

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

From the Land of Shadows: The Making of Grey Owl. By Donald B. Smith.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1qb6671c>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 15(3)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Black-Rogers, Mary

Publication Date

1991-06-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

for other maps reflecting, for example, the westward moving frontier. No one questions the portrayal of the historic role of the military in Indian affairs; it is essential data for this atlas! However, much of it has been well documented and recorded in print. But in terms of the frontier, it is disappointing that Prucha has not deemed historic Indian boundaries (compare De Vorsey's *The Indian Boundary in the Southern Colonies, 1763-1775*) to be germane, nor early reconnaissance maps of Indian sites and encampments, nor official survey plats, which have figured importantly in the distortion of Indian geography at different times in the exploration, occupation, and dispossession of Indian Country. Finally, I am not convinced that Palacios's maps needed reprinting—perhaps just a few, selectively placed in appropriate topical sections.

Overall, it is not so much what Prucha has included that I criticize, but what he has left out. I would have wanted to be complete as well as comprehensive and not concern myself about the survey nature of such a map collection. To be sure, this Indian atlas fills a void in map coverage: its design and presentation as well as statistical and reference data enhance its utility, and the total provides us with a remarkable atlas that will not likely be displaced by anyone else's efforts other than Prucha's, who, I hope, will expand, amend, and modify a second edition within a few years. In short, Prucha has broken new ground in his presentation of the cartographic history of Indian affairs.

Imre Sutton

California State University, Fullerton

From the Land of Shadows: The Making of Grey Owl. By Donald B. Smith. Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: Western Producer Prairie Books, 1990. 336 pages. \$24.95 cloth.

Somewhat like Archie Belaney (alias Grey Owl), author Donald Smith enjoys delivering illustrated lectures around the country about the objects of his intellectual passions, most recently the making of this book (a twenty-year passion, he states). Prior to reading it, I attended one of these performances last fall, at the Royal Ontario Museum in Toronto. Historian Smith was giving the ROM's 1990 Edward S. Rogers Annual Lecture in Anthropology. While enjoying it immensely and with much interest, I

had at that time two critical reactions: First, there was little said about the Indians among whom Belaney was an imposter for his entire adult life—about their culture and history, or how, from their point of view, he could have been so successful in his masquerade. Thus it was hardly anthropology. (Not that Ed Rogers would have objected; although his own primary passion was Indian ethnology, his eclectic and human interests no doubt met a spark in his student, Donald Smith, a couple of decades ago.) Second, I tended to agree with a question from the audience regarding Smith's inferences that it was Belaney's unhappy and lonely childhood that had led to his creating an imaginary family and identity, and Smith's references to Grey Owl's continued inner torment and need for "counseling"—which the author then admitted were his own interpretations.

It is satisfying to report that both of these questions are put to rest in the book. This volume represents a superb job of sleuthing and documenting minutely the life of this unique, talented man. Born in Sussex, England, in 1888, Belaney was immersed from early childhood in the faraway world of the North American Indians and later dramatically fulfilled his dream of becoming one of them. It was only after his death in 1938 that he was publicly unmasked; even then some of his closest associates (including his publisher and one of his Indian wives) were unbelieving. During his life he had become a famous American Indian, and in this role he was an early spokesman for conservation of the Indian way and of the natural environment. He was a much sought and lionized public speaker and writer both in America and in England. And he was an Indian—to the public, to the Indians, and, according to his biographer, to his own inner consciousness (p. 206: "he probably believed . . . that he was an Indian").

It is not for this reviewer to relate how such a life was possible or the manner of its accomplishment. To create the book that tells that story, the author managed to locate most if not all of the voluminous material that exists about this man; he also interviewed many who had known his subject—either as Archie Belaney or as Grey Owl. It is a monumental volume and extraordinarily readable and exciting, whether you are environmentally inclined or not. The dust jacket highlights this latter appeal, to the neglect of the attractions of Indian life and history. Yet the book includes a goodly amount of ethnographic information and ethnohistorical documentation about the Canadian Indians with whom Grey

Owl associated—largely Ojibwa—in Ontario and Quebec. In fact, a 1971 student paper on Grey Owl by the same author specifically addressed this subject, stating on page 4, “His life story aside, he deserves to be remembered today for the value of his ethnographic writings on the Ojibwa of Northeastern Ontario” (to which professor Ed Rogers responded in the margin, “and concern for conservation—& role as innovator of Ind. customs”). That the present-day publishers chose to highlight Belaney’s environmental contribution is understandable; with all of the evidence now pulled together, Smith’s book shows this theme to have been particularly strong in Belaney’s life and work. Indeed, one might wonder whether he used the Grey Owl identity as a vehicle for spreading his gospel about preserving the wilderness and its life forms. (Pages 85 and 214 suggest so.)

The book’s appeal is wide, due to good writing, good choice of citations, careful documentation, and the fascinating character of the biographical subject himself. Belaney was, among other things, an exceptionally talented and appealing writer; Smith wisely allows him to speak for himself at points where his own words effectively carry the story and reveal his personal views and quandaries about his dual world. Belaney’s published books and articles were well crafted for his purposes, but of greater richness are excerpts from his articulate and apparently ceaseless correspondence. Becoming an Indian did not entail giving up being an Englishman, in Belaney’s case; any temptation to compare his experience with that, for example, of John Tanner, the white Ojibwa of a century earlier, had best be forgotten—though one wonders if Tanner’s narrative, first published in 1830, was not one of the books about Indians that Belaney avidly consumed in his youth.

As for Smith’s psychoanalysis of Belaney’s motivations (the jacket states that Belaney “uncovers the inner torment of a deeply troubled individual”), one must acknowledge that the book provides supporting testimony. Not all of it is equally convincing; it seems unnecessary, for example, to ascribe Belaney’s homey description of the British royal family to his own childhood lack of the usual familial complement. The best support comes from the subject himself, who at one point appears to project his own impasse when writing of the plight of the “[h]alf-breed . . . with the blood of two races alternately predominating” (Smith, 1971: 58). Behavioral evidence, e.g., heavy drinking, also points to in-

ner torment. But could this not be the torment of many sensitive, creative writers? (Belaney could write only when entirely alone; he described the torture of sweating out the actual writing and rewriting and the crucial importance of its reception by readers.) In the end, though, I am ready to concede that Smith's insight into Belaney's inner self—never really expressed by the subject—no doubt grew truer during the two decades he spent passionately investigating every detail of Grey Owl's life in its various environments—social and psychological as well as physical.

It seems appropriate here to concentrate on the Indian environment in which Archie Belaney of Sussex, England, gradually became Grey Owl (or Wa-Sha-Quon-Asin), Indian spokesman for the Canadian wilderness and its inhabitants. For him, the inhabitants of the wilderness included all living things—not only humans—just as it did for the Ojibwa people among whom he began this new identity. (His fondness for animals is shown to have begun in childhood, and its connection then with Indians would only have been through his immersion in the romantic notions of that era regarding these "children of nature." His later conservationist crusade and views, and the style of their expression, resembled more the Englishman than the Indian. This in spite of the public appearances he made in fringed and beaded hide clothing, dark facial makeup, long, braided black-dyed hair.)

In any case, the Indians he came to know personally, beginning about 1908 in the area north of Toronto and south of James Bay (a map of "Archie Belaney's North" appears on page 30), were very real contemporary native people, who had already coped with drastic changes and dual identities for several generations. He accepted them as such, shedding romantic notions; he claimed later to have presented them to readers "not as characters from the pages of cheaply sensational literature, but as a people having so very many worthwhile attributes . . . which can be very useful to the country" (Smith, 1971:56). How well writer and storyteller Grey Owl hewed to this principle and to the facts is open to question. He is shown to have used artistic license and imagination to make his ideas more memorable to readers and audiences (p. 104), a practice that renders his picture of Indian life somewhat suspect.

But this story of Archie Belaney's life is also an ethnohistorical account of the Indian and Métis communities that Belaney knew, their sociopolitical practices and circumstances, and the events

that touched them during the decades of the 1920s and 1930s when they were straddling two cultures, two languages, and two sets of institutions and values and were dealing with the heritage and the future of both. I find Smith's historical glimpse of these communities and people not only more reliable but more important and interesting than Grey Owl's version. For one thing, this account of Belaney's Indian environment circa 1908-1930 reveals the great variation among Canadian native people in different regions of the country, even within Ontario, at any given period, with regard to their experience of white contact. Archie Belaney's northwestern Ontario may have seemed to him remote and wild, an escape from "civilization" and its destructive by-products. However, in dealing with contact pressures, its people had a two-to three-generation lead over the Indian inhabitants of, for example, northwestern Ontario, where the Ojibwa and Cree north of the Albany River were, in 1930, just signing a treaty with the government and had been largely unknown to the outside until then. There is still no road into many of the native communities in that area; in 1930 the first planes were landing on the lakes, destined to relieve lengthy waterway or dogteam travel. When E. S. Rogers first went there in 1958, there were no English speakers at all in the community of his residence. (See the work of E. S. and M. B. Rogers with the Crane Indians of this area, 1958-75.)

From the Ojibwa and mixed-blood people of the boreal forest in eastern Ontario, Belaney learned many woodland skills and much of their language and lore (although probably nearly all were then bilingual), and somehow came to be an accepted, if sometimes troublesome and puzzling figure in their lives. It is hard to understand, however, how they could have believed his Indian ancestry story, which apparently only occurred to him after two decades of association with them. His story of birth in the Mexican border village of Hermosillo, of an Apache mother and a white father, of traveling about with Cody's wild west show in both the United States and England, and finally choosing Canada as his home must have suited the rather wild and roving behavior that he exhibited. In 1930 (coinciding with the publication of his first book), he declared he would start using his Ojibwa name, claiming that he had been adopted by this tribe some years before. (The adoption was later refuted by the Indians involved.) Considering the fact that he really never relinquished many of his English ways, one must conclude that most people,

Indian and white, simply wanted to believe in Grey Owl; many gave testimony that he was one of the most persuasive individuals they had ever encountered.

Smith's persistent endeavors to find and talk with Grey Owl's family and associates on both sides of the Atlantic add an important ingredient to this book. While fully crediting those who had written about Grey Owl before him, this historian conducted his own research and fieldwork, where his talents complement his archival genius. Through interviews and correspondence and what became personal friendships, Smith unearthed facts and opinions with which to round out "the making of Grey Owl." In this singular creation, the Indians of "Archie Belaney's North" are given full voice, alongside Belaney's English and Canadian publishers and publicists, readers, audiences, and admirers. The author's acknowledgments section contains a five-page list of the firsthand contacts from whom he elicited data that helped him "to complete this obsession of more than twenty years" (p. 223).

Smith might have completed the book sooner had he not been so meticulous about reporting his sources. An extensive and useful bibliography is another great value of this volume, along with full references and annotations in the seventy pages of endnotes. Donald Smith's passion is surely a scholarly one, a zeal to leave no stone unturned, and to share his search and its yield with his readers. He finds excitement in researching the lives of others and shares that, too. (Two previous books have approached history via biography.) Thirty-six pages are filled with excellent photographs, grouped in sections following the relevant text. Like Grey Owl, Smith is both an engaging storyteller and an exacting craftsman.

Mary Black-Rogers

Royal Ontario Museum and McMaster University

American Indian Literatures: An Introduction, Bibliographic Review, and Selected Bibliography. By A. LaVonne Brown Ruoff. New York: Modern Language Association, 1990. 200 pages. \$17.50 paper. \$37.00 cloth.

In a model preface, A. LaVonne Brown Ruoff, professor of English at the University of Illinois at Chicago, defines terminology, identifies the intended audience, and traces the lineage of this