

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Aleut Identities: Tradition and Modernity in an Indigenous Fishery. By Katherine L. Reedy-Maschner

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/1vc4s77m>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 36(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Arnold, David

Publication Date

2012-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Aleut Identities: Tradition and Modernity in an Indigenous Fishery. By Katherine L. Reedy-Maschner. Montreal, QC, and Kingston, ON: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2010. 314 pages. \$95.00 cloth; \$29.95 paper.

To forge an existence as a small-boat commercial fisherman in the modern world is exceedingly difficult. Fishermen, and the fishing communities they inhabit, are dependent upon a myriad of outside forces over which they have no control: competition from a globalized farmed-fish industry, fluctuating world markets, oscillating ocean temperatures, ruthless multinationals, overlapping bureaucracies, overreaching conservation managers, and oppositional environmental groups. These are problems that affect fishermen the world over, yet in King Cove, Alaska, a remote community in the Aleutian Islands, these problems come with added layers of meaning. For Aleut people in King Cove, fishing is not just an occupation—it is the foundation of modern Aleut cultural identity. As Katherine Reedy-Maschner tells it, commercial fishing for the Aleut is more than simply a source of cash; it is the essential link between traditional ways and modern adaptation. Commercial fishing is the mechanism through which culture is transmitted, identity forged, rank and status established, and subsistence livelihoods continued. What will happen to Aleut peoples, Reedy-Maschner asks, if access to the commercial fisheries is further restricted for Aleuts in King Cove and the surrounding communities?

As an undergraduate at the University of Wisconsin–Madison, Reedy-Maschner spent her summers on archaeological field projects on the eastern Aleutian Island of Unimak. Rather than continue with research at remote dig sites, she gravitated toward modern Aleut villages such as King Cove. In 2000 she began the twenty months of fieldwork that would inform her dissertation in anthropology at Cambridge University, and ultimately this book. What fascinates Reedy-Maschner about these modern Aleut communities is how steadfastly they resist easy anthropological categorization. Here are communities in which commercialization has not planted the seeds of cultural dislocation and destruction, but instead have provided a source of community cohesion, identity, and cultural continuity. The way these resilient Aleut communities wed commercial fishing and subsistence activities, the way they carry forth tradition in the form of commercial participation, made Reedy-Maschner rethink the meaning of indigeneity and even the concept of tradition: “while continuing to harvest traditional foods, [the Aleut] have translated a long relationship with the sea into a commercial enterprise that permeates every aspect of Aleut life, from family relations to engagement with the global community,” she writes. “I am thus challenging the assumption that Alaskan indigeneity is inextricably linked to ‘subsistence,’ and I am contributing

to the ongoing critical discussions about indigeneity within anthropology more generally" (5).

Reedy-Maschner's signal contribution is the extent to which she challenges conventional (and dated) anthropological thinking that romanticizes "traditional" communities, treats all sources of modernization as destructive, and views all indigenous peoples as victims rather than active agents of their own destinies. She argues that "instead of assuming roles of victimhood," the Aleut "voluntarily grasped commercialization in order to raise their own standards of living and create an economic base that ideally would provide for many generations to come" (207). Moreover, Reedy-Maschner rejects an entire set of conventional anthropological concepts: tradition is fixed, "authentic" hunter-gatherers do not engage in the market, and hunting and gathering for subsistence is separate from commercial fishing. She does an excellent job of showing that while Aleut peoples have simultaneously engaged in subsistence and commercial activities, anthropologists, conservation officials, and government bureaucrats have often drawn arbitrary boundaries that separate these behaviors. "Tradition," she argues, "uniquely combines subsistence and commercial economies and practice for the Aleut" (187).

Although Reedy-Maschner deserves credit for her fluid definitions of identity and tradition that account for continuity and change, the author consistently overstates the extent to which her approach is new or unique. Because this is the first Aleut ethnography in more than thirty years, her approach may break new ground in Aleut studies, and for this she deserves applause. Still, given that throughout the past two decades numerous works in anthropology and the social sciences generally have challenged static and romantic notions of tradition and identity, her claims to uniqueness seem exaggerated. Dozens—perhaps hundreds—of recent works have focused on the extent to which aboriginal peoples all over the globe have drawn their traditions forward while adapting their customs and identities to commercial economies. Hundreds more have challenged the concept of "essentialism," whereby traditional peoples and cultures are considered "authentic" only when they behave in stereotypically "traditional" ways. Several works about Alaska Natives (many by anthropologists in the Alaska Department of Fish and Game Subsistence Division) have emphasized the intertwined nature of subsistence and commercial pursuits for Native peoples in Alaska. When the author begins her study with the statement that "indigenous peoples of Alaska are often portrayed as timeless groups who hunt and fish primarily for their own consumption," the reader has to wonder "by whom?" Certainly not anyone familiar with contemporary Alaska Natives. The passive voice in this opening statement is the first telltale sign of a straw man the author uses throughout to underscore the unique nature of her arguments, as in "I propose an unconventional definition of identity that

requires process and stasis to be thought of theoretically together. Defining culture or authenticity as unchanging prevents people from shaping their own identity” (32). Yet surely those studies that define “culture or authenticity as unchanging” or refuse to acknowledge tradition and modernity in the making of identity are outdated.

Despite its tendency to overdramatize the uniqueness of its claims, and to read somewhat like a dissertation, *Aleut Identities* is an important contribution to the anthropological literature of Alaska, the North, and fishing communities generally. Reedy-Maschner argues that “the relative absence of publications and research on the Aleut . . . contributes to many contemporary problems that Aleuts face” (9). If true, then perhaps this work will do more than simply update the record of scholarly work on the Aleut. Perhaps it will help the Aleut people navigate a quickly changing world in which their very identity as commercial fishers (and Aleuts) will be challenged by a vast array of new obstacles.

David Arnold

Columbia Basin College

The Assassination of Hole in the Day. By Anton Treuer. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2011. 295 pages. \$25.95 cloth; \$17.95 paper.

Hole in the Day the Younger (1828–68) was a major Ojibwa (Chippewa) leader who shaped Ojibwa, Minnesota, and US history. Yet this is the first major study of his place in Ojibwa history. Anton Treuer’s *Hole in the Day* (Bagone-giizhig) is multidimensional, revealed as an Ojibwa leader who alternately opposed and supported American policies; insisted on traditional relationships, but carved out his power in a radical departure from tradition; embraced wealth and self-enhancement; and often duped other Ojibwa into doing his bidding. Pictures of Hole in the Day show a striking figure wearing the otter turban of a traditional *ogima* (civic band leader), the eagle feathers of a warrior, and the tailored suit of an American man of means. Hated and feared by many, a leader unlike many Ojibwa had ever had, Hole in the Day was the embodiment of what a leader needed to be in order to negotiate the turmoil of the mid-nineteenth century.

Treuer begins his narrative with the assassination of Hole in the Day in 1868 by eleven, possibly fourteen, Leech Lake Ojibwa Band members. The assassination was widely reported throughout the United States because Hole in the Day had captured the imagination of the American public. Along with contemporary news, official Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA) reactions, and oral