

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Zuni Enigma. By Nancy Yaw Davis.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/01r3979t>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 24(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Mithlo, Nancy Marie

Publication Date

2000-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

using statistics he proves that factors other than economic ones remained important. For example, the motives for many so-called fur-stealing raids had their origins in the tribes' traditional cultures; numerous engagements took place to acquire captives to replace dead Iroquois. Several raids did not even result in large catches of furs traded to Europeans.

Brañdao also examines the role of the fur trade between Native Americans and Europeans. For a considerable period, the years covered in this study, the fur trade was not very significant. The arrival of Europeans and the subsequent trade did not bring added hostilities—European diseases did. Because of pandemics the Iroquois had to find more captives to replace their dead. Statistics indicate that this is a correct assumption.

The author remarks that the Iroquois engaged in trade to obtain weapons to fight other Natives, and hoped to form political links in their fight against Native foes. Brañdao understates this aspect of trade. Richter disagrees (see his *The Ordeal of the Longhouse*), stating that trade did have political implications.

Brañdao makes several important points regarding Iroquois relations with France. New France started the conflict because it believed the Huron and Algonquin were more reliable allies than the Iroquois. The French established this anti-Iroquois policy early, leaving the Iroquois to unite to deal with their foes. At times this unity proved difficult because of the loose nature of the confederacy—one tribe might fight the French while another remained aloof. The French, even after negotiating peace, refused to abandon Iroquois enemies. French aid led to conflict with the Iroquois who fought not for furs but for survival. The Iroquois were trapped in a vicious cycle. Added to this were cultural imperatives requiring the Iroquois to wage war.

Brañdao has written an excellent study, but, as noted, it is one-sided. The second half of the work consists of over one hundred pages of statistics. The author makes use of numbers to prove his assertion. He has something here—the evidence confirms that factors other than economics caused warfare. It is not clear, however, Brañdao notwithstanding, that these statistics prove the utter absence of economic motivation. The work is not for the lay person, but for specialists who should read and consider this fine addition to Iroquoian studies.

John Richard Beery
University of Toledo

The Zuni Enigma. By Nancy Yaw Davis. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 2000. 318 pages. \$26.05 cloth.

This problematic work seeks to demonstrate the theory that the Pueblo of Zuni, New Mexico is unique in its language, culture, and biology largely due to the influx of thirteenth-century Japanese monks who reached the West Coast of North America, migrated east in search of the middle of the world, and settled in the Zuni Valley. The author, Nancy Yaw Davis, advocates the consideration of her premise based on her belief that "coming to grips with

new ideas about human history and society” may “take us beyond the divisive constraints of ethnicity and national boundaries” and encourage us “to ponder our shared humanity across our common planet” in the hopes that this may help “usher in a more peaceful twenty-first century” (p. xxix).

Given the Zuni Pueblo’s sovereign status as demonstrated by self-governance in education, health care, and cultural resource management, it is surprising that Davis’s oft-repeated premise of “our shared humanity” should go unchecked. The assimilationist approach Davis champions as the impetus to her research denies the efforts of Native American nations to exert control over their land, resources, and people as distinct political entities. If ethnicity were inherently divisive, as Davis suggests, the achievement of world peace would necessitate erasure of distinct societies, theoretically being accomplished by the racial mixing she seeks to demonstrate in *The Zuni Enigma*.

The danger of this type of argument is evidenced in Davis’s description of the proposed genetic mixing. Assumptions of romantic love and a social agenda of out-breeding are made clear in Davis’s statement that, “These (genetic) links are indicative of a lot of lively sexual activity in the past, sex not inhibited by differences, but perhaps enhanced by them, protecting the species from unhealthy homogeneity mixing of the gene pool work” (p. 12). Even if the reader concludes that the Japanese did reach the Pueblo of Zuni hundreds of years ago, would this lead to notions of a “shared identity” among, say, the two Zuni council members Davis states were prisoners of the Japanese in World War II? Does racial mixing necessarily indicate shared social beliefs? Would a new found racial connection invariably lead to the two cultures embracing a model version of the world peace Davis champions?

While these questions may be intriguing, Davis’s thesis—presented at times in the text as a possibility at other times as a foregone conclusion—infers that the Zuni and their ancestors were incapable of developing a complex religious and social society without the influence of a foreign overseas power. Although she states that her findings “do not in any way undermine the intelligence of Native Americans” (p. 214), it is difficult for the reader not to come to this conclusion. Davis’s inability to understand how her premise may impact contemporary interpretations of the Pueblo of Zuni reflects poorly upon her judgment and makes obvious her lack of relatedness to the politics of contemporary Native American life.

In her introduction, Davis takes pains to explain that she never requested the approval or blessing of her theory from the Zuni Tribal Council when she approached them to explain her research in 1988. She states that she did not ask for permission to undertake original research in their community, but was only studying published documents. Davis’s rationalization not to work with the contemporary community was that “the Zuni already are among the most-studied people on earth” (p. xxix). This claim of innocence, however, overlooks the problem of working with those published materials without incorporating the tribe at present.

For example, under the subheading “Reconnect Those Bones” Davis advocates further study by “a contemporary team of physical anthropologists trained in the latest technology . . . to review the skeletal material from the

Pueblo IV sites on the Zuni Reservation” (p. 111). Zuni tribal policy is well established regarding the disturbance of human remains on the reservation. Excavation of skeletal remains takes place only under conditions of unavoidable earth disturbances or construction. In addition, Davis clearly violates the wishes of the Zuni tribe by reproducing a photograph of a Native California skull from a 1963 study that compared Native American skeletons to Japanese skeletons (p. 117). In a well distributed 1986 correspondence from the then-governor of Zuni Pueblo Chauncey Simplicio to the President of the Society of American Archaeology Don D. Fowler, the governor states that display of American Indian skeletal remains is “an insult to our cultural and religious values” that “ought to cease in respect to the dead” (Simplicio 7 April 1986). Why then would Davis choose to display this photo? Curiously, a contemporary photo of Zuni artist Rowena Him follows two pages later in the text. What relevance does this photo have for Davis’s argument? More importantly, what relevance does this photo have for Rowena Him, situated as it is next to a potentially offensive photo of a human skull?

It is this lack of engagement with the current political and social structure of the Pueblo of Zuni that makes *The Zuni Enigma* so troubling. Whose enigma does Davis refer to in her title? What is ambiguous or inexplicable to the author does not appear to be a concern shared by the community she seeks to understand. If ascertaining whether the Zuni and the Japanese experienced racial mixing were a pressing concern, would a tribal resolution not be enacted? Couldn’t the Zuni Archaeology program lead this effort? Davis’s failure to grasp this logic is evidenced by the manner in which she interprets her initial presentation of her research to the Zuni Tribal Council in 1988. Davis recounts that “rather than the hostility, defiance and dismissal” she feared, the elected representatives of Zuni actually expressed “a keen intellectual interest” in her theory. This in turn signals Davis’s own “pilgrimage to the ‘center of the world’” (p. xxviii).

A sense of the newly converted, yet terribly inexperienced, interloper permeates the text. Davis recounts her discovery of the “remarkably similar” aspects of Zuni religion and Taoism, with the opening, “It happened on a dark, rainy night in Seattle” (p. xxix). Statements that seek to describe the Zuni population read, “The people of Zuni are handsome, with healthy dark skin and shiny straight black hair” (pp. 5–6). It is difficult to follow Davis’s subsequent arguments with any sense of validity considering these naive assumptions of purity. Similarly, the book’s photos that juxtapose Zuni children with Japanese children reek of the same notions of essentialism that gave rise to such discredited works as *Black Indians, A Hidden Heritage* (William Loren Katz, 1986). This level of conjecture, the “why can’t we just all get along?” moralizing, and the arrogant assumption that the Zuni Tribal Council would react to her theory on a purely emotional level (instead of an intellectual level) leave little room for the reader to engage in the serious inquiry Davis argues the work deserves.

Davis presents a litany of evidence for her thesis, including Japanese and Zuni similarities in creation stories, prehistoric and historic composite social developments, the incidence of earthquakes, dental morphology,

skeletal material, blood alleles, high rates of kidney failure, language forms, kinship patterns, child-rearing practices, cosmology, religion, and material culture. In addition, arguments are presented which seek to prove the possibility of transpacific travel, including coastal trade routes, Asian-related iron and pottery artifacts found on the West Coast, shipbuilding techniques, pirate activity, and shipwrecks.

The 215 pages of text are accompanied by fifty pages of endnotes, many of which are extended commentaries proposing even broader conclusions than the main manuscript. Davis's heavy dependency on the *Handbook of North American Indians* (W. C. Sturtevant, general ed., 1978) and her lengthy explanatory sections on DNA, kinship, and prehistory indicate the work is directed toward a general readership. This admittedly broad approach fails to capture the interest of the more serious reader Davis seeks in order to further her research agenda. In reference to her assumed critics, Davis suggests that they, not she, should disprove her theory by conducting research that counters her claims. This reasoning fails to make sense given the broad humanistic premise of the research (world peace) and its disconnection to the contemporary concerns of the tribe itself.

If *The Zuni Enigma* had been more grounded in the ongoing research of the tribe, or had Davis allowed herself the time to mature into an understanding of the relevance of historic, published materials to the tribe today, then the arguments presented may have been more palatable. On the topic of the Human Genome Project, which Davis feels confident will support her arguments, she indicates an understanding of this sensitivity, stating that the genetic research should only be done at the request of the Zuni tribe. If the bulk of her substantial research on the topic of a possible Japanese connection at Zuni had adhered to this same cultural standard, a truly useful product might have resulted.

Nancy Marie Mithlo

Institute of American Indian Arts