

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Pre-Removal Choctaw History: Exploring New Paths. Edited by Greg O'Brien.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0ph5815j>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 32(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Milne, George E.

Publication Date

2008-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

and (2) represent tribal people outside of a Western framework and survivance through the remaking of place outside of their aboriginal territories.

When the social practices about a place are studied this can reveal the ways that race, subjugation, and emancipation might manifest through place. This book serves as a widely sweeping entry into place, Native culture, and social processes. All of these ideas about place characterize the many lived practices of diverse indigenous peoples in relationship to land and place. *Place and Native American History and Culture* also gives a reading of the lived practices of those who colonize and subjugate indigenous peoples. It can give the reader an abbreviated idea of the larger social processes from which the lived practices emanate.

There are more than five hundred tribes in the United States, and although there are common ideologies across the tribal nations there are also highly differentiated experiences. These experiences are principally in terms of various treaties negotiated and of resources based on their regions. Thus this area needs scholarship. This book addresses not only a collective American Indian idea of place but also various geographic sites in the United States: southeast tribes, southwest tribes, northern tribes, central plains tribes, and northwest tribes. *Place and Native American History and Culture* can capably launch an interested scholar in the direction of these regions as well as create a pan-Indian perspective, especially in terms of the federal government's relationship with tribes and the issues it has generated. Porter's work demonstrates the many ways American Indians and place can be understood and represented, which consequently informs decolonizing scholarship. In summary, Porter assembles a collection that offers many points of departure to interrogate tribal ideas about and relationships to place further.

Laura Harjo

University of Southern California

Pre-Removal Choctaw History: Exploring New Paths. Edited by Greg O'Brien. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. 256 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

In an effort to close a gap in the written history of the Choctaws, Greg O'Brien has assembled the work of some of the most important scholars in the field. In many ways, he has succeeded in doing so. The last twenty-five years have witnessed a growing number of monographs on Native Americans of the Southeast during the Colonial and Early Republic eras. Before this time, most historians focused on American Indians after Removal. This oversight was particularly true of the so-called Five-Civilized Tribes. Although other nations such as the Cherokees and Creeks have been the subject of recent books, the Choctaws' story before the 1830s has been neglected. *Pre-Removal Choctaw History* seeks to address this oversight. Aside from O'Brien's contributions (an introduction and three articles that cover the late eighteenth century), the book contains six more essays by James Taylor Carson, Patricia Galloway, LeAnne Howe, and Clara Sue Kidwell, the

last two of whom are Choctaws, each dealing with a specific aspect of the Choctaw Nation's past.

Focus is one of the strengths of this collection. Although the authors' works concentrate on narrow topics, taken together, they form a cohesive narrative. Moreover, several essays address some issues of interest to newcomers to the field. O'Brien's introduction, "The Coming of Age of Choctaw History," not only surveys the historiography of the field but also entices budding scholars to begin their own research by listing archival repositories at the end of the article.

LeAnne Howe's contribution examines the tale of the Unknown Woman, or the "Woman Who Stretches Way Back," the person who gave the Choctaws corn. After briefly retelling the old story, Howe appends a play script. By framing the written word as dialogue, she reminds the reader of the oral roots of Choctaw history, thereby offering a subtle commentary on more conventional academic approaches to recovering the past.

Patricia Galloway's first installment, "Countering a Powerful Indefiniteness," performs a similar function as she offers a commentary on the growth of the field. After recounting her experiences learning the trade of an ethnohistorian of the Choctaws, she provides an excellent bibliography of archaeological articles published by her former employer, the Mississippi Department of Archives and History. Galloway's other contribution on the Choctaw Civil War first appeared in the *Journal of Mississippi History* in 1982, and, until now, copies of it have been difficult to find. It is safe to say that the article has stood the test of time and remains the definitive study of a complicated period.

O'Brien's article on Anglo-Choctaw trade between 1763 and 1774 chronicles the cynical manner in which British imperial agents employed trade to instigate perpetual war between the Creeks and the Choctaws. They did so to prevent these Indians from raiding the colonies to the east. The fighting that took place during the 1760s and 1770s, however, fit into long-standing patterns of Southeastern intertribal warfare. The British could influence war leaders by providing guns and ammunition, but such conflicts proved difficult to manage for the benefit of the Crown, particularly after the Choctaws began to trade with the new masters of New Orleans, the Spanish.

The next two entries are also by Greg O'Brien, and both deal with the Choctaws during the 1780s. The first of these recounts the assistance the Choctaws rendered the British during the siege of Pensacola during 1781. O'Brien takes aim at the often-repeated assertion that the Choctaws aided the patriot cause during the war. He demonstrates through evidence culled from Spanish documents that the Choctaws took the side of the British to support their most important trading partners. The second essay examines the negotiations leading to the Treaty of Hopewell in 1785. O'Brien shows that Americans, who misinterpreted Choctaw expectations of hospitality, ignored the Indians' demands for trade and other concessions. By dealing with the Spanish in Florida and New Orleans, Choctaws refused to honor the parts of the treaty that restricted their diplomacy as dependents of the United States. Instead of creating a "middle ground," the inability of one side to understand

the other or to convince them to adopt their cultural practices made the Old Southwest “a contested zone.”

James Taylor Carson’s contribution focuses on the social impact of cattle on the Choctaws. He challenges Charles Sellars’s argument that land and land-use patterns were the most important brake on the triumph of impersonal capitalistic trading practices during the early nineteenth century (Charles Sellars, *The Market Revolution: Jacksonian America, 1815–1846*, 1991). Carson argues that culture was “an even more conservative force with the market economy” (183). Rather than disrupting Choctaw society, animal husbandry offered an alternative to harvesting deerskins. Women as well as men played a role in this economy and exchanged cattle with their white neighbors for goods and services. This permitted the Choctaws to soften the impact of the emerging market economy and preserve their culture during the first decades of the 1800s.

Clara Sue Kidwell’s essay on missionaries in Choctaw country also speaks of cultural continuity. Although Protestant missionaries tried to mold the Choctaws in their own image, “they often found themselves being bent to the will of tribal leaders even as they tried to bring the Choctaws to spiritual salvation” (200). Men like Cyrus Kingsbury, in their efforts to convert these Indians, helped to bring literacy to the Choctaw people. One of the most important contributions came from the missionary Cyrus Byington when he translated the Bible into Choctaw, thereby creating “the definitive version of Choctaw orthography” (217). By teaching reading and writing skills in the Choctaw language, missionaries helped sustain the Choctaws culture and helped them preserve their identity for the present generation.

James Taylor Carson wrote the final chapter, a short biography of Greenwood LeFlore. This Choctaw leader’s role in negotiating the Treaty of Dancing Rabbit Creek has left him with a bad reputation as an ambitious “mixed blood,” who traded away the Choctaw’s Mississippi homeland. His plantation, worked by African American slaves, reinforced the notion that LeFlore turned his back on a “traditional” Indian lifestyle. Carson reframes LeFlore as a Creole who lived a blended lifestyle that incorporated elements of European and Native cultural, religious, and economic practices.

O’Brien’s effort to bridge the gap between precontact and post-Removal Choctaw history is impressive. To say the least, he has assembled an “all-star” team of Colonial Indian scholars. *Pre-Removal Choctaw History* will make a welcome resource for upper-division and graduate students as well as the casual reader new to the field. For its many strong points, the book falls short in two areas. First, several of the works have been around for some time. For instance, the articles by Galloway and Kidwell are more than a quarter-century old, and although they have stood up well, it may be time for a new look at the subject. The other area is a bit broader. Although the stories fit together quite well, it still leaves some room for a book to cover the eighteenth-century void between Patricia Galloway’s seminal *Choctaw Genesis* and Angie Debo’s classic *The Rise and Fall of the Choctaw Republic*. Nonetheless, even if O’Brien’s collection has not completely bridged the gap, he has significantly narrowed it.

George E. Milne
Oakland University