

UC Santa Barbara

UC Santa Barbara Previously Published Works

Title

Birthing a Mother: The Surrogate Body and the Pregnant Self

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2041886w>

Journal

Contemporary Sociology A Journal of Reviews, 40(2)

ISSN

0094-3061

Author

Bielby, Denise D

Publication Date

2011-03-01

DOI

10.1177/0094306110396847aaa

Peer reviewed



Review

Reviewed Work(s): *Birth of a Mother: The Surrogate Body and the Pregnant Self* by Elly Teman

Review by: Denise D. Bielby

Source: *Contemporary Sociology*, Vol. 40, No. 2 (March 2011), pp. 229-231

Published by: American Sociological Association

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/23042160>

Accessed: 21-12-2018 20:03 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

American Sociological Association is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Contemporary Sociology*

that have made themselves heavily felt in Brazil, as well; cf. Goldenberg) have particularly strong historical legacies of this type, having considerable success in hegemonizing such notions of “what a woman is.” In turn, these inherently constraining constructions offer ample opportunity for policing women’s behavior and social participation in different walks of life, touching all women in one way or another yet, at the same time, heavily inflected by questions of class and race/ethnicity, age and sexual orientation.

Working with interviews and focus groups as specific methodological tools, Sutton’s intense experience in the field included a universe of socially-diverse women, as well as an ample number of political activists similarly varying in background and arenas of political struggle. Thus, she is able to provide dense descriptions of the experiences of *piqueteras*—working-class women who became engaged in street-based resistance (building and defending road blockades) to economic injustice, adopting attitudes that contrasted not only with elite discourse on womanhood¹ but which could also take their male partners, friends or family members by surprise. And there are testimonies of many others—middle-class women recounting their abortion experiences and reflecting on the cruelty of societal denial of women’s right to choose, young working class lesbians, an indigenous activist and a middle class black professional in a country that has made great historical efforts to claim its whiteness, all acutely aware of how they belong to a culture that marks them as bodily or sexually deviant. Their stories are shot through with experiences of violence, but also with large doses of courage and hope.

Sutton’s well-written text brings her informants’ stories richly to life. She shows

us how the metaphor “*poner el cuerpo*” (literally, putting [in]one’s body)—a phrase so often used by the women she interviewed and spoke to—takes on particular meanings in specific contexts. In Argentina, women famously put their bodies on the front line during resistance to the military dictatorship, as so eloquently demonstrated by the famous Las Madres de la Plaza de Mayo, women who used a traditional hegemonic signifier of womanhood—maternity, the maternal role and body—for contesting a brutal political regime. She also evokes many other instances in which women engaged with their social world—through organizing, protest and daily life—in ways that were more overtly disruptive of gender codes and (hetero) sexual/body norms. Thus, she shows us that although there are many different situations in which the expression *poner el cuerpo* might be used, what is most important is what it always connotes: the fullest sense of physical and spiritual presence, giving one’s all, taking risks, putting one’s mind and body to the task—as so many women of the Global South do today, facing the challenge of building a better world, at whatever the scale.

References

- Goldenberg, Miriam. 2008. *Coroas - Corpo, Envelhecimento, Casamento E Infidelidade*. Rio de Janeiro: Record.
- Rubin, Gayle. “The Traffic in Women. Notes on the “Political Economy” of Sex.” In: Reitter, Rayna (ed.) *Toward an Anthropology of Women*. 1975. New York: Monthly Review Press.

Birth of a Mother: The Surrogate Body and the Pregnant Self, by **Elly Teman**. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2010. 361pp. \$21.95 paper. ISBN: 9780520259645.

DENISE D. BIELBY
University of California, Santa Barbara
bielbyd@soc.ucsb.edu

Birth of a Mother is a beautifully and carefully written ethnographic analysis of the intimate emotional experiences of women who

¹ Sutton has convincingly evoked that elite nation building efforts that attempted to discipline working-class women by discursive constructions of their “proper place”: “feminine virtuosity, sacrifice, altruism, dignified work and filial and fraternal love . . . [to contrast both] the deviant working-class femininity embodied by the figure of the prostitute and the elegantly and highly superior feminine embodiment of upper-class women” (p. 65).

elect to provide the gift of maternity to those who are unable to bear a child. The informants who share their experiences are Israeli women who have decided to undertake a surrogate pregnancy, and their first-hand accounts of how they anticipated, managed, confronted, and rebuffed the inevitably complicated medical and legal dynamics of their experience make up the focus of this book. In order to control for the variable impact that culture, institutional, and social difference can bring to the surrogacy process, the author, a medical anthropologist, elected for several reasons to focus on the particular experiences of Israeli women. First, surrogacy is legal in Israel and surrogacy contracts are legal in its courts. Unlike arrangements in the leading surrogacy centers of California—which extol technology over nature and minimize state intervention in private reproductive lives, and the United Kingdom, where state regulations deter surrogacy from becoming a commercial venture and where surrogacy contracts are not enforceable—Israeli law actively permits compensated surrogacy but also tightly regulates every aspect of the process. Second, both the Jewish religion and Israeli national discourse amplify and clarify the very concepts being negotiated in surrogacy arrangements—maternity, kin relations, and bodies and boundaries, both personal and national. As a case study, Israel also introduces religion into the mix, further complicating how cultures employ beliefs about nature to maintain the social order associated with gender and race and to manage the relationship of technology to nature. Third, the relatively small size of Israel provided easy access to both parties of the dyad, the surrogate and the intended mother, and it also offered ready access to women who, unlike those in other locations, are allowed by national law to overtly pursue surrogacy strictly for financial gain. Thus, informants' commonly stated motivations for surrogacy such as love of pregnancy, empathy for childless couples, and the desire to make a unique contribution were combined with rational economic goals of paying off loans, providing for their own children's basic needs, and saving for the future.

The analysis of these women's experience is organized into four parts: "Dividing" focuses

on the ways in which surrogates demarcate the parts of their bodies they wish to retain for themselves throughout the process and those they wish to distance from and/or share with the intended mother. These demarcations form a "body map" that serves as a template for the emotion work associated with nurturing the fetus and relating to the intended couple, and as self-constructed guidelines body maps establish symbolic boundaries that translate into actions the surrogates rely upon throughout the pregnancy to preserve integrity of self. Often, mapping entailed bright lines that could shift, sometimes in contradictory ways, but it afforded these women control over their on-loan bodies and thus transcendence over the pregnancy.

"Connecting" addresses the activities of intended mothers as they moved away from their prior inability to be a mother and embarked on initially tentative steps in the process of preparing themselves for motherhood. These steps included naturalizing the embryos, actively seeking out knowledge about pregnancy and fetal development, and participating in prenatal care. These abstract claiming practices by intended mothers generated a privileged knowledge of the fetus that often encroached upon and complicated the contracted work of the surrogates. Inevitably, though, the pregnant body and the pregnancy itself became conjoined between surrogate and intended mothers through physical, psychological, and cultural activities and practices that redefined the pregnancy-by-proxy as one that embodied for the intended mother a gestational environment that replaced the surrogate.

"Separating" addresses the post-birth period—the strictly prescribed Israeli state-directed intervention that seals off the surrogate from the intended mother's new maternity and process of parental claiming. These rational, institutional practices that are designed to assure severance of all ties between the surrogate and the fetus and the intended mother stand in stark contrast to the preceding physical and emotional intertwining between the women, and are examined through the contrasting lenses of the intended's viewpoint of contractual exchange and the surrogate's of gifting. Here, for the first time, the intended mother now defines the terms of the relationship, a shift in power

and control that can leave the surrogate feeling like a commodity and her contribution to Israeli nation-state building marginalized.

"Redefining" describes how despite the ultimately alienating and disempowering experience of the final stage of surrogacy, it is transformed into one characterized by surrogates as the most meaningful experience of their lives. This takes place through the surrogate's portrayal of herself as a courageous heroine who through sheer physical strength and emotional fortitude is able to successfully challenge doctors' authoritative medical knowledge and endure extreme discomfort from the preparation for and undertaking of embryo transfers. This prowess is characterized, the author argues, in masculinized terms of mastery of the body over medical technology that are consistent with Israeli national culture.

This thoughtfully researched book sheds richly detailed substantive light upon and understanding of the social and emotional experience of the technical and technological aspects of surrogacy within a unique cultural context primarily from the vantage point of the surrogate and secondarily from that of the intended mother. But as a particular case study this book goes well beyond descriptive focus to clarify the profound impact that national cultures, legal structures, and religious ideologies can have upon the surrogate experience, especially when women explicitly enter into symbolic relations with the state through their roles as wives and mothers. The research offered here raises provocative questions about the extent to which reproductive technologies are postmodern challenges of modernist notions of the nuclear family and motherhood, the presumption that medical technologies are moving us closer to the end of the body, that new technologies usurp nature as we know it and lead to a type of postmodern procreation, and whether state control of reproduction upends women's and children's interests. At the core of this research is a deep human emotion in an unexpected place: the surrogates' greater sense of loss over dissolution of companionship with the intended mother than that from relinquishing the child she carried.

Working in the Shadows: A Year of Doing the Jobs [Most] Americans Won't Do, by **Gabriel Thompson**. New York, NY: Nation Books, 2010. 298pp. \$24.95 cloth. ISBN: 9781568584089.

TOM JURAVICH

University of Massachusetts, Amherst
juravich@lrrc.umass.edu

Sociologists are not the only ones who have used participant observation to study work and the labor process. Journalists have also long traded their reporter's notebooks for hard hats, aprons and rubber gloves to join the American workforce. Some of their sojourns have made for interesting reading, and sociologists have often used their accounts to introduce issues in the sociology of work and to jump-start discussion. Some of these journalists—such as Barbara Garson in her *All the Livelong Day* and more recently Barbara Ehrenreich in her *Nickel and Dimed*—have also made important contributions to sociological literature. Gabriel Thompson in his *Working in the Shadows: A Year of Doing the Jobs [Most] Americans Won't Do*, is the latest in this tradition of journalists doing important sociological work.

With unbridled enthusiasm, Thompson goes to work picking lettuce, processing chicken and delivering food—work typically done by immigrant workers. He is clear about his intentions. He is not pretending to be an immigrant worker, nor is he trying to replicate Ehrenreich's attempt to live on the wages he makes. He goes to work to experience first-hand the work of immigrant workers and to share with us what this work entails.

He begins in Yuma, Arizona where 90 percent of the iceberg lettuce for the U.S. and Canadian market is grown and picked during the winter months. He takes a job cutting lettuce with the global giant Dole, joining a crew of 18 immigrant workers, most of whom are guest workers from Mexico. In an effort to change the discourse on immigrant reform, the United Farm Workers have begun a campaign inviting white Americans to come join them working in the fields, if they think that immigrants are taking their jobs away. Thompson chronicles why they have not had many takers. In the

Contemporary Sociology 40, 2