Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory

Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory

Title

COMMENTS ON McBRIDE'S COMPLETION OF KRONER'S PROOF THAT HYDROGENS OF BENZENE ARE HOMOTOPIC

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/09r8q1qm>

Author

Balasubramanian, K.

Publication Date

1980-12-01

Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

Materials & Molecular Research Division

Submitted to Theoretica Chimica Acta

COMMENTS ON McBRIDE'S COMPLETION OF KRONER'S
PROOF THAT HYDROGENS OF BENZENE ARE HOMOTOPIC

K. Balasubramanian

December 1980

RECEIVED
LAWRENCE
BERKELEY LABORATORY

FEB 9 1981

LIBRARY AND
DOCUMENTS SECTION

TWO-WEEK LOAN COPY

*This is a Library Circulating Copy
which may be borrowed for two weeks.
For a personal retention copy, call
Tech. Info. Division, Ext. 6782.*

DISCLAIMER

This document was prepared as an account of work sponsored by the United States Government. While this document is believed to contain correct information, neither the United States Government nor any agency thereof, nor the Regents of the University of California, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by its trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise, does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or any agency thereof, or the Regents of the University of California. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government or any agency thereof or the Regents of the University of California.

Comments on McBride's Completion of Kroner's Proof
That Hydrogens of Benzene are Homotopic

K. Balasubramanian

Department of Chemistry
and
Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory
University of California
Berkeley, CA 94720

Abstract

This paper shows that McBride's completion of Kroner's proof (J. M. McBride, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 102, 4134 (1980)) can be immediately obtained using methods developed by the author in the context of isomer enumeration and NMR-signal enumeration using a theorem of Pólya. The method is illustrated with both rigid and non-rigid molecules.

I noted with interest the recent paper of McBride on the homotopy of the hydrogens of benzene.^[1] I have been interested in developing combinatorial and group theoretical methods,^[2-8] in general, for several problems in chemistry. One of the problems that I have been interested in is to partition a set of nuclei present in a molecule (both rigid and non-rigid) into equivalence classes of nuclei, wherein all the nuclei in a class are equivalent under the action of the rotational subgroup of the molecule. I feel that this proof which McBride has outlined follows immediately from this technique which I present below.

Let G be the rotational subgroup of the point group of the molecule and define the cycle index of G , P_G to be

$$P_G = \frac{1}{|G|} \sum_{g \in G} x_1^{b_1} x_2^{b_2} \dots \quad (1)$$

where $x_1^{b_1} x_2^{b_2} \dots$ is a representation of a typical permutation $g \in G$ having b_1 cycles of length 1, b_2 cycles of length 2, etc. Consider D as the set of atoms whose equivalence is under consideration. For the benzene problem D is the set of hydrogen atoms. Let R be a set consisting of 2 elements. Let $N = |D|$, be the number of elements in D . Let l and f be the weights of the 2 elements in the set R . Then the present author^[2] showed in the context of isomer enumeration and enumeration of NMR signals that the coefficient of f^{N-1} or f in the expression (2) obtained using a theorem of Polya^[9,10] gives the number of equivalence classes of the nuclei in the set D .

$$G.F. = P_G (x_k \rightarrow (1+f)^k). \quad (2)$$

For the benzene problem P_G and G.F. are given by Eqs. (3) and (4).

$$P_G = 1/12 (x_1^6 + 2x_6 + 2x_3^2 + 4x_2^3 + 3x_1^2 x_2^2) \quad (3)$$

$$G.F. = f^6 + f^5 + 3f^4 + 3f^3 + 3f^2 + f + 1. \quad (4)$$

Since the coefficient of f^5 in (4) is 1 there is just one equivalence class of hydrogen atoms establishing McBride's proof in a straightforward manner. The method can be applied very easily to many polyatomic molecules. For example, expressions thus obtained for naphthalene and anthracene are shown below (Eqs. 5 and 6).

$$G.F. = f^8 + 2f^7 + 10f^6 + 14f^5 + 22f^4 + 14f^3 + 10f^2 + 2f + 1 \quad (5)$$

$$G.F. = f^{10} + 3f^9 + 15f^8 + 32f^7 + 60f^6 + 66f^5 + 60f^4 + 32f^3 + 15f^2 + 3f + 1. \quad (6)$$

For non-rigid molecules using the author's generalized wreath product methods^[2,6] this can be done. For example, I give below the expressions (7) and (8) that I obtained for rigid and non-rigid propane molecules.^[4]

$$1/4((1+f)^8 + 2(1+f)^2(1+f^2)^3 + (1+f^2)^4) \quad (7)$$

$$1/36[(1+f)^8 + 4(1+f)^5(1+f^3) + 4(1+f)^2(1+f^3)^2 + 3(1+f^2)^4 + 6(1+f^2)(1+f^6) + 12(1+f)^2(1+f^2)^3 + 6(1+f)^2(1+f^6)]. \quad (8)$$

The coefficients of f^7 in (7) and (8) are given by (9) and (10), respectively, establishing the fact that there are 3 and 2 classes of protons for rigid and non-rigid molecules, respectively.

$$\frac{1}{4} \left[\binom{8}{7} + 2 \binom{2}{1} \right] = 3 \quad (9)$$

$$\frac{1}{36} \left[\binom{8}{7} + 4 \binom{5}{1} + 4 \binom{2}{1} + 12 \binom{2}{1} + 6 \binom{2}{1} \right] = 2. \quad (10)$$

However, when one considers the rotational subgroups instead of the point groups, we obtain the number of classes of protons for rigid and non-rigid propanes to be 4 and 2, indicating that there is a pair of enantiotopic protons for the rigid molecule.

Acknowledgment

The author is indebted to Professor Kenneth S. Pitzer for his encouragement. The research was supported in part by the Division of Chemical Sciences, Office of the Basic Energy Sciences, U. S. Department of Energy under Contract No. W-7405-ENG-48.

References

1. McBride, J. M.: J. Am. Chem. Soc. 102, 4134 (1980).
2. Balasubramanian, K.: Theoret. Chim. Acta 51, 37 (1979).
3. Balasubramanian, K.: Annal N.Y. Acad. Sci. 319, 33 (1979).
4. Balasubramanian, K.: Theoret. Chim. Acta 53, 129 (1979).
5. Balasubramanian, K.: Indian J. Chem. 16B, 1094 (1978).
6. Balasubramanian, K.: J. Chem. Phys. 72, 665 (1980).
7. Balasubramanian, K.: J. Chem. Phys. 73, 3321 (1980).
8. Balasubramanian, K.: Theoret. Chim. Acta. (in press).
9. Pólya, G.: Acta. Math. 68, 145 (1937).
10. Harary, F., Palmer, E. M., Robinson, R. W. and Read, R. C. in: Chemical Applications of Graph Theory", (ed. A. T. Balaban, New York: Academic Press, 1976).