

UCLA

UCLA Historical Journal

Title

The Philistines and Their Material Culture. By TRUDE DOTHAN. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1982. Pp. xxii+310. Plates, figures, notes, maps, bibliography, index. \$45.00.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1nx0r6jg>

Journal

UCLA Historical Journal, 4(0)

Author

Proffitt III, T.D.

Publication Date

1983

Copyright Information

Copyright 1983 by the author(s). All rights reserved unless otherwise indicated. Contact the author(s) for any necessary permissions. Learn more at <https://escholarship.org/terms>

Peer reviewed

biographies and travellers' memoirs. Unfortunately, there are only a handful of Russian sources, mostly translated abstracts of contemporary Russian newspapers and journals. Since the author does not read Russian, he could not tap a wide variety of Russian documents and memoir literature. His treatment of Russia, while good overall, is therefore not of the same quality as his treatment of Britain and causes certain minor historical inaccuracies in the discussion of Russian history. In the chapter "The Origins of Russian Expansion in Asia," for example, the author claims "it was only in the sixteenth century that the hold of the Golden Horde was weakened enough to allow the first stirrings of Russian nationhood" (p. 1). But the first stirrings of Russian nationhood were in the fourteenth century, and in the sixteenth century, Russia actually destroyed and absorbed the Khanates of Kazan and Astrakhan, two of the three successor states of the Golden Horde.

The second flaw in the book is that the author generally does not use footnotes. This makes it difficult to pursue subjects he only touches on briefly. It also gives the book a superficial appearance of having been written as popular history.

Flaws notwithstanding, the book is well-written, cogently argued, and offers a novel contribution to European and Asian history in the age of imperialism. Earlier studies by Edward Ingram (*The Beginnings of the Great Game in Asia, 1828-1834*), Muhammad Anwar Khan (*England, Russia, and Central Asia: A Study in Diplomacy, 1857-1878*), Vinodina Terway (*The East India Company and Russia, 1800-1857*), and others are all more narrowly focused than Morgan's. The book includes an epilogue by Geoffrey Wheeler briefly summarizing British, Russian, and Soviet involvement in the area from 1895 to 1981. *Anglo-Russian Rivalry in Central Asia* is well worth reading for both the specialist and the general reader.

Michael Gelb
University of California, Los Angeles

The Philistines and Their Material Culture. By TRUDE DOTZHAN.
New Haven: Yale University Press, 1982. Pp. xxii+310. Plates,
figures, notes, maps, bibliography, index. \$45.00.

Readers seeking a history of the Philistines or a history of Philistine archaeology will be disappointed in this version of a 1967 Hebrew language work of the same title. Others, however, will find information relating to ceramics, architecture, history of religion, cultural diffusion,

and a sketch of the last days of the Bronze Age in the east Mediterranean world. The author's primary thesis is that Philistine culture is characterized by eclecticism as seen in its material culture. Emphasis is placed on the "initial stages of Philistine culture when its distinctive character reflected its origins" (p. xx) by an examination of artifacts in museums and private collections. The Philistine character thus revealed is eccentric, but basically Aegean. Indeed, Trude Dothan rejects data contrary to an Aegean origin (see, for example, pp. 11-12) and even ignores a Hittite analogue to the David and Goliath duel. The data are sufficiently complete, however, to allow the discerning reader to arrive at an independent judgment on this and other matters.

Chapter one reviews the known historical data from Egyptian and biblical sources, dismissing some portions of the biblical text as anachronistic. Overall, the archaeological and Egyptian records complement the biblical record. Egyptian sources dominated Philistine historiography in the nineteenth century; in the twentieth century, despite the presence of Assyrian and biblical records, archaeology has dominated Philistine historiography as the volume shows.

Initially, Dothan defines the Philistines as "Sea Peoples" who settled in Canaan. Later they are defined as one or more of the ethnic groups called Sea Peoples in Egyptian records. This inconsistency in defining "Philistine(s)" is a major weakness in the text. Only in part does this ambiguity reflect the nature of the evidence. Another flaw is the failure to utilize all readily available works on the subject, especially doctoral theses. Missing from the bibliography are theses by Grenald, Homan, and Rahtjen, as well as articles by Hoffer. The volume concludes with a discussion of an absolute chronology which is established by scarabs, pottery, and Egyptian and Hebrew records. Problems with Israelite chronology are not discussed, other than to place Philistine-Israelite relations in the Iron Age. An elaborate time line is provided for comparative chronological purposes.

Chapter two details stratigraphy and is basic to subsequent chapters. Specific sites are analyzed in what is the most comprehensive survey of sites discussed in any volume on the Philistines. In this section, as in the ceramic analysis that follows, the Cypriot connection looms large in the east Mediterranean ambient. The survey also shows how widespread Philistine settlement was: from east of the Jordan to the Mediterranean Sea, from northern Dan to the southern end of the Gaza Strip. Chapter two concludes with an appendix on the distribution of iron in support of Dothan's contention that the Philistines did not introduce iron to Palestine, one of the major historiographic contributions of the work.

In Chapter three Arne Furumark's analysis of Aegean pottery is

utilized to give a detailed interpretation of Philistine pottery as syncretistic in style and motif. The author seeks to define Philistine pottery in terms which distinguish it from the pottery of other east Mediterranean peoples, showing how the art spread and assimilated local motifs and styles into its repertoire. Basic types are discussed in detail. Significant is a discussion of the evolution and development of anthropoid coffins, a middle-class Egyptian burial custom adopted by Philistines. The author concludes that the three phases of ceramic development correlate with the three phases of Philistine history: 1) Aegean origin and migration; 2) Philistine conquest of Canaan; and 3) Israelite ascendancy over Philistia. Syncretism is seen at every stage and is well illustrated not only by Philistine pottery but by Philistine burial customs and cult objects as well.

Because of its nature as a work on material culture, Dothan's work lacks extensive historical analysis. Philistine material culture is analyzed as Aegean-Semitic reflecting the nature of the Philistine-Canaanite encounter. Based as it is on extensive current archaeology, major collections, and studies, this volume will remain the classic work on Philistine archaeology for years to come. Not a history itself, it is a source book for historians on the ancient Near East. *The Philistines and Their Material Culture* is in the tradition of quality archaeological reporting that has long been associated with Israeli archaeology and should be of interest to students of the Bible, the ancient Near East, religion, art, and architecture, while its coverage of Philistine art should be of use to museums and art dealers. The work has set a high standard in archaeological writing and should be a welcome resource volume in any art museum or university library, as well as libraries of Near Eastern specialists.

T. D. Proffitt III

University of California, Los Angeles

War Against War: British and German Radical Movements in the First World War. By F. L. CARSTEN. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1982. Pp. 300. Notes, index, bibliography. \$22.95.

For those interested in European history, the name F. L. Carsten is a familiar one. His works, including *The Rise of Fascism* and the highly acclaimed *The Reichswehr and Politics*, a study of the influence of the German army in the Weimar Republic, have earned him a well-deserved reputation. In *War Against War* Carsten enters familiar territory. Although numerous monographs and articles have