

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Dreaming with the Ancestors: Black Seminole Women in Texas and Mexico. By Shirley Boteler Mock.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1m98n6k0>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bateman, Rebecca B.

Publication Date

2012-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Dreaming with the Ancestors: Black Seminole Women in Texas and Mexico. By Shirley Boteler Mock. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2010. 400 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

In her book, Shirley Mock's stated intent is to discuss Seminole Maroon culture and history from the perspective of women and to contribute to the growing body of knowledge on relationships between Africans and Native Americans by adding a gendered perspective. In the mid-1980s, I conducted fieldwork with the Seminole Freedmen in Oklahoma, the relatives of the Texas and Mexico Seminole Maroons (or Black Seminoles) whose ancestors left Indian Territory for Mexico in 1850. The Maroons and their Seminole allies had fought long and hard to defend their Florida homes against American forces, but were ultimately removed to Indian Territory in the late 1840s. The founders of the Mexico and Texas Maroon communities, along with some of their Native American allies, left the Territory seeking the freedom to live in peace in Mexico, free from slavers' raids, while the ancestors of the Oklahoma communities chose to remain behind with the majority of the Seminoles.

I was interested in collecting oral histories and stories, and many of the people with whom I worked were elderly, and the majority were women. In the voices of the Seminole Maroon women Mock recorded in Texas and Mexico, many of the same themes can be heard: their and their female ancestors' crucial role in preserving cultural and historical traditions and holding families together in the face of violence, dispossession, and dislocation; the importance of their faith; and in particular, their lives of hard work and attachment to their lands. Seminole Maroon women's stories have much to say not only about their own lives, but also about what they want others to know about their people and their history. While Mock's book brought back fond memories, and the author's obvious affection for Alice Fay and the other Seminole Maroon women is touching, the book is frustrating and ultimately disappointing.

The author's academic background is in Mesoamerican archaeology and cultural resource management, and consulting work in the latter first brought her into contact with the Seminole Maroon community in Brackettville, Texas, and later in Mexico. Both her approach and the structure of the book reflect her primary concern with the preservation of elder Seminole Maroon women's personal narratives, stories, and oral histories, rather than with their analysis and interpretation.

While the women and their stories are fascinating on their own, Mock could have enriched our understanding of the women's stories, and Seminole Maroon culture and history, had she included discussion of the rich literature

on oral history and historical consciousness among other maroon societies and aboriginal peoples (particularly elder women), and gender differences between men's and women's autobiographical stories. The lack of sophisticated scholarly analysis makes the book seem chatty, confusingly mixing together history (much previously published, especially in the work of Kenneth Wiggins Porter and Kevin Mulroy) and references to scholarly literature on Seminole Maroons, with the stories and conversations Mock recorded and her personal feelings about the women with whom she worked and interacted. As a result the book is not quite an academic study, nor entirely suited for a nonacademic audience.

The book also contains a number of theoretical and methodological shortcomings. Mock is not always careful to note when she is engaging in speculation about Seminole Maroon women's historical roles. For example, it is confusing for the reader when long passages make assertions about the role of Maroon women in the Seminole Wars, but contain no references (32). In another instance she assigns Gullah or African origins to many names and nicknames on scant or no evidence. Although she discusses at some length my own analysis of Seminole Maroon naming, several inaccurate statements indicate that the argument itself and its relevance to her own data have been misunderstood. Despite the author's nonspecialist status, this is a puzzling and perhaps careless unfamiliarity with the scholarly literature.

It is clear from Mock's discussion that the role of kinship and genealogical connection to the ancestors is a crucial component of Seminole Maroon identity in Texas/Mexico, as it is in Oklahoma. Given the complexity and cultural importance of the family histories and the ties between and among families, family tree diagrams would have made it much easier for the reader to keep track of the names and relationships Mock discusses, and to see patterns in the intergenerational transmission of names. Seminole Maroon descendants, in particular, would find such diagrams helpful, especially given that the author intends for the book to be used by them and succeeding generations.

These criticisms are not to say that Mock's book lacks value: there was very little known about the Mexico Seminole Maroon communities (Nacimiento, Múzquiz) heretofore, and in that respect, Mock has made an important contribution to the collective knowledge on Seminole Maroon history. And this is the only book dedicated to a discussion of the lives of African American women associated with any of the Five Civilized Tribes. Many of the photographs in the book, some privately owned, were previously unpublished, and offer a fascinating visual record of historical and contemporary Seminole Maroon life in Texas, Mexico, and Oklahoma. Other scholars can no doubt use Mock's documentation of women's narratives, information on naming—the adoption of Spanish/Mexican names among the

Texas and Mexico Seminole Maroons adds a further fascinating complexity to their naming system—and her discussion of religious beliefs and practices as subjects for further analysis.

Students of Seminole Maroon history and culture, along with the Seminole Maroons themselves, will benefit from Mock's work in preserving the wisdom, courage, perseverance, and knowledge of Maroon women, and she deserves to be commended. From a scholarly perspective, however, this could have been a more insightful and useful book.

Rebecca B. Bateman

Simon Fraser University

Feasting with Shellfish in the Southern Ohio Valley: Archaic Sacred Sites and Rituals. By Cheryl Claassen. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 2010. 264 pages. \$49.00 cloth.

The introductory chapter clearly states the author's goal, that of "elucidating the spiritual life of Archaic peoples in the southern Ohio Valley" (5). The main part of the book consists of much data, in both text and table form. The information was primarily compiled from the many references, with additions from the author's many contacts with colleagues, who are all acknowledged, as well as her personal examination of some collections. Tables present radiocarbon dates, statistics on modern mussel fisheries, the amount of fill contained in shell heaps and earthen mounds, and site descriptions, including counts of tool types and fauna recovered and details of human and dog burials, including evidence for ritual violence. This data is integral to the author's reinterpretations of previously published accounts of the activities associated with shell heaps that are found along some southern tributaries of the Ohio River, and the shell heaps' cultural meaning. The author ends the volume with a list of testable hypotheses that she recommends for future research, research that may bolster or refute her interpretations.

Claassen states her view with admirable clarity and gives data that can be checked, making the few missteps she takes in presenting her worthwhile opinions more easily apparent. The following comments will offer several such examples from the author's set of reinterpretations, and do not necessarily follow the order of their appearance in the book itself.

In reinterpreting aspects of mortuary behavior, Claassen characterizes objects accompanying individual internments neither as prestige items, gifts to an individual, evidence of the social status in life of the individual interred, nor of his or her occupation, but rather as signifying a particular god. She