

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Where the Two Roads Meet. By Christopher Vecsey.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0s31p2s1>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 25(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Morrison, Kenneth M.

Publication Date

2001-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

of various ceremonies. The act of weaving is not simply about putting designs onto a loom; weaving is done with various symbols, which have lost their cultural meanings due to centuries of enculturation and acculturation. In the process, weavers interpreted and acquired views on aesthetic, economic, political, and social changes that then showed themselves in their weavings. During the nineteenth century and earlier, all Navajo textiles had a religious ceremony symbol intertwined with them, but general cultural knowledge of such symbols has been displaced through time, due mostly to the continual cultural loss the Navajo are experiencing.

Of course, many of my questions on this book circulate around Navajo weaving and the broader cultural understanding of indigenous art. As a weaver for the past twenty-five-plus years, the current Navajo weavers view their work more as an art than anything else. Navajo textile weaving is commonly referred to here and elsewhere as craft (p. 4). In art theory, craft is attributed to the manual labor involved and which is thought to involve limited intellectual thought process or creativity skills.

It is certainly time to move away from the continuous commodification of Native art, which has been overanalyzed for decades. It is the twenty-first century and works on color and weft/warp analyses still are published in abundance. There is a desperate need for specific tribal and cultural analysis of textiles and other art by Native people, since they will utilize the outcome of the work and not shelf the results.

Wesley Thomas
Indiana University

Where the Two Roads Meet. By Christopher Vecsey. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1999. 400 pages. \$40.00 cloth.

Christopher Vecsey's *Where the Two Roads Meet* is the third and final volume of his historically comprehensive series *American Indian Catholics*. Volume one, *On the Padre's Trail* (1996), treats Spanish Catholicism among Native Mexican peoples, the Pueblos of the Mexican-American Southwest, and Indian Catholicism in California. Volume two, *The Paths of Kateri's Kin* (1997), focuses on French Catholicism's effects on seventeenth-century Algonkians and Iroquoians, the history and contemporary character of Catholicism for those peoples and for the Muskogean of the Southeast, and it examines the trajectory of Catholicism in the Pacific Northwest. Similarly, *Where the Two Roads Meet* combines a historical analysis of the development of Catholicism among the Sioux, a careful reading of American Indian missiology, and a detailed study of Indian Catholicism in general in the period after World War II. All three volumes consolidate what is known about the historical and ongoing Native American-Catholic encounter.

Although all three volumes share a similar structure, *Where the Two Roads Meet* best expresses Vecsey's intent of reconstructing religious history as a way of understanding contemporary forms of Indian Catholicism. In a number of

vignettes, Vecsey surveys Native American ways of ignoring, repudiating, resisting, appropriating, adapting, consolidating, syncretizing, and compartmentalizing traditional religious views and the alternative (and sometimes apparently complementary) theologies of Catholicism. I use the word *theologies* because Vecsey documents not only a variety of Catholic theological views, but a myriad of indigenous Christianities as well. At the same time, Vecsey carefully develops the particular understandings and changing proselytizing strategies of Spanish, French, and American missionaries, as well as Native American responses to them.

All these themes are handled on the basis of extensive archival research and on a comprehensive reading of an enormous literature that make the series a thorough overview of the missionary-Native encounter. These volumes are particularly outstanding in their focus on twentieth-century Native American efforts to make sense of Catholicism in a nearly bewildering variety of ways. At this level, Vecsey created a new, field-oriented historical methodology. Vecsey traveled throughout the continent talking and corresponding extensively with both Native Catholics and the bishops, priests, and nuns (sometimes Native priests and nuns) who have attempted to interpret Catholicism to address Native Americans' religious needs. He thus presents a scholarly and personal knowledge of church-oriented and indigenous forms of Catholicism that few others possess.

These methods make *Where the Two Roads Meet* important in four outstanding ways. First, Vecsey focuses on the religious history of the Jesuit-Lakota encounter: the culturally hostile mindset of the priests, rivalry with Protestant missionaries, and the success and failure of Catholic schools and religious sodalities in promoting radical religious change before World War II. In addition, Vecsey surveys the role played by Lakota catechists, Nicholas Black Elk among them. Foreshadowing the expansive discussion of his final section, Vecsey also reconstructs Lakota religious history during the post-war period as priests haltingly attempted to incorporate the forms of Lakota religious culture (sweats and the Pipe, for example) into Catholic liturgy. Vecsey also details how Lakota people variously resisted and cooperated with such adaptations. Second, Vecsey gives careful attention to the cultural tolerance and intolerance of Catholic missionaries to various Native peoples and their changing social, political, and economic circumstances; at this level, *Where the Two Roads Meet* contextualizes Catholicism in the larger currents of twentieth-century American Indian reservation and urban life. Third, Vecsey provides biographical sketches of some of the most prominent Native and non-Native leaders. Here he examines the tension between those who wished to incorporate American Indians in a universalistic church and those who favored accommodation—inculturation is the term of choice—to indigenous religious forms and sensibilities. Fourth, Vecsey applies the results of his field work and correspondence to a comprehensive overview of the Catholic-Indian relationship since the Vatican II. Subsequent to that council various popes have articulated a more tolerant view of indigenous cultures and Vecsey follows the North American developments closely. In this section, Vecsey conveys the complexity of viewpoints in a number of ways, particularly in exam-

ining the Church's effort to use the annual Tekakwitha Conference to achieve inculturation. As Vecsey demonstrates, Catholic Indian participation in the conference has produced ongoing controversy among Indian laity and largely non-Indian clerics, among the clerics, and also among Native peoples themselves.

The least satisfactory element of *Where the Two Roads Meet* emerges in Vecsey's overly general treatment of indigenous religious life. "Traditional Sioux Spirituality," an example typical of all three volumes, is given slightly more than one-and-a-half pages (pp. 5–6), and these describe Lakota cosmology and religious conception in ethnocentric terms. It is certainly true that making relatives was traditionally a central Lakota religious goal. But, such a goal does not fit well with Vecsey's characterization of Lakota cosmology as consisting of a holy (and thus implicitly profane) realm of being which "permeated" not only the "natural world" but the whole cosmos. The term *permeated* reduces the interpersonal interactions of making relatives to an impersonal and biochemical process, and the term *holy* stipulates a cosmic hierarchy in which the Lakota people would be, as Catholics contend all people are, subservient to beings greater than themselves. Vecsey thus imposes a Catholic system of ontology and dimensionality on an unexamined Lakota cosmology: divinity, the sacred, humanity, and nature. That some humans beings shared *wakan* characteristics with other-than-human persons should alert us, however, that cosmic differentiation of beings into greater and lesser forms did not obtain in the Lakota worldview. Moreover, the act of making relatives with cosmic beings necessarily entails mutual responsibility, an understanding that Vecsey shows the Catholic Church has begun to approach in recent times, but also a relational insight difficult to balance against the cosmic hierarchy and the hierarchical authority of the Church.

The problem here is not simply that Vecsey applies such religiously ethnocentric terms without justifying them. Rather, the central issue is that such an approach undercuts Vecsey's ability to make sense of religious change. On the one hand, he demonstrates that translation of religious concepts has had a troubled, and for scholars troublesome, history between the Lakota and Catholic missionaries. On the other, the problem is that nineteenth-century Lakota had a distinctive philosophy of being, a particular way of knowing reality, and an ethical and relational view of religious responsibility that shaped the ways in which they made and to some degree still make sense of Catholic views of reality. Lakota ways of reasoning are still poorly understood by scholars, and by missionaries who aim to transform indigenous forms of rationality they barely see. To be fair, Vecsey states that understanding indigenous thought as the motive force of historical religious syncretism is not the primary purpose of these volumes, but the series is also handicapped in understanding indigenous processes of religious change because it marginalizes the influence of traditional religious orientations on religious history.

Further, if Lakota religious views were non-theistic, then Catholic views of superior cosmic divinity, of culture as shaped by original and ongoing human sin, of the need for saving grace, constitute in their universalistic imposition on Native peoples a culturally genocidal shift in worldview. Was the mission-

aries' translation of their god concept as Wakantanka, or even as the Great Spirit, meaningful to the Lakota people, or even adequate as an expression of the theocentric missionary cosmos? Vecsey presents much evidence that neither Lakota nor missionaries were satisfied with the analogy in the past, or even now. Are contemporary missionaries correct in saying that pre-contact Lakota, other Native Americans, and Catholics everywhere "worship" the same God? These sorts of questions, and they are central to understanding religious history, cannot be asked or answered on the basis of Vecsey's characterization of traditional Lakota religious conception and practice. He does demonstrate that misunderstandings of traditional Native American worldviews have shaped not only the shifting missiological project of the Catholic Church, but also the religious views of some, perhaps many, Indian Catholics. Just as Catholic missionary leaders and some Native American individuals have done, Vecsey struggles against his imprecise view of traditional Native American religious systems.

Kenneth M. Morrison
Arizona State University

Will the Time Ever Come? A Tlingit Source Book. Edited by Andrew Hope III and Thomas F. Thornton. Fairbanks: University of Alaska Fairbanks, Alaska Native Knowledge Network, 2000. 160 pages. \$15.00 paper.

Will the Time Ever Come? A Tlingit Source Book is a compilation of papers that were presented at the Conference of Tlingit Tribes and Clans in Haines, Alaska, in 1993. Informally known as the Clan Conference, the 1993 meeting brought together for the first time Native and non-Native scholars in a collaborative effort to exchange and preserve traditional Tlingit knowledge. The paper topics touch on a variety of issues, including Tlingit historiography, clan migrations, warfare, kinship, property tenure, language, ethnogeography, cultural resource management, subsistence, and naming. Part one is on Tlingit history and traditions, part two on contemporary issues and projects, and the appendix contains previously unpublished manuscripts written by Lieutenant George Emmons, an ethnographer who worked among the Tlingit in the late nineteenth century, and a working list of the Tlingit clans and clan houses.

Like this book, an appreciation of Tlingit history and culture necessarily involve a basic understanding of the Tlingit clan system. Tlingit society is divided into two equal parts or moieties. Numerous clans are organized under the two moieties. Within each clan, there are usually a number of related house groups. Tlingit settlements, also known as *kwaans*, are scattered throughout southeast Alaska. Traditionally the clan was the primary social unit. All important decisions regarding subsistence, warfare, and migration were made at the clan level. *Will the Time Ever Come?* contains historical accounts of a few *kwaans* and migration stories of a couple clans.

In the introduction, Andy Hope proposes that the confluence of deferential Tlingit social patterns and aggressive missionaries placed Tlingit culture