

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Northern Haida Songs. By John Enrico and Wendy Bross Stuart.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/19v640tw>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 23(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

White, Frederick

**Publication Date**

1999

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

today supposed to look at recurring themes and visions among Native Americans in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries as a kind of original intent? If so, should not we expect arguments based on this doctrine to founder on the same shoals as debates over how to interpret the United States Constitution? That Williams' book provokes such questions should not be construed as a weakness; rather, it is because it does so that it is such a welcome addition to the historical literature. Subsequent writers have exciting avenues to explore thanks, in part, to *Linking Arms Together*.

*James Drake*

Metropolitan State College of Denver

**Northern Haida Songs.** By John Enrico and Wendy Bross Stuart. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1996. 519 pages. \$40.00 cloth.

John Enrico, an anthropological linguist, and Wendy Bross Stuart, an ethnomusicologist, pool their specializations and collaborate to produce a volume of Northern Haida songs. In this volume of songs from Massett, British Columbia, and Prince of Wales Island, Alaska, the writers provide an ethnological background to the Haida, transcriptions for 128 songs, and in the final section, both musical and linguistic analyses of the songs. They explain that their collaboration has its basis in providing "proper treatment" of the songs (p. 3), which includes musical and linguistic analysis in harmony, rather than separately, as was the case historically.

A bilingual dedication to Florence Davidson, a well-known descendant of Charles Edenshaw, the even more well-known Haida carver, begins the volume. In the four pages of orthography and abbreviations that follow the contents, it is evident that they assume a competence in phonological and syntactical linguistics, and there is no attempt to acquaint beginners to the field. As you read on to the first section, the authors provide an overview of much of the history concerning anthropological and sociological research among the Haida, and again it is assumed that the reader will have competence in cultural anthropology. They mention that the basic premise for collecting and researching among the Haida, and indeed among all of the tribes along the coast, is to document and to salvage Haida customs, including the songs, history, mythology, and language. They also criticize former works and explain their shortcomings in terms of inconsistent orthographies as well as the rare inability to see the "relationship between text and music" (p. 3). The subsequent ethnography background is specific to the songs and the eight different categories which the authors provide, though they mention that such categorization or labels may not exist within the Haida frame of reference. The eight categories include: major potlatches, lullabies, mourning, warfare and making peace, vengeance, manipulating or manifesting the supernatural, play, and miscellaneous songs. There are five other ethnographical aspects considered, which are borrowed and unassignable songs, composition, performance, Haida musical concepts, and the decline of traditional music.

In the second section, the 128 songs are presented in 349 pages with eleven analytical categories: pulse, meter, pitch change, ambitus, scale, solfege, characteristic interval, characteristic rhythm, contour, musical structure, and linguistic structure. This section seems to be much more friendly to the untrained, as the terms are nicely defined. Additionally, the songs are translated and represented in speech and in a free translation which makes the reading more lively and interactive. The analysis often has comments about the song, giving further information to understand the song from a greater ethnographical perspective. Multiple performances of one song are occasionally included.

In the final section, the corpus of songs is analyzed and compared in great detail. The analyses and comparisons focus on the musical and linguistic elements of the songs, variation in performances of the same token, and variation among the singers. The authors give considerable attention to vocables, noting differences in Haida usages to Kwakwaka'wakw, Navajo, and Havasupai. They consider vocable frequency (in percent) by singer, vowel, or consonant frequencies; structure of vocable string; and hierarchical structure of vocable phrases.

Their final consideration is a linguistic analysis of the difference between language in speech and song, focusing on the phonological differences. Three main aspects are covered: tone and pitch accent, stress, and vowel length. A fourth aspect considers the vowel mutation rule, which ends with the observation that there is one-way influence of the music causing changes in language. The final section closes with linguistic observations concerning song lexicon and syntax. This section is filled with linguistic terminology and analyses that make for exciting reading because the authors provide and explain detailed aspects of the Haida language, which contributes to understanding not only the song, but Haida culture as well.

An interesting aspect of the authors' analyses focuses on variation of performances of the same token by the same performer and the same token in comparison to other performers. They present the existence of variation as problematic, and the scope of the research considers the difference in variation and how it pertains to the performative aspect. The unasked question of whether such variation is idiosyncratic may provide clues and give greater ethnographic insight to the Haida and their songs, rather than implementing the necessity of seeing variation as problematic.

The people with whose songs and traditions scholars work are in fact working from less than perfect recall and often are unable to explain the significance of certain elements in the songs. This is not necessarily reflective of the lack of knowledge of the informant, but it may be considered culturally inappropriate for the informant to comment on, divulge, or in any way betray the ownership of the song, whether it is within the same clan or from another clan. Some comments seem to suggest that the informants lack the knowledge concerning "genres" or function, but it is more likely that despite the best intentions of benevolent experts, some information will not be given. Such information is undisclosed for various reasons, including ownership, membership in the tribe, the notion of sacred and private, kinship, and cul-

turally defined discourse conventions which relegate information flow to strangers.

Perhaps what is most impactful is the nature of the book, that is, its goal to salvage and document the Haida songs. For this reason I have written a double-edged review. *Northern Haida Songs* is well written, detailed, and scholarly. Such research provides a bountiful collection of work, but the audience of such research somehow remains outside the people from whom the collections came. In a sense, much of the work is inaccessible or at best difficult for any linguistically and musically untrained person to understand. Thus, the majority of the Haidas themselves couldn't enjoy or appreciate the discussion and analyses of the songs, though the fluent elders could certainly comment on the translations and ethnographical content of the book. The result is that the book targets an audience that does not include the subjects of the research.

Finally, this collection also reveals that the people who had such knowledge and skill are few in number. The somber nature of this work is reflected, in that those who helped document the songs for this volume are now dead (p. 4), as is the case for the person to whom the volume is dedicated. It is significant, therefore, that this collection exists, since it may be only through such documentation that the Haida songs will endure past the generation of people who now know, are skilled in singing, and are trying to revive the culture beyond their own existence.

*Frederick White*

University of California, Los Angeles

**The Paths of Kateri's Kin.** By Christopher Vecsey. Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1997. 392 pages. \$40.00 cloth.

In *The Paths of Kateri's Kin*, a well-written, thorough, and insightful account, Christopher Vecsey examines the history and contemporary expression of Catholicism among Native Americans who were the recipients, and descendants of recipients, of French missionary activity beginning in the early seventeenth century. The book spans the time of the first missions and continues into the present, combining an analytic view of history with the immediacy of contemporary scenes. A recurring theme is the devotion that many Native American Catholics today give to the seventeenth century Mohawk convert Kateri Tekakwitha, whose "life and death became central icons" of Jesuits in North America and of many contemporary American Indian Catholics (p. 99).

Born in 1656 in a Mohawk community in northern New York state, Kateri was baptized in 1676, moved to the Jesuit mission community of Kahnawake near Montreal, and died in 1680 after four years of intense devotional activity that included extreme acts of self-mortification such as walking barefoot in the snow and ice of winter, eating sand and glass, and thrashing herself with branches. Kateri was also known in the community for her charitable acts of aiding the elderly and ill. Shortly after her death, devotions to Kateri became popular among the converts at Kahnawake and later spread elsewhere among