UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
Paddling to Where I Stand: Agnes Alfred, Qwiqwasutinuxw Noblewoman. Edited by Martine J. Reid.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0ft6b5cz

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 29(2)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Miller, Bruce Granville

Publication Date
2005-03-01

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

photographs of the people, the confrontations, and the events that surrounded AIM leader Dennis Banks and formed the American Indian Movement.

John Sanchez
Pennsylvania State University

Paddling to Where I Stand: Agnes Alfred, Qwiqwasutinuxw Noblewoman. Edited by Martine J. Reid and translated by Daisy Sewid-Smith. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2004. 325 pages. $85.00 cloth; $24.95 paper.

Paddling to Where I Stand is the product of the collaboration of three women, one an elder storyteller born about 1890, the second her granddaughter and a university language instructor, and the third a French-born independent scholar, trained in anthropology and best known as the wife of the former Bill Reid, Haida artist extraordinaire. Agnes Alfred, the elder, is said to be the "author of this book" (xv), but this is only partly true. We are also told it is her book. This is programmatic and barely credible because Agnes Alfred was a nonliterate woman, a member of the nation referred to in the older literature as Kwakiutl, and more recently as the Kwakwak'wakw. In fact, the book is not simply a record of her voice; it contains diverse materials, including an introduction that considers what an autobiography or life histories might be to First Nations people, notes on style and translation, and a historical context. Chapters that give the stories told in Kwakwala by Agnes Martin and translated into English are introduced by discussions about history and ethnography. Appendixes include a eulogy by Daisy Sewid-Smith, the granddaughter, genealogical materials, and extensive notes to the chapters, containing more historical and ethnographic detail and references to social theory. The stories told by Agnes Alfred are arranged into sections that largely reflect earlier anthropological categories of study, such as "war, conflict, and slavery," "ceremonies and rituals," and "childhood." The first narratives are brief snippets of myths.

This volume continues a long-standing practice of featuring high-status people in biography, autobiography, and storytelling in the Northwest Coast. Most of these people have been male, as the authors point out, although, strangely, the autobiography of Lucy Thompson, a Yurok woman, does not seem to be accounted for in making the case for a male bias. This volume does nothing to address the equally compelling issue of aristocratic bias. As a teacher of Northwest Coast ethnography courses at the University of British Columbia for some years, I have been told on several occasions by students who are members of high-status families that lower-ranked students ought to be quiet and refrain from commenting on community life or history. This does not seem to be simply an issue of ownership of chiefly stories but reflects personal differences in rank and a consequent control over speech. The stories of rank-and-file community members would clearly be of wide interest, although including them would not accomplish some of the goals set out by the three coauthors of *Paddling*.

A related issue is the competition between the narratives of noble lineages in Northwest Coast communities. Kathy Sparrow, a Haida community member and scholar, has observed the extent to which a single family in her community has been able to influence the academic and popular imagery of the Haida for many decades. Their story, in effect, has become the Haida story. In *Paddling*, Agnes Alfred presents a number of forms of oral narratives; some are formal mythology, others are family history, and others still are personal reminiscences. Agnes Alfred occasionally contrasts the accuracy of her own stories with those of others and she relies on the practice of oral footnoting—giving the source of her stories as a means of establishing credibility. Some of these accounts are frankly political in that they advance her family at the expense of others. She presents details of non–family members she believes have violated cultural norms and behaved badly. Particular stories are especially pointed; these concern who practiced witchcraft and who attempted to gain advantage by improperly retrieving a broken copper. This last issue is notable because the possession and transmission of coppers is at the center of potlatching and ceremonial life. In earlier periods, metal was limited on the Northwest Coast, and surface-excavated, pounded copper took on great importance because it was rare and because it is obtained from within the earth, a different and spiritually potent location. Copper was shaped into something resembling the flattened human torso and painted with totemic designs. These coppers are named, spiritual entities and often are objects of great value. "Breaking" coppers by holders of chiefly title was a demonstration of power and importance. The removal of coppers, masks, and other pieces from the famous 1921 Dan Cranmer potlatch is an event notorious in tribal history and was witnessed by Agnes Alfred herself. For all of these reasons, the idea that someone, without validated rights, would retrieve the copper was, in her own words, "shameful" and dishonorable (125).

Controlling history and who can tell it is a constant feature of life in Northwest Coast communities. Indeed, a great deal is at stake in various ritual gatherings in which orators present versions of reality that they seek to have ratified by the assembled guests. These realities include such significant issues as who can hold a chiefly name and title, who should be honored and memorialized, and so on. This book, then, is itself a part of this process of laying claim to and reproducing family status. But it is peculiar in its own way that family stories and sacred oral histories would be preserved through publication on paper instead of through private storytelling and longhouse oratory. The Coast Salish elder and storyteller Vi Hilbert has claimed that she would not have published various forms of oral materials if community members would agree to live forever and ensure the transmission of these materials. In the absence of the prior practice of the regular telling of oral traditions within the community, as she experienced it as a child, she has sought out all available means to perpetuate these stories. But, as Sparrow points out, social status is perhaps not properly acquired and validated through the participation of members of the outside, nonaboriginal world.

The stories by Agnes Alfred and the commentaries surrounding them have a subtext of the rejection of modernity and the modern. The narrator

repeatedly tells of her own difficulties and puzzlement about curling irons and other devices. The tone is self-deprecating and includes comments about foolish behavior. But the volume paradoxically reveals the importance of accommodating change and the role of the elite in this process. In common with other Northwest Coast biographies and autobiographies, being the first in the community to operate a powerboat or to engage in entrepreneurial activities is revealed as a sign of leadership and personal efficacy, and Agnes Alfred's account places herself and her relatives among the elite.

The stories are frequently humorous and historically interesting. People well known to outsider academics show up frequently, including the famous carver Mungo Martin. An account of a slave served up in a feast bowl, told in song form, captures the playful and engaging nature of the book and the insistent importance of where one is placed within society (in part, 149–50):

> He who had big wide eyes
> He who had big blinking eyes
> This big sniffling man
> Peeking out of
> The feast bowl. . . .

In short, *Paddling* is a considerable contribution to Northwest Coast studies and autobiography of aboriginal peoples.

Bruce Granville Miller
University of British Columbia

The Penobscot Dance of Resistance: Tradition in the History of a People. By Pauleena MacDougall. Durham: University of New Hampshire Press, 2004. 250 pages. $24.95 paper.

The historiography of New England's Native peoples has overwhelmingly focused on those Indians residing in the region's south. But, following the lead of talented scholars like Kenneth M. Morrison, David L. Ghere, and Colin G. Calloway, historians are now publishing more books (Kevin Sweeney and Evan Haefeli's *Captors and Captives* being the most outstanding recent example) and completing more dissertations (Alice Nash and David Stewart-Smith, among others) on the Indian peoples of Maine, New Hampshire, and Vermont. Pauleena MacDougall adds her book, *The Penobscot Dance of Resistance: Tradition in the History of a People*, a four-hundred-year history of the Penobscot Nation, to this growing list.

MacDougall, associate director of the Maine Folklife Center at the University of Maine in Orono, states that she has "spent more than twenty years studying the documents, both primary and secondary, and talking with members of the community" (6). She uses the metaphor of dance as the thread that binds her narrative together over its four-century span. Because dance is "central to Penobscot culture" (11), she finds it an appropriate

metaphor for "Penobscot resistance" to both European and American oppression, characterizing their relations as a dance in which "the two lines of dancers do not know or trust one another" (12).

Focusing on the "core teachings that sustain resistance," MacDougall highlights the importance of Penobscot "traditional beliefs and customs of the culture" in their fight against "four hundred years of resistance and adaptation to cultural hegemony" (36). Guided by the trickster-hero Gluskabe and his wise grandmother, Woodchuck, the Penobscots used myth and ritual as constant resources to negotiate and interact with outsiders, especially after contact with Europeans. The Penobscots, and other Indians of Maine, were "puzzled" by Europeans at first contact, suffered through trade abuses and epidemic diseases, and "became resentful of the kinds of controls Europeans exerted over Native people's lives" (46). MacDougall argues that the Penobscots bonded with other Maine tribes early in the seventeenth century to negotiate, trade, and make war, all to counter European control. Ultimately, the Penobscots (and the rest of the Wabanaki Nation) allied themselves with the French to help them defend themselves against English land encroachment. In doing so, they began a long association with Catholicism that lasts to this day.

War characterized the period between 1688 and 1760, when all of Wabanakia became embroiled in conflicts between the French and the English—a period MacDougall characterizes as one of declension for the Penobscots. She argues that France proved to be an unreliable ally, and the removal of the French in North America in 1763 forced the Penobscots to trade with the English. They became dependent on foreign trade goods, they overhunted their region, and they began to split into factions. Many Penobscots migrated to Canada. The English forced them to accept unfair trade and political agreements, as the Penobscots did not have the economic or military strength to create alternatives. Hoping that the break between the new United States and Great Britain would bring about more positive relations with the Americans, they came to an agreement in 1775 with the government in Boston, which promised autonomy, open trade, and protection from Massachusetts settlers if the Penobscots either joined the war or remained neutral. But the Penobscots ultimately were disappointed, as the Americans failed to protect their lands, sovereignty, and safety after the Revolution.

The second half of the book, which focuses on the Penobscots' relations with Americans in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, helps to fill a wide gap in the historiography. It is the best part of the book. The Penobscots continued the "dance of resistance" during this period, as they sought to maintain their way of life in the face of white people's demands for land and Indian assimilation. They were only partially successful, however, as they were forced to give up lands in treaties to Massachusetts in 1763, 1796, and 1818 and live on a reservation. They embraced Catholicism and "repeatedly requested financial support for their Catholic priest and for education of their children" as a way to counter the "pressure to accept Protestant missionaries" (126). MacDougall argues that the Penobscots eagerly sent their children to school, for education led to greater access to the benefits of a broader