

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Penobscot Dance of Resistance: Tradition in the History of a People. By Pauleena MacDougall.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/0z09b8nj>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 29(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bilodeau, Christopher

Publication Date

2005-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

metaphor for “Penobscot resistance” to both European and American oppression, characterizing their relations as a dance in which “the two lines of dancers do not know or trust one another” (12).

Focusing on the “core teachings that sustain resistance,” MacDougall highlights the importance of Penobscot “traditional beliefs and customs of the culture” in their fight against “four hundred years of resistance and adaptation to cultural hegemony” (36). Guided by the trickster-hero Gluskabe and his wise grandmother, Woodchuck, the Penobscots used myth and ritual as constant resources to negotiate and interact with outsiders, especially after contact with Europeans. The Penobscots, and other Indians of Maine, were “puzzled” by Europeans at first contact, suffered through trade abuses and epidemic diseases, and “became resentful of the kinds of controls Europeans exerted over Native people’s lives” (46). MacDougall argues that the Penobscots bonded with other Maine tribes early in the seventeenth century to negotiate, trade, and make war, all to counter European control. Ultimately, the Penobscots (and the rest of the Wabanaki Nation) allied themselves with the French to help them defend themselves against English land encroachment. In doing so, they began a long association with Catholicism that lasts to this day.

War characterized the period between 1688 and 1760, when all of Wabanakia became embroiled in conflicts between the French and the English—a period MacDougall characterizes as one of declension for the Penobscots. She argues that France proved to be an unreliable ally, and the removal of the French in North America in 1763 forced the Penobscots to trade with the English. They became dependent on foreign trade goods, they overhunted their region, and they began to split into factions. Many Penobscots migrated to Canada. The English forced them to accept unfair trade and political agreements, as the Penobscots did not have the economic or military strength to create alternatives. Hoping that the break between the new United States and Great Britain would bring about more positive relations with the Americans, they came to an agreement in 1775 with the government in Boston, which promised autonomy, open trade, and protection from Massachusetts settlers if the Penobscots either joined the war or remained neutral. But the Penobscots ultimately were disappointed, as the Americans failed to protect their lands, sovereignty, and safety after the Revolution.

The second half of the book, which focuses on the Penobscots’ relations with Americans in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, helps to fill a wide gap in the historiography. It is the best part of the book. The Penobscots continued the “dance of resistance” during this period, as they sought to maintain their way of life in the face of white people’s demands for land and Indian assimilation. They were only partially successful, however, as they were forced to give up lands in treaties to Massachusetts in 1763, 1796, and 1818 and live on a reservation. They embraced Catholicism and “repeatedly requested financial support for their Catholic priest and for education of their children” as a way to counter the “pressure to accept Protestant missionaries” (126). MacDougall argues that the Penobscots eagerly sent their children to school, for education led to greater access to the benefits of a broader

American society and helped the Indians negotiate with American state governments. Throughout the nineteenth century, the Penobscots worked hard to control their land's resources and to hunt and fish as they liked, and they supplemented their income through basketry, guiding, lumbering, domestic work, and shoe making. They also attempted to block outside control from white Indian agents appointed by the state, to maintain their Catholic priests instead of Protestant ministers, to marry within their community, and to speak the Penobscot language, all against the wishes of Massachusetts, then Maine (after it became a state in 1820).

They maintained this adversarial stance even through the difficulties of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The constant resistance took its toll on the Penobscots, MacDougall argues, and it led to internal rifts that hurt group cohesion and effectiveness. Factions arose in the mid-nineteenth century around two, then three political parties on the reservation, each with its own platforms on such flashpoint issues as language, education, and assimilation. The Penobscots negotiated these internal problems while simultaneously dealing with growing American encroachment. Overall, Penobscots "resisted the paternal actions of the state" (164) by petitioning their causes to the state government, demanding their choices for Indian agents, and seeking to maintain sovereignty as outlined by eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century treaties. They used the "commodification of culture" as a "resistance strategy for economic and cultural survival" through the creation, marketing, and sales of Indian goods such as canoes, or through their status as "authentic" Indians to work in the tourist industry (192–93). The Penobscots appropriated the market for their own use, MacDougall argues, for they understood that "cultural continuity does not mean cultural sameness, and cultural change does not result in total assimilation or extinction" (195).

The Penobscots of the twentieth century continued to face splits within their community. After fighting in Europe and the Pacific during World War II, many Penobscot soldiers left a world outside of the United States where they were treated with dignity and respect, only to return to a world inside the United States that denied them jobs and marginalized them in American life. Many left the reservation, hoping to take advantage of the opportunities that lay outside of it. But others attempted to use their military experiences, their education, and the example of the African American civil rights movement of the 1950s and 1960s in ways that "strengthened Penobscot resistance efforts in the twentieth century" (21). Federal recognition and the subsequent land claims settlement, MacDougall contends, resulted from those efforts. Employment, education levels, and average salaries all rose after the land claims settlement, and the Penobscots wielded a political leverage they simply did not have before. The largest victory from the settlement, she argues, might be in the realm of psychology, as it instilled a sense of accomplishment on the reservation. But splits within the community remained, as more radical "traditionalists" viewed the settlement as a sellout, and attempted to use older Penobscot cultural practices as political weapons against accommodation and American cultural encroachment. This situation led to tension on the reservation, which continues today.

Unfortunately, certain errors mar the first half of the book. For example, the Sokokis are not the same as the Sacos, as they are on map 1, but, as Gordon M. Day noted, they lived instead along the Connecticut River Valley, in western New England. The Kennebec sachem Mogg did not fight in King William's War (in Maine, 1689–98) for he died in 1677, during the King Philip's War. France did not "let go" of the southern coast of Acadia to the English in Utrecht in 1713 but instead ceded Acadia according to "its ancient limits," and a commission was supposed to be created (it never was) to identify just what those ancient limits were (79). And Norridgewock was destroyed and its Jesuit, Sébastien Râle, killed, in 1724, not 1723. Some of these errors, and others like them, might be attributed to an incomplete bibliography, as MacDougall often cites older, outdated works instead of newer scholarship (the works of Emerson W. Baker, Alvin H. Morrison, and Gordon M. Day are not in the bibliography, nor is Bruce J. Bourque's recent *Twelve Thousand Years: American Indians in Maine* [2001]). This is puzzling, as much of this neglected scholarship could support her overall thesis.

One could question MacDougall's focus on resistance in the book. She convincingly highlights the ability of the Penobscots to shape their world and to resist European and American influence. But by emphasizing resistance so thoroughly, she at times flattens out the dynamic interaction between white people and Indians. The Europeans did not gain hegemony over the region immediately at contact, and the Penobscots, as MacDougall ably shows, maintained a power to act in creative ways. Those ways might not all be best characterized as resistance. But overall, this work, especially its second half, covers neglected ground and should raise new questions for the historians of nineteenth- and twentieth-century Wabanaki Indians.

Christopher Bilodeau
Cornell University

Precious Cargo: California Indian Cradle Baskets and Childbirth Traditions. By Brian Bibby, with an essay by Craig D. Bates. Berkeley: Heydey Books, 2004. 146 pages. \$22.50 paper.

Thirty contemporary California Indian basket weavers were commissioned to create cradleboards for inclusion in *Precious Cargo: California Indian Cradle Baskets and Childbirth Traditions*, an exhibition curated by Brian Bibby at the Marin Museum of the American Indian. The exhibition catalog includes color photographs of these, as well as older versions, and comments made by the weavers during oral interviews conducted by Bibby. The objective of the exhibit is to explore the use, form, and meaning of cradle baskets and place them within the context of childbirth traditions from twenty-three California tribes.

The catalog contains three parts. The first part, the introduction, presents the results of Bibby's research and includes a brief historical overview of the Euro-American influence on California tribes; the forms and functions of