

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Where Lightning Strikes: The Lives of American Indian Sacred Places. By Peter Nabokov.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/17f659rk>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Grim, John A.

Publication Date

2007

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

In the end, this volume accomplishes a couple of very important things. Foster provides a subtle and complex rendering of the Métis south of the forty-ninth parallel. But perhaps even more significantly she does so by recounting how the complex, pragmatic, and adaptive kinship and social networks of Métis communities were maintained. In spite of policies generated through essentialist Euro-American racial categories, it is the porous and socially inclusive orientation of Métis communities that, in the end, are responsible for community and cultural continuity. This, somewhat ironically, is most clear in an area of the Métis homeland in which the reidentification of a Métis community as such has occurred in the absence of even quasi-official support or recognition of the category Métis.

Mike Evans

The University of British Columbia, Okanagan

Where Lightning Strikes: The Lives of American Indian Sacred Places. By Peter Nabokov. New York: Viking Penguin, 2006. 350 pages. \$24.95 cloth; \$16.00 paper.

Where Lightning Strikes is a “big” book that draws on the author’s rich experiences, conversations, and studies to evoke empathy and a respectful solidarity with American Indians. Peter Nabokov challenges stereotypes regarding Indians, environments, and religions even as he brings together an amazing wealth of stories, ethnography, history, and personal reflections about diverse American Indian peoples and their relationships with sacred places. Nabokov uses two especially engaging lenses to focus insight and challenge understanding. First, this book is a study of “the lives” of sacred places. Second, the book is organized as a historical and legal reflection on major court cases in the United States related to sacred sites.

This book is dedicated to the Lakota lawyer and scholar, Vine Deloria Jr., who shared Peter Nabokov’s dismay at the lack of legal protection afforded sacred lands by the American Indian Religious Freedom Act (AIRFA) of 1978. This act was designed to protect the first amendment rights of American Indians, but it has largely left Native tribes still struggling to preserve sacred sites. Prompted by this concern Nabokov has expanded arguments that he sketched in his chapter “Anchoring the Past in Place” in *A Forest of Time* (2002). *Where Lightning Strikes* greatly amplifies his earlier insights regarding the historical character of sacred places. He develops new arguments about the particular relationships of American Indian peoples with sacred sites and analyzes significant court cases following the AIRFA legislation that impacts many of those sites.

Nabokov structures his book as a jurisprudential reflection on court cases from the late 1970s and 1980s. Using the four directions as a schema, Nabokov organizes his book as a trope for the legal assertion of national power over Native peoples and lands. A subtext surfaces in the book showing that although resistance by Native peoples to preserve sacred sites in the twentieth

and twenty-first centuries has taken place in law courts, this legal history mirrors earlier historical and mythic struggles. In each cardinal direction the author takes up four studies of diverse American Indian peoples and their complex relationships with sacred places. The “east” section gives glimpses into the “life” of sacred sites among the Penobscot, Ojibwa, Choctaw, and Cherokee while drawing the reader into the historical and legal complexities of the Tellico Dam case on the Little Tennessee River.

The “south” section explores the impact of legal cases involving the flooding of sacred sites by Glen Canyon Dam, expansion of skiing facilities on the San Francisco Peaks held sacred by the Hopi and Navajo, and extractive industries on the lives of Puebloan and Navajo sacred sites. The “north” section presents Lakota foundational beliefs in the Black Hills as their ancestral homeland. Nabokov also describes legal efforts of multiple tribes to stop development of Bear Butte in the Black Hills. Using migration stories, Nabokov traces the Crow journey to the Big Horn Mountains and their formation as a people in search of sacred tobacco. The author discusses “incarnations” of Columbia River Plateau Indian sacred landscapes in relation to the Wanapum religious prophet, Smohalla, and the Kootenai legal fight to save Kootenai Falls.

Finally, the “west” segment presents an impassioned discussion of Native Californian peoples and landscapes. Nabokov describes the role of dreaming among the Yuman peoples of the Lower Colorado River. He cites Theodora Kroeber’s observation that “the Yumans have kept much of the ‘real’ look because there are still among them their Old Ones to take the young to the sacred mountain and [Colorado] river sites, to repeat to them the old epic tales of their people and to teach them to dream” (242). Nabokov also discusses central and northern Californian Native peoples concluding with an overview of the legal struggles of the Yurok, Karuk, and Tolowa tribes to stop a US Forest Service road in a case that went to the Supreme Court as *Lyng v. Northwest Indian Cemetery Protective Association*. This 1988 decision against Native tribes marked the nadir of AIRFA. Nabokov cites Justice William Brennan’s minority decision in which he uses the phrase, “cruelly surreal,” to describe the ironic situation in which American Indian religious freedom amounted to seeing their spiritual lives, sacred sites, and religious ways further undermined.

Nabokov’s second major theme explores the spiritual “lives of American Indian sacred places.” He challenges the reader to understand spiritual presences revealed at specific Native sacred sites in the context of indigenous worldviews and the diverse cultural ways of American Indian life. These lived relationships not only come down from the ancestral past but move into present responsibilities. This “life” of a site can only be suggested by a broad array of personal, historical, and mythic stories. Nabokov skillfully weaves these stories and recollections from many prominent tribespeople such as the Lakota Sundance Chief, Fools Crow, and the Wintu healer, Florence Jones. He also comments on non-Native writings, such as those by Henry David Thoreau, whose affinity for Native peoples he affirms, and John Muir, whose inability to connect with the California Indians, he criticizes.

Non-Indian observers might misunderstand the names and stories, performances, and responsibilities concerning sacred places. For example, Nabokov points out how comparing Indian sacred places with Christian churches often undermined protection of the larger natural processes that compose Native sacred sites. But Nabokov reminds us that by means of their beliefs and practices “Indians played a part in the inner life of the land, and it responded as an influential participant in theirs” (xii). Native Americans, moreover, enter into sacred sites in ways that add layers of complexity and meaning to their mutual relationships that may not be apparent to a Western-educated person. For example, language enables Native peoples to comprehend mythic stories that name particular locations as having the personal dimension of memory as well as the communal character of history. In several chapters Nabokov explores how specific rituals enable community connections with spiritual presences in ways “that no one knew *when* was being sung of, though *where* was always clear” (236).

Nabokov combines experiential and historical anthropology in *Where Lightning Strikes* to challenge stereotypes that American Indian relationships with sacred lands are ahistorical, or timeless. He illustrates this point using the large civic and spiritual footprint of Hopewellian and Mississippian mound sites, noting that they may have been pilgrimage stops, or “town houses” for distinct social groups, or burial sites for “performances of great magnitude” (38). He also explores the changing relationships of Choctaw peoples with their origin place, Nanih Waiya, as both a “temple” and a “cave” mound (49). Moreover, he argues, American Indian sacred sites may not conform to non-Indian aesthetics or environmental and geographical ideas about immersion in, and responsibility to, local place. Nabokov reminds the reader that in the diversity of ways in which Native peoples relate to sacred places “there is no necessary correlation between Indian spiritual beliefs and environmental ethics, no automatic or easy transition from one to the other” (187).

Where Lightning Strikes discusses the lives of sacred sites and Native American peoples not as environmental tropes, then, but as peoples and places with their own traditional histories and unique relationships. Underlying Nabokov’s work is a revealing argument about Native perspectives on spiritual presences in the land. The author observes that among the Penobscot “the landscape might be lonely without human beings” (9). This sense of the land being lonely or yearning for Native presence is continued in Nabokov’s citation of the ethnography of A. I. Hallowell who observed that “the Ojibwa saw some rocks as reaching out *to them*.” This insight about the affection of plants, animals, and mineral spirits for Native individuals and communities establishes a significant insight for understanding the intimacy of American Indian “lives” lived in mutual affection with sacred places. Nabokov is also clear in his presentation of examples of awesome and fear-inspiring experiences of land. He gives numerous examples in which Native American peoples recognize particular sites as dangerous locations where sorcerers acquired fearsome powers for self-aggrandizement.

Nabokov also explores concepts, such as animism, derived from Enlightenment thought and scientific objectivity that interprets indigenous spiritual

intent in ways that reject any notion of actual presences in the land. Studies cited, such as Nurit Bird-David's "'Animism' Revisited: Personhood, Environment and Relational Epistemology" (*Current Anthropology*, 1999), provide further background for thinking through this cultural sense of an earth yearning for the human as seen by Native peoples and an objectivizing Western ethos that rejects nature as alive.

Nabokov does not clutter his experientially oriented text with footnotes, and they are not missed. His thirty-two pages of sources are closely related to his arguments by sentence references and page numbers. These sources are helpful in expanding his arguments in the sixteen case studies with informative ethnographic citations.

There is an increasing library of works and films on American Indian sacred sites. The film and Web site, *In the Light of Reverence*, visually illustrate several of the case studies that Nabokov presents such as the Hopi and Navajo loss of Woodruff Butte, the Lakota efforts to protect Native prayer bundles and activities at Bear Lodge Butte (Devil's Tower), and the Winemem (Wintu) Indians' resistance to multiple intrusions at Panther Meadows, Mount Shasta. Studies of sacred sites among specific peoples are available to expand Nabokov's broader discussions such as in the Navajo/Diné context: Laurance Linford, *Navajo Places: History, Legend and Landscape* (2000), Klara Bonsack Kelley and Harris Francis, *Navajo Sacred Places* (1994), and Douglas Preston, *Talking to the Ground* (1995). There is also the interesting approach to sacred sites implicit in Mark Warhus, *Another America: Native American Maps and the History of Our Land* (1997) that documents in a different way the resistance and survivals of Native peoples in relation to their homelands.

This is a remarkable contribution to our understanding of American Indian sacred places that highlights the most significant interpretive voice as that of Indian traditions. And that Native voice, Nabokov conjectures, is quite often silent, attentive to life in the region, and capable of unexpected humor in the gravity of landscapes.

John A. Grim
Yale University

The World We Used to Live In: Remembering the Powers of the Medicine Men. By Vine Deloria Jr. Golden, CO: Fulcrum Publishing, 2006. 224 pages. \$16.95 paper.

Vine's death in November 2005 marked the passing of a gifted, remarkable human being whose many writings articulate a passionate affirmation of Native rights in a context of Native spirituality. Many of us will certainly miss his humor, critical spirit, visionary ideas, and honesty in confronting the limitations of non-Native intellectual attitudes toward Native religions. It is no surprise that one of his last works underscores the unique spiritual capacities of remarkable Native religious leaders, as he was one of those leaders.