

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

“Bringing Them under Subjection”: California’s Tejón Reservation and Beyond, 1852–1864.  
By George Harwood Phillips.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0ch8m6mb>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 28(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Karr, Steven M.

**Publication Date**

2004-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

have no definitive answers, this volume reinforces Nika Collison's conclusion that Reid, her grandfather, has "given us 'things' to do" (2).

The volume is an illustrative example of how art historians are reconsidering their role in the making of an artist. Numerous scholars (Jonaitis, Summers, Glass) either call for or demonstrate an understanding of how art history has constructed the story of the renaissance and the figuring of Reid as a "genius" in that story. Each of these writers, then, demonstrates an increasingly complex, multilayered approach to history that takes into account more disparate facts than were incorporated in the formalist histories of the 1980s. The works of Steve Brown (*Native Visions*, 1998) and Robin Wright (*Northern Haida Master Carvers*, 2001) are held up as examples that provide alternative narratives, privileging the value of artwork that affirms social values (157) and that is "based on the principle of continuity of traditions" (272, n. 7).

In her preface, Ruth Phillips (then director of MOA) points out that both the conference and the book "model the contrapuntal relationships between university-based and community-based students of and authorities on Native culture that have come to characterize contemporary representations of indigenous art" (5). Although this book certainly informs the reader on Bill Reid's life, work, and legacy, it has much to offer beyond the artist himself, discussing issues that must be dealt with by scholars and students of Native art—issues of authorship, identity, and motivation of artists but also, just as importantly, those of the scholars who document their work. Duffek and Townsend-Gault point out that there were "many Bill Reids"; the perspectives presented by the authors in this volume attest to the endless perceptions and interpretations that can be brought to bear on any one subject when considered by numerous individuals. Although the era of the monograph is not over, collections such as this one avoid the pitfalls of the modernist canon "genius" and "master" paradigm that often surrounds the work of artists who, like Reid, are so much in the public eye as icons of a particular tradition. With its diverse collection of authors, *Bill Reid and Beyond* is a model for future volumes considering artists or issues in indigenous art.

*Kathryn Bunn-Marcuse*  
University of Washington

**"Bringing Them under Subjection": California's Tejón Reservation and Beyond, 1852–1864.** By George Harwood Phillips. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2004. 369 pages. \$59.95 cloth.

After the signing of the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, followed by the mass onslaught of gold seekers in 1849, the US government found itself ill prepared to understand the complexities of Native cultures in California. Placed in one of two poorly defined categories, Native peoples were termed either Mission Indians, groups associated with the Franciscan missions, or simply "wild," which was used to describe all other groups beyond the

missions' coastal influence. Deviating from the program of the previous decade, however, the federal government chose confinement over expulsion for Indian peoples throughout the vast newly acquired Western lands, and California quickly reflected this policy change. At the beginning of 1852 federal Indian agents hastily negotiated eighteen treaties with what they believed were the leaders of all known tribes in California. Public outcry by non-Hispanic Californians against the treaties persuaded the US Senate not to ratify them. This, coupled with exploitative labor laws and continued tensions with white miners and settlers, left California's Indian population in very tenuous circumstances.

This uncertainty was met with an effort to create "military posts" or reservations throughout the state where Indians would be encouraged to live, kept from the unwanted encroachments of white society by a resident garrison of soldiers. The first of these posts was the Sebastian Military Reserve, more commonly known as the Tejón Reservation. Established in 1853 at the southern end of the San Joaquin Valley, for a decade the reservation was home to 500 Tejoneños and Tulareños Indians, mostly from the Southern Valley Yokut bands that traditionally inhabited the region.

The last of a three-volume study on Indian and Euro-American relations primarily in central California by noted Native American historian George Harwood Philips, *Bringing Them under Subjection* examines the establishment and ultimate demise of the state's first permanent Indian reservation. The San Joaquin Valley—a vast expanse the author describes as a "zone of interaction"—is a region that maintains some geographic unity, a degree of cultural uniformity among its Native inhabitants, and historical continuity. Most important, though, Phillips says the valley holds this distinction "because more than other interior regions in California, it was repeatedly penetrated by Euroamericans" (xv). He further contends that during the Tejón Reservation's twelve-year tenure, Indians from the Southern Mines and the Tulare Valley—subregions of the broader San Joaquin—as a result of pressures resulting from increasing numbers of white miners and settlers and the subsequent federal policies created to address those pressures, experienced "varying degrees of subjection" (xvii).

This book is an ambitious study of a region that, as the author states, has not been thoroughly examined by either anthropologists or historians. In many respects, however, events surrounding the Tejón Reservation and the San Joaquin Valley's shorter-lived Indian farms mirror those of other reservations throughout the American West, only with different players. Many Tejoneños retained significant aspects of their indigenous culture well into the Euro-American period, in part because of ceremonial continuity and political and economic stability. Much of this could be directly attributed to their earlier accommodation of white culture, especially European-style agriculture and animal husbandry—a point initially lost even on Edward F. Beale, the American Indian agent greatly responsible for the early success of the Military Reserve plan.

Americans continually underestimated Native peoples' familiarity with white culture, much as they underestimated the complexities of Indian

culture, and California was no exception. Nevertheless, as the author points out, the state's Gold Rush prompted federal Indian officials to act quickly concerning its Indian population. Whereas some groups were displaced from their traditional lands by whites, particularly those from the Southern Mines area, other Indians chose to abide by American laws—sometimes capturing raiding parties, returning stolen livestock to white authorities, or refusing to participate in uprisings. Here Phillips specifically refers to the Garra uprising, which he so well chronicled in an earlier monograph. Tulare Indians were asked by emissaries of a southern California chief—presumably Garra himself—for their support against the Americans. The Tejoneños refused, however, as they were intent on abiding by the treaties negotiated with the Americans. Phillips notes, "To assure the residents of Los Angeles that the Tejoneños had no hostile intentions, Zapatero, headman of the Tinliw, visited the pueblo in November, presenting to the local authorities a certificate from George Barbour, stating that he was a good Indian and had befriended white people" (44).

Despite such goodwill gestures, the majority of the state's white residents remained wary of San Joaquin Valley Indians and called for their removal east of the Sierra Nevada. California Indian superintendent Beale, however, was intent on maintaining them on the military reserves, which he viewed as "a modified version of the Spanish mission system" (87). Interestingly, though, as the author correctly notes, it was not Beale but Los Angeles judge Benjamin Hayes who provided the mechanics for administering the reserves, just as Redick McKee, O. M. Wozencraft, and Barbour were actually responsible for creating the state's reservation system. Phillips is further correct in his overall assessment of Beale as an ineffective administrator of those government reserves.

As other authors have argued, Phillips also asserts that the reservation did not necessarily lead to cultural degradation but often facilitated greater sharing of traditional ceremonies, values, and customs among Indians both on and off the reserves. When government assistance fell short, Indians likely supplemented their diets by traditional means, gathering piñon nuts and other wild foods, as well as fishing and hunting waterfowl at area lakes. But the author notes that drought, poor equipment, overworked draft animals, and earthquakes were not the only reasons agriculture suffered; the location of the Tejón Reservation may have been the primary reason. Phillips reminds the reader that the Cañada de las Uvas and Tejón Pass remained the primary route for trade and communication between the San Joaquin Valley and southern California, with herds of cattle, sheep, and horses crossing once-fertile Indian cropland. Further aggravating any sense of security among the Indians was the constant stream of undesirable whites passing through their lands.

For those attached to Indian farms life was even more precarious, as white settlers hindered their ability to provide for themselves, mainly by preventing them from practicing burning to flush out wild game. This, coupled with the ill effects of drought on unirrigated fields, left few satisfactory sources of food. Settlers increasingly began to disperse Indians from their villages, forcing them to fend for themselves in areas without natural food sources and

populated by hostile whites. Not surprisingly, perhaps, many whites still held the idea that removal was the most viable Indian policy for California. Since transporting Indians to Indian Territory was impractical, Phillips notes that the editor of a San Francisco newspaper called for the US government to purchase Baja California for use as an Indian reservation.

Not unexpectedly, though, as Phillips argues, despite the difficulties they faced, Indian peoples of this region were adept at accommodating white culture. Indians were already familiar with European agricultural practices, and they were successful at individual subsistence farming, as were the Mission groups in southern California. Still, some Indians served as vaqueros and ranch hands while others relocated to Bakersfield or eventually to the Tule River Reservation.

Although it contains little ethnographic material, the book's merits are clear, as it provides a detailed account of how California's first reservations were established and how they ultimately declined in the southern San Joaquin Valley. Moreover, the author demonstrates clearly how California's Indian policy acted as a test case for a new federal program implemented throughout the American West, one that focused more on the sequestration of Native peoples on reserved lands closer to their traditional lands than on outright removal. The book contains an excellent array of maps, tables, and illustrations and is essential reading for any serious student of US federal Indian policy in the West. Together with its two predecessors, it will likely remain the most comprehensive study of Indian-white relations in California's Great Central Valley for some time to come.

*Steven M. Karr*

Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County

**Coacoochee's Bones: A Seminole Saga.** By Susan A. Miller. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2003. 284 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

A great deal of hard, extensive, and relevant archival research went into Susan Miller's important and interesting book, *Coacoochee's Bones: A Seminole Saga*. The book should be in the library of anyone seriously interested in American Indian history, especially that of the Seminoles and Creeks, and in the biographies of American Indian leaders.

Professor Miller's work joins the rising tide of literature on tribal history and culture written by tribal people themselves, providing a counterbalance to the earlier, more colonialist points of view of some established scholars whose works lack the authenticity of the voices of tribal people. I will provide context for Miller's book in the literature, addressing why and where it is important.

The sad but perhaps inevitable encounter of European and American Indian civilizations brought about many serious changes in tribal life, with many of those changes occurring in a destructive way. The changes often included the widespread scattering, dispersal, and displacement of Natives