

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Prayer on Top of the Earth: The Spiritual Universe of the Plains Apaches. By Kay Parker Schweinfurth.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/10p418pf>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 27(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Greenfeld, Philip J.

Publication Date

2003-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

an exhibition called "In the Beginning." The immediate commercial success of these simple but bold figures on colorful backgrounds brought the project visibility, continuing orders, and further financial support. After 1979, the tapestries changed when a new adviser encouraged more complex narrative scenes and more blended colors. New artists and newly trained weavers started to produce multiple editions of the same work, although exact copies were never intended. Adviser Deborah Hickman enhanced the quality of weaving, and larger tapestries involving multiple weavers, were tried. Though women artists produced most of the drawings used, many men also began to submit drawings. Occasionally "modern" images, such as a helicopter, were reproduced, but for the most part, the weavers preferred to depict "traditional" life on the land and former spiritual beliefs. Von Finckenstein correctly suggests that it's not just the white market that desires this "memory art," but the artists and weavers themselves see the opportunity to preserve images of their former nomadic lives and pass on these lost realities to their children and to white people who have never known those experiences.

In the past decade, specialized workshops have trained the weavers in more sophisticated rendering of lines and textures, and more dramatic landscapes and natural scenes have become common. Although nineteen women weaver-artists have worked on the 500 or so tapestries produced since 1970, a smaller core of long-term employees has become very skilled. Younger artists, who never knew the nomadic life, are submitting drawings, and the Tapestry Studio is soliciting more specialized and large, often "architectural" commissions for its unique works.

This book tells the story with the most appropriate contributors and illustrates the works in high quality plates. Central are the contributions of July Papatsie, who not only wrote a chapter, but served as translator for some of the non-Inuit contributors and produced culturally explanatory commentaries on most of the artworks. He also includes recorded stories and statements by artists going back as far as 1976.

As is the authoritative work to date on the Pangnirtung experiment, this book is well worth buying for both the detailed history and the illustrations, which represent about 10 percent of the tapestries produced to date. However, there are no illustrations of the weaving studio and the artists at work. One might also ask why none of the key non-Inuit participants are portrayed along with their Inuit colleagues.

Nelson Graburn

University of California at Berkeley

Prayer on Top of the Earth: The Spiritual Universe of the Plains Apaches. By Kay Parker Schweinfurth. Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2002. 239 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

This book falls within the genre of what used to be called "salvage ethnography," ethnography based on interviews with the last surviving members of a

society who had actually experienced a previous, but no longer viable way of life. Most of the data recounted by Schweinfurth was gathered by William E. Bittle or his students in field schools he directed for the University of Oklahoma's Department of Anthropology and Indian Studies Program between 1952 and 1964. The ethnographic focus of the book is the Plains Apaches, a group known in the older literature as the Kiowa-Apache. Schweinfurth (p. xvii–xiviii) is quick to point out that the ethnonym currently preferred by members of this tribe is "Plains Apaches" or simply "Apaches." Ethnographers applied the older designation, Kiowa-Apache, because of these Apaches' close association during the nineteenth century with the Kiowa, a group with whom they're linked neither linguistically nor prehistorically.

Bittle devoted most of his academic life to the study of the Plains Apache, beginning with his doctoral dissertation on the Plains Apache language in 1956 under Harry Hoijer at UCLA. Although he published a number of articles, both ethnographic and linguistic, on them throughout his career, Bittle still had a sizable body of data that he hoped to write up in his retirement years. Unfortunately, his health failed him and Schweinfurth took over the materials in 1989, working for ten years to develop this book. She had been one of Bittle's students and had attended his field schools. In addition, while writing the book she consulted with other individuals who had also attended the field schools, as well as living members of the Plains Apache community. Bittle was able to offer her advice via correspondence until his death in 1999.

The book consists of twelve chapters, plus a preface and introduction. The introduction provides justification for writing the book, but strikes some odd chords. First is the comment that the Plains Apache are "the only example of a Plains tribe that came from an identifiable non-Plains source" (p. xviii). I fail to understand this statement, given the fact that the Comanche came from the northern Great Basin and the Lakota from areas east of the Plains in what is now Minnesota. A second oddity is a passing nod to the post-modernist's dialogic view of ethnography. Although much of the material in the later chapters might be directly in the consultant's words, I'd hardly call it a dialog in the sense of Clifford and Marcus. The material was collected in a traditional interview format and is presented in a standard way for a salvage ethnography. Finally, the author discusses anthropological definitions of religion utilizing Levi-Strauss, Durkheim, Geertz, and Malinowski in a sort of catchall definition. Like the nod to postmodernism, she does not integrate her theoretical discussion well into the rest of the book.

The rest of the text addresses a variety of themes. These include a review of the biographies of the consultants who provided the data for the book, a discussion of Plains Apache history, Apache cosmology and mythology, medicine bundles, life forms and the spirits, curing, pan-Indian religion, the peyote cult, Christianity, and attempts to revive and maintain the traditional ceremonial societies. Less prominent, but mentioned in her discussion, is the social structure and social organization of the Plains Apache.

With respect to Plains Apache history, the author discusses hypotheses about their migration to the Plains, and their cultural characteristics compared to the other Apacheans and to other Plains tribes. She notes

(pp. 25–26) that they share with the other Apacheans such traits as language, a fear of the dead, linkage of the dead with owls, coyote stories, and twin culture heroes. Throughout the rest of the book she mentions, but does not identify as typically Apachean, traits such as sororal polygyny, levirate, sororate, directionality, color symbolism, circles, and the number four. She also considers the traits that Plains Apache share with other Plains tribes. However, she does not discuss the apparently significant culture losses or differences relative to the other Apacheans and Athapaskans. Specifically, the Plains Apache's lack of a Changing Woman-type deity, a Southwestern deity who also has analogs in the North; their lack of masked dancers such as the *gaan* or *yei*, a Southwestern characteristic; and their lack of a significant puberty ceremony for girls, another Southwestern and Northern Athapaskan characteristic. The lack of such a discussion, along with the author's failure to cite Basehart, Basso, Farrer, Goodwin, or Kluckhohn (and only minimal use of Hoijer and Opler), reveals a decidedly Plains, as opposed to a comparative Southwestern or Northern Athapaskan, perspective.

As for Plains Apache cosmology and mythology, again a discussion of the nature of deities could have been enriched by comparison with the Southwestern Apacheans. Schweinfurth questions (p. 29) whether or not the Plains Apaches had a primary creator deity who is now called "Earth-He-Made-It" or "Our Father." She suspects that Christianity played a role in this concept. On the other hand, if this were the case, Christianity also played a role in Southwestern Apachean cosmology. "On-Account-of Him-Life-Is" (e.g., Western Apache *bik'ehgo hidáán*) or an analog turns up in the belief systems of the Western Apache, Chiricahua, and Mescalero, a commonality that seems to argue for antiquity, rather than diffusion or acculturation. At the least, comparative material would have provided the basis for discussion.

There is some discussion of the kinship system, although it's not a major part of this work. Again, compared to Southwestern Apacheans, there is a somewhat different emphasis in Plains Apache culture. All the Southwestern Apacheans have some degree of focus on matrilineal relations, if only in terms of differentiating between maternal and paternal grandparents, such as in the Chiricahua and Mescalero kinship systems. Western Apache and Navajo, of course, have full-blown matrilineal clan systems with concordant bifurcating Iroquois-type kinship systems. This matrilineal emphasis, which seems to have been carried over from their northern origins, is remarkably absent among the Plains Apache. The Plains Apache kinship system is not only generational in Ego's generation, but in $G \pm 2$ as well. It's a totally bilateral system. This might reflect the rather remarkable parallel adaptation to the Plains lifestyle that most Plains societies seem to have developed. Again, however, Schweinfurth makes little comment or comparison.

Similarly, Athapaskan social organization was also molded to the Plains environment, as the band becoming a basic unit that, at least linguistically, seems comparable to the camp among the Southwestern Apacheans. For example, the Plains Apache term for band is *gonkas*, while the Western Apache word for camp is *gotah*. The stem in these two terms appears to be an example of the t: k sound correspondence pointed out by Hoijer.

Let me conclude with comments on two more details, one relating to form and the other to content. First, although the chapters are numbered in the table of contents and the endnotes refer to these numbers, the chapter headings in the text itself were given chapter titles, but not numbered. Since the endnotes had no chapter titles listed, nor any reference to the pages covered by the notes, relating notes to specific sections of the book was very confusing.

Second, as with so many ethnographers, Schweinfurth seems to have little linguistic sophistication. In her discussion of the tribal medicine bundles, something very Plains in character, she says (p. 60) that they are “addressed as *sitsoyan*, an Apache term for ‘four grandfathers.’” A few lines later, she says that *sit* is the number four. *Tsoyan* is the stem for “grandparent/grandchild” (relative in $G \pm 2$), but as in all the Apachean languages, a kinship term must be possessed and prefixed by *s̄* “my,” not “four.”

In general, the book discusses specific Plains Apache beliefs, myths, religious practices, and other ethnographic detail. Since so little is known about these people, this is valuable information. However, when I began the work, I was eager to learn more about the Plains Apache and looked forward to some explanation of their cultural form compared to the rest of the Apachean cluster. I came away from the book with a somewhat empty feeling, aware of many new facts, but failing to find context and explanations for them.

Philip J. Greenfeld

San Diego State University

Shaping Survival: Essays by Four American Indian Tribal Women. By Lanniko L. Lee, Florestine Kiyukanpi Renville, Karen Lone Hill, and Lydia Whirlwind Soldier. Edited by Jack W. Marken and Charles L. Woodard. Lanham, Maryland: Scarecrow Press, 2002. \$34.95 cloth.

The four autobiographical essays that comprise this powerful book help explain how some Lakota and Dakota women of the baby-boom generation overcame their formal education in assimilation and developed Indian studies programs and new Native periodicals to teach the cultural traditions most had learned informally. The authors, all college graduates and enrolled tribal members, were born in the 1940s and 1950s on or near four different South Dakota reservations. They tell their individual stories with clear and distinct voices. Together, they sing a chorus of praise for tribal values that survived all efforts to destroy them. Reconnecting to these traditions enabled each of these women to overcome the internalized oppression that most felt their schooling seemed designed to produce, and gave their adult lives a focus—to help the next generation live as Lakotas/Dakotas in the twenty-first century.

The editors' introduction explains that this book emerged from a program of annual retreats for aspiring Native writers organized at South Dakota State University in the early 1990s and continued by noted Dakota author Elizabeth Cook-Lynn and Charles L. Woodard, one of the coeditors of this volume. The book's four authors are all members of the Oak Lake Writers