

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

A Coalition of Lineages: The Fernandeano Tataviam Band of Mission Indians. By Duane Champagne and Carole Goldberg.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0cf8f0r8>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 45(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Sepulveda, Charles

Publication Date

2021

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

reputation as an African American imposter, con man, and alleged child abuser. These efforts, combined with the actions of a judge lacking sympathy for Native people, resulted in a hung jury and the dismissal of Thunderwater's case against the newspapers that impugned his character.

Reid's book sheds important new light on an understudied chapter of Haudenosaunee history. He credits Thunderwater for playing a key role in revitalizing the nascent Haudenosaunee nationalism of the late nineteenth century in Canada and identifies his movement as providing a vital bridge between that prior era and the subsequent versions of twentieth-century activism supporting Haudenosaunee sovereignty. Reid acknowledges that Thunderwater's attempt to incorporate the Council of the Tribes via Canadian Parliamentary legislation in 1918 represented "one of the most important expressions" of the Thunderwater Movement (151), but does not explain the possible implications of that initiative had it succeeded. That minor criticism aside, this book is highly recommended as an accessible, compelling account of a fascinating individual's life.

Jon Parmenter
Cornell University

A Coalition of Lineages: The Fernandeano Tataviam Band of Mission Indians. By Duane Champagne and Carole Goldberg. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2021. 408 pages. \$24.95 paper; \$150.00 electronic.

American Indian studies, as a transdisciplinary field, has significantly contributed to our understanding of Native pasts, presents, and futures. The work of Duane Champagne, sociologist and professor emeritus in American Indian studies at the University of California, Los Angeles (UCLA), has been vital to the development of American Indian studies, as has that of Carole Goldberg, distinguished professor of law emerita at UCLA. Champagne is known for his work on cultural and social change and the continuity of Indigenous nations, and Goldberg as a leading scholar of federal Indian law and tribal law. The two have been integral to the growing field of American Indian studies for decades at UCLA and their legacy will continue to be felt for decades to come. In *A Coalition of Lineages*, which chronicles the history of the band from creation to their contemporary governance, Champagne and Goldberg's expertise combines, along with that of their research team, to analyze the history of the Indians interned by the Catholic missionaries and Spanish soldiers at Mission San Fernando Rey de España, as well as their descendants.

At fewer than 250 pages, the book offers a quick overview of thousands of years of history before contact in addition to nearly 225 years after the colonial mission was founded within their traditional territory. Champagne and Goldberg have written a robust and accessible summary of the tribe's history and continuity for a general audience of non-experts in the fields of American Indian, California Indian, and mission studies, including a well-crafted argument that the Fernandeano Tataviam

Band of Mission Indians be acknowledged as a tribal nation through the US federal recognition guidelines. Champagne and Goldberg provided research support for the federal recognition application of the Fernandeano Tataviam Band of Mission Indians and this book is a result of those efforts. The central thesis is that the federal government should provide formal recognition since the “ancestors of the present-day Fernandeano Tataviam Band of Mission Indians belonged to self-governing lineages—ministates or tribes—situated in villages and settlements across the landscape of the valleys we now call San Fernando and Santa Clarita and the surrounding areas” and the band has “demonstrat[ed] continuity of tribal existence to the Office of Federal Acknowledgment” (241–243).

While I agree with their argument, I would have appreciated the authors’ complicating and critiquing a system of acknowledgment that both limits tribal sovereignty and works to further fold Native peoples into the structures of settler colonialism. Within Native studies, scholars have actively engaged this critique, particularly the scholarship of authors from First Nations. Glen Coulthard, for example, in his book *Red Skin, White Masks*, problematizes the assumption that relationships between Native nations and the state can be reconciled through recognition. He argues that reconciliation of tribal sovereignty through state systems remains colonial. Recognized or unrecognized, the state continues to be committed to the dispossession of Indigenous lands. Settler colonialism is a structure of domination and formal recognition does not end this system. It ends, as Leanne Betasamosake Simpson writes in *Dancing on Our Turtle’s Back*, through Indigenous resurgence “on our own terms, without the sanction, permission or engagement of the state” (*Dancing*, 17).

And yet the day-to-day experience of being unrecognized is often left out of the critique. How do unrecognized tribes take land back, for example, when there is no guarantee that they can afford to pay the upkeep such as property taxes? How do tribes sustain human-land relationships and their nondifferentiated culture (which Champagne’s scholarship emphasizes throughout his career) if they do not have access to land, which federal recognition could assist with? How much more challenging is it for tribes without federal recognition to protect sacred places when federal law does not apply? To raise these questions, in addition to the unfortunate but necessary significance of acknowledgment for tribes within a settler system, coupled with a critique of recognition focused on unrecognized tribes such as the Fernandeanos, would have been an important addition to the field.

A Coalition of Lineages shines brightest when it includes the voices of the Fernandeanos and their history of twentieth-century tribal governance, kinship, and activism. Chapters 6 and 7 are particularly interesting in their discussion of Fernandeano lineages, the term Champagne and Goldberg use to describe the “interconnected lineages born at the mission and their descendants” (170). These two chapters contain photos of tribal members and show the continuity of the tribe through cultural practices, identity, languages, kinship, and political leadership, which “remained strongly interrelated or nondifferentiated” despite the “drastically changed economic, political, and cultural environment from premission times” (204, 238). According to tribal

member Stanley Salazar, gatherings were integral to maintaining tribal cohesion: “what kept our tribe together was the people” (214).

While *A Coalition of Lineages* delivers a promising discussion of Fernandean lineages and their continuity through time that provides them a strong application for federal acknowledgment, its analysis of the effects of the mission system is insufficient. Although scholars have debated how to define Indian labor and captivity at the missions after baptism, most would agree that once the priests baptized them, they were not free to leave, and their labor was mandatory. Robert Heizer called the mission system “enslavement,” while James Sandos disagrees with scholars referring to Indians as slaves and called the mission system “spiritual peonage.” Both scholars state that the missionaries required neophyte (baptized Indian) labor. Rather than address the mission as enforcing a system of labor on baptized Fernandeanos, however, Champagne and Goldberg write that women wove clothing, prepared meals, and performed other tasks, while “men assumed a variety of *occupations* as farmers, shoemakers, cowboys, shepherds, carpenters, metalworkers, and any tasks necessary to sustain the largely self-reliant mission economy” (emphasis added). The missionaries are likened to “economic managers” (58). *A Coalition of Lineages* downplays the impact of the mission—the narrative that has been portrayed too long in mission mythology and the California fourth grade mission project.

Analysis of gendered effects and sexual violence of the mission are nonexistent, including the captivity of unmarried Indian girls. Using the passive voice, the authors note that neophyte boys and girls “were kept” in separate dormitories (57) but don’t explain who kept them or how they were kept in the mission’s gendered dormitories. As described by contemporaries and in recent scholarship, these were California’s first prisons, where girls were locked up until they married or died. The work of Deborah Miranda, Chelsea Vaughn, Edward Castillo, or Antonia Castañeda could have supported a more vigorous analysis of the gendered structures of the mission.

Although the book’s inadequate analysis of the structure and impact of the mission system on Fernandeanos and California Indians makes it challenging to recommend it to those readers not well versed in mission histories, *A Coalition of Lineages* is nonetheless an important and robust study highlighting the continuity of the unrecognized Fernandeano Tataviam Band of Mission Indians, the genealogical caretakers of the San Fernando and Santa Clarita valleys and the surrounding areas. They should be recognized and given back their land, as should their unrecognized relatives and neighbors, the Chumash, Acjachemen, and Tongva/Gabrielino nations. Yet, despite Champagne and Goldberg’s argument that federal recognition is a step toward remedying the harm of colonialism (16), the sovereignty promised through recognition does not dismantle the oppressive colonial, racist, and patriarchal structure of the state.

Charles Sepulveda
University of Utah