

UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

Sexuality and the Unnatural in Colonial Latin America

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0qf2s5fv>

Journal

Hispanic American Historical Review, 100(2)

ISSN

0018-2168

Author

O'Toole, Rachel Sarah

Publication Date

2020-05-01

DOI

10.1215/00182168-8178479

Peer reviewed

auctions, lending, public readings, discussions, and performances in the informal settings of pulperias, barbershops, beauty salons, and shoe stores.

Soriano coins original concepts with the potential to transform interdisciplinary studies of the Age of Revolutions. Venezuela's port towns and cities were home to "semiliterate" communities that promoted "plebeian literacy" among diverse social groups lacking full and independent access to the written word but fully engaging in public debate nonetheless (pp. 40–41). Complemented by a wide circulation of hand-copied manuscripts and ephemeral texts, orality was a particularly effective form of communication that, Soriano asserts, slowly altered the social and political environment in Venezuela by making revolution, liberty, equality, and abolition familiar to all. In this incipient public sphere, revolutionary ideas were no simple foreign contagion, as colonial elites and authorities claimed. They were reshaped through rewriting, debate, and retelling to reflect local society and fit its members' political needs and goals.

Soriano's final three chapters present case studies of lesser-known movements that were steeped in Venezuela's semiliterate political culture and included the participation of slaves, free Afro-descendant peoples, and white "dissident elite readers" (p. 71). One will not find the 1795 Coro rebellion, the 1797 La Guaira conspiracy, or the 1799 Maracaibo revolt treated with depth in broad surveys of slavery and revolution. *Tides of Revolution* is sure to change that. Soriano's analysis of the 1797 La Guaira conspiracy neatly encapsulates her book's unique contributions. Although these movements failed, Soriano intriguingly suggests that they not only resulted in new forms of repression and surveillance but succeeded in producing concessions that gave Afro-Venezuelans spaces to pursue "new social and political roles" (p. 213). The immediate consequences of these late 1790s events are evident, but their effects in the decade after could have been further elucidated, especially for Afro-Venezuelans' social networks.

Tides of Revolution offers a bounty of novel historical insights and is a noteworthy revision to understandings of the public sphere. By analyzing non-print-based information mediums and forms of nation making that have been ignored, Soriano highlights earlier preindependence social networks that even Benedict Anderson's critics overlooked. This book will spawn similar investigations and inspire new debates about whether Latin America, particularly Venezuela, was an Atlantic revolutionary outlier.

EDWARD P. POMPEIAN, University of Tampa

DOI 10.1215/00182168-8178468

Sexuality and the Unnatural in Colonial Latin America. Edited by ZEB TORTORICI. Oakland: University of California Press, 2016. Figures. Tables. Notes. Index. xiv, 239 pp. Paper, \$29.95.

Zeb Tortorici explains that gender and sex were defined in colonial Latin America according to bodily designations. Drawing on the growing field of early modern science studies, the editor and the nine contributors work to explain how distinctions between natural and unnatural ordered inhabitants of the Iberian Americas. The volume, as a

whole, asks how colonial authorities and church officials described people who did not present as gender normative or engage in procreative sexual activities, heteronormative marriage arrangements, and patriarchal ordering of family.

Turning away from a recovery of gay history to understand how queer sex worked within theological conceptions of sin, the chapters as a whole communicate why bestiality (as explored in Milada Bazant's chapter), incest, sodomy, and masturbation were considered unnatural acts in the colonial era. In his riveting contribution, Martín Bowen Silva argues that a Chilean elite cataloged his sins according to the distinction of natural versus unnatural while at the same time "constructing his own knowledge of the body" (p. 105). With evidence from the rare archival find of this young elite man's journal, Bowen Silva claims that José Ignacio Eyzaguirre's masturbation and sexual experimentation with others was part of his Enlightenment drive to create knowledge. Fernanda Molina's brilliant chapter examines Inquisition prosecutions of the sin and the crime of sodomy to explain how men such as Luis de Herrera—who boldly named himself as a "puto"—articulated a shared community that forged erotic and emotional bonds through hugging, holding hands, and caressing among men who shared bedrooms and lives (p. 155). Engaged in foundational and current queer theory, including that of Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick and others, Molina's work joins that of Bowen Silva and Nicole von Germeten to identify a vibrant and contentious collectivity of queers.

Among the greatest contributions of the volume is the deep exploration of women's sexuality, based in astonishing archival research and astute interpretation. Unsurprisingly, colonial inhabitants incorporated Catholic practices and beliefs into their sexual habits. Jacqueline S. Holler suggests in her chapter that the devil figured prominently in unnatural activities, especially for women, whom the Catholic clergy understood as especially susceptible to evil temptations. Simultaneously, women invoked the devil—whether he appeared as a black man or a friendly dog—as a superior lover. Moreover, the volume is filled with examples of women who "play[ed]" with, seduced, kissed, cohabited with, and courted other women, including inserting "instruments" into willing vaginas and available anuses (pp. 82–83). A majority of these examples were shrouded within clerical and judicial doubts of what Zeb Tortorici has described as "penetrational ambiguity" (p. 121). Nevertheless, Chad Thomas Black illuminates two rare secular prosecutions of "female sodomy" in eighteenth-century Quito of women who were known publicly as lovers and partners (p. 120). As such, the volume expands on an emerging scholarship regarding feminine, queer, and trans sexuality in the colonial period that has been previously explored by some of this volume's contributors such as Asunción Lavrin and Pete Sigal, but also Martha Few and the late María Elena Martínez.

The collection carefully outlines the power of patriarchy over people with effeminate gender presentations, as does von Germeten in her examination of an inquisitorial prosecution of clerical sodomy. The case highlights the repeated sexual predation that women of color especially experienced in the vibrant Caribbean port of Cartagena. While clearly recuperating queer sex acts among men, von Germeten underlines the racial and class hierarchies that allowed a Spanish-descent cleric to harass, assault, and objectify black women, men, and children. Indeed, the contributors repeatedly remind us

of the limitations facing historians since, as Ronaldo Vainfas and Tortorici explain, sex among females was generally dismissed, or misunderstood, as not counting as a crime of heresy (abandoning an article of faith) or sodomy (anal penetration with ejaculation) and therefore left undocumented (pp. 78, 81). Lee M. Penyak's chapter additionally reveals the overwhelming patriarchal power of fathers and husbands to rule their households but also to be pardoned from their sexual crimes against daughters and wives. Nonetheless, Nora E. Jaffary's insightful explanation of why a lower-status woman in late eighteenth-century Mexico did not threaten the Inquisition even as she inserted images of saints into her vagina underlines the erasure of women as sexual agents but reveals a glorious world of sexual activity (p. 49).

The authors' treatment of racial hierarchies, however, required keener attention to violence within slavery and the sexual exploitation of women of color throughout the Americas. Sexual activities between a slaveholder and an enslaved person of their household are unfortunately discussed in the same register as relations between elite schoolboys in urban Santiago. The book nonetheless remains remarkably teachable. The essays are filled with concise but vivid stories of individuals deeply located within specific historical contexts, further encouraging us to investigate the vast terrain of sex throughout colonial Latin America.

RACHEL SARAH O'TOOLE, University of California, Irvine

DOI 10.1215/00182168-8178479

Twentieth–Twenty-First Centuries

Argentina's Missing Bones: Revisiting the History of the Dirty War.

By JAMES P. BRENNAN. Violence in Latin American History. Oakland: University of California Press, 2018. Photographs. Maps. Tables. Appendixes. Notes.

Bibliography. Index. xi, 195 pp. Paper, \$34.95.

Argentina's Missing Bones is about the history of the dirty war in Córdoba province and the author's search to find the specific features that would make it a "unique" case within Argentina (p. 18). Chapter 1 reviews the social forces that the province's military authorities perceived as threatening. Chapter 2 studies the repressive apparatus created by Luciano Benjamín Menéndez, who from 1975 was in charge of the Córdoba-based Third Army Corps; chapter 3 studies La Perla, the province's most important clandestine detention center (CDC), through which more than 1,000 prisoners passed. Chapters 4 and 5 respectively analyze the Third Army Corps' dynamics and transnational influences on the Argentine military's indoctrination. The final three chapters are devoted to some of this process's consequences: respectively, the trials that ended up condemning Menéndez to life imprisonment, the memory of those directly affected by state terrorism in Córdoba, and the question of blame for what happened.

The book's main contribution is to provide a cartography of illegal repression in Córdoba, which covered not only the six clandestine detention centers created by