UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

A Zuni Artist Looks at Frank Hamilton Cushing: Cartoons by Phil Hughte.

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0ht0c7q0

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal, 19(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Green, Jesse D.

Publication Date

1995-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

Reviews 229

Furthermore, the introduction serves exceptionally well as an overview of issues in Native American history for this period, while the documents will provide the student with an appreciation of Indian perspectives on events and issues raised in other assigned readings or in class discussion.

David L. Ghere University of Minnesota

A Zuni Artist Looks at Frank Hamilton Cushing: Cartoons by Phil Hughte. Zuni, New Mexico: Pueblo of Zuni Arts and Crafts, A:shiwi A:wan Museum and Heritage Center, 1994. 124 pages. \$24.95 paper.

Late one September afternoon in 1879, a stranger from the East rode unannounced into Zuni Pueblo on muleback. This was Frank Hamilton Cushing, who would become Zuni's—and the world's—first live-in anthropologist. In the course of the next four-and-one-half years, Cushing became conversant in the Zuni language, was adopted into the governor's family and clan, and participated generally in the life of the pueblo, eventually winning a prominent role as an officer in the Zuni war society and an intermediary with the local white authorities. At the same time, to varying degrees of Zuni consternation, he learned—and recorded—everything he could about their culture and secret lore.

Now, a century later, Cushing remains a legendary figure in Zuni, as well as in the field of anthropology—and one who still arouses mixed feelings among Zuni people as well as among anthropologists. In Zuni, he is remembered at once as a friend who understood the Zuni and who saved a vital part of their reservation from land-grabbers with powerful political connections; as a well-meaning but comically immature busybody; and as a not-so-well-meaning intruder who wormed his way into the inner sanctums of Zuni religious life and then betrayed sacred secrets.

Mixed feelings figure accordingly in the story recounted in the forty-three cartoons by Phil Hughte gathered and published here with comments by Triloki Nath Pandey, Jim Ostler, and Krisztina Kosse. As the title suggests, the cartoons belong to the genre of "observers observed" or "the other speaks," represented (under titles that betray an earlier sensibility) in studies of indigenous art

such as Julius E. Lips's The Savage Hits Back, or The White Man Through Native Eyes (New Haven, 1937) and exhibitions such as that mounted at Chicago's Field Museum in 1961 under the title "Primitive Artists Look at Civilization." Drawing on writings by and about Cushing, on communal memories, and on sheer imagination, a contemporary Zuni artist here looks at Cushing's life from his fabled boyhood to his "last supper," when he swallowed the fatal fishbone. The drawings are arranged in chronological order, with comments by the artist and more or less (often less) apt quotations from Cushing publications. All but a few are set in Zuni and show Cushing interacting with Zuni people and others in a series of scenes that add up to a kind of ballad of his adventures in Zuni-arriving in the pueblo, eating his first traditional meal, sketching things he was not supposed to, being sick, fending off prospective Zuni brides, leading a group of Zuni headmen on a tour to Washington and Boston, getting married, shooting a Navajo horse, warning off missionaries, getting hit on the head by Matilda Stevenson's umbrella, posing as a mudhead, and so on.

More than ordinarily, this is a book you can judge (or at least be introduced to) by its cover, since this is where you see the first of the drawings—so placed, no doubt, because this particular drawing lends a perspective to all the others. Against the background of Towayalane Mesa, it shows four figures: a cartoon Cushing on the right, togged out in his Zuni vestments, aiming what appears to be a video camera at two men on the left who are looking at a painting propped on an easel. The painting hides the torso and face of the man farthest from Cushing, but the position of this man in the drawing is symmetrical to Cushing's, and the parts of him that are visible are identical to the figure representing Cushing. This Cushing double also holds a camera (of the still variety), hanging from one hand. Two fingers of his other hand make the sign of horns (or feathers?) behind the head of the third man, a realistically drawn figure whose anachronistically modern clothes, including a Northern Arizona University baseball cap, could type him as either a tourist or a contemporary Zuni. This man's profile is shadowed on the same painting that conceals the other man's face. In the center of the drawing is a cartoon Zuni child holding a palette and brushes for the artist (who uses neither in these drawings). But which of the two figures by the easel is the artist? For those who briefly wonder or do not already know, the answer to this question is provided in the frontispiece, a set of photoReviews 231

graphs of the same scene minus everyone except the modern figure, here identified as Phil Hughte. In any case, the point of the drawing and its humor seems to lie in the multiple layers of reflection it suggests: of Cushing "looking at" the Zuni, including the anomalously and ambiguously represented artist, and at himself; of Zuni people looking at Cushing and at Hughte; and of Hughte (finger-crowned from behind) looking at the reader, at the picture on the easel, and at his own profile shadowed on the latter. The question of who is/was looking at whom is thus wryly acknowledged at the outset as not altogether simple—any more than the question of who in this cast is most "different": the drawn Cushing with the sharp nose and the mustache or the "photographed" Hughte in the shades and city clothes.

The cover drawing is also typical of the rest in the interest it holds as a drawing. Most of the faces in the other drawings include the same eye-covering headband, round face, and bulbous nose with which the child in this one is endowed—a cartoon model inspired, according to Hughte's account in an interview aired on Albuquerque KNME-TV, by an encounter with a drunken man whose headband had slipped down over his eyes. For all the cartoon faces, however, there is more to meet the eye in these drawings than mere caricature—viz., on the cover, the realistic self-portrait of Hughte, the closely observed design and texture of the dress of all the figures, and the finely rendered detail of the mesa looming over the whole, as well as the unity of composition effected by this background presence and the arrangement of the figures in the foreground. Even the figures themselves, except for the faces, do not quite fit the ordinary cartoon stereotype, seeming to belong in some middle ground between cartoon and cliff painting.

What is also apparent in these drawings, in the careful attention to details of landscape, architecture, dress, paraphernalia, and activity, is Hughte's affectionate interest in capturing or recreating as much as he can of the texture of Zuni life and culture in the era of Cushing's visit. In this effort, he clearly draws not only on Cushing's descriptions but on photographs and illustrations accompanying them or dating from the same period; for example, the originals for the figure and immediate setting of the man being hanged for witchcraft (p. 33) and for the "bogeyman" (p. 45) may be found in "My Adventures in Zuni."

According to Jim Ostler's note, the idea for this collection of drawings came out of a discussion he had with Hughte on the subject of Zuni humor, particularly arising out of contacts between Zuni people and whites in their respective worlds. This subject "led directly to a discussion of THE Whiteman in Zuni, Frank Hamilton Cushing"—and thence to the first drawings and a succession of further discussions and more drawings (p. 107). Clearly, for an artist with Hughte's relish for incongruity (earlier-cartoons of his show Zuni people attracting bemused attention in the white world by bearing water jars on their heads, traveling in mule-drawn covered wagons with signs saying "San Francisco or Bust," and beating a drum at the foot of the Eiffel Tower), Cushing's career in Zuni offered rich possibilities—and a welcome shift in perspective. In this setting the norms are Zuni and the attention-attracting anomolies are white.

As the one who is "other" in this setting, Cushing is shown provoking a range of reactions—from amazement, amusement, friendly concern, or admiration to mockery or outrage. In some of the drawings, he is pictured as a more or less passive figure to whom or for whom things are being done (he is being clothed, fed, teased, deloused, nursed, washed); in others, he is busily about one or another of his various callings as observer, participant, collector, spokesman, or defender, or he is making a prayer stick, playing a Zuni flute (so badly that his hearers cover their ears), or making a graffito of his Zuni name on a wall. Not all of the scenes are humorous, but most are, and in most cases the humor is at Cushing's expense—pointing at such un-Zuni-like shortcomings as skinny legs, susceptibility to cold, or vanity (in one drawing, he has posted a sign proclaiming his famous self-identification as "1st War Chief of Zuni, U.S. Assistant Ethnologist"), or aimed at his ignorance and/or violation of Zuni proprieties (e.g., a view of him trying to take a bath in an area where Zuni women gathered to chat).

Perhaps as a form of poetic justice—given the liberties Cushing is generally assumed to have taken with fact in the interest of vivid narrative—quite a few of these scenes are purely fictional or, at any rate, independent of any known source of information outside the pueblo. In the words of an introductory note, they are "presumed by the artist to have taken place and, if they didn't, Phil believes that they should have" (p. 17). Some scenes are connected somewhat loosely to known events (e.g., Cushing's wife was reported to have been upset by Zuni people walking unannounced into their apartment, but it is not known that this happened when the Cushings were making love); others

Reviews 233

reinterpret these events to suit contemporary circumstances (in the context of the border disputes of the 1880s, the Navajo whose horse Cushing shot because it was grazing on Zuni land would not have been viewed as the "innocent bystander" Hughte refers to in the caption for his drawing of the episode). Occasionally, as in the case of the drawing of Cushing "protecting the Nutria area" from two army officers who wanted to develop it as a ranch, the aim seems to have been simply to imagine, without any particularly comic touches, how such an encounter—if it had happened—might have looked.

The last four drawings in the book concern events—real or imagined—belonging to the period after Cushing's departure from Zuni and amount to a kind of recapitulation of the ambivalent feelings this friend and intruder aroused. The first shows him posing for a photograph in a mudhead mask he had fashioned in his workshop at the Smithsonian. "This drawing," Hughte writes on the page opposite, "got me really upset and depressed that someone so helpful and loyal to the Zuni people would go back to the Smithsonian and do such a terrible thing This was a very uncomfortable drawing for me to do" (p. 96). (Nevertheless, the comedian in him could not resist adding a mouse who peers quizzically out from under the screen behind Cushing.) The next drawing shows a Zuni priest holding up the offending photograph, a white woman (identified in the television interview as Matilda Stevenson) who has brought it to him, a Zuni woman who is weeping, and four Zuni men, each with a different idea about how to deal with this breach (decapitation, hanging, castration, and initiation). The third shows Cushing seated at a beachside table in the Florida Keys, licking his lips at the sight of the fish on the platter about to be served. Under the caption "The Last Supper," Hughte points out several other features in the drawing: "On the bottom there is a black cat screaming at him. Notice that his feather is falling off. That is the end of Cushing. This was a fun drawing to do" (p. 100). In the last drawing, "an elderly Zuni is reminiscing about Cushing and some of the funny things he did. He is talking about the time Cushing dressed as a Plains Indian and had his photo taken" (p. 102). The photo of a diapered Cushing astride a saw horse appears in a cloud above the old Zuni's head, and his young Zuni audience is shown laughing.

Thus art seems to settle old scores. However, despite the obvious resentment conveyed here and there, the impression left with this reviewer by the collection as a whole is of a generally

gentle, if satiric, re-envisioning of this legendary intercultural encounter. Indeed, leafing through these drawings makes one appreciate again the esteem for hospitality and forebearance, as well as the keen sense of humor, that have always been characteristic of Zuni culture. As for Cushing, his adventures and foibles, real or imagined, are fair game, and what Hughte and his Zuni make of them may be counted on to provide other readers, as well as this one, with many a moment of amusement and delight.

Jesse D. Green Chicago State University