UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Covered with Night: A Story of Murder and Indigenous Justice in Early America. By Nicole Eustace

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/08n580v9

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 44(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hauptman, Laurence M.

Publication Date

2020-09-01

DOI

10.17953/aicrj.44.4.reviews

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

DOI 10.17953/aicrj.44.4.reviews

Reviews

Downloaded from http://meridian.allenpress.com/aicrj/article-pdf/44/4/101/2945485/i0161-6463-44-4-101.pdf by University of California Los Angeles user on 14 September 2022

Covered with Night: A Story of Murder and Indigenous Justice in Early America. By Nicole Eustace. New York: Liveright Publishing/W. W. Norton Co., 2021. 447 pp. $29.95 cloth; $26.23 electronic.

In the woods near the Indian town of Conestoga in 1722, fur trader John Cartlidge, who was drunk, killed Sawantaeny, a Seneca hunter. In Nicole Eustace's thoroughly researched account of the murder and the criminal proceedings against John and Edward Cartlidge, the focus is how the Hodinöhsö:ni' (Haudenosaunee) and Pennsylvania colonists viewed and dispensed criminal justice in the period leading up to the Treaty of Albany, also in 1722. At the time, this region of traditional Susquehannock territory in Pennsylvania was under the "watchful eyes" of the Six Nations, who had defeated the Susquehannocks in a 1670s war, and both Algonquian and Iroquoian peoples resided in the area. Although Alan Taylor and John Smolenski previously have written about this case, Eustace's account is the first full-scale study of the murder and its aftermath, which aroused great emotions on both sides of the cultural divide and threatened to shatter the peace throughout the middle colonies.

A professor of history at New York University who has written on the history of human emotions, Eustace is well suited to write about this case. Her books include *Passion is the Gale: Emotion, Power, and the Coming of the American Revolution* (2008); *1812: War and the Passions of Patriotism* (2012); and, co-edited with Frederika J. Teute, *Warring for America: Cultural Contest in the Era of 1812* (2017). For *Covered with Night*'s study of divergent concepts of criminal justice, she has familiarized herself with the anthropological literature, especially the work of William N. Fenton and his extensive writings on the Iroquoian Condolence Council. Eustace has also carefully combed and analyzed treaty councils and other colonial documents from Pennsylvania, Maryland, Virginia, and New York, and extensively researched major collections such as the American Philosophical Society, Library Company of Philadelphia, and the Historical Society of Pennsylvania.

This is an outstanding book, although some readers might be taken aback by the author's use of the present tense in her wonderful descriptions of people, places, and events. Nevertheless, her style proves quite effective since it actually draws readers into the narrative, almost as if becoming firsthand observers. The Hodinöhsö:ni´ had two choices: revenge killing or "covering the grave." John Cartlidge claimed that the killing was a horrible accident and that Sawantaeny was his friend. Instead of seeking revenge, the Hodinöhsö:ni´ interpreted Cartlidge's offense as forgivable, but only if representatives of both the Indigenous nation and Pennsylvania officials properly "covered the grave" by participating in a solemn Condolence Council and providing adequate compensation to the victim's family. In line with Iroquoian beliefs, the Condolence Council restored harmony, allowing those grieving to wipe away their tears, unclear

their throats, and unplug their ears. By participating, the victim's kin "forfeited the right to seek revenge" (30). Masterful forest diplomats, the Hodinöhsö:ni´ also understood that by insisting that Condolence Councils be called and its rituals followed, recognition of their sovereignty and other concessions could be obtained without war.

The author effectively depicts the Philadelphia Anglican and Quaker leaders, together with exquisite descriptions of their opulent residences, and then dissects what motivated this elite. Eustace exposes the hypocrisy of men such as Governor William Keith and James Logan, the prosperous and powerful Philadelphia merchant sent to do the initial investigation of the murder. Keith specifically feared the loss of his mining opportunities, while Logan, a prominent Quaker and slaveholder, was fearful of losing his lucrative investments in the fur trade. According to Governor Keith and prominent colonial officials, the Cartridges had to be punished. Despite sharp political divisions between Anglican and Quaker colonists over most matters, Pennsylvania's leadership agreed that if the Cartlidge brothers were not punished or executed, an all-out Indian war could result, much like the events in 1675 and 1676 in New England and Virginia. They feared that a war would threaten the continued existence of the colony, but also could be disastrous to their own personal financial interests. Seeing themselves as models of civility, they hid behind English law and their Christian beliefs, condemning the Indians for cruelty even while some of the colony's elite held slaves.

As Eustace states, "The English were utterly mistaken in their belief that they alone understood the concept of living in 'civil society' and that civility was a uniquely English achievement that Native peoples could appreciate only after being 'reduced'—that is, conquered" (8). Eustace shows the numerous missteps by colonial officials in attempting to exact justice, including their stereotypical views of Indigenous peoples, ignorance of how to properly address these diverse tribesmen, and lack of knowledge about the importance of wampum belts in council proceedings. Although Natives were initially dismissed as witnesses, the author identifies several American Indians who turned this tragedy into a teaching moment, including the Mingo/Seneca diplomat Taquatarensaly—better known to the colonists as "Captain Civility"—who was the spokesman for diverse Native Americans in the vicinity of Conestoga; Satceechoe, a Cayuga hunter; "Smith the Ganawese," a Conoy translator who knew little English; and Tanachaha, the Iroquois council speaker at the Treaty of Albany. Tanachaha insisted on restorative justice and reconciliation through "emotional consolation, spiritual renewal and material restitution, by carrying out the long-held Iroquoian tradition of covering the grave" (293).

The murder case finally closed when chiefs of the Five Nations and governors of four colonies, Pennsylvania, Maryland, Virginia, and New York, met in Albany and signed the Treaty of 1722. If the author perhaps somewhat exaggerates the overall importance of this 1722 treaty compared to others, such as those reached in 1701, she is absolutely right that it is a clear example of Indigenous justice at work. Governor Keith was present not only to negotiate, but also to take part in condoling the murdered Sawantaeny. Clearly having learned from his previous errors, Keith was now courteous in his address and brought two belts of wampum with him as gifts

Downloaded from http://meridian.allenpress.com/aicrj/article-pdf/44/4/101/2945485/i0161-6463-44-4-101.pdf by University of California Los Angeles user on 14 September 2022

for the chiefs. *Covered with Night* confirms much of Fenton's previous writings on the Condolence Council—namely, that during much of the colonial era, whoever came to negotiate with the Hodinöhsö:ni´ had to know the protocol and come on Iroquois terms in order to have a chance to succeed. Nicole Eustace's effective storytelling makes this book essential reading for all scholars in the field.

Laurence M. Hauptman, emeritus
State University of New York, New Paltz

Eva Mirabal: Three Generations of Tradition and Modernity at Taos Pueblo. By Lois P. Rudnick with Jonathan Warm Day Coming. Santa Fe: Museum of New Mexico Press, 2021. 160 pages. $34.95 cloth.

The Studio at the Santa Fe Indian School had an intense florescence under founder Dorothy Dunn's short tenure, as well as that of her handpicked successor, Geronima Cruz Montoya (Okay Owingeh). The studio's success was due to the instructors' dedication to their students and the superior training they provided. Eva Mirabal (1920–1968) attended the Studio from 1936–1942 and received training from both Dunn and Montoya, who encouraged their students to contemplate their Native lives and cultures as subject matter for their art. It was quite audacious at this time to have students openly reminisce about their Native cultures within the militaristic confines of the Indian School. Allowing students to speak their language, and think and talk about home, helped attendance to grow from three students in the first year to 187 the following year.

Dunn's teaching style and that of the Studio have long come under criticism, with much of this critique arising out of a series of Ford Foundation-sponsored meetings at the University of Arizona in the late 1950s, which would ultimately lead to the founding of the Institute of American Indian Arts. Dunn's myopic view of how Indigenous students should paint does deserve critique, as well as better examination and understanding. The teaching styles of Dunn and Montoya created an almost universal appreciation in Studio students, and in addition, both teachers were particularly supportive of their young women students. While there has been much analysis of Dunn and other non-Native patronizers, there are fewer biographies of Dunn's students from their own perspectives. *Eva Mirabal: Three Generations of Tradition and Modernity at Taos Pueblo* helps fill this void. Mirabal is not the author, but she left a trove of letters and sketchbooks that tell the story of her life growing up in Taos Pueblo, art training at the Studio, her World War II military service, and her successes and difficulties in pursuing an art career.

Her son, Jonathan Warm Day Coming (Taos Pueblo) had long desired to write his mother's biography, but "felt intrusive about my mother's life." Fortuitously, about four years ago, he shared a public program panel with art historian Lois Rudnick at the Harwood Museum of Art in Taos. They struck up a conversation and the resulting book went to press just prior to Rudnick's passing. One would not assume such an

Downloaded from http://meridian.allenpress.com/aicrj/article-pdf/44/4/101/2945485/i0161-6463-44-4-101.pdf by University of California Los Angeles user on 14 September 2022