four white guys, and I was like, "Oh my word, are these the only people who have any say over anything?" And I repeatedly met with a lot of white people, and I didn't meet with one... I met with one person of color, and she was somebody's administrative assistant, and she normally didn't even interview people, but they had me meet with her... It just felt so pandering. While having people of color in the interview process- Because right at the gate, you're showing candidates of all kinds that's it a diverse school, and that people of diverse backgrounds have say and input in things. That's huge. That's such a massive message for everybody, not just candidates of color. It lets everybody know what kind of place you're coming to. So as far as recruitment goes, yeah, that's huge.

Similarly teachers discussed how the presence of ethnic diversity in the faculty is important and potentially comforting to a candidate of color in that they won't be "the only one". Though some candidates will be comfortable being trailblazers if required, seeing diversity in the faculty of a school sends a message that other people of color are happy working here. Brynne described: "When you walk into a [school] and you don't see anyone who looks like you, it becomes very uncomfortable to be the only one of anything, than when you walk into a diverse space it seems by far more open." Ultimately a greater number of people of color lead teachers to perceive a greater support network. Rebecca described how a support network ultimately leads to greater comfort and therefore towards more successful retention:

I think a lot of it [connection to school] has to do with your network, the people that are your unofficial mentors and the people that you seek out are obviously the people that you feel comfortable with and for me personally they've always been people that share a culture with me and the more of those teachers that you have around you the more comfortable you're going to feel and the more willing you are to stay there longer because you feel like you are part of a school that obviously appreciates you and where you feel like you are a part of the school. So I think that can only happen if you have higher numbers of teachers with color and if you only have one or two then obviously your network and your support group becomes smaller and there's less of a possibility that you will want to continue with the school when you don't feel like you really connect.

Finally, the presence of student body diversity (racially, ethnically, socioeconomically, religiously...etc.) sends message that the school values a diverse community. 92.9% of questionnaire respondents responded that they agreed or strongly agreed with the statement: *It is important for me to work at a school that values student diversity*. Candidates perceive that diversifying the student body is easier due to an annual admissions cycle versus less frequent faculty openings, therefore expectations for student diversity are higher than for faculty diversity. Teachers interviewed described seeing students of color on their visit as reflections of themselves. Michelle, who is multiracial, described how seeing multiracial kids on her interview day led her to committing to the school she currently works at:

You are never sure when you first visit a place that seemed like they were saying the right things and then I saw lots of multiracial kids on my tour. They were that drew me in. I felt like they are waiting for me, they are here, and I am supposed to be here, and it just felt as a right fit...I saw the reflections of me. I saw all these multiracial, biracial kids all over on my tour and during my demo lesson. I don't remember it as much in some of the other schools that I visited and felt like there were more mixed raced kids here. I really identified strongly with the mixed race kids and faces that I thought I was making eye contact all over place with them. Then, the campus felt really welcoming right away.

Additionally some teachers talked about how they were drawn to work in independent schools for the opportunity to be there for students, including being there for underrepresented students with whom they can relate to via common experiences. Particularly, all teachers interviewed that were also alumni of independent schools, mentioned they were partially motivated to teach due to their own student experience. Both positive and negative experiences (in being one of the few...in lacking teachers of color) were mentioned, but consistently teachers described a desire to be there for students of color due to lacking mentors/teachers of color in their own independent school experience. Rebecca, an alumni teacher, who started her teaching career at her alma mater relayed how that decision was influenced by her student experience:

It was my experience as a student that I felt that there was a need for me to go back to the school, specifically my school and be a teacher there. So, I would say that that's the main reason I started teaching where I was a teacher because I felt like I had role models at the school when I was there that really were mentors to me and I felt like there weren't enough of them so I decided to go back in order to become a mentor to someone eventually. And hopefully I did do that at some point. That was primarily why I decided to go back.

Finding #7: Candidates value curriculum flexibility and professional growth opportunities

Another major finding is that several teachers discussed the opportunity to have some autonomy to bring in their ideas and their lens/passions into their classroom as a main reason they were attracted to independent schools. Teachers of color are drawn to collaborative communities that welcome new ideas. Brynne described being drawn to a school despite its lack of faculty diversity due to their openness around curriculum: “when I went to go interview

for my school, when I was talking about the things I was passionate about, my school seemed really receptive and hungry for those ideas, despite the fact that the faculty doesn't reflect diversity whatsoever." In addition to having influence over the curriculum, the majority of teachers interviewed also mentioned how professional development was a key recruitment factor for them. Professional development opportunities include discipline specific opportunities as well as personal career development and support opportunities as teachers found in attending the annual national NAIS People of Color Conference (PoCC). Brynne shared that her two priorities in finding a school were "control over curriculum and people who were supportive of me going to PoCC." Edwin, who was in a hybrid dean of students and faculty role, expressed that being clear about what he was looking for when he interviewed at schools led him to successfully finding a good match:

I was very, very clear that there were a couple of things I was looking for. One, was a community that I fit into that was going to take me for all of that I have to offer. That was really important. Two, I still love teaching and I still want to do some teaching. Three, I wanted to have some administrative responsibilities, and what that looked like didn't really matter to me what it was called, it didn't really matter to me as long as I had the flexibility to have some responsibility in terms of programming and administration, and I got a lot of various response and all of that was really good.

Therefore, schools that ask candidates what they are looking for in a school are more likely to identify ways of supporting individual faculty members, and thereby better assess who is the best fit for the current opening. Additionally, teachers were attracted to schools that had expectations for the entire faculty to engage in diversity professional development. Karen described how she was attracted to the school she is currently at due to it having a community wide commitment to growth: "The school embraces open dialogue about diversity. The expectation is for all faculty to engage in this work. The responsibility belongs to all faculty, not just something that involves people of color."

Research Question 3: What challenges regarding retention decision, if any, do faculty of color encounter at independent schools?

There were three main findings that arose from the faculty interviews in regards to main challenges to retention of faculty of color in independent schools: additional stresses associated with being underrepresented on campus, lack of mentorship and opportunities for further growth, and guilt arising from not working in schools that more reflective of their own backgrounds and communities. Overall it seems that personal resiliency traits play a key role in how well faculty of color are able to overcome these challenges.

Finding #8: Additional pressures and isolation associated with being underrepresented on campus

Loneliness

Being one of the few faculty of color in an independent school leads to additional pressures and stresses, such as feelings of loneliness, which can create doubt on whether one fully belongs to the school community. Rebecca reflected on the low numbers of faculty of color at her school as follows:

The fact that you look around and you don't really identify with everybody that's around you, I think that can make it hard. I think in some ways it could make you feel uncomfortable depending on how secure you are. Even now at my school for example if I just am visualizing our faculty room there are maybe three.

It is important to note that what heightens the discomfort in being one of the few, is the additional stress of experiencing microaggressions in a school community that doesn't openly engage in conversations to support inclusion by openly discussing the experience of underrepresented members on campus. When their experience is unacknowledged, it leaves faculty of color feeling unsupported and lonely as described below by Brynne:

I think it's lonely being a faculty member of color. That one is big. And it's hard to stomach as many microaggressions I think happen when there isn't a culture of talking about what those things are, and people don't want to deal with what that is.

Eight of the nine teachers interviewed discussed the experience of being one of a few faculty of color in their schools, or in some cases the only one, leading to feelings of being tokenized, singled out or "othered". All faculty interviewed discussed a feeling of being under the spotlight, due to standing out as different from the majority faculty. Several faculty empathized that this feeling of alienation and being singled out is similar to the experiences of students of color in majority white classes. Brynne, who is an independent school alumna, explained this parallel experience as follows.

I understand and see the students from a different standpoint I think. I've walked in their shoes, so I do have sensitivity to it. I know what it's like to be the only brown child in a room, especially Black child in a room, and have everyone turn and, on, let's see, Black History month, "How do you feel about Dr. Martin Luther King, let's talk about slavery, civil rights," and it's a very uncomfortable feeling, that alienation.

Being underrepresented also leads to faculty of color experiencing the burden of representation. There is additional stress associated with faculty of color feeling they are representing their racial group and that their actions may be attributed to that group membership instead of to them as individual. Michelle, who with 26 years of teaching experience is well respected at her school site, explained this phenomenon as follows:

If you are a white teacher and you fail, it has nothing to do with your race, but if you are of color and you fail the perception from the outside is that it has everything to do with your race. "They keep hiring those teachers of color and they are crappy or whatever." ... So many faculty members of color have talked about needing to be 200% better, needing to be perfectly well spoken and excellent writing and whatever. Like I said before if you fail as a new teacher, you are just failing as a new teacher, but if you fail as a new teacher of color, it is because you are a teacher of color. You are a person of color. It is what people see is, oh my black teacher failed like they didn't fit in. "They just got hired because they were black or whatever." It is the weight of holding your race on your shoulders so everything about this, this can feel like you are under a microscope.

Though the experience of being under the spotlight can be a common one for faculty of color that are one of a few, their ability to navigate and overcome these challenges will influence their ability to adapt to the school culture and expectations. Faculty resiliency can vary based on individual personal past experiences and personalities. When they are one of a few, or the only one, teachers found it hard to speak up when they experience microaggressions, or to ask for help when they may otherwise be struggling. Edwin discussed feeling that he needed “to monitor” himself and how faculty of color choose not to speak up when they predict they won’t be supported. He shared what would go through his head in these moments:

“They’re not going to hear me. This is going to result in something much bigger than it needs to be, and I’m just not in for it right now. This is not an important moment.” We learned how to cut ourselves off and to say, “No, I don’t want to do that,” or we learned how to say, “This is not the space for me. I need to get out.”

Schools need to understand that the faculty of color experience is different from the majority, and yet acknowledge that different individuals will need varying levels of support or perhaps little to no support based on their specific traits and situations. Edwin summarized well the importance of schools recognizing the need to individually check in with faculty of color to better provide support targeting their expressed needs:

A big part of it is understanding that walking into an independent school, the experience might well be different depending on the person of color and what their background is and what their comfort level is. Some may well, like myself, be used to be one of the few already. While others, may not be used to that at all. If that’s the case, just assessing like what kind of support do you need, and sometimes that is the question to ask and you can’t ask it on the first day. What you need to do is wait three months and then, have a meeting. How are you finding this experience? This is absolutely not being used for evaluation. We want to know how you’re finding this experience. Are there challenges that you’re facing? Are there ways that we can support you?... You have to find a way to do it to really allow the person to be able to say, “Yeah, I’m having some struggle points. I don’t think the parents are ... I don’t think they’re on the same page that I’m on. I don’t think my department is really understanding where I’m coming from.” You’ve got to be able to give them that space to say it, and let them be safe in saying it.

Experiencing Microaggressions

Microaggressions are the everyday verbal, nonverbal, and environmental slights, snubs, or insults, whether intentional or unintentional, which communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative messages to target persons based on their marginalized group membership. Some common examples of microaggressions experienced by faculty of color in independent schools include having their qualifications questioned, being dismissed or ignored during faculty meetings, and experiencing stereotyping.

Brynnen, who identifies as multiracial, shared how it took her a while to feel comfortable with wearing her hair down at work because it was just another constant visible reminder about how different she was. She explained how her hair would be the source of creating situations where she felt “othered”:

I used to always wear my hair back. The entire first year I taught, I didn’t wear my hair down and curly until I think two and half years on my job that I finally felt comfortable. Just because it made me stand out more than I needed to I suppose at the time. And wanting to own it, and being open to being asked the questions, and dealing with hair touching, and all the other things that come inside of that. And just being very comfortable to say, “Please don’t touch my hair.” Or, “Yes, you can touch it this once so I can explain to you why not to touch it.” People still touch your hair. Even when it’s up, they still touch it.

Rebecca, a world language teacher, described how an interaction with a senior level administrator, who made an inappropriate joke about her fluency in front of her students, left her feeling disconnected to the school. She summarized the uncomfortable experience as follows

There are interactions that happen with people that you expect much more from, and they were completely clueless that they even impacted you in the way that they did. ... I think that when that happened I had my real, true doubts about whether or not I really belonged at this school and whether I should even continue working there because I hadn't felt so uncomfortable ever, and by a supervisor essentially, it felt wrong.

Karen, who is experienced in navigating independent schools but is in her first year at a new school this year, described being rebuffed by some of her white colleagues when she attempted to join in on their group conversation.

I would add something, and people wouldn't acknowledge that I even said anything, and it was just like, "Wow." So after that happened a couple of times, I was like, "You know what, whatever. I'm going to waste no energy trying to insert myself in that, I'm not interested in that," but, did I think, "Oh, it's because I'm a person of color?" No, but there was a part of me that was like, "Do you all not see what you look like through my eyes? Is this something that's ever crossed your mind?" But I don't think so. There are times where I've been aware of [being a person of color], and then it crosses my mind, or then I think, "Wow, what a coincidence," and I say that in a sarcastic way. It'll be, "Oh, all these people are sitting in a circle talking. I'm the only person not in it, I'm the only person who's not white," I'll see that dynamic, and that's exactly what I'll say to myself, like, "Funny, how the one non-white person is not..."

Though she acknowledged that the exclusion was probably unintentional, this savvy experienced teacher was able to acknowledge that thought and dismiss it, while another faculty of color less experienced in independent schools may be more greatly impacted by the perceived alienation possibly due to racial differences.

The stories shared above are examples of experiences that were due to the ethnic membership of the faculty, experiences that their white colleagues would not be experiencing the stress and frustration.

"You prove yourself more often and to a greater degree"

Eight of the nine faculty interviewed described how when a person of color enters an independent school, an environment that is predominantly white, oftentimes, the assumption is that they are not quite as prepared as their white peers. They do have to "prove [themselves] far more often"-- both as a person of color and as a woman, so therefore double the pressure for women of color. The majority of interviews touched upon this experience, nicely summarized by

the following insight, provided by Edwin who experiences his credentials being questioned even with having a Ph.D. degree in the discipline he teaches.

You prove yourself more often and to a greater degree. If you are lucky enough to have an advance degree behind you, that helps some. If you don't, then that increases your uphill battle. I think there you are far more likely to be called on your mistakes as a person of color than not. You're given a little bit more leeway to make mistakes as a white faculty member. I would say that's not just true here, but in my other school and also from just talking to colleagues at other places. Open house is your time to get the parents and wow them, and you got to do that because if you don't, then their mistrust builds. I think there's a little bit more pressure as a person of color to really ... It does mean that I have to be very dynamic in my personality and my communication to the parents, so that they can say, "Oh, wow. This person actually knows what they're talking about."

It is notable above that the perception of being seen as less qualified is pressure that can radiate from the parents as well as from other colleagues at the school. Edwin echoed the sentiments of several other faculty interviewed who think that type of pressure is not necessarily on their white colleagues. He said, "I do think in addition that sometimes, when mistakes are made and maybe even unintentionally, probably unintentionally, people of color are judged a little bit more harshly by administration." In explaining how a female colleague in her first year in a new role was criticized harshly, instead of being mentored, Edwin went on to share how that treatment was different from how white colleagues at that same school are treated: "in the meantime there are definitely other issues that have been far more longer lasting, and particularly with colleagues who are not people of color that have dragged down for three years, and they've been given chance, after chance, after chance, after chance to change things and haven't."

Overall when support mechanisms are seen as unfair, or when qualifications are questioned after being hired it emphasizes feelings of not really belonging to the community and leads to heightening feelings of disconnection.

Burden of representation

Another layer to the burden of representation is when faculty of color are overextended in responsibilities to support students of color and/or diversity initiatives. Faculty described being approached as the expert in supporting students of their same racial group when they may not necessarily understand or be the best teacher to reach out to that child. This comes with another set of stereotypes in assuming that teachers of color are most equipped, or even prepared and willing to, be the mentor for students of color. Though several faculty of color do value the opportunity to be there to support students of color, and to be able to connect with them being able to relate in a common experience, schools should not assume that all people of color are equally capable of, or even ready to, being given this responsibility or be a leader in diversity initiatives.

Loneliness, microaggressions, and the burden of representation are aspects of faculty of color's experiences in independent schools that lead to additional stress and pressures which in turn challenge faculty of color retention. Successful faculty of color discussed strategies to help navigate these challenges, mainly centered on finding mentors and a support network within their schools. The absence of these resources adds an additional challenge in itself.

Finding #9: Lack of mentorship and opportunities to grow

Six of the nine faculty interviewed talked about moving schools to find opportunities to keep growing professionally when that opportunity was not afforded at their former school site. Even when they expressed interest in looking for more leadership responsibilities, faculty explained that former schools were not responsive to their requests. Edwin explained that though openings became available while he was at his former school, he wasn't even informed about the

searches, and therefore he experienced that they “were definitely not ready to give that to [him] and didn’t have space for [him] to move up.”

Faculty expressed disappointment when schools did not listen to them, did not ask them about their needs. Charles described how schools could best support faculty of color by listening openly to their needs and responding to their requests.

If they tell you they are having a hard time, actually listen and do something about it. If they tell you they are looking for more opportunities, that they want to move up to a leadership position, keep that in mind. In my case I told them when I was hired that eventually I would like to return to an administrative position, but since then opportunities have come by and they don’t look to me for them. Positions that have opened up have gone to people with less experience. No criteria is posted, and things like “we feel they know the school culture better” is said of teachers that get it due to more time at the school. How many years do I need to know the school culture? I feel like I know the school culture now pretty well. Often schools lose people of color due to not giving them the opportunities to move up. Someone with less resiliency may give up, but I know my self-worth and I know that if I go somewhere else it may work out. I feel that is where I am right now, that it may be time to look for another school where I can continue to grow in a leadership/administrative role.

Having realized that his school is not being supportive of his professional goals, Charles is starting to feel less committed to staying where he is currently at realizing that his potential to be promoted is limited if he stays.

Faculty interviewed mentioned the positive impact of mentoring relationships, whether formalized by the school or those that developed informally, as an important support system for them in their schools. Edwin described activities, such as a faculty hike or group dinner, that was organized by the school and helps to “build a sense of community in that the people that you work with aren’t just people you work with, they can be your friends.” Creating these informal social opportunities are important for first year teachers ability in building relationships that lead to a network of support.

Only 50.6% of the questionnaire respondent agreed or strongly agreed with the statement: *My school has effective structures and programs in place to help support teachers in their first year at our school.* These data shows that this is an area of growth for schools. All nine faculty interviewed discussed the presence of a mentoring program at their school, though it was clear that in most cases the assigned mentor was not necessarily someone they connected with, and often they would seek out other informal mentoring relationships at their schools with other colleagues based around common backgrounds or personality compatibilities. Brynneen, discussed how her carpool buddy, who happened to be one of the other few faculty of color at her school, was an important source of support for her:

There's an informal mentor, I wasn't ever officially her mentee. So a lot of the time, she lives near me so we carpool sometimes or she'd need a ride because things were happening with her car and her family, and we live near each other. So a lot of time we'd ride with each other and that was an informal space to discuss what was going on and uncomfortable moments with students or with adults. We would really talk about microaggressions and the toll that it takes working in a space that isn't diverse and how that affects a faculty member of color. It met the need for a vent space. It was like a mini affinity group carpool. And that was really like a wonderful thing that I've actually been missing this year, because we haven't carpooled at all this year. And I recently told her, "I'm just going to leave my car one day so we can get in the car and I can just let it out."

The interaction above highlights the appreciation of an affinity group space, where faculty of color can process, reflect on, and be better prepared to navigate common experiences of underrepresented faculty in independent schools. Only one of the nine teachers interviewed had an official affinity group space provided by the school, however seven of the remaining eight teachers mentioned PoCC and SoCal POCIS events, both which offer an affinity space component, as spaces of rejuvenation and support. Brynneen explained the impact of her PoCC affinity group experience on her ability to gain perspective and rejuvenation in her dedication to the importance of her work in independent schools:

Yeah. I think every time, specifically, I go to POCC and I meet up, particularly, with all of my mixed race affinity group friends. It's not the fact that their mixed race, it's just that they're people of color. But when we all meet up, we're like, "Ah, it feels so good to be here. I feel like I can be myself and someone can really hear me." That you can not only talk about what's happening with you professionally, people are going to understand because you're educators, but to be able to talk about the rest of that, the complexities, racial politics inside of the workplace, and then in education itself.

Mentoring relationships are important in supporting faculty of color, and the absence of them will reduce retention. When faculty are able to find mentors to help them navigate the specific school cultures at their independent school, they are able to adapt more successfully. One example of how an affinity group space and/or a successful mentoring relationship can assist a faculty of color is that it can reduce stereotype threat because they provide spaces for them to process emotions that may otherwise go untended. One of the younger teachers interviewed explained that her ability to connect with more experienced educators of color has been a meaningful source of strength for her in developing effective communication skills. She said, "Because I don't want to come off as the angry brown girl. I want to come off like I have something to say, it's important, and I'm trying to move something further. To come off passionate in a positive sense, versus angry or bossy or the rest of the negative adjectives that can be atoned to me." Overall a major finding is that effective mentorship and support networks, and professional growth opportunities lead to more confident individuals and therefore to increased retention of faculty of color.

Summary

Overall, the findings show that administrators interviewed have a strong commitment to and an understanding of how best to improve recruitment and retention of faculty of color, though schools vary based on how that goal or policy is articulated and lived out in their schools. Factors that faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school is the

interview day experience, the diversity of the interview team and of the school community, and the curriculum flexibility and professional growth opportunities available at that school.

Challenges to retention included additional pressures and feelings of isolation associated with being underrepresented on campus, and lack of mentorship and growth opportunities. The faculty interviews showed that even when retention structures (i.e. a mentoring program or new faculty orientation) is put into place the perception of its effectiveness can vary significantly between individuals and schools. The data revealed areas of further growth, and there are several recommendations for school around recruitment and retention practices that will be outlined in the next chapter.

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION

Introduction

As a woman of color currently working at an independent school as the Director of Diversity, it is important to acknowledge my positionality and personal connection to this study. Having over a decade of experiences working in independent schools, collaborating with diversity practitioners from other schools, and implementing diversity initiatives, I went into this study with a sense of what I expected to find. Though a lot of my gut intuition was reaffirmed by the end of the study, I also was surprised to discover what I did not know. I entered this study thinking only about what schools can do to improve practices around recruitment and retention, and though certainly there is a lot there, I have realized that beyond what a school can do and provide externally, it is also the internal resiliency factors within potential candidates that play a role in facilitating a successful transition.

By listening to all the interviewees' stories, this study allowed me to reflect on my own internal resiliency. I realized that there were several aspects of my identity that provided me additional strengths to navigate some of the obstacles faculty of color experience at independent school. I discovered that part of the reason why I have been successful at independent schools is due to life experiences that enabled me to build internal resiliency—i.e. being an immigrant, being a translator for my parents as a child, being the first in my family to go to college, being a woman in science. All of these opportunities to practice navigating being “one of a few” prepared me with a foundation of skills way before coming to work at an independent school. Therefore it was the finding of the impact of the intersectionality of identities that surprised me the most. I initially entered with race as the main lens of the study, and leave with an appreciation for the intersectionality of cultural identities. Though everyone is an individual,

there are still common experiences shared within groups. Additionally, intersectionality is not clear-cut, especially being that the aspect of one's identity that is most impactful in a given environment will vary based on a person's past experiences. Therefore, schools can nurture internal resiliency among faculty of color by reaffirming their experiences, and creating counter cultural spaces where people can share stories. I am honored to have been able to gather stories and share glimpses through the included quotes from faculty of color in this study. It is the personal stories gathered in this qualitative study that best inform the recommendations.

As best practices by NAIS and CAIS ask independent schools to strive to increase faculty diversity, this study aimed to examine effectiveness of current recruitment and retention practices, and shed further light on challenges faced by faculty of color who are underrepresented in majority white independent schools. At the beginning of this study I thought of recruitment and retention as two distinct areas, expecting to learn what schools can do better to improve retention of faculty of color, separately from how to improve their recruitment practices. Though there are areas specific to each aspect, this study has revealed that there is a lot of overlap in the two—that is recruitment practices are the first step in increasing retention, and since the initial interview interactions are key for both the candidate and the school in identifying the best match, schools need to see the relationship as interconnected: recruitment towards retention. The onboarding process, which starts with the initial interview, is key in a new faculty member's successful transition to a new school. Clear communication of the school's values, culture, and expectations of faculty are crucial in the interview phase as well as in the orientation to the school during the faculty member's first year. After presenting recommendations for independent schools based on the findings, I share limitations of the findings, and possible future research opportunities.

Recommendations for Independent Schools

The following recommendations are based on the findings from this study, which focused on recruitment and retention of faculty of color. However, several aspects will also certainly benefit the recruitment and retention of white faculty, as well.

Recommendations for school practice around recruitment of faculty of color

School leaders need to be vocal about their commitment to increasing faculty diversity. For proactive recruitment to be effective, school leaders need to lead conscious conversations with hiring committees about the goal to diversify faculty. Additionally, administrators need to address the need for professional development to support a school's diversity goals. Beyond diversity, the conversation needs to be about true inclusion and, therefore, schools are urged to commit to cultural competency training in understanding how to embrace diversity as a source of strength. In particular heads of schools need to speak up. Both NAIS and CAIS have guidelines that set expectations for their schools to promote diversity in their students and faculty. The NAIS Principles of Good Practice for Equity and Justice (Appendix F) articulate a number of standards that NAIS believes creates excellence in schools. Active leadership in communicating the true value of diversity, its necessity to strengthening the school's mission, and a commitment to ongoing professional development to better serve an increasingly diverse demographic is essential in setting the foundation to attract faculty of color as well as prospective families of color.

Schools need to do additional outreach to increase diversity in its candidate pool.

The questionnaire as well as the interview data revealed an overwhelming number of study participants suggesting that schools expand the net used in recruitment. Teachers interviewed suggested forming relationships with organizations where people of color are represented well

(i.e. HBCUs, ethnic fraternities, Black engineering society, etc.) and local schools of education.

While we live in one of the most diverse cities in the world, some independent schools currently rely only on the two main hiring firms for recruitment. These firms will likely send candidates from the east coast across country to interview for an opening here rather than do the local outreach necessary to increase diversity in the local applicant pool. Charles, one of the teachers interviewed relayed the following anecdote:

Once a head of school on a panel at PoCC about recruitment said “I just can’t find them,” and we are here, they are just not looking in the right places. If it wasn’t for the fact that I was already at a private school and knew about the traditional channels (Carney Sandoe & CalWest) I would not have ended up at my school. I’ve told them that. If someone sends in a cover letter & resume directly they may not get the same attention as those coming through the traditional channels.

The quote above alludes to a hierarchy in prioritization of candidates that come from the traditional channels of the hiring firms. Until these firms have a candidate pool reflective of our region’s diversity, the majority of candidates available for consideration through the traditional channels will likely be white. Therefore new channels of outreach need to be opened to increase the number of teachers of color that even know about teaching opportunities in independent schools.

Schools need to make their community’s valuing of diversity visible in the interview process. This recommendation is not meant to infer that schools exaggerate how diverse their community actually is, but it does mean that candidates get to meet with people that are good representatives of the school, and also that they get to hear about any values, goals, programming, professional development opportunities etc. that reflect the school’s commitment to diversity. Schools should be able to describe how those values live out at the school, which is particularly important when the ethnic diversity and/or commitment to multiculturalism in the curriculum is not visible at first glance when the candidate is walking through the school. If a

school has an administrator who is in charge of diversity strategic planning and program development (i.e. Director of Diversity, Director of Multiculturalism, Diversity & Inclusion Coordinator...etc.) that person should ideally be involved in the interview process to help convey this aspect of school life.

Including faculty and administrators of color in the interviewing process relays to candidates that the school values their involvement in the process. When schools have ethnic diversity present in the leadership of their school it is easier for candidates to visualize the possibility of their future growth and promotion opportunities at the school. Of course, candidates are not always thinking about future promotion at the interview phase, but even when their long-term plan is to stay in the classroom, having ethnic diversity in the school leadership conveys that the school embraces diversity beyond the “token” approach. An additional benefit, of visible diversity on the hiring team, is that it also creates opportunities for candidates to meet directly with people of color already working at the school. This in turn creates a space for candidates interested to ask current members of the community questions regarding their experience at the school as a person of color.

Schools need to examine and minimize unconscious bias in hiring practices. There needs to be a consistent hiring process, and a clear feedback process for the hiring committee so that candidates experience a fair evaluation. It is important for schools to examine unconscious biases that may influence hiring decisions. When biases are not examined they are more likely to impact procedures. For example, a majority white hiring team may have a subconscious affinity towards and a preferential bias toward white candidates that remind them of themselves. This bias, if unacknowledged, will present a challenge in hiring equally qualified candidates of color for openings. Similarly hiring teams may have a bias in preferring to interview candidates from

elite universities or those who already have independent school teaching experience, versus local state university graduate or public school teachers which limits the diversity of the applicant pool. Charles explained this phenomenon as he has seen it play out:

I think more of the conversation today, on the campus and nationally is around what role unconscious bias is playing in the country. Both in terms of policing, but in other areas as well. We're starting to talk about that, so I think that's one of the areas where some work could have been done. I think that also plays an important role in the hiring process when we look at resumes. We look at names on resumes, or schools that aren't top tier, or Ivy League. What role that bias plays in the hiring process in finding people that we're comfortable with, but that might not push or challenge us to grow.

Therefore, training of hiring committee members to ensure consistency in the interviewing and evaluation process is important in minimizing unconscious bias. This includes addressing any misconceptions associated with stereotypes of people of color. Increasing awareness of unconscious bias is a step towards addressing and minimizing its impact. Again this type of professional development, as well as all previous recommendations for school practice around recruitment, is another area where an a school can vastly benefit from having a skilled Director of Diversity, who can help design, implement, and sustain these components and related initiatives.

Recommendations for school practice around retention of faculty of color

Schools need to think of recruitment as the first step of retention, as candidates start the onboarding process in the initial interview. The orientation of a new faculty member to an independent school community starts with the initial interview. The first school representatives a candidate meets play a key role in initiating the introduction to the school culture, and giving an impression of the school community. Therefore, these school representatives should be mindful of how they are representing the school and realize that though they are assessing candidates, the

process is two-ways with candidates, in turn, assessing them as they are trying to get a sense of whether this school is one where they would want to work. To reduce anxiety for the candidates, school representatives should be honest in describing the school and the position being interviewed for, welcoming instead of interrogative, and transparent about the orientation and support systems available to new faculty. Once hired, the new faculty orientation should go beyond policies and procedures by including communication of the school culture and transparency of faculty expectations and feedback structures to support a successful first year.

Schools should create, and continuously evaluate to improve, formal faculty mentoring programs and professional development opportunities aimed to support new faculty as well as promote inclusive school environments. As the findings described, mentors and professional growth opportunities are factors that increase retention. Therefore, schools should put into place structures to support new faculty in their first year and also support continuous professional growth beyond the first year. Ideally, professional development opportunities would extend beyond content areas and include opportunities for faculty to develop conflict resolution and cross cultural competency and communication skills. If school set expectations for their entire faculty to grow in these areas, the school as a whole will become more inclusive spaces and be better prepared to welcome and serve future families and teachers of color. Also, schools that have mentoring programs should clarify goals of their programs, provide clear expectations to the mentors, and ask mentees about the program's effectiveness at the end of their first year. Additionally, most schools seemed to pair new faculty members with a mentor from their same department when someone outside of the department may be a better fit depending on the personality and needs of the new faculty member. Therefore, schools should reevaluate their mentoring program and ensure a more consistent experience by providing clear

expectations, and necessary orientation and support training, for mentors to be able to maximize their impact.

Faculty of color affinity groups should also be supported, though depending on the level of interest and number of faculty of color at a given school that are interested there may also be a need to establish connections across schools. Schools are encouraged to support faculty participation in SoCal POCIS and PoCC. SoCal POCIS is a regional organization that offers a few events for their sponsoring schools every year, one of those being an affinity group workshop in the fall. Additionally PoCC was mentioned by several faculty interviewed as a source of rejuvenation. This national conference has as one of its primary goals the support of people of color in independent schools. In the quote below Michelle describes the impact of the conference affinity group experience that she looks forward to annually:

Well, I think affinity groups are great thing, and I think that there should be more of them. The people of color conference absolutely was a huge part of my retention. I mean in my early years I had my TOC, my teachers of color group and I had the PoCC [People of Color Conference] and I looked forwards to those moments of connecting, walking around a sea of people of color and feeling fed and feeling even though in my workplaces I was not alone. I was not the only person of color, but being one of the few in both schools I've worked, and the amazing feeling of being surrounded by other educators of color who are going through some of the same stuff. It is just so important. I think that's just huge, finding a way to create that space in your school and outside your school.

Overall each school needs to do it's own self-reflection by creating a safe process for faculty of color to provide feedback regarding which support structures are best suited to meet the needs of their current faculty.

Schools need to evaluate and increase effectiveness of onboarding and feedback structure in supporting new faculty transition. In addition to providing a new faculty orientation and a mentoring program, schools should also build in a check-in process with an administrator proactively reaching out to new faculty in their first year to assess what individual

challenges, if any, that teacher is having in order for the school to respond with the appropriate support. Though a department chair is usually the one checking and providing feedback in regards to new hires teaching the first year, it would be ideal if another administrator that the faculty member has established a relationship with can also be responsible for checking in as far as the cultural transition to a new school. Ideally, the assigned mentor is another resource for orienting the new faculty member to the school; however, the quality of the mentoring relationship can vary depending on personality differences and time commitment made to it. An evaluation process for the mentoring program should happen every year to gather feedback from both the mentors and the mentees. Particularly, the feedback from the mentees should be used to create clearer expectations for the mentors as well as providing guidance for a mentor orientation and/or redesign of the process used for mentor-mentee pairing assignments.

Additionally, schools with a religious affiliation need to include an additional layer of orientation covering how religious values influence school culture and impact teacher expectations. This is particularly important for teachers that don't have the same religious self-identification as the school and, therefore, may have less personal experience to draw from. Rebecca, who works at a religiously affiliated school, described reaching out to a new faculty member who was struggling to get used to the school culture,

We were talking and I remember reaching out to him because I remember what it was like as a first year teacher and him not really knowing anybody on the trip so I just went over to him and I introduced myself and we were just chatting a little bit and then he said to me "How long does it take to get used to all of this?" And I remember asking him "What do you mean?" And he's like "Getting used to all these things that happen that they do." Just the [religious/cultural] activities and I said to him "Eventually it becomes normal to you." Because it does. It becomes part of the day to day and it does get easier but I think that for teachers who identify with that culture, it's less of a transition, I think the transition is harder if you don't necessarily identify with the culture.

This anecdote conveys well the feeling of an underrepresented faculty member whose experience

is in a way unintentionally, of course, overlooked by the school which has a clear majority of students and faculty from the same religious and ethnic background. Continuous evaluation of the effectiveness of all orientation and retention support systems is necessary to adapt them to best meet changing needs from year to year, but also to best meet individual needs.

Limitations

One limitation of this study is the lack of gender diversity in the administrator interviews, which were all with female administrators. Though some male administrators were invited to participate, none of them volunteered within the time frame of that phase of the study. Two white male administrators did respond to my email invitation several weeks later, but at that point I had already moved on to the faculty interview phase of the study. Additionally, the fact that the majority of administrators interviewed were people of color is also not representative of the majority of independent school administrators who are mostly white males. This raises a question of the validity in the administrator data being representative of the actual broader administrator perception and support around faculty diversity efforts. A larger administrator group with greater gender and less racial diversity would have been more reflective of our current school leadership demographics. However, the experience and demonstrated commitment towards diversifying faculty of the administrators interviewed led to their selection for the study, and, therefore, they represent active school leaders that served as excellent resources in informing this study. It also seems logical that this group was more eager to talk about their successes and challenges around this topic due to their personal connection to being from underrepresented groups themselves. Therefore they had professional experience as a school administrator, as well as personal experiences as female administrators and people of

color in independent schools to draw from during the interview.

Another limitation is that I did not interview faculty that left and were no longer in independent schools which may have provided more insights to areas where faculty of color believed they lacked support within, or connection to, those school communities resulting in their decision to leave. However, the biggest limitation in generalizing the results broadly is that each independent school is a unique entity with overlapping aspects yet with distinct school cultures. Therefore, while this study was meant to be a regional analysis there are subtleties to large variations in experiences of faculty of color from school to school around recruitment and retention. The triangulation of data from the administrator interviews, faculty questionnaires, and faculty interviews allowed for identification of common themes and prioritization of general recommendations.

Areas of Future Research

The alumni faculty experience in independent schools

Alumni of color that go into education are sometimes drawn to working in independent schools due to their experience there as students. A benefit of hiring alumni is that they are already familiar with the school culture. Rebecca, who was an alumna of the first school she worked at, explained how being an alumna can serve as an advantage to navigating independent school culture:

I think if you're totally unfamiliar with independent schools from the get-go when you first start teaching at one of these independent schools it's a big culture shock. It can be very intimidating because it's such a different environment, for me I was already used to that environment so I knew what to expect so the transition wasn't as difficult but I'm just thinking back to when I started as a student in independent schools and I could imagine that that's similar to what the experiences a new teacher in an independent school must be like. I almost feel like I had an advantage because I did go to an independent school so I know what it was all about. It's not easy, you're thrown into this environment that almost

seems like surreal, the amount of resources and wealth that exists that isn't part of your day-to-day reality outside of this world. So I think that in itself is probably something that can be shocking to someone who is not used to that type of workplace.

Independent schools should explore identifying students who are interested in entering the education field one day and get to know them, possibly mentor them to eventually becoming a teacher there. Another alumna mentioned that if someone had reached out to her from her alma mater when she was a recent college graduate, she would have jumped on the opportunity to work there immediately.

Brynnen, the youngest of the teachers interviewed, explained that she returned to independent schools because “it’s a world I’m comfortable with... I think I chose to stay in independent schools at this point because of my experience in them, which was pretty traumatic.” In her case it was negative experiences faced as one of the only students of color at her school that gave her the motivation to return to be the voice for students in similar situations. Further research on the experiences of alumni teachers of color can provide further insights on how to recruit teacher candidates from that potential group of applicants to increase diversity in the applicant pool.

Specific ethnic group experience—Asian American vs. Latino vs. Multiracial

The constraints of this study did not allow for a thorough examination of unique experiences that may arise in different ethnic groups. Janice, an Asian teacher interviewed, mentioned the “model minority” stereotype impacting her experience differently from how she saw other faculty of color treated and talked about. Janice shared,

I don't think an African-American teacher could have blended in the way [I did]- as easily. Just because being black sticks out more I think in our community, I think ... The whole idea of model minority. I feel like that's part of the reason why I was hired was because they needed a teacher of color, and it was safer to go with the Asian teacher than

any other teacher of color because I didn't see anybody else. There are very few other teachers of color now ... We have one, two, three, three Asian teachers.

She went on to share about an experience her first year where other faculty were talking about a black student and made a stereotypical remark in front of her that made her realize that she was not seen by them as a person of color. The majority of respondents in the faculty of color questionnaire were Asian but there was not a large enough sample size of the other groups in this study to disaggregate data by ethnic groups in order to analyze for differences between groups.

Considering that Latinos are the largest ethnic group in Los Angeles, and in Southern California, they are greatly underrepresented in the student body and faculty of independent schools. Though schools are making an effort to recruit more Latino students, it can be noted that culturally, especially for first generation independent school families, the faculty diversity present at a school is one factor that can influence parent's decision to let their child attend an independent school. Therefore, further research examining the Latino faculty experience in independent schools, can give more insights on the great cultural and racial diversity (i.e. some Latinos identify may identify racially as white and some as Black, reflective of the group's wide range of skin colors) of this group and how that impacts individual's experiences. As schools focus on diversifying their student bodies, further attention to the increasing numbers and diversity of their Latino faculty will help support a more inclusive school community for a diverse group of Latino students and parents.

Additionally, multiracial faculty participants discussed their experience being bicultural as an advantage in "code-switching" within an independent school culture. One multiracial faculty discussed experiences growing up always feeling a little different from either side of his family. Therefore, the feeling of being different than the majority of those around him is one he was used to, in turn potentially increasing his resiliency in navigating a school community where

he is one of a few faculty of color. Another important distinction between multiracial faculty, particularly those with white heritage is the experience of not always being readily identified physically as a person of color. Some multiracial faculty are able to “pass” as white and/or their lighter skin or hair color, straighter hair or other white associated physical characteristics lead to increased group affiliation among white colleagues. Since the future of our student body, and therefore, the future of our teacher candidate pool, is increasingly multiracial, special attention to the experiences of the multiracial community experience should be an area of interest for our schools.

Future studies can explore each ethnic group individually to better identify unique challenges that may distinguish the experience of different ethnic groups on our independent school campuses and, therefore, shed more light on recruitment and retention practices tailored to different needs dependent on the make up of each school community.

Impact of the intersectionality of other layers of identity with racial identity of teachers

Finally, another area of potential research is the intersectionality of other layers of identity with the racial identity of teachers. Though people of color in independent schools as a group have common experiences, there is great variation on the individual level as far as personality traits that influence resiliency, as well as in the dominant aspect of identity that impacts the day to day experience of individuals. For example, age, and similarly the number of years of experience, can impact how well individuals can navigate challenges faced. Faculty interviewed with more years of experience were able to speak more about strategies and skills learned in dealing with the experiences related to being underrepresented on campus, while younger faculty tended to focus on the personal impact felt and isolation due to negative interactions and microaggressions experienced.

Additionally, not all people of color struggle with racial identity as the most impactful aspect of their identity within an independent school climate. Daniel described himself as a “double minority” in being a gay multiracial man. He discussed that he had experienced isolation more around his identity as a gay man, but acknowledged that he is not always visibly recognized as a person of color. Similarly, gender can be a more impactful aspect of identity for a woman who is the only one in her department or administrative team, or for a male teacher in a majority female elementary school.

Finally, another aspect of identity that can be more salient is group identification with a lower socioeconomic group/neighborhood, or public school students, that can contrast sharply with the affluent culture of private independent schools. Some of the teachers interviewed described feelings of not serving their communities and expressing guilt related to that decision. In addressing guilt experienced in working for an affluent, privileged community instead of a community more reflective of the one they grew up in (i.e. more diverse, and/or one seen as more in need), some faculty of color rationalize their decision to work in independent schools. The following quote, from Mike a teacher that has worked in independent schools for over 20 years, conveys the emotional conflict between being called to work in “his community” and acknowledging the great impact of staying at his independent school for students he does share a group identity with:

Deep down inside, I know I'm not teaching students who were like me when I grew up, not very many. I grew up in a gang neighborhood. Single mom, the whole story, the whole stereotypical story in a way. I'm playing it safe by being here. I know that I can be out somewhere, perhaps inspiring kids who grew up a lot more like me but this is a very safe, comfortable, easy environment. It's a place that anyone would want to work at but I'm not necessarily teaching the population that I've known. I wanted to be a teacher since seventh grade. I'm not teaching the population of people that I thought I'd be teaching. I don't think about it too often but when I do think about it, I feel as though I'm not making as much of a difference as I could. I am pretty confident I'm making a difference in the students who I work with. But, there's a feeling of, I could perhaps be making an even

bigger impact or even more meaningful impact at a different place. On the other hand, we do pull kids in from Compton and Long Beach and Inglewood and Lawndale and the surrounding areas. I keep an eye out for those kids. Those kids, oftentimes, they're here for the same reason that I am. This is a safe environment. It's a high-functioning environment. Parents value that but that doesn't make their being here easy. In fact, it can be just as difficult for a different reason to be in a school where they are clearly the minority. Also, going to a school outside their neighborhood where they are perceived by their neighbors as being different just because they go to [an elite independent school]. I'm here for those kids too.

As the teacher above describes, reminding himself about his role in supporting students of color from low to middle-class communities, is an example of a strategy that some teachers of color who stay in independent schools develop. They themselves of the important role and work, as people of color, they have in independent schools. Another value that people of color bring to schools is breaking stereotypes of their groups, in some cases being the first professional of their ethnic group that students meet. Brynennen, a multiracial teacher, describes the impact her presence has on her white students:

The best part is knowing I can make a complete difference in a child's mind. Just interacting with me, it means every time you think of, let's say a Black person or a Latina, you might think of your teacher, who's bright and smart and funny and not someone on the nightly news, or not the idea of an immigrant immediately being something that's negative or the idea of a Black person being negative or scary. That there's a possibility, that is, that I can break the stereotype in their minds. And when people ask me how can I choose to teach the population I teach verses "my own people", which is a difficult word choice because I feel like that they assume that all people of color are poor or all people of color don't have the right access to good education. I understand the larger statistics within that, but we still do have children of color and families of color who can pay and give their kids this type of education.

It is notable that the last part of quote above also addresses assumptions that people of color can't afford independent schools. While they are certainly underrepresented, Brynennen acknowledges that there are children of color in independent schools, and not all are in need of financial aid.

Another common theme in how teachers of color overcome this feeling of guilt, is in acknowledging the opportunity to impact the future influence and values of the privileged population they serve. Janice describes how working in an independent school provides her the opportunity to directly impact future leaders, and shared how the headmaster used the following rationale to recruit her when she first interviewed her:

The headmaster told me at the time that these are going to be our future leaders. A lot of these kids are going to be our future leaders, and so if you hope to influence them now, so they can have that trickle down effect and hopefully make changes up there when they are in these positions of power because a lot of them are that 1%, and unfortunately, they're the ones that make a lot of decisions in a lot of areas. That helped alleviate some of my guilt because I knew that. These kids, they have good teachers, they have good facilities. I think it was just one of those things where- I still struggle with it. It's not that it's passed. It's just that I just know that I'm making more of a difference here than I ever would be back in [public schools]... unless I go to the district offices, which I don't want to do.

Finally, Michelle, who at the beginning of her career felt the pressure as a teacher of color to go teach in public schools where there are more students of color, offered a summary of the emotional rollercoaster some teachers of color go through in choosing to go to, and then to stay in, independent schools:

Suddenly, I went through a feeling of confused guilt, from choosing, from thinking I might choose to be at independent schools to a definite, this is where I belong very clearly. This is the work that I am supposed to be doing and what would happen if there were no teachers of color in independent schools. It is completely necessary.

Therefore further research in identifying, and how best to nurture, resilient personality characteristics in faculty that help take feelings of guilt and disassociation transform them to feelings of commitment, a call to duty, would be another valuable future area of study.

Final Remarks

In conclusion, this study showed that teacher candidates may at times decide to go to schools where they don't have/get all their highest priority factors met (i.e. salary & benefits, class size, geographic location, faculty and student diversity, etc.). The list of highest priority factors varies from person to person, but as a group the data show that faculty diversity, student diversity and commitment to professional development to allow for ongoing growth- on the personal and community level- are aspects that are of high value to candidates of color. Resilient candidates may still be successful at schools where they face challenges and cultural conflicts, but contentment and fulfillment happens only when a majority of a candidate's personal values/goals align with those of the school. Therefore, the recruitment phase is critical in exploring this alignment, and support systems are important in increasing retention after hiring. Ultimately a school's commitment to diversity has to be supported by the school leadership, which must take proactive measures in creating ongoing conversations, education for the community to address misconceptions around diversity, articulation that diversity strengthens teams, and finally thoughtful recruitment and retention procedures and systems in place to truly live out their school's commitment to diversity.

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A: Administrator Interview Protocol

Research Questions

1. According to administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do independent schools use to effectively recruit and retain faculty of color?
2. What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school?
3. What challenges regarding retention decision, if any, do faculty of color encounter at independent schools?

Rationale / RQ connection	Question (probing/follow up question indented)
Demographic Data	1. How many years of administrative experience do you currently have?
	2. How many of those years have been in independent schools?
	3. What is your ethnic identification?
RQ#1 & #2	4. Did you attend an independent school as a student? -If so, how did that influence your decision to work in independent schools? -How did that contribute to your preparation to work in independent schools, if at all? -If not, in your opinion, do you think that candidates that attended independent schools may be influenced to work in independent schools due to that experience?
RQ #1	5. How involved are you in the faculty hiring process at your school? What role do you play?
RQ #1	6. Who oversees the hiring process at your school? Who else gives input in the hiring decision? -Do these groups get any training? Any cultural competency training?
RQ #1 & #3	7. Does your current school have any recruitment or retention practices in place that influence a candidate's decision to work here?
RQ #1 & #3	8. How does your student ethnic diversity compare to your faculty ethnic diversity? -Is there a goal to have them be closer to each other? To have the faculty of color percentage more closely reflect the percentage of students of color?
RQ #1 & #3	9. Do you feel that faculty of color may bring a cultural competency that benefits students? In knowing/interacting with students of color?

RQ #1 & #3	10. Would you say there is a proactive effort to recruit qualified candidates from diverse backgrounds for each faculty opening?
RQ #1	11. How challenged are you in dealing with issues of diversity? Do you face impediments to using your voice in advocating for diversity?
RQ #3	12. How does your school foster personal relationships and connections within the community in the faculty member's first year?
RQ #3	13. Does your school have a formal or informal mentoring program for new faculty? -If so, what are the best aspects? What are areas of improvement?
RQ #3	14. In your opinion are there unique challenges faced by faculty of color in independent schools? If so, what are they?
RQ #3	15. In your opinion, what is the most challenging aspect of working at your school for faculty of color?
RQ #3	16. Are there any stories you can share, that you experienced or witnessed, that demonstrate how faculty of color experience independent schools differently from white colleagues?
RQ #1	17. How can independent schools recruit teachers of color more effectively?
RQ #1 & #3	18. How can independent schools retain teachers of color more effectively?

Appendix B: Faculty of Color Questionnaire

Faculty of Color Recruitment and Retention Questionnaire

Thank you for taking the time to complete this questionnaire aimed to identify effective practices related to recruitment and retention of faculty of color in Southern California independent schools. The questionnaire should take you between 5-10 minutes to complete. All information provided in this questionnaire will remain confidential and findings will be summarized and reported in aggregate form.

*** Required**

1. Which of the following best describes your main role? *

- ☐ Faculty
- ☐ Administrator who also teaches as part of the faculty (only select if you teach less than 50% of a full-time teaching load)
- ☐ Other:

2a. Please select ALL descriptors that describe the type of independent school you are currently working in. *

Please check all that apply.

- ☐ Elementary only
- ☐ High School only
- ☐ K-12th
- ☐ Religious Affiliation (i.e. Christian, Catholic, Episcopal, Jewish etc.)
- ☐ Boarding school
- ☐ Other:

2b. Please indicate if your school is located within or outside of Los Angeles County. *

This study is focused on southern California schools due to the demographic diversity of the region, and due to the study being conducted out of UCLA. Previous research studies on recruitment and retention of teachers of color in independent schools have occurred on the east coast, so this will be the first study of this kind focused on this region.

- ☐ Located inside Los Angeles County
- ☐ Located in Southern California, but outside of Los Angeles County
- ☐ Other:

3. Please rate your satisfaction with your independent school in each area: *

	Very Dissatisfied	Dissatisfied	Neutral	Satisfied	Very Satisfied
Overall sense of community among students	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Overall sense of community among faculty	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Racial/ethnic diversity of the faculty	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Racial/ethnic diversity of the student body	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Atmosphere for political differences	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Atmosphere for differences in sexual orientation	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Atmosphere for religious differences	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Socioeconomic diversity of the student body	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Administrative response to incidents of bias, microaggressions, and bullying.	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Administration's commitment to regularly speaking about the value of diversity.	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐

Faculty Background Questions

4a. Which grade levels do you teach in? *

Please check all that apply.

- ☐ K-3
- ☐ 4-6
- ☐ 7-8
- ☐ 9-12

4b. What department do you teach in: *

If you teach in multiple departments check the department that represents the majority of your courses.

- ☐ English
- ☐ Visual Arts or Performing Arts
- ☐ Science
- ☐ Math
- ☐ World Languages or Foreign Languages
- ☐ Computer Science
- ☐ History
- ☐ Other:

4c. How many years of teaching experience do you currently have? *

Please count the current year.

- ☐ 1-2 years
- ☐ 3-5 years
- ☐ 6-10 years
- ☐ 11-15 years
- ☐ 16-20 years
- ☐ over 20 years

4d. How many different schools have you worked in? *

Full-time working years only. Please do not count any years of student teaching.

4e. How many years have you worked in your current main role at your current school site? *

Recruitment Related Questions

The following group of questions are aimed at assessing factors independent school teacher candidates consider in selecting their work site as well as perceptions by current faculty on effective recruitment practices. Please read each statement carefully and indicate on the scale of 1-5 how strongly you agree with each statement.

5. It is important for me to work at a school that values student diversity. *

Diversity can include: racial, ethnic, religious, socioeconomic, ability, gender identity & expression, and sexual orientation.

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

6. How students of color experience, and are supported in, independent schools impacts my decision to work at my school. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

7. The inclusion of a socioeconomic range of students impacts my decision to work at my school. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

8. It is important for me to work at a school that values faculty diversity. *

Diversity can include: racial, ethnic, religious, socioeconomic, ability, gender identity & expression, and sexual orientation.

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

9. In reflecting on questions 5 - 8, do you have specific examples you would like to share to support, or further explain, your selections above?

10a. When choosing a school site to work at, please rank each of the following factors considered by faculty candidates in making their decision to indicate their relative priority:

★

Though priorities will vary between individual candidates, please answer this question based on your experience.

	Not important- Did not impact my decision	Less Important	Somewhat Important	Important	Most important (Top 3)
Average class size	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
New faculty support provided	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Faculty diversity	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Student diversity	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Professional development opportunities	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Mission statement of the school	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Interview day experience	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Salary and benefits	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐

	Not important- Did not impact my decision	Less Important	Somewhat Important	Important	Most important (Top 3)
Opportunities for faculty to get involved with aspects of school life beyond their teaching responsibilities	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
Geographic location of school (demographics of that neighborhood community)	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐

10b. Are there any other important factors considered by faculty candidates in making their decision that are not listed above? If so please list and describe below.

Though priorities will vary between individual teachers, please answer this question based on your experience.

11. As you were interviewing at different schools were there any key incidents or interactions that influenced you to decide to take, or not take, the job at that school?

12. In your opinion, how can independent schools RECRUIT teachers of color more effectively? *

Retention Related Questions

The following group of questions are aimed at assessing factors that may impact independent school faculty retention. Please read each statement carefully and indicate on the scale of 1-5 how strongly you agree with each statement.

13. My school has effective structures and programs in place to help support teachers in their first year at our school. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

14. I felt welcomed and supported when I first started working at my current school. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

15. My school provides/assigns a mentor to new faculty. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

16. I feel valued at my current work place. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

17. I currently have colleagues on my school campus that I can go to to for advice when facing a challenging work situation. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

18. Faculty of color experience independent schools differently from their white colleagues. *

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

19. In reflecting on questions 13 - 18, do you have specific examples you would like to share to support, or further explain, your selections above?

20. I have observed, or experienced, microaggressions at my school. *

The theory of microaggressions usually revolves around perceived demeaning implications and other subtle insults against other people, and may be perpetrated against those due to gender, race, sexual orientation, and ability status etc. (Those who inflict microaggressions are often unaware that they have done anything to harm another person.)

1 2 3 4 5

Strongly Disagree ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ ☐ Strongly Agree

21. In reflecting on question 20, please share examples of any racial microaggression(s) you have experienced or observed at your worksite.

Definition of racial microaggression: Racial microaggressions are brief and commonplace daily verbal, behavioral, or environmental indignities, whether intentional or unintentional, that communicate hostile, derogatory, or negative racial slights and insults towards people of color. (Those who inflict racial microaggressions are often unaware that they have done anything to harm another person.)

22. In your opinion, how can independent schools RETAIN teachers of color more effectively? *

Demographic Questions

You're almost done! Please answer the following demographic questions that will allow survey data to be sorted and analyzed in multiple ways.

23. Gender: *

- ☐ Male
- ☐ Female
- ☐ Non-binary

24. Ethnicity (options listed are based on the descriptors used by the National Association of Independent Schools) *

Please check the box (or boxes) that allows you to best self-identify your race and ethnicity. The categories listed below are the ones used to report data to NAIS.

- ☐ Black or African American
- ☐ Hispanic or Latino
- ☐ Asian
- ☐ Middle Eastern
- ☐ Two or More Races
- ☐ Native Hawaiin or other Pacific Islander
- ☐ American Indian or Alaskan Native
- ☐ White

25. Did you ever attend a private or an independent school (K-12th) as a student? *

- ☐ Yes
- ☐ No

26a. If you did attend a private or an independent school as a student, how do you feel that impacted your decision/commitment to work in an independent school?

- ☐ Not at All
- ☐ Somewhat
- ☐ Very Much

26b. Please use the space below to further explain your selection above:

Interview Invitation

The next phase of this study includes one-on-one interviews with faculty of color. The researcher will aim to interview a group representative of the larger sample population, therefore not all volunteers will be contacted. Thank you in advance for your consideration.

Would you be interested in participating in a one-on-one interview as part of the second phase of the study?

If interviewed you will receive a \$25 gift card to iTunes as a thank you for your time.

- ☐ No, Thank You
- ☐ Yes I am willing to be interviewed (you will be directed to a separate page to enter in your contact information)

Contact Information for Interview

Please supply the information below to express interest in participating in a 45 min one-on-one interview. Interviews may be conducted at UCLA, at your school site, or other convenient location based on your availability. Additionally, if selected to be interviewed you will receive a \$25 iTunes gift card as a thank you for your time. Interview data will remain confidential and will not be used in any way that would negatively harm participants. Not all volunteers will be contacted. The study will aim to interview a group representative of the larger sample population. Thank you in advance for your consideration.

First & Last Name: *

Email Address: *

Telephone Number:

Initial communication will be attempted by email first, but a telephone number is requested as an additional means of contact.

If you provided a telephone number above, what is the best time to reach you?

- ☒ morning (9-12)
- ☐ mid-day (3-5)
- ☐ Evening (5-8)
- ☐ no preference

Appendix C: Faculty of Color Interview Protocol

Research Questions

1. According to administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do independent schools use to effectively recruit and retain faculty of color?
2. What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school?
3. What challenges regarding retention decision, if any, do faculty of color encounter at independent schools?

Rationale / RQ connection	Question (probing/follow up questions indented)
Demographic Data	1. How long have you worked as a teacher? -How many years of those have been in independent schools? -Did you have any other careers before becoming a teacher?
	2. What is your ethnic identification?
RQ #2	3. Did you attend an independent school as a student? -If so, how did that influence your decision to work in independent schools? -How did it contribute to your preparation to work in independent schools, if at all?
RQ #2 & #3	4. Did you previously work at another independent school? -Why did you leave that school?
RQ #2	5. Why did you choose to work at your current school? -What aspects of the hiring process were most meaningful to you? Why? -What were the most important factors you considered in your decision? -As you were interviewing at different schools were there any key incidents or interactions that influenced you to decide to take, or not take, the job at a school?
RQ #2 & 3	6. Does your current school have any recruitment or retention practices in place that influenced your decision to work there?
RQ #3	7. What is the best part of working at your school for you?
RQ #3	8. How does your school foster personal relationships and connections within the community in a faculty member's first year?
RQ #3	9. Does your school have a formal or informal mentoring program for new faculty? -If so, what are the best aspects? What are areas of improvement?

RQ #3	10. In your opinion are there unique challenges faced by faculty of color in independent schools? If so, what are they? - What is the most challenging aspect of working at your school for you?
RQ #3	11. Are there any stories you can share, that you experienced or witnessed, that demonstrate how faculty of color experience independent schools differently from white colleagues?
RQ #2	12. How can independent schools recruit teachers of color more effectively?
RQ #3	13. How can independent schools retain teachers of color more effectively?

Appendix D: NAIS Facts at a Glance 2014-2015

Independent School Facts At A Glance for: The National Association of Independent Schools (NAIS)											
1,093 NAIS Member schools responded to the Annual DASL Statistics Survey for the 2014-2015 Academic year. (Please note that these statistics are based upon the schools that provided information for each specific survey. Not all schools responded to every single category).											
Dashes indicate data not submitted or collected. * Extreme data outliers have been removed.											
INDICATORS PROFILE				ALL NAIS SCHOOLS							
				2014-2015 Day Schools		2014-2015 Boarding Schools		2014-2015 All Schools			
School Count				898		195					1,093
Total Enrollment				472,052		81,412					553,464
Average Enrollment				526		417					506
Median Enrollment				417		311					396
Total Enrollment of Students of Color				123,301		21,274					144,575
Enrollment of Students of Color as % Total Enrollment				28.9%		29.7%					29.0%
Percentage of African American Students				6.2%		6.7%					6.3%
Percentage of Hispanic American Students				4.5%		3.9%					4.4%
Percentage of Asian American Students				8.7%		5.7%					8.3%
Percentage of Native American Students				0.3%		0.4%					0.3%
Percentage of Pacific Islander American Students				0.3%		7.7%					1.3%
Percentage of Multiracial American Students				7.4%		4.6%					7.0%
Percentage of Middle Eastern American Students				1.4%		0.8%					1.4%
Percentage of International Students				1.6%		14.3%					3.4%
Percentage of Unsure about diversity				3.5%		2.4%					3.3%
Percentage of European American Students				66.1%		53.5%					64.3%
Total Faculty as % of Total Staff				52.7%		36.5%					49.3%
Total Faculty of Color as % of Total Faculty				12.8%		15.1%					13.1%
Total Administrative Staff as % of Total Staff				16.1%		18.6%					16.7%
Total Administrators of Color as % of Total Administrators				12.5%		8.9%					11.7%
Total Instructional Support as % of Total Staff				11.3%		10.5%					11.1%
Total Instructional Support of Color as % of Total Instructional Support Staff				16.2%		17.1%					16.5%
Total Other Staff as % of Total Staff				20.0%		36.0%					23.4%
Total Other Staff Of Color as % of Total Other Staff				30.3%		21.0%					26.8%

Data table adapted from: <https://www.nais.org/Statistics/Pages/NAIS-Independent-School-Facts-at-a-Glance.aspx>

Appendix E: CAIS Facts at a Glance 2014-2015

Independent School Facts At A Glance for: California Association of Independent Schools (CAIS-CA)				
160 CAIS-CA schools responded to the Annual DASL Statistics Survey for the 2014-2015 academic year. (Please note that these statistics are based upon the schools that provided information for each specific survey. Not all schools responded to every single category).				
<i>Dashes indicate data not submitted or collected. * Extreme data outliers have been removed.</i>		All Association Member Schools		
INDICATORS PROFILE		2014-2015 All Schools		
Total Enrollment of Students of Color				23,187
Enrollment of Students of Color as % Total Enrollment				37.6%
Percentage of African American Students				4.0%
Percentage of Hispanic American Students				5.8%
Percentage of Asian American Students				12.7%
Percentage of Native American Students				0.2%
Percentage of Pacific Islander American Students				0.2%
Percentage of Multiracial American Students				11.9%
Percentage of Middle Eastern American Students				2.8%
Percentage of International Students				2.3%
Percentage of Unsure about diversity				5.4%
Percentage of European American Students				54.7%
Total Faculty as % of Total Staff				50.1%
Total Faculty of Color as % of Total Faculty				18.6%
Total Administrative Staff as % of Total Staff				17.3%
Total Administrators of Color as % of Total Administrators				19.9%
Total Instructional Support as % of Total Staff				12.2%
Total Instructional Support of Color as % of Total Instructional Support Staff				28.0%
Total Other Staff as % of Total Staff				20.6%
Total Other Staff Of Color as % of Total Other Staff				43.9%

Data table from: <http://www.nais.org/Statistics/Pages/California-Association-of-Independent-Schools.aspx>

Appendix F: NAIS Principles of Good Practice for Equity and Justice

National Association of Independent Schools PRINCIPLES OF GOOD PRACTICE

EQUITY AND JUSTICE

PREAMBLE: The following principles provide common ground for interaction between independent school professionals and their many constituents (parents, students, colleagues at other schools, and the public). The NAIS Principles of Good Practice for member schools define high standards and ethical behavior in key areas of school operations to guide schools in becoming the best education communities they can be, to embed the expectation of professionalism, and to further our sector's core values of transparency, excellence, and inclusivity. Accordingly, membership in NAIS is contingent upon agreement to abide by "the spirit" of the PGPs. (See "General Considerations Regarding NAIS Principles of Good Practice" on the NAIS Website.)

OVERVIEW: *NAIS schools value the representation and full engagement of individuals whose differences include—but are not limited to—age, ethnicity, family makeup, gender, learning style, physical ability, race, religion, sexual orientation, and socioeconomic status. NAIS welcomes and celebrates the diversity of our member schools; we expect member schools to create and sustain diverse, inclusive, equitable, and just communities that are safe and welcoming for all; we recognize to do so requires commitment, reflection, deliberate planning and action, and ongoing accountability. The following NAIS Principles of Good Practice for Equity and Justice provide the foundation for such an independent school community.*

1. The school establishes the foundations for its commitment to equity and justice in its defining documents (mission, core value, and/or philosophy statements).
2. The school respects, affirms, and protects the dignity and worth of each member of its community.
3. The board of trustees and the head of school articulate strategic goals and objectives that promote diversity, inclusion, equity, and justice in the life of the school.
4. The school develops meaningful requirements for cross-cultural competency and provides training and support for all members of its community, including the board of trustees, parents, students, and all school personnel.
5. The board of trustees and the head of school keep the school accountable for living its mission by periodically monitoring and assessing school culture and ongoing efforts in admission, hiring, retention, financial aid, and curriculum development.
6. The school works deliberately to ensure that the board of trustees, administration, faculty, staff, and student body reflect the diversity that is present in the rapidly changing and increasingly diverse school-age population in our country.
7. The head of school ensures that diversity initiatives are coordinated and led by a designated individual who is a member of one of the school leadership teams, with the training, authority, and support needed to influence key areas of policy development, decision-making, budget, and management.
8. The school uses inclusive language in all written, electronic, and oral communication.
9. The school adopts a non-discrimination statement applicable to the administration of all of its programs and policies, in full compliance with local, state, and federal law. That said, the school makes the law the floor, not the ceiling, for establishing itself as a diverse, inclusive, safe, and welcoming community for all students, staff, and families.

Appendix G: Recruitment Emails

Email forwarded to SoCal POCIS listserv by Olivia Brown:

From: Olivia Brown <manzanaytu@gmail.com>

Date: Thursday, February 19, 2015 at 10:49 AM

Dear All,

It is with great pride that I forward this request for participation in Rosa Dominguez's request. Rosa is in her final work toward her Doctorate and I hope you can help her out.

Thanks so much,

Olivia

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Rosa Dominguez <rosadominguez@ucla.edu>

Date: Sun, Feb 15, 2015 at 9:23 AM

Subject: Invitation to participate in Recruitment and Retention of Faculty of Color study

To: manzanaytu@gmail.com

Dear SoCal POCIS members,

My name is Rosa Dominguez and I am a doctoral student at UCLA's Graduate School of Education & Information Studies. Some of you may also know me as the Director of Diversity at Campbell Hall or through my SoCal POCIS volunteer work, however I am now writing to you independently of those roles and in the capacity of a graduate student researcher only. My dissertation study is looking at **effective recruitment and retention of faculty of color in independent schools located within Los Angeles County and I want to invite you all to participate in one of the following ways:**

- **If you identify as a faculty of color that works at an independent school located in the Los Angeles county area, I invite you to take a few minutes to participate by completing the online questionnaire found at the following link:** <http://bit.ly/RR2015>. The questionnaire data will help inform effective practices around recruitment and retention of faculty of color, as well as provide insights for faculty interviews. The questionnaire will take less than 10 minutes to complete and will be completely confidential.
- **Forward this email and share the questionnaire link with faculty of color in your school** (in LA county area), and in your professional network to invite them to participate by filling it out. Again participation will remain completely confidential.
- At the end of the online questionnaire you will also have the opportunity, to **volunteer to be interviewed** (February-March) for the study. To volunteer to be interviewed you will be asked to provide contact information, but contact information will be stored separately from the rest of the questionnaire data. Those selected to participate in a 30-45 minute interview will receive a \$25 iTunes gift card for their participation. All interviewee personal information will be kept confidential.

The main research questions that will be answered by this study are:

1. According to school administrators, what structures and practices, if any, do

independent schools use to recruit and retain faculty of color?

2. What factors do faculty of color consider in choosing to work at an independent school?

3. What are the formal and informal practices that faculty of color encounter at their schools that influence their decision to remain or leave employment?

A summary of the findings will be shared with the CAIS office, and directly with any participating school that request a copy, to further inform their strategic planning around effective recruitment and retention practices.

Please let me know if you are interested in participating in this great opportunity to contribute knowledge to an area of high interest for CAIS, NAIS, as well as found in the strategic plans of many of our schools.

Thank you,
Rosa Dominguez
Ed.D. Candidate
rosadominguez@ucla.edu

--

Olivia Brown
Chair SoCalPOCIS
P.O. Box 70946
Pasadena, 91117
626-510-6157

Email forwarded to CAIS heads and assistant heads listserv by Jim McManus:

From: Jim McManus <jmcmanus@caisca.org>
Date: Monday, April 13, 2015 at 8:01 AM
To: "cais-heads@caiscalist.org" <cais-heads@caiscalist.org>, Assistant Heads Listserv
<assistantheads@caiscalist.org>
Subject: [CAIS] Southern California Schools: Survey for Faculty of Color

Dear Colleagues in Southern California Schools:

Periodically I am asked by doctoral students if CAIS would be willing to circulate questionnaires to people within our schools, with the hope that the doctoral student will gain easy access to a captive audience. In many cases, I politely turn down those requests, as the researchers don't understand our schools, and their research may not benefit our schools. However, I have been approached with a request by Rosa Dominguez, a doctoral candidate at UCLA and the Director of Diversity at Campbell Hall, to help her to reach people of color on our faculties, with the hope that they would be willing to complete a brief questionnaire about their experiences. After meeting with her, it was clear that her research findings would be of interest to our schools, and her experience at Campbell Hall effectively positions her to understand and appreciate the CAIS community.

Accordingly, if you are at a southern California school (which is the geographic scope of her study), she would very much appreciate your forwarding this email to any people of color on your faculty (including administrators who teach, as well as teaching aides and interns), encouraging them to use the link below to complete the 5-10-minute questionnaire that she has developed. As you can imagine, the more input she is able to gather, the more reliable and insightful the findings will be. Since Rosa has committed to sharing her findings at future CAIS conferences so that we can all benefit from useful strategies for attracting and retaining teachers of color, I am hoping that you will take a minute to forward this to the appropriate individuals on your faculty. Thanks for your assistance, and here is Rosa's letter, with instructions for the questionnaire link:

Dear CAIS Southern California Heads,

I am a doctoral student at UCLA's Graduate School of Education & Information Studies, as well as the Director of Diversity at Campbell Hall. I am writing to you independently of my role at Campbell Hall, and only in the capacity of a graduate student researcher, to invite your school to participate in my dissertation study. This study is looking at effective recruitment and retention of faculty of color in independent schools. All southern California schools are invited to participate in the questionnaire phase of the study, which will be analyzed along with interview data (already completed) of administrators and faculty from within the region. This study is focused on southern California schools due to the demographic diversity of the region and due to the study being conducted out of UCLA. Though there is a lot of research available about the benefits of having a diverse faculty, and several studies have been conducted on recruitment and retention of teachers of color in public schools, there is comparably very little focused on independent schools. Previous research studies on recruitment and retention of teachers of color in independent schools have occurred on the east coast, but this will be the first study of this kind focused on this region of the country.

Due to strong interest, the questionnaire phase of this study has been extended. Please contribute to this study by forwarding this email to your faculty and inviting those that self-identify as people of color to **complete the questionnaire BEFORE APRIL 20th**. Thank you to schools that have already participated!

Teachers who would like to participate (including administrators of color who also teach, as well as paid interns and aides who interviewed for their positions) are asked to take a few minutes to complete the online questionnaire found at the following link: <http://bit.ly/RR2015>. The questionnaire will close on April 20th. The questionnaire data will help inform effective practices around recruitment and retention of faculty of color. **The questionnaire will take only 5-10 minutes to complete**, and participation will be completely confidential. Names of schools and of participants are not requested, and all findings will be reported in aggregate form.

A summary of the findings will be shared with the CAIS office, and directly with any participating school that requests a copy, to further inform their strategic planning around

effective recruitment and retention practices.

Thank you in advance for participating in this great opportunity to contribute knowledge to an area that is of high interest for CAIS, NAIS, and many of our schools -- as evidenced in their strategic plans. Please feel free to contact me with any additional questions you may have.

Thank you,

Rosa Dominguez

Ed.D. Candidate

rosadominguez@ucla.edu

James McManus, Executive Director

California Association of Independent Schools

4450 Lakeside Drive, Suite 375

Burbank, CA 91505

Phone: [\(818\) 845-0800](tel:(818)845-0800) *Fax:* [\(818\) 845-0888](tel:(818)845-0888)

jmcmanus@caisca.org www.caisca.org

Appendix H: Faculty of Color Questionnaire Results

Table H1.

Question 3 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification

Question 3. Please rate your satisfaction with your independent school in each of the following areas (Very Dissatisfied-1, Dissatisfied-2, Neutral-3, Satisfied-4, Very Satisfied-5):	All Faculty of Color (n= 84)	Asian* (n=24)	Black or African-American (n=25)	Two or More Races (n=16)	Hispanic or Latino (n=17)
Overall sense of community among students	4.11	4.08	4.08	4.19	4.12
Overall sense of community among faculty	3.69	3.88	3.88	3.63	3.41
Racial/ethnic diversity of the faculty	2.64	2.75	2.54	2.63	2.65
Racial/ethnic diversity of student body	2.71	2.96	2.50	2.88	2.65
Atmosphere for political differences	3.23	3.04	3.42	3.31	3.29
Atmosphere for differences in sexual orientation	3.85	3.96	4.00	4.00	3.47
Atmosphere for religious differences	3.75	3.75	3.79	3.94	3.65
Socioeconomic diversity of the student body	2.67	2.88	2.63	2.56	2.65
Administrative response to incidents of bias, microaggressions, and bullying.	3.29	3.42	3.13	3.63	3.29
Administration's commitment to regularly speaking about the value of diversity.	3.32	3.42	3.17	3.81	3.12

*Including one respondent that identified as Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander.

Table H2.

Question 5-8 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification

Question (Likert scale: 1- Strongly Disagree to 5-Strongly Agree)	All Faculty of Color (n= 84)	Asian* (n=24)	Black or African-American (n=25)	Two or More Races (n=16)	Hispanic or Latino (n=17)
5. It is important for me to work at a school that values student diversity.	4.62	4.67	4.44	4.69	4.76
6. How students of color experience, and are supported in, independent schools impacts my decision to work at my school.	4.07	4.38	3.88	4.00	4.00
7. The inclusion of a socioeconomic range of students impacts my decision to work at my school.	3.73	4.00	3.64	3.75	3.47
8. It is important for me to work at a school that values faculty diversity.	4.42	4.67	4.20	4.5	4.35

Table H3.

Most Important Factors Selected (Question 10a) In Choosing a School Site To Work At by Ethnic Self-identification*

Factors considered by faculty candidates in making their decision in choosing a school site to work at*	All Faculty of Color (n= 84)	Asian* (n=24)	Black or African-American (n=25)	Two or More Races (n=16)	Hispanic or Latino (n=17)
Average class size	19	5	4	1	8
New faculty support provided	10	2	3	2	3
Faculty diversity	11	3	3	2	3
Student diversity	21	8	6	4	3
Professional development opportunities	25	7	10	5	3
Mission statement of the school	25	8	6	5	5
Interview day experience	18	6	7	3	1
Salary and benefits	46	11	18	6	10
Opportunities for faculty to get involved with aspects of school life beyond their teaching responsibilities	17	3	5	5	3
Geographic location of school (demographics of that neighborhood community)	20	5	4	5	6

*Numbers on this table indicate how many respondents chose that factor as one of the top 3 factors most important factors for them.

Table H4.

Question 13-18 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification

Question (Likert scale: 1- Strongly Disagree to 5-Strongly Agree)	All Faculty of Color (n= 84)	Asian* (n=24)	Black or African-American (n=25)	Two or More Races (n=16)	Hispanic or Latino (n=17)
13. My school has effective structures and programs in place to help support teachers in their first year at our school.	3.48	3.29	3.40	3.75	3.41
14. I felt welcomed and supported when I first started working at my current school.	3.96	3.92	3.96	4.19	3.71
15. My school provides/assigns a mentor to new faculty.	4.06	4.25	3.84	4.44	3.65
16. I feel valued at my current work place.	3.94	3.83	4.04	4.06	3.76
17. I currently have colleagues on my school campus that I can go to for advice when facing a challenging work situation.	4.19	4.29	3.96	4.13	4.35
18. Faculty of color experience independent schools differently from their white colleagues.	4.08	4.00	4.44	4.13	3.59

Table H5.

Question 20 Response Averages by Ethnic Self-identification

Question (Likert scale: 1- Strongly Disagree to 5-Strongly Agree)	All Faculty of Color (n= 84)	Asian* (n=24)	Black or African-American (n=25)	Two or More Races (n=16)	Hispanic or Latino (n=17)
20. I have observed, or experienced, microaggressions at my school.	3.76	3.46	3.92	3.94	3.71

REFERENCES

- Achinstein, B., Ogawa, R. T., Sexton, D., & Freitas, C. (2010). Retaining Teachers of Color: A Pressing Problem and a Potential Strategy for “Hard-to-Staff” Schools. *Review of Educational Research*, 80(1), 71–107. doi:10.3102/0034654309355994
- Astin, A. W. (1993). Diversity and multiculturalism on the campus: How are students affected?. *Change: The Magazine of Higher Learning*, 25(2), 44-49.
- Aud, S., Hussar, W., Kena, G., Bianco, K., Frohlich, L., Kemp, J., & Tahan, K. (2011). The Condition of Education 2011. NCES 2011-033. *National Center for Education Statistics*. Retrieved September 2014 from <http://nces.ed.gov/pubs2011/2011033.pdf>
- Boser, U. (2014, May). Teacher Diversity Revisited: A New State-by-State Analysis. *Center for American Progress*. Retrieved October 22, 2014 from <http://cdn.americanprogress.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/TeacherDiversity.pdf>
- Branch, A. J. (2001, September). Increasing the Numbers of Teachers of Color in K—12 Public Schools. In *The Educational Forum* (Vol. 65, No. 3, pp. 254-261). Taylor & Francis Group.
- Brown, A. C., & Greenwood, J. J. (2010). Changing the Face of the Academy: Innovative Approaches to Faculty Recruitment. *Independent School*, 69(2), n2.
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (3rd ed.). Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Datnow, A., & Cooper, R. (1997). Peer networks of African American students in independent schools: Affirming academic success and racial identity. *Journal of Negro Education*, 66(1), 56–72. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2967251

- Elfers, A. M., Plecki, M. L., & Knapp, M. S. (2006). Teacher mobility: Looking more closely at "the movers" within a state system. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 81(3), 94-127.
- Gay, G., & Howard, T. C. (2000). Multicultural teacher education for the 21st century. *The Teacher Educator*, 36(1), 1-16.
- Hodgkinson, H. (2002). Demographics and teacher education: An overview. *Journal of teacher education*, 53(2), 102-105.
- Howard, Tyrone C. (2010-04-18). Why Race and Culture Matter in Schools: Closing the Achievement Gap in America's Classrooms (Multicultural Education Series) (Kindle Locations 1240-1241). Teachers College Press. Kindle Edition.
- Imig, D. E., & Imig, D. R. (1987). Strengthening and maintaining the pool of qualified teachers. *Strengthening teacher education: The challenges to college and university leaders*, 36-54.
- Ingersoll, R. M. (2002). The teacher shortage: A case of wrong diagnosis and wrong prescription. *NASSP bulletin*, 86(631), 16-31.
- Ingersoll, R. M. (2003). The Teacher shortage: Myth or reality?. *Educational Horizons*, 81, 146-152.
- Kane, P. R., & Orsini, A. J. (Eds.). (2003). *The colors of excellence: Hiring and keeping teachers of color in independent schools*. Teachers College Press.
- Kanter, R.M. (1977). Some effects of proportions on group life: Skewed sex ratios and responses to token women. *American Journal of Sociology*, 82 (5), 965-990.
- Knowles, M. F., & Harleston, B. W. (1997). Achieving Diversity in the Professoriate: Challenges and Opportunities. American Council on Education report.

- Landson-Billings, G. (1994). *The dreamkeepers: Successful teachers of African American children*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Madsen, J. A., & Mabokela, R. O. (2000). Organizational culture and its impact on African American teachers. *American Educational Research Journal*, 37(4), 849-876.
- Maxwell, J. A. (2012). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (Vol. 41). Sage publications.
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (3rd ed.). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- NAIS Equity & Social Justice Principles of Good Practice. (2012). Retrieved August 27, 2014 from <http://www.nais.org/Series/Pages/Equity-and-Justice.aspx>
- Nieto, S. (2000) *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education* (3rd Ed.). New York: Longman.
- Page, S. E. (2008). *The Difference: How the Power of Diversity Creates Better Groups, Firms, Schools, and Societies (New Edition)*. Princeton University Press. Achinstein, B., Ogawa, R. T., Sexton, D., & Freitas, C. (2010). Retaining Teachers of Color: A Pressing Problem and a Potential Strategy for “Hard-to-Staff” Schools. *Review of Educational Research*, 80(1), 71–107. doi:10.3102/0034654309355994
- Souto-Manning, M., & Dice, J. L. (2007). Reflective Teaching in the Early Years: A Case for Mentoring Diverse Educators. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 34(6), 425–430. doi:10.1007/s10643-007-0151-1
- Talbert-Johnson, C., & Tillman, B. (1999). Perspectives on Color in Teacher Education Programs: Prominent Issues. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 50(3), 200–208. doi:10.1177/002248719905000306

- Vargas, S. R. (2012). *Women of color heads of independent schools: Toward a framework of culturally relevant leadership*. The Ohio State University.
- Villegas, A. M., & Davis, D. (2008). Preparing teachers of color to confront racial/ethnic disparities in educational outcomes. *Handbook on research in teacher education*, 583-605.
- Villegas, A. M., & Irvine, J. J. (2010). Diversifying the teaching force: An examination of major arguments. *The Urban Review*, 42(3), 175-192.
- Villegas, A. M., & Irvine, J. J. (2009). Arguments for increasing the racial/ethnic diversity of the teaching force: A look at the evidence. In *annual meeting of the American Educational Research Conference, San Diego, CA*.
- Villegas, A., & Lucas, T. F. (2004). Diversifying the teacher workforce: A retrospective and prospective analysis. *Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education*, 103(1), 70-104.