

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Under the Palace Portal: Native American Artists in Santa Fe. By Karl Hoerig.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1gd2q4q8>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 28(2)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Fricke, Suzanne Newman

**Publication Date**

2004-03-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

There are certainly other anthologies of Native women's writing, Christine Miller and Patricia Chuchyrk's *Women of the First Nations: Power, Wisdom, and Strength* (1996) being one Canadian example, and a useful bibliography at the end of this book lists others. The "Canadianism" of this book is one of its distinguishing features, and the editors provide helpful footnotes to the text to explain some unique aspects of Canadian government policy that have had a particularly unfortunate impact on Native women. The editors have sought some geographic and cultural variety among their writers (there is a lack of Inuit voices), an impressive effort in a book that was a volunteer project with the assistance of the Ontario Federation of Indian Friendship Centres. And unlike previous collections that include many pieces about reserve/reservation life, *Strong Women Stories* focuses on the experiences of urban Native women.

What also distinguishes *Strong Women Stories* is its effort to bring to life the effects of colonization as they continue to be experienced by women in contemporary Native communities. This focus does raise one problem: the European, Euro-American, and North American colonizing societies of which the book's writers are so bitterly critical have not been in stasis during the last five hundred years. The economic and social structures that long reinforced patriarchal domination have been challenged and in some cases broken; moreover, cultural anthropology and other scholarship suggests that the collision with Euro-American cultures did not have a uniform effect on the roles of Native women. The twentieth-century changes in the roles of mainstream women are largely ignored by these writers (although a couple do touch on feminism, and Dawn Martin-Hill has some lively comments on New Age feminists in "She No Speaks and Other Colonial Constructs of 'The Traditional Woman,'" chap. 7). Canadian government policy toward Native peoples has also undergone changes, and the increasingly multicultural nature of Canadian society in general adds a further complexity to the position of Canadian First Nations. Lacking acknowledgment of these realities, a number of the writers in this book sound anachronistic.

However, the editors' purpose in this book was not to produce a work of scholarly analysis but to give voice to grassroots Native women. If their authentic view of their lives is that colonialism still afflicts their communities, then so be it. That is how they feel. A number of their voices are so immediate and powerful that the "strong women" in this volume come alive on the page, and that alone makes this collective effort worth the reading.

*Katherine Beaty Chiste*  
University of Lethbridge

**Under the Palace Portal: Native American Artists in Santa Fe.** By Karl Hoerig. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2004. 261 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

Refreshingly readable, insightfully argued, and well-researched, Karl Hoerig's *Under the Palace Portal: Native American Artists in Santa Fe* offers an in-depth look at one of Santa Fe's most important tourist attractions, the Portal Program. In Santa Fe's central plaza Native artists sell their wares to the many visitors

under the front porch of the Museum of New Mexico, formerly the Palace of the Governors. Hoerig, who received his PhD in cultural anthropology from the University of Arizona and is currently the director of *Nohwiike' Bagowa*, the White Mountain Apache Cultural Center and Museum at Fort Apache, Arizona, spent several years studying and working for the Portal Program to gain insight into its history and how it functions in the contemporary Native art market. Often dismissed by tourists and scholars alike as a show for the tourists, with sellers displaying themselves in Native clothes, Hoerig demonstrates how the program has been misinterpreted and misunderstood. It is not a "front area" dressed up as a "back area," to use Dean MacCannell's terms set up in his seminal text *The Tourist* (1976); rather, it is a unique market for Native art, one that was organized largely by Natives and is run almost entirely by Natives using standards set by the artists themselves.

Hoerig's study combines various areas of research, including the history of the Southwest, tourist studies, legal proceedings, and the personal history of the vendors. The Portal Program evolved from the early Indian art markets as an ad hoc group of artists trying to claim a patch of ground into the Portal Program, a regulated and official organization. As more artists tried to claim a space, the need for a more systematic approach led to stricter regulations and rules binding the artists. To secure a space on the grounds, artists arrive at 7:00 a.m., and if there are more artists than spaces, a common occurrence in the summer and on weekends, a lottery is held. Artists can only display pieces made by them or created within their household to avoid an individual's buying pieces from many different artists and to ensure no artists undercut the prices of others by selling in bulk. The Portal Program not only regulates how the arts are sold but also who can sell. Each artist must hold a demonstration in front of committee members to show proficiency and adherence to standards, a process sometimes made more difficult when the art is considered secret to the Pueblo or tribe; in such cases demonstrations are made before members of the artist's group so that no secrets are revealed.

Hoerig establishes the importance of the Portal Program to the history of Native arts as an example of a Native art market that is run by the artists themselves and not, as it is commonly seen, a tourist attraction pandering for the attention of sightseers. Rather, it is a program that arose organically to fill a need for Native artists, where they can continue to make their works while balancing the various needs in their life, such as children and family obligations. For Pueblo Natives, feast days often interrupt work, requiring participants to be at the Pueblo, away from work for days at a time.

One of the unexpected results of the Portal Program is that it brought artists from various areas together and created a place where different groups were forced to interact. Before the lottery of spaces, artists self-segregated into their tribal groups. Now they are forced to intermix. Hoerig describes the positive and negative aspects of these interactions. In 1997 jeweler Jennifer Juan created a silver concho belt portraying masked dancers from both Navajo and Pueblo dances. Although aesthetically the belt was so skillfully made and so beautiful that it earned Juan a first-place ribbon at the Indian market, it upset the artists at the portal because of the sacredness of the images and their intermixing. Juan was asked by the other artists to remove the belt from her

cloth, which she did. Though Juan learned from other groups about their artwork, she also showed the limitations of such interactions.

Perhaps the most compelling account in the book centers on lawsuits in the 1970s led by Paul and Sara Livingstone against the Portal. With the craze for Native jewelry in the 1970s, the market for Native jewelry replaced the market for Native ceramics and prompted the Livingstones to make jewelry in a Native style. When they tried to sell at the Portal with the Native artists, they were removed by museum officials with the aid of the police. With the help of the ACLU the Livingstones filed suit in 1977 against George Ewing, director of the Museum of New Mexico, and the museum's Board of Regents, as well as the mayor, the police chief, and the city council. Livingstone charged that his Fourteenth Amendment rights, the right to equal protection under the law, were violated when he was not allowed to sell his art. The museum successfully argued that the Portal market was an important tourist site that brought people not only to the museums in the area (the Museum of Fine Arts is located across the street) but also to the plaza's restaurants and vendors. The suit forced the museum to recognize the importance of having Native artists in front as a display of living Native history. These proceedings came to define the Portal as a place for Native artists and forced the artists and the Museum of New Mexico to instigate the Portal Program to regulate the market.

I would have liked Hoerig to discuss further why the artists continue to place their work on the floor of the Portal, a historic but awkward method of display. He mentions it briefly in chapter 7, explaining that although "critics might argue that the status of the artworks is diminished because they are displayed on a sidewalk, this reflects a lack of understanding" (181). The tradition of displaying the works on the ground started with the Indian art markets, but the market now allows the artists to bring tables. Hoerig dismisses the use of tables, though, explaining that the vendors rejected tables because it would allow fewer sellers to set up each day. While this is a valid explanation, it does not address the issues around the display. It forces the buyers to bend over to see the work and the sellers to sit on or near the cold ground (most artists bring low lawn chairs for comfort) and creates a situation in which visitors literally look down on the artists and their art. On the ground it is not only disorienting for the viewers, who are constantly looking down at the art and up to avoid collision with fellow tourists, but it also diminishes the importance of the pieces.

As one of the first Native-run programs, the Portal Program can be seen as a model for Native artists across the country. One important reason tourists buy at the Portal rather than from the many galleries and jewelry stores in and around the plaza is the personal connection with the artists. In some of the book's most humorous anecdotes Hoerig records a number of ignorant comments made to the artists, but he also notes that both the artists and the buyers profit from the personal interactions during the sales. In *Under the Palace Portal* Hoerig has provided more than just a fine history of a local phenomenon; he has described a program that could serve as a model for Native artists across the country.