UC Davis
UC Davis Previously Published Works

Title
The Counterpoint of Allusion in Fifteenth-Century Masses

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2fk7r1fn

Journal
Journal of the American Musicological Society, 45(2)

ISSN
0003-0139

Author
Reynolds, Christopher A

Publication Date
1992-07-01

DOI
10.1525/jams.1992.45.2.03a00020

Peer reviewed

eScholarship.org
Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

AMS AMERICAN MUSICOLOGICAL SOCIETY

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA PRESS
JOURNALS + DIGITAL PUBLISHING

The Counterpoint of Allusion in Fifteenth-Century Masses
Author(s): Christopher A. Reynolds
Source: *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, Vol. 45, No. 2 (Summer, 1992), pp. 228-260
Published by: University of California Press on behalf of the American Musicological Society
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/831448
Accessed: 14-01-2016 08:28 UTC

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

American Musicological Society and University of California Press are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of the American Musicological Society.*

http://www.jstor.org

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

The Counterpoint of Allusion in Fifteenth-Century Masses*

By CHRISTOPHER A. REYNOLDS

ANALYSES OF LITERATURE COMMONLY DISTINGUISH different types of reference to an earlier work by the terms allusion, paraphrase, and quotation. An exact reuse of a text is a quotation, while citations that are varied may constitute allusions or paraphrases depending on their length and context. It is less usual to distinguish quotations that also serve as allusions; to give an example, the last words of Jesus in the Gospel according to St. Matthew, "My God, my God, why hast thou forsaken me?," quote from the despairing first verse of Psalm 22. But according to centuries of biblical exegesis, the quotation of this particular Psalm beginning alludes further to the remaining Psalm verses, verses that prophesy various details of the Crucifixion before ending with an unequivocal affirmation of faith. Understood in this way the allusion transforms the meaning of the quotation.

Fifteenth-century composers, as well as artists and writers, often alluded, paraphrased, and quoted. Mass composers regularly quoted the tenor voice of chansons, and allusions occurred between Masses based on the same chanson or chant, and also between chansons. The relationship between Caron's chanson "Mourir me fault" and Busnois' "J'ay mains de biens" combines textual quotation with melodic allusion. Even if we cannot identify with certainty who is quoting whom, Busnois appears to cite text and music from the beginning of Caron's chanson. Midway through "J'ay mains de biens," at the text "mourir me fault," Busnois inserts a slightly altered form of Caron's opening motive (see Example 1). Musical paraphrases, though harder to identify, are thought to have been the normal practice for students emulating established masters.[1]

*I would like to thank Anna Maria Busse Berger, Margaret Bent, and Reinhard Strohm for commenting on an early draft of this paper. Work for this study began at the Villa I Tatti in 1988–89 with the support of a fellowship from the National Endowment for the Humanities.

[1] Howard Mayer Brown, "Emulation, Competition, and Homage: Imitation and Theories of Imitation in the Renaissance," this JOURNAL 35 (1982): 1–48. Another

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 1

Caron, "Mourir me fault," mm. 1–3 Busnois, "J'ay mains de biens," mm. 61–64

S Mor- ir me fault S Mou- rir me fault

Instances of allusion between chansons are plentiful, much more so than present scholarship would indicate. It is easy to recognize textual and musical allusion like that between the beginnings of the anonymous "Comme ung homme desconforté" and Binchois' "Comme femme desconfortée" or between Du Fay's "Le serviteur hault guerdonné" and the anonymous "Le serviteur infortuné"; but as the textual similarities diminish, so too does our confidence in establishing the significance of musical parallels.[2]

The important role of textual ties is evident in the two possible instances of allusion presented in Example 2. I have compared the opening of the chanson "Terriblement suis fortunée" to that of another anonymous chanson, "Fortune, n'as-tu point pitié" in Example 2a.[3] The musical similarities of the first phrase include the bass (although it is omitted from Example 2a), and they extend to cadential

instance of the relationship demonstrated in Example 1 can be seen in Ockeghem's "Ma maistresse" and the chanson "Au travail suis," probably by Barbingant but also with an attribution to Ockeghem. The first phrase of "Ma maistresse" is a textual and musical quotation of the last phrase in "Au travail suis." In this case, as in many others, one borrowing begat others. Ockeghem's beginning, in which the motive is imitated at the fifth below instead of the octave, then evidently inspired Caron, not once but twice: in "Cent mille escus" (mm. 41 ff.) and "Helas que pourra devenir" (part 2). Isaac enters this chain with his untexted paraphrase of "Helas" in Florence 229. The two chansons by Caron and that by Isaac are available in Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier from the Time of Lorenzo the Magnificent: Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale MS Banco Rari 229* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1983), nos. 70, 206, and 6, respectively. Brown comments on Isaac's reworking in the text volume, 209.

[2] The most extensive discussion of motivic and textual relationships between chansons, and their rhetorical background, is Brown, "Emulation, Competition, and Homage."

[3] "Terriblement suis fortunée" exists in several copies. It was sufficiently popular for Barbingant to use it as the basis of a Mass, and for it to be quoted both in the quodlibet "Mon seul plaisir" and by Jean Molinet in his *Le débat du viel gendarme et du viel amoureux*. It is discussed in Henrietta Schavran, "The Manuscript Pavia, Biblioteca Universitaria, Codice Aldini 362: A Study of Song Tradition in Italy circa 1440–1480" (Ph.D. diss., New York University, 1978), vol. 1, 78–81; and Maniates, "Combinative Techniques in Franco-Flemish Polyphony: A Study of Mannerism in Music from 1450–1530" (Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1965), 54–55 and 70–73. In contrast "Fortune, n'as-tu point pitié" appears only in Pavia 362. The first composition in this chansonnier is "Terriblement suis fortunée."

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

patterns throughout the chanson and also to text.[4] Aside from the common theme of *fortune*, the last syllables of the second line in "Terriblement suis fortunée, / Et de grans douleurs *atournée*," make an identical rhyme with "Fortune, n'as-tu point pitié, / De moy, que lonctemps *as tourné*." Indeed, the musical resemblances shown in Example 2a are particularly strong because of the textual similarities.

By comparison, the inability to examine textual parallels in Example 2b makes it correspondingly more difficult to assess the importance of the musical similarities, similarities that are no less strong than those shown in Example 2a. The first phrase of the anonymous chanson "Faulx, envieulx et meigre face" compares closely to the beginning of the second half of Agricola's "Je n'ay dueil que de vos viegna."[5] Although Agricola might well have based this part of his four-voice chanson on the (probably) earlier three-voice "Faulx envieulx," unfortunately only the textual incipit of the anonymous chanson survives. For Part 1 of "Je n'ay dueil," as Howard Mayer Brown has suggested, there is a likely model. Part 1 appears to derive both the initial text and music from Ockeghem's "Je n'ay dueil que je ne suis mort."[6] This reinforces the point at hand: the textual resemblances that help inform our musical comparison of Agricola's "Je n'ay dueil" (Part 1) and Ockeghem's chanson do not exist for Agricola's Part 2 and "Faulx, envieulx et meigre face."

Although quotations and allusions are both familiar concepts, quotations that also function as allusions have only begun to be identified in music of the period. This is ironic because, of all the arts, music is particularly capable of allusive quotations. Although other Renaissance artists worked with one medium, painters with visual images and writers with words, composers had the ability to work in two separate media: music and poetry. Thus a quotation in one medium could allude to the other. Renaissance composers could use a melodic quotation (or also a melodic allusion) to create a textual

[4] Compare "Terriblement," mm. 9–11 and 16–18, to "Fortune," mm. 14–16 and 19–21, respectively. The frequency of cadences is the same in each: "Terriblement" has seven cadences in twenty-three measures; "Fortune" has seven in twenty-five.

[5] These have been edited in Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier*, nos. 190 and 174, respectively. I have omitted the contratenor 1 from "Je n'ay dueil." Two other chansons start the second part with similar phrases: anonymous "Bonne dame playsant" (ibid., no. 222), and Puyllois/Braxatoris, "So lanc so meer" (Escorial, no. 96). The same sort of relationship between the opening motive of one chanson and the beginning of the second part of another exists between "Departes vous male bouche," pt. 2 (attributed to Du Fay in MC and Ockeghem in Paris 15123) and the anonymous "Mon cuer a demy se depart" (Niv).

[6] Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier*, text volume, 280.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

allusion: the quoted or slightly altered notes were understood to allude to the unquoted text. In citations that involve not an exact quotation of melody but an altered reference, the allusion may be said to be compound: the melodic allusion recalls both tune and text. As Michael Long has argued, the unsung text of a chanson used as the cantus firmus in a Mass could comment on the Mass text.[7] The tenor,

Example 2

(a) Anonymous, "Terriblement suis fortunée," mm. 1–5

Anonymous, "Fortune, n'as-tu point pitié," mm. 1–5

(b) Anonymous, "Faulx, envieulx et meigre face," mm. 1–8

Agricola, "Je n'ay dueil que de vos viegna," mm. 59–68

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

however, was not the only voice capable of conveying allusive meaning.

Until now studies of chanson citations in Masses have commonly examined either cantus firmus usage in tenor Masses or the citation of several voices in parody Masses. But, as I will argue, fifteenth-century Mass composers also used the contrapuntal voices to allude to chansons unrelated to the chanson present in the cantus firmus or parody voices, and they did so in a way that differs from contrapuntal citations found in polyphonic compositions of earlier centuries. The primary function of this practice was evidently to create rhetorically appropriate textual allusions.

By implication this argument contradicts the view that French and Flemish composers were, as products of a northern scholastic environment, inherently insensitive to the aims and methods of Italian humanists. This is the contention of two valuable and influential studies, one that examined Italian humanists who dealt seriously with music (and also with the absence of musical discussions by most humanists), and the other, music theorists who were also humanists.[8] My disagreement with their conclusions has in the first case to do with the assumption that the few humanists who wrote negatively about polyphony (and very often contemporary expressions of any kind) can be understood as typical of humanists in general; and in the second, with the privileging of music theory at the expense of the actual polyphony, with the assumption that music theorists with a humanistic bent would have described the ways in which polyphony written by northern composers applied classical rhetorical techniques. Both studies give the impression that there was one humanistic point of view, overlooking very substantial differences of opinion among humanists, differences that are pertinent for the relationship of humanism to polyphony, whether northern or Italian. The conflicts between humanists in the fifteenth century were extensive, not simply in arguing the merits of Cicero as opposed to Quintillian, or whether it was better to imitate one stylistic model or several, but on

[7] Michael Long, "Symbol and Ritual in Josquin's *Missa di Dadi*," this JOURNAL 42 (1989): 1–22.

[8] Nino Pirrotta, "Music and Cultural Tendencies in Fifteenth-Century Italy," this JOURNAL 19 (1966): 127–61; reprinted in Pirrotta, *Music and Culture in Italy from the Middle Ages to the Baroque* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984), 80–112 and 382–91; and Claude Palisca, *Humanism in Italian Renaissance Musical Thought* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1985), 1–22.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

fundamental questions such as the relative merits of the present and the past, and whether or not philosophy and rhetoric could benefit from each other.[9]

* * *

The first few preliminary examples of Mass movements that contain quotations seek to establish that the counterpoint in Mass movements occasionally bears striking resemblances to the opening motives of chansons. Although in some cases the allusive meaning seems clear, the question of textual interpretation will be raised in later examples. Examples 3 and 4 juxtapose chanson beginnings with

Example 3

Caron (or Busnois), "Pourtant se mon voloir s'est mis," mm. 1–7

[Faugues], *Missa Pour l'amour d'une,* Benedictus, mm. 1–8

Mass motives that are not taken from the chanson sung in the tenor. Example 3 compares the chanson "Pourtant se mon voloir s'est mis" by Caron (or Busnois) to the Benedictus of the *Missa Pour l'amour d'une* in the manuscript San Pietro B 80, a Mass that I attribute to Guillaume Faugues.[10] Example 4 places Johannes Cornago's chanson

[9] Strict definitions of humanism are not limited to musicological studies. Recent historical research also comments on the overly narrow view of humanism prevalent through the 1970s. An insightful study of the diversity of humanistic thought is Riccardo Fubini, "L'umanista: ritorno di un paradigma? Saggio per un profilo storico da Petrarca ad Erasmo," *Archivio storico italiano* 147 (1989): 435–508. Investigations of humanism increasingly recognize differences by city and region; see, for example, John F. D'Amico, *Renaissance Humanism in Papal Rome: Humanists and Churchmen on the Eve of the Reformation* (Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1983), xiii-xviii and 3–37; and the city-by-city review of humanism in *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, ed. Albert Rabil, Jr. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988), vol. 1, 141–331. Roy M. Ellefsen, "Music and Humanism in the Early Renaissance: Their Relationship and Its Roots in the Rhetorical and Philosophical Traditions" (Ph.D. diss., Florida State University, 1981), has imaginative and useful insights, despite its lack of musical sophistication. Further references are cited below.

[10] I make this attribution in a forthcoming book on music at San Pietro in Vaticano during the fifteenth century.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 4

Cornago, "Moro perché non day fede," mm. 1–7

Cornago, *Missa Ayo vista lo mappamundo,* Kyrie 2, mm. 1–4

"Moro perché non day fede" alongside the Kyrie 2 of his *Missa Ayo visto lo mappamundo* (I will return to the obvious similarity of Examples 3 and 4).[11]

Examples 5 and 6 cite several voices from two sections of a Credo composed by the little-known Seraphinus and copied in Naples during the 1480s. The Credo, which has attracted attention because of its unusual sectional structure, quotes at "Et incarnatus" from the chanson "Fortune par ta crualté" by Vincenet, another composer associated with Naples.[12] The beginning of the chanson appears in Example 5a; it is then transposed in Example 5b, so that it might be compared easily to the Et incarnatus in Example 5c. Seraphinus incorporates material from all three voices of the chanson. Examples 5d and 5e are internal phrases of each work. In Example 6 the "Et ex patre" section of this same Credo is compared to another Mass movement, the Benedictus of the *Missa Je suis en la mer* by Faugues. In this case the top two voices are switched. I have marked the exchanged voices motive "a" and motive "c." At the end of each example comes motive "b." While Seraphinus seems to quote Faugues, they both appear to cite the chanson by Busnois, "Quand ce viendra," shown in Example 6c.

The following examples suggest that this type of melodic reference created meaningful textual allusions. The examples progress from individual allusions, to Masses that quote from more than one phrase of a chanson, to chansons or chants that are cited in more than one Mass. In proposing interpretations of the allusions, it is useful to distinguish at

[11] Both are edited in Rebecca Gerber, *Johannes Cornago Complete Works*, Recent Researches in the Music of the Middle Ages and Early Renaissance, no. 15 (Madison: A-R Editions, 1984).

[12] Allan Atlas discusses this Credo in his *Music at the Aragonese Court of Naples* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 131–33. He observes that, "although Seraphinus begins section A by closely paraphrasing the melody of Credo I (*Liber usualis*, 64–66) in the superius, he proceeds rather freely thereafter" (p. 132). See also pp. 120–21, on the dating of its unique source, Perugia 431.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 5

(a) Seraphinus, Credo, mm. 45–47 (Et incarnatus)

(b) mm. 45–47 transposed

(c) Vincenet, "Fortune par ta crualté," mm. 1–6

(d) Seraphinus, mm. 50–52

(e) Vincenet, mm. 15–19

least two possible levels of reading: authorial readings that the composer intended, and nonauthorial readings that may have occurred independently to musicians of the time. For cases in which the allusion in a Mass is to a chanson by the same composer, the allusion is particularly likely

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 6

(a) Seraphinus, Credo, mm. 18–23 (Et ex Patre)

(b) Faugues, *Missa Je suis en la mer,* Benedictus, mm. 1–12

(c) Busnois, "Quand ce viendra," mm. 1–7

to be "an intentional echo of an earlier text: it not only reminds us; it means to remind us."[13] For example, the "Cum Sancto" of an independent Gloria setting by Du Fay in Trent 92 quotes from Du Fay's chanson "Adieu, quitte le demeurant de ma vie" (Example 7). The combined

Example 7

Du Fay, "Adieu, quitte le demeurant de ma vie," mm. 1–3

Du Fay, Gloria (no. 28), mm. 156–57 (Cum sancto spiritu)

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

imagery of the chanson (leaving "the abode" of one's life) and the Mass ("With the Holy Spirit in the Glory of God the Father") suggests a vision of life after death, whether for Christ or a recently deceased contemporary of Du Fay. But while it is one thing to propose that Du Fay intended this allusion, it is another to claim that he intended this or that particular interpretation of the allusion. The interpretations offered here aim to suggest the kind of intertextual readings that performers and informed listeners might have made, as they sang or heard one motive that recalled another.

Of the allusions suggested above, that in Example 4 has the strongest affinity between the sacred text, "Kyrie eleison" (Lord have mercy), and the secular. The chanson "Moro perché non day fede" makes its own direct plea for clemency: "I die because you will not give faith / To the pain that grieves me. / I beg your mercy." But this prayer is all the more pertinent because the poet of the chanson begs mercy from his Lady, whom he acknowledges as "the solace" of his "miserable soul," and because the Kyrie is part of a Marian Mass.[14] The scribe of Trent 88, the main source of Cornago's Mass, made clear the Marian intent of the Mass with this inscription: "Frater Johannes Cornago. La missa de la mapamundi apud Neapolim et la missa de nostra dona Sancta Maria." Rebecca Gerber has noted the traditional link between the references to sailing in the chanson "Ayo visto," medieval navigators, and Mary, the proverbial "star of the sea."[15]

Beyond offering a commentary on the Mass text, allusive quotations could contribute to the textual "theme" of the cantus firmus. In Example 8 the anonymous chanson "Quant jamés aultre bien n'auroye" is close melodically to the first measures of the Christe in Faugues' *Missa Le serviteur*. But the second line of the chanson "Que d'estre avoyé serviteur" also contributes textually to an association of this motive with the idea of servitude present in the "Le serviteur" chanson on which the entire Mass is based. In the unique source for "Quant jamés," Pavia 362, it is copied immediately before "Le serviteur infortuné."

Two apparent allusions in Caron's *Missa Clemens et benigna* involve this kind of interaction between the chanson and tenor text (see Example 9). He begins this Mass with a motive very like those found in "Madonna par la torno" (Escorial, no. 118) and "Hélas mestresse

[13] James Chandler, "Romantic Allusion," *Critical Inquiry* 8 (1982): 463. This passage is quoted in Kenneth Hull, "Brahms the Allusive: Extra-Compositional Reference in the Instrumental Music of Johannes Brahms" (Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1989), 40–41.

[14] Gerber, *Cornago*, xxii.

[15] Gerber, *Cornago*, viii-x.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 8

Anonymous, "Quant jamés aultre bien n'auroye," mm. 1–3
(transposed up a fifth)

Faugues, *Missa Le serviteur,* Christe, mm. 1–6

m'amie" (Pavia 362, no. 15), both anonymous (see Example 9a). In the latter chanson the poet speaks to his mistress ("my friend that I love"), telling her that when he is far from her, "sadness and melancholy are all my worldly goods."[16] This fits well with the Marian text of "Clemens et benigna," an Osanna trope.[17] By commencing the Kyrie I with potential allusions to chansons that refer to a mistress, Caron appears to coordinate secular and sacred references. Since the chansons both address a mistress, there is also the possibility that one of them alludes to the other, although the absence of anything but the first ungrammatical words of "Madonna par la torno" prevents a comparison.

Caron begins the Credo in a manner that recalls Joye's chanson "Mercy mon dueil" textually and motivically. The poem is suitable both because its pleas for mercy fit comfortably in a Mass based on a theme of clemency, and because it also affirms Marian beliefs. The

[16] Anonymous:
Hélas, mestresse, m'amie, / Que j'ayme prinse et crains, /
Quant de vous suis loingtains, / Quant que je voy m'ennuye.
Deul et merancoullye, / Sont tous mes biens mondains.
Hélas, mestresse, ...
Soulet sans conpagn*ie*, / Souvant je feis mes plains, /
Et puis estans mes mains, / En maudisant ma vie.
Hélas, mestresse, ...

[17] The text, found in manuscripts from the eleventh through the sixteenth centuries, is available in *Analecta hymnica medii aevi*, vol. 47, ed. C. Blume and H. M. Bannister (Leipzig, 1905), 350:

1. *Hosanna*

2a. Clemens et benigna, Iugi laude digna, Maria.	2b. Fer spiritalia Nobis remedia, Maria.

. . . .

7. *In excelsis*

For the melody as it appears in a thirteenth-century Sarum Missal (Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, MS 135), see Louis Gottlieb, "The Cyclic Masses of Trent Codex 89" (Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1958), vol. 2, 279.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

final stanza concludes "Wherefore, unless it be in Our Lady, / All hope has failed me."[18] Motivically the opening turn shown in Example 9b is characteristic of other chansons (among which are

Example 9

(a) Caron, *Missa Clemens et benigna,* Kyrie 1, mm. 1–4

S

T

Anonymous, "Madonna par la torno," mm. 1–3

S

T

Anonymous, "Hélas mestresse m'amie," mm. 1–4

S

(b) Caron, *Missa Clemens et benigna,* Patrem, mm. 1–7

S

Joye, "Mercy mon dueil," mm. 1–11

S

Horlay, "Hélas! je suis livré a mort"; Anonymous, "Mon cuer de dueil partira"; and also Hayne, "Amours, amours, trop me fiers"), but none comes so close to the Mass motive in both notes and the evident Marian sentiments of the Mass.[19]

[18] The translation is by Howard Garey, in Leeman Perkins and Howard Garey, *The Mellon Chansonnier* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979), vol. 2, 279.

[19] The chansons have been edited, "Hélas je suis livré" as no. 45, in Martha K. Hanen, *The Chansonnier El Escorial IV. a. 24,* Institute for Mediaeval Music,

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

A possible allusion in the anonymous *Missa L'homme armé* of Bologna Q16 also activates a secular-Marian reading. In the Credo at the text "Et incarnatus," the anonymous composer employs imitative counterpoint that is also found in Busnois' chanson "Ma tressouveraine princesse" (see Example 10). This melody is not uncommon, but when it appears imitatively the time interval of imitation is normally either two breves (as in the anonymous "Tenes en chause," no. 211 in Florence 229) or even three (as in Martini's "La Martinella," no. 13 of Florence 229). The setting of the *L'homme armé* Credo is closest musically and textually to the Busnois chanson. Just as the Mass text affirms Christ's incarnation through the Virgin Mary, the chanson describes "My most sovereign princess, without whom I cannot live."[20]

Example 10

Busnois, "Ma tressouveraine princesse," mm. 1–6

S

T

Anonymous, *Missa L'homme armé* (Bologna Q16), Credo, mm. 63–68 (Et incarnatus)

S

CT

The direction of the allusion shown in Example 11 is reversed: a chanson now seems to cite an earlier Mass. The motive that Ockeghem uses to set the "Et resurrexit" text in his *Missa Caput* resembles at least three chanson beginnings: the tenor of Compère's "Le renvoy

Musicological Studies, no. 36 (Henryville, Ottawa, and Binningen, 1983); "Mon cuer de dueil" in Schavran, "Pavia 362," no. 30; and "Amour, amours," in Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier*, no. 264.

[20] This chanson is edited in Louise Litterick, "The Manuscript Royal 20. A. XVI of the British Library" (Ph.D. diss., New York University, 1976), 249–50. The first lines of text are "Ma tressouverainne princesse / Celle sans qui je ne puis vivre." For "Tenes en chause," see Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier*, no. 211; and for Martini's *La Martinella*, Brown, no. 13.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

d'ung cueur esgaré," shown here, and also the two tenors presented earlier in Example 2a, "Terriblement suis fortunée" and "Fortune, n'as-tu point pitié"; the most obvious textual parallel is also the most exact rhythmic correspondence: the compatible images of the Resurrection and "Le renvoy," "the return of a heart misled," create an appropriate rhetorical commentary. The other two chansons may well antedate Ockeghem's Mass, and Ockeghem may have had his own associations between his Mass motive and one or both of the earlier chanson tenors. Because there is no chance that Compère's chanson preceded Ockeghem's Mass, "Le renvoy" would have alluded to the Mass text, rather than vice versa; yet questions of priority would have been unimportant to any musician who made an association between a Mass and chanson. Textual relevance rather than compositional chronology would determine the success of the allusion. For composers who were schooled and employed by the church, allusions in chansons to Mass or motet texts must have been unavoidable (another possible instance is discussed below with regard to Example 14, p. 246).[21]

Example 11

Ockeghem, *Missa Caput*, Credo, mm. 49–54 (Et resurrexit)

Compère, "Le renvoy d'ung cueur esgaré," mm. 1–5

Each of these has been an isolated example of allusion. Examples 12 and 13 present more complex references, Masses that allude to more than one phrase of a single chanson. Caron incorporated a series of motivic allusions to one of his own chansons into the Credo of his *Missa Sanguis sanctorum*; indeed, this is not so much an instance of quotation or allusion as it is one of paraphrase. From the duet at "Et resurrexit" through the four-voice entrance at "Cuius regni non erit finis," Caron begins each phrase with motives from his chanson "O vie fortunée." The individual phrases of the chanson are all present in the

[21] I am grateful to Alejandro Planchart for this observation.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 12

(a) Caron, *Missa Sanguis sanctorum,* Et resurrexit — Caron, "O vie fortunée," phrase 3

(b) *Missa Sanguis,* secundum scripturas — "O vie fortunée," phrase 3a

S
CT

S
T

(c) *Missa Sanguis,* et ascendit

S

CT

"O vie fortunée," phrase 4

S

T

(d) *Missa Sanguis,* et iterum — "O vie fortunée," phrase 2

S

(e) *Missa Sanguis,* cuius regni non erit finis

S
CT

"O vie fortunée," phrase 1

S
T

Mass, but not in the order that they have in the chanson. Caron rearranged the motives in the Mass, shown in Example 12, in the following sequence:

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Et resurrexit	= Chanson phrase 3
secundum Scripturas	= phrase 3a
Et ascendit in caelum	= phrase 4
Et iterum venturus	= phrase 2
cuius regni non erit finis	= phrase 1

The motives are slightly varied, and in several cases a contrapuntal voice is also taken from the chanson, especially for the triadic, imitative duet at "Et ascendit" (Example 12c).

The lack of a grammatical chanson text precludes any detailed interpretation of possible textual allusions. But according to the extant readings, the Resurrection text in the Mass is accompanied by the chanson motive that is apparently linked to a line about someone that had "so quickly passed into a changed state" ("Que n'en voloye, voyre, et sy tost passée / En chaingement d'estas"). It is more certain that Caron timed the text "whose reign shall have no end" to coincide with the first words of the chanson, "O vie fortunée."[22]

When, as often is the case, the head motive of a Mass is unrelated to the chanson or chant present in the tenor, the head motive may refer to an altogether different chanson or chant. In Du Fay's *Missa Se la face ay pale*, for example, every movement but the Kyrie begins with an extended duet that has a marked similarity to the briefly imitative upper voices of the chanson "He nesse pas grant desplaysir" by Puyllois (see Example 13). And in the "Et in terra" the second phrase of this duet (Example 13b) seems related to the second phrase of the chanson, as does the triadic ending of the Agnus 2 (Example 13c) to the final measures of the chanson. Both poems speak of the pain of love. With Puyllois it is "a great displeasure / when one has to travel so far / to see one's sweet lady," while with Du Fay, the lover for whom "love is so bitter" can have "nothing good" without his beautiful lady.

A final type of allusive borrowing involves chansons that are cited in two or more Masses. Most of the many instances of motivic

[22] My thanks to Leofranc Holford-Strevens for his translation of the preceding chanson verse. As Brown and others have noted, "O vie fortunée" is extremely close to the chanson "Cent mille escus quant je voldroie"; see his "Emulation, Competition, and Homage," 25–29, and the bibliography he cites in n. 30. Given this similarity, a relationship between the Mass and "Cent mille escus" might also be considered, although melodically the Mass seems closer to "O vie fortunée." Were a singer to make an association with the more popular "Cent mille escus," however, the Mass text is suitable: "Et iterum venturus est, cuius regni non finis" would correspond to verses 1 and 2, "And paradise when I die, / A hundred thousand crowns when I want them"; Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier*, text volume, 241.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 13

(a) Puyllois, "He nesse pas grant desplaysir," mm. 1–8

S
T

Du Fay, *Missa Se la face ay pale,* Et in terra, mm. 1–4

S
CT

(b) Puyllois, mm. 18–22

S
T

Du Fay, mm. 7–9

S
CT

(c) Puyllois, mm. 59–71

S
S

Du Fay, Agnus 2, mm. 50–59

S
S

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

resemblances between Masses that scholars have noted are potentially based on a common musical-textual source. The Benedictus of Ockeghem's *Missa* begins in much the same way as the Crucifixus of the second Naples *Missa L'homme armé*. The opening gesture of each continues into a rising figure (bracketed in Example 14a and b). The "Qui tollis" in Caron's *Missa Jesus autem transiens* (Example 14c) may be related.[23] The shared notes of the contra voice are marked with an "x." This time the web of potential references leads to the chansons presented earlier in Example 2b, the anonymous chanson "Faulx, envieulx et meigre face" and the second half of Agricola's "Je n'ay dueil que de vos viegna." Of these examples the two chansons and Ockeghem's Benedictus display the imitative counterpoint in the contra voice, and "Faulx, envieulx" shares with Caron's "Qui tollis" the same bass accompaniment.

Although no text exists for "Faulx envieulx," that for "Je n'ay dueil" expresses a pronounced religiosity. The text for Part 2 is explicit: "For God desired to make you so perfect / that nothing can please me / except to praise your great virtues." As Brown observed for these lines, "it is impossible not to think of the human soul worshiping Christ."[24] The phrase "for God desired to make you so perfect" is equally suitable as a commentary on the Benedictus, referring to the followers of Christ, or on the Crucifixus text in the Credo, as an explanation of why Christ had to endure the Crucifixion. But here as in Example 11, the Mass settings doubtless precede the chanson. The textual missing link, "Faulx, envieulx et meigre face," is stylistically early enough to have served as a model for Ockeghem's Benedictus.

In addition to references between Masses and chansons, motets would have been equally fertile territory for the use of allusive quotations. As Charles Hamm noticed some years ago, and Shai Burstyn elaborated, Leonel Power's early setting of "Anima mea liquefacta est" draws several internal phrases from the opening motive of Binchois' chanson, "De plus en plus." Burstyn also observed

[23] This is not the only motive shared by Ockeghem's *Missa*, one of the Naples *L'homme armé* Masses, and a Mass by Caron. As I described in "Death or Mercy from the Lamb of God: Allusive Quotations in the Contrapuntal Voices of Polyphonic Masses," paper read at the Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society, Oakland, California, November 1990, and as I will elaborate elsewhere, the Agnus 2 of Ockeghem's *Missa*, the Agnus 2 of Caron's *Missa L'homme armé*, and the Benedictus of the sixth Naples *Missa L'homme armé* have extensive motivic connections.

[24] Brown, *A Florentine Chansonnier*, text volume, 281. The translation is by Brian Jeffery.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Example 14

(a) Ockeghem, *Missa* (3v), Benedictus, mm. 1–7

S

CT

(b) Anonymous, *Missa L'homme armé* (Naples no. 2), Crucifixus, mm. 1–8

S

CT

B

(c) Caron, *Missa Jesus autem transiens,* Qui tollis, mm. 1–7

S

CT

B

textual parallels between the chanson poem and the Song of Songs verses set by Power.[25] Later in the century, when Josquin quotes the beginning of the chanson "D'ung aultre amer" in the middle of his motet "Tu solus, qui facis mirabilia," the only difference from the examples cited above is the presence of text as well as music. The notion of "loving another" expressed in the French text is included only to be rejected in the Latin motet text as "deceitful" and "sinful."

[25] Hamm, *Leonel Power Complete Works* Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae, no. 50, vol. 1, xv (Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1969); and Burstyn, "Power's *Anima mea* and Binchois' *De plus en plus*: A Study in Musical Relationships," *Musica disciplina* 30 (1976): 55–72.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Josquin thereby strengthens the pledge of fidelity to "the only Creator." His motet is exceptional only in his inclusion of the chanson text, not in his quotation of the musical motive. And as Richard Taruskin first noted, Josquin also quoted (without text) the superius line of "J'ay pris amours" in the contra voice of the motet "Christe, Fili Dei."[26]

The added text and also the length of Josquin's quotation makes it far more recognizable than the allusions proposed in Examples 3 and 4, involving Masses by Faugues and Cornago and chansons by Caron (or Busnois) and Cornago. Because the motives in those examples have marked similarities to each other, it is easy to question the presence of a purposeful citation rather than merely a coincidental resemblance. As a result, Examples 3 and 4 touch on several basic issues, foremost among them the notion of a distinctive motive. The more one looks for motives which could be considered distinctive, the more inescapable the conclusion that there is no such thing as a motive which is by itself unique or even rare. Yet, paradoxically, this motivic commonality is necessarily a precondition for motivic allusions. The motives presented above become more or less distinctive through their contrapuntal-harmonic settings, their rhythmic contours, and their textual associations.

The exactitude of motivic details probably matters more to students of this music today than it would to singers or musically literate listeners of the time. There are at least four separate criteria for evaluating the possible existence of an allusive quotation: (1) the length and distinctive profile of a quotation (regarding the question of what length is sufficient to constitute an allusion or quotation, the short entries of quodlibets—sometimes not more than four notes—are relevant); (2) the degree of a match between texts (whether sacred and secular, sacred and sacred, or secular and secular); (3) the popularity of the source (not relevant when the Mass and chanson are by the same composer); and (4) the chronological and geographical proximity of the chanson and Mass and their composers.

Where there is a strong resonance between two texts, the dependence traditionally placed on a well-defined motive diminishes. That is as valid in Examples 4, 8, and 11 as it is in Examples 1 and 2. Similarly, the popularity of a chanson—assessed chiefly by what is

[26] See his edition of "J'ay pris amours" (Miami: Ogni Sorte Editions, 1982), 5; noting the verbal context of the motet, "a litany to Jesus Christ to intercede with his mother," Taruskin suggests that "'J'ay pris amours' seems to be intended here as a secret love letter to the Virgin Mary."

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

known of its dissemination, but also by the number of compositions that can be shown to quote from it—is important. In that respect, the eight widely distributed sources for Busnois' "Quant ce viendra," cited in Example 6, are a far more credible demonstration of popularity than is the single source of "Quant jamés aultre bien n'auroye" (Pavia 362), cited in Example 8. And the brevity and common character of the motives in Example 4 are offset by the fact that Cornago composed both the chanson and the Mass. In sum, the potential sources of allusive motives for a composer are no different from the traditional sources of motives for a cantus firmus or parody Mass; namely the chansons or motets by the same composer, those of a close contemporary, or those that were widely distributed.

These criteria lead directly to questions about the audience for an allusion. By its very commonality, Cornago's motive from "Moro perché non day fede" (Example 4) forces the questions: is this an allusion that a patron could be expected to recognize? members of the court who may have heard the chanson sung at dinner the night before? the fellow singers? In cases of multiple allusions such as that in Example 14, or in the instance of the so-called "second tune" of *L'homme armé* Masses, there is evidence that one or more composers recognized the allusion of a colleague.[27] But more often than not these questions will be unanswerable. Although many allusions were doubtless easily appreciated, it would be wrong to look only to widely circulated chansons as sources for possible allusions. Quotations and allusions could also have been a relatively private affair, much as the allusions one humanist might include in a letter to another.

* * *

This musical practice has clear parallels with the rhetorical thought of humanists from the late fourteenth into the sixteenth centuries. Particularly for ecclesiastical humanists—whether active in the international milieu of the papal court or at a northern university or court—there was a marked tendency to seek an accommodation between the conflicting interests of humanists and those of Medieval theologians and scholastic philosophers. Among those who took the lead in arguing that the scholastic realms of dialectic and philosophy should function in the language of the age was Lorenzo Valla. Taking his cue from Quintillian and Cicero, Valla maintained that "philoso-

[27] The "second tune" is discussed in Lewis Lockwood, "Aspects of the 'L'homme armé' Tradition," *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association* 100 (1973–74): 97–122.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

phy and dialectic do not usually, nor should they, depart from the most frequent usage in speaking the path . . . beaten by the masses and sturdily paved."[28] The humanist secretary Giovanni Pontano subsequently expressed the same view in his *Aegidius*: "We must discuss divine matters with the same words we employ in talking and reasoning about human affairs."[29]

The rhetorical impulse to discuss divine matters in the popular language led painters to portray biblical stories with modern images, peopling their frescoes with contemporary figures dressed in the latest fashions; and it caused composers to base their Masses on chansons.[30] This practice did not so much "sanctify" worldly affairs, as Panofsky claimed for art and Michael Long for music,[31] as the reverse: by using earthly means to describe otherworldly matters, the descriptions became more immediate, more understandable, more persuasive. While the associations between chanson tune and the implied text and the actual Mass text are often presented today as irreverent humor, composers of the time would have had loftier motives. Their popular allusions helped them to humanize the religious mysteries they celebrated. The use of a chanson tune in a sacred context followed Cicero's advice to orators to draw on popular usage rather than

[28] The translation is that of David Marsh, "Grammar, Method, and Polemic in Lorenzo Valla's 'Elegantiae,'" *Rinascimento* 19 (1979): 105. Jerrold Seigel also discusses this passage in *Rhetoric and Philosophy in Renaissance Humanism: The Union of Eloquence and Wisdom, Petrarch to Valla* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1968), 162–64. For an account of Valla's argument in favor of Quintillian rather than Cicero, see Salvatore Camporeale, *Lorenzo Valla: umanesimo e teologia* (Florence: Istituto nazionale di studi sul Rinascimento, 1972), 89–100. On the accommodations made between scholasticism and humanism in Roman cultural and intellectual life, see D'Amico, *Renaissance Humanism in Papal Rome*, especially 115–43.

[29] "Nec nos de Deo cum disserimus aliis quidem verbis quam cum de homine et loquimur et disputamus," Marsh, "Grammar, Method, and Polemic," 106. Marsh makes the connection between Pontano and Valla.

[30] On the necessity for painters to imitate the ancients while also acknowledging modern styles, see E. H. Gombrich, "The Style all'antica: Imitation and Assimilation," in his *Norm and Form: Studies in the Art of the Renaissance* (London: Phaidon, 1966), 122–28; and Sydney Anglo, "Humanism and the Court Arts," in *The Impact of Humanism on Western Europe*, ed. Anthony Goodman and Angus MacKay (London and New York: Longman, 1990), 70, who quotes Lodovico Canossa in Baldassare Castiglione's *Il Cortegiano*, "Se noi vorremo imitar gli antichi, non gl'imitaremo" (1, xxxii). And there is much that is relevant to this theme in Michael Baxandall, *Giotto and the Orators: Humanist Observers of Painting in Italy and the Discovery of Pictorial Composition, 1350–1450* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971); see, for example, 97–98, where he quotes Leonardo Giustiniani, a pupil of Guarino, on the value of portraying things "fashioned as if living" (p. 98).

[31] Long, "Symbol and Ritual," 2; Erwin Panofsky, *Early Netherlandish Painting* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1953), vol. 1, 142.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

philosophical distinctions, to weigh words not in "a goldsmith's balance, but in a popular scale."[32]

At a time when the Bible first began to be interpreted as a book of history, secular and sacred imagery regularly intermingled or alternated.[33] Sermons in the vernacular by no means replaced sermons in Latin; and among those preached in Latin, the older thematic sermons held their own against more modern examples of epideictic oratory.[34] For musicians the popular scale advocated by Cicero did not preclude composing motets and Masses on chant. Josquin was evidently as comfortable basing a Mass on "Pange lingua" as he was on the "L'homme armé" tune. And despite the focus of this essay, allusive quotations of chants were doubtless as frequent as those to chansons. It is not so much wrong as partisan (siding with conservative churchmen of the time) to see a qualitative difference between works based on a chant and those on a chanson. It mattered more for the tune to be presented recognizably, so that the source of the Mass could be understood and, according to one of the chief aims of epideictic rhetoric, enjoyed. Because sacred and secular history were both valued sources of knowledge, Tinctoris had as much right to praise Pope Alexander VI by comparing him to Alexander the Great in the motet "Gaude Roma" as Du Fay did when he honored Pope Eugenius IV in the motet "Ecclesie militantis" by drawing on two chants for the archangel Gabriel (Gabriele was the Pope's secular name). Both lauded their subjects by making comparisons to historical figures that would have been easily understood and appreciated by their audiences.

Allusions and quotations of chansons in contrapuntal voices differ most significantly from the chanson tunes presented in a cantus firmus in that they are unannounced. Composers who wove chanson and

[32] Marsh, "Grammar, Method, and Polemic," 105; "non aurificis statera sed populari quadam trutina" (*De oratore*, vol. 2, 38, 159).

[33] On the appearance of a historical interpretation of the Bible, see John O'Malley, *Praise and Blame in Renaissance Rome: Rhetoric, Doctrine, and Reform in the Sacred Orators of the Papal Court, c. 1450–1521* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1979), 62.

[34] Humanist oratory utilized principally the third type of classical eloquence, the *genus demonstrativum* or epideictic. Intended to arouse feelings of praise or blame, it was particularly suitable for celebratory and ceremonial events. Epideictic oratory attempted to move listeners as well as to teach, and to impress them with the beauty and artistry of the oration. On epideictic oratory in the Renaissance see O'Malley, *Praise and Blame*, 36–41; A. Leigh DeNeef, "Epideictic Rhetoric and the Renaissance Lyric," *The Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 3 (1973): 203–31; and John McManamon, *Funeral Oratory and the Cultural Ideals of Italian Humanism* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1989), 32–35, 155–56, and 132–34.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

chant motives into the contrapuntal lines of Masses and motets did in music what many humanists did in words. Whether writing letters, treatises, or orations, humanists at times quoted and alluded to classical and biblical sources without calling attention to their allusive habits. In her edition of a volume of letters by Poggio Bracciolini, Phyllis Gordon cites the constant appearance of phrases in his letters from classical texts, biblical verse, and passages from the Church Fathers. Although some sentences are a "veritable mosaic of quotations," none of the borrowed phrases is ever identified as a quotation.[35] John O'Malley has similar conclusions in his study of sermons preached at the papal court, noting particularly a sermon by Agostino Filippi that has quotations, paraphrases, and allusions from sacred and profane sources that "fit the rhythm [of the text] and do not attract attention to themselves."[36] Whether quotations were incorporated seamlessly into the new text or presented conspicuously, there were important Classical models. The allusive techniques of Virgil, who integrated earlier texts into his own, have recently been contrasted with those of Ovid, who preferred to call attention to the artifice of his allusions.[37]

Another function of chanson allusions and quotations is easily overlooked in the midst of other rhetorical considerations; namely, that composers would have implanted chanson melodies in Masses to entertain. With regard to his epistolary style, Poggio Bracciolini explicitly acknowledged this purpose when he published his letters in 1436: "For I used to put into letters whatever came to the tip of my tongue, so that sometimes even the vernacular is mixed into them, though for amusement."[38] For Mass composers in the fifteenth century, French chansons were the musical vernacular, the source of witty commentary on traditional texts. The desires to please as well as to teach were both served by the complex and sophisticated interactions that were possible between the texts (whether written or remembered) of the tenor and the Mass, between those of an allusive motive in a contrapuntal voice and the Mass, between a contrapuntal

[35] Poggius Bracciolini, *Two Renaissance Book Hunters: The Letters of Poggius Bracciolini to Nicolaus de Niccolis*, trans. and ed. Phyllis Walter Goodhart Gordon (New York: Columbia University Press, 1974), 9.

[36] O'Malley, *Praise and Blame*, 53–54.

[37] Charles Segal discusses the two complementary tendencies in the forward to his edition of Gian Biagio Conte, *The Rhetoric of Imitation: Genre and Poetic Memory in Virgil and Other Latin Poets*, trans. and ed. C. Segal (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986), 12.

[38] Bracciolini, *Two Renaissance Book Hunters*, 21.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

voice and the tenor, and between all three. Parody Masses differ from the technique described above primarily in drawing the contrapuntal voices from the same source as the tenor, an option not available in Masses based on chant.

But if composers incorporated contrapuntal allusions as often as here suggested, why did music theorists from the period not mention this practice? For such a purely rhetorical technique, music-theoretical commentary was hardly necessary. Quotation, allusion, and paraphrase were rhetorical devices, and rhetorical instruction was readily available. For the same reason, fifteenth-century Italian humanists wrote few original Rhetorics. Far from implying a lack of interest, this scarcity testifies to the great authority and availability of classical manuals. Cicero and Quintillian were not easily supplanted.[39] And if modern investigations into compositional practices were limited to the issues discussed by Tinctoris and others, there would be no investigations of proportional structures in Josquin, of numerological significance in Busnois, of the impact of commercial math on the mensural system, or of imitation, either as a contrapuntal technique or a rhetorical principle. Theorists of any age have circumscribed interests.

For the moment, one of the most significant implications of this practice is that northern composers showed a remarkable ability to adapt their sophisticated contrapuntal techniques to rhetorical modes of expression advocated by Italian humanists. The notion that the art of Du Fay and his successors stood at artistic odds with humanism by expounding some sort of purely scholastic (and northern) expression is simplistic both in its view of musical techniques and cultural trends. It discounts the continued importance of scholastic thought throughout the Renaissance in Italy as well as the north,[40] overlooks the rapid

[39] John Monfasani, "Humanism and Rhetoric," in *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, ed. Albert Rabil, Jr. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988), vol. 3, 171–235, especially 186–87. The same argument pertains to treatises on grammar, popular in the Middle Ages and again in the sixteenth century; but in the 1400s grammarians "continued to utilize pedagogical material that had been inherited, in an unbroken tradition, from late antiquity." W. Keith Percival, "Renaissance Grammar," in *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, vol. 3, 71.

[40] See P. O. Kristeller, "Rhetoric in Medieval and Renaissance Culture," in *Renaissance Eloquence: Studies in the Theory and Practice of Renaissance Rhetoric*, ed. James Murphy (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1983); and idem, "Humanism and Scholasticism in the Italian Renaissance," *Byzantion* 17 (1944–45): 346–74. This latter essay has been reprinted several times, most recently in Paul Oskar Kristeller, *Renaissance Thought and Its Sources*, ed. M. Mooney (New York: Columbia University Press, 1979), 85–105; citations are to the latter edition.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

advance of humanistic ideals in northern courts, monasteries, and universities,[41] and perhaps most of all, ignores the many areas of rapprochement between scholasticism and humanism that were particularly characteristic of clerical humanism.[42] This is not to deny either the antipathy that militantly classical humanists felt toward polyphony and its northern practitioners or the antitheoretical tendencies of many northern singers in Italy; but these two extremes should not obscure the vast and heterodox middle ground between them.

This polarized view of polyphony in the fifteenth century casts humanism and scholasticism (and north and south) as opposing factions in a kind of cultural Cold War. But in the fifteenth century this opposition was often defined more narrowly as one between rhetoric and philosophy. The distinction is important, because while with humanism music historians are easily snared in problems of definition and the lack of ancient musical models, with rhetoric and oratory there is a system of communication with many parallels to music. In Kristeller's formulation, humanists were not philosophers who made up for their lack of philosophical depth with an interest in rhetoric and antiquity, but "professional rhetoricians . . . who tried to

[41] Typical of recent studies on northern humanism, Lewis Spitz characterizes the development of German humanism as "wide open to further study"; "The Course of German Humanism," in *Itinerarium italicum. The Profile of the Italian Renaissance in the Mirror of its European Transformations*, ed. Heiko A. Oberman with Thomas Brady, Jr. (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1975), 389. See among others, Jozef Ijsewijn, "The Coming of Humanism to the Low Countries," in *Itinerarium italicum*, 193–301; Kristeller, "The European Diffusion of Italian Humanism," in *Renaissance Thought and the Arts: Collected Essays* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1965), 69–88; Roberto Weiss, *The Spread of Italian Humanism* (London: Hutchinson, 1964); Morimichi Watanabe, "Gregor Heimburg and Early Humanism in Germany," in *Philosophy and Humanism: Renaissance Essays in Honor of Paul Oskar Kristeller*, ed. Edward P. Mahoney (New York: Columbia University Press, 1976), 406–22; and the articles in *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, vol. 2, *Humanism Beyond Italy*, ed. Albert Rabil, Jr. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988).

[42] See among many recent works, D'Amico, *Renaissance Humanism in Papal Rome*; Jerry Bentley, *Humanists and Holy Writ: New Testament Scholarship in the Renaissance* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983); Charles Stinger, *Humanism and the Church Fathers: Ambrogio Traversari (1386–1439) and Christian Antiquity in the Italian Renaissance* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1977); and Charles Trinkaus, *In Our Image and Likeness: Humanity and Divinity in Italian Humanist Thought* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970).

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

assert the importance of their field of learning and to impose their standards upon the other fields of learning and of science, including philosophy."[43]

Northern musicians, by their education and by their exposure to Italian culture, had ample opportunity to adapt new rhetorical ideas to their own musical language, as much science as art.[44] In the mid-fifteenth century it would no longer have been necessary for northern musicians to have traveled to Italy. By then the latest rhetorical ideas of Italian humanists could have reached them through contacts at ecclesiastical councils, the influence of Italian humanists residing in the north (such as Bracciolini in England and Aeneas Silvius Piccolomini, the "apostle of humanism" at the Hapsburg court of Frederick III), and also through contact with colleagues who had returned from a sojourn in Italy. Du Fay, resident at the same courts as Leon Battista Alberti—Bologna, Rome, Florence—was only one of many.

Contrapuntal citations of preexistent works were not at all new to the fifteenth century, but then, neither was an interest in Classical rhetoric. Musical precedents exist in the parodies of early Quattrocento Italian composers like Bartolomeo da Bologna and in the musical and textual paraphrases of fourteenth-century French composers. Instances of melodic quotation can also be compared to the evolution of polytextual techniques in fourteenth-century French motets and fifteenth-century combinative chansons.[45] Already in the later thir-

[43] Kristeller, "Humanism and Scholasticism in the Italian Renaissance," 92. In northern countries as well as Italy, humanism developed not in philosophy or science but in grammar and rhetoric. See also Kristeller, 91; and Noel L. Brann, "Humanism in Germany," 131.

[44] Brown discusses the receptivity of northern musicians to rhetorical techniques in "Emulation, Competition, and Homage," 42–45.

[45] An important study of polytextual polyphony is Reinhold Hammerstein, "Über das gleichzeitige Erklingen mehrerer Texte: Zur Geschichte mehrtextiger Komposition unter besonderer Berücksichtigung J.S. Bachs," *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 27 (1970): 257–86. See among others Leo Schrade, "A Fourteenth Century Parody Mass," *Acta musicologica* 27 (1955): 13–39; Kurt von Fischer, "Kontrafakturen und Parodien italienischer Werke des Trecento und frühen Quattrocento," *Annales musicologiques* 5 (1957): 43–59; Roland Jackson, "Musical Interrelations Between Fourteenth Century Mass Movements (A Preliminary Study)," *Acta musicologica* 29 (1957): 54–64; Ursula Günther, "Zitate in Französischen Liedsätzen der Ars Nova und Ars Subtilior," *Musica disciplina* 26 (1972): 53–68; and Brown, "Emulation, Competition, and Homage," 44–55. Indeed, as Planchart pointed out to me, the urge of composers to incorporate modern commentary on sacred texts can be traced back to the troping impulse in Medieval chant (although such commentary was necessarily not simultaneous). And Margaret Bent arrived at strikingly similar conclusions about

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

teenth century, French composers quoted trouvère compositions in the motet-*enté*. They could graft the secular tune, its text, or both into either of the upper voices of the motet. Adam de la Halle is typical in citing note for note and word for word the refrain from his rondeau "A Dieu commant" in his motet "A Dieu commant / Aucun se sont / Super te." The middle voice of the rondeau is divided so that it begins and ends the middle voice of the motet, while the tenor and upper voice are new.

In the same way, Medieval preachers often quoted verbatim from Greek and Roman writers. What was new in the fifteenth century was the extent to which humanists integrated the words of Classical and secular authors into their writings and sermons. With regard to the stylistic differences of Medieval and Renaissance sacred oratory, O'Malley observes a marked tendency for sermons of the older thematic type to quote directly and explicitly from Classical as well as biblical sources; in contrast, epideictic sermons minimize such literal citations in favor of allusions and paraphrases. Orators who avoided literal quotations were "following, probably wittingly, the example of Cicero himself."[46] In explaining how writers should incorporate phrases from earlier sources, the Ciceronian Gasparino Barzizza (d. 1431) taught that "all good literary imitation comes from adding, subtracting, altering, transferring, or renewing."[47] Fifteenth-century notions about the proper way to translate from Greek similarly differed from Medieval practices in the admonition to avoid "word for word" (*ad verbum*) renditions.[48]

Epideictic oratory used allusion like the trope of Classical rhetoric, in which a figure displaced from its original context assumes a figurative meaning in a new context. The philologist Giorgio Pasquali, in describing a Classical "arte allusiva," stressed the necessity

Machaut's counterpoint in her paper "Machaut's Motets 10 and 15," read at the Nineteenth Medieval and Renaissance Music Conference in Oxford, England (20 July 1991).

[46] O'Malley, *Praise and Blame*, 54, and the discussion on 53–58. Thematic sermons are so-called because they begin with a biblical quotation, that is, a "theme" (O'Malley, 44). Regarding areas of continuity between Medieval and Renaissance rhetoric, see Kristeller, "Humanism and Scholasticism in the Italian Renaissance," 94–95.

[47] Quoted in Baxandall, *Giotto and the Orators*, 34.

[48] Seigel, *Rhetoric and Philosophy in Renaissance Humanism*, 120. Brown arrives at the same conclusion to describe how chanson composers emulated each other: "Old voices are not merely taken over intact and adorned with new counterpoints, but rather the existing melodic material is reshaped and rearranged into new musical phrases." See his "Emulation, Competition, and Homage," 15.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

for informed interpretations of a text to reconstruct a poem's cultural background. His remarks about looking for allusions in Roman poetry are equally appropriate for Renaissance polyphony:

> The poet may not be aware of reminiscences, and he may hope that his imitations escape his public's notice; but allusions do not produce the desired effect if the reader does not clearly remember the text to which they refer.[49]

For composers about whom little is known, this type of study offers the potential to show relationships between two or more composers; to identify groups of composers based on the configurations of their counterpoint; to understand something of the way fifteenth-century musicians (and possibly their patrons) interpreted the texts of the Mass; and to know something that art historians have known for some time: that contemporary images were used to give ancient texts an emotional immediacy. Studies of allusions in Masses may identify an evolving vocabulary of imagery and ideas, a vocabulary that composers and patrons conceivably shared. Patrons would in this manner have had the means to make prescriptive requests (as they did to artists in their employ) about imagery and content; and composers would have been able to explain the ingenuity with which they had constructed a particular allusion. A polyphonic setting of a popular song or chant was not simply a means of presenting earlier material in a high musical style, but a way to convey familiar melodic and textual ideas in new, pleasurable, and instructive combinations.

The cultural background of polyphonic Masses extends to a multiplicity of texts, sacred and profane, Latin and vernacular; and it encompasses contrapuntal techniques honed in northern cathedrals and rhetorical skills shaped in both northern and Italian intellectual circles. The study of music in the fifteenth century—like that of philosophy, theology, jurisprudence or any of several other areas—should examine how humanistic pursuits changed the traditional possibilities for thought and expression. Just as biblical studies benefitted from philological techniques that had developed in the effort to improve and interpret the available texts of Cicero, sacred polyphony gained from rhetorical modes of expression that were tested in civic oratory. In the service of Christian worship, the pursuit

[49] Giorgio Pasquali, "Arte allusiva," in *Stravaganze quarte e supreme* (Venice: Neri Pozza, 1951), 11–20; reprinted in *Pagine stravaganti* (Florence: Sansoni, 1968), 275–83. I cite the translation of Charles Segal in his edition of Gian Biagio Conte, *The Rhetoric of Imitation*, 24–25, and paraphrase the introductory remarks of Conte.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

of eloquence engaged Italian theologians and northern musicians alike.

University of California at Davis

Manuscript Abbreviations

Bologna Q16	Bologna, Civico museo bibliografico musicale, MS Q 16
Escorial	El Escorial, Biblioteca del Monasterio, MS IV. a. 24
Florence 229	Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale MS Banco Rari 229
MC	Montecassino, Archivio della Badia, Cod. 871N
Mellon	New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Library, MS 91
Niv	Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, MS without number (Nivelle de la Chaussée)
Paris 15123	Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, MS fonds fr. 5123 (Pixérécourt)
Pavia 362	Pavia, Biblioteca Universitaria, Codice Aldini 362

List Of Works Cited

Anglo, Sydney. "Humanism and the Court Arts." In *The Impact of Humanism on Western Europe*, edited by Anthony Goodman and Angus MacKay, 66–98. London and New York: Longman, 1990.

Atlas, Allan. *Music at the Aragonese Court of Naples*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.

Baxandall, Michael. *Giotto and the Orators: Humanist Observers of Painting in Italy and the Discovery of Pictorial Composition, 1350–1450*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971.

Bent, Margaret. "Machaut's Motets 10 and 15." Paper read at the Nineteenth Medieval and Renaissance Music Conference, Oxford, England, 20 July 1991.

Bentley, Jerry. *Humanists and Holy Writ: New Testament Scholarship in the Renaissance*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1983.

Bracciolini, Poggius. *Two Renaissance Book Hunters: The Letters of Poggius Bracciolini to Nicolaus de Niccolis*. Translated and edited by Phyllis Walter Goodhart Gordon. New York: Columbia University Press: 1974.

Brann, Noel. "Humanism in Germany." In *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, edited by Albert Rabil, Jr., vol. 2, 123–55. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988.

Brown, Howard Mayer. "Emulation, Competition, and Homage: Imitation and Theories of Imitation in the Renaissance." This Journal 35 (1982): 1–48.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

———. *A Florentine Chansonnier from the Time of Lorenzo the Magnificent: Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale MS Banco Rari 229*. 2 vols. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1983.

Burstyn, Shai. "Power's *Anima mea* amd Binchois' *De plus en plus*: A Study in Musical Relationships." *Musica disciplina* 30 (1976): 55–72.

Camporeale, Salvatore. *Lorenzo Valla: umanesimo e teologia*. Florence: Istituto nazionale di studi sul Rinascimento, 1972.

Chandler, James. "Romantic Allusion." *Critical Inquiry* 8 (1982): 461–87.

Conte, Gian Biagio. *The Rhetoric of Imitation: Genre and Poetic Memory in Virgil and Other Latin Poets*. Translated and edited by Charles Segal. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.

D'Amico, John F. *Renaissance Humanism in Papal Rome: Humanists and Churchmen on the Eve of the Reformation*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1983.

DeNeef, A. Leigh. "Epideictic Rhetoric and the Renaissance Lyric." *The Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies* 3 (1973): 203–31.

Ellefson, Roy M. "Music and Humanism in the Early Renaissance: Their Relationship and Its Roots in the Rhetorical and Philosophical Traditions." Ph.D. diss., Florida State University, 1981.

Fischer, Kurt von. "Kontrafakturen und Parodien italienischer Werke des Trecento und frühen Quattrocento." *Annales musicologiques* 5 (1957): 43–59.

Fubini, Riccardo. "L'umanista: ritorno di un paradigma? Saggio per un profilo storico da Petrarca ad Erasmo." *Archivio storico italiano* 147 (1989): 435–508.

Gerber, Rebecca. *Johannes Cornago Complete Works*. Recent Researches in the Music of the Middle Ages and Early Renaissance, no. 15. Madison: A-R Editions, 1984.

Gombrich, E. H. "The Style all'antica: Imitation and Assimilation." In *Norm and Form: Studies in the Art of the Renaissance*, 122–28. London: Phaidon, 1966.

Gottlieb, Louis. "The Cyclic Masses of Trent Codex 89." Ph.D. diss., University of California, Berkeley, 1958.

Günther, Ursula. "Zitate in Französischen Liedsätzen der Ars Nova und Ars Subtilior." *Musica disciplina* 26 (1972): 53–68.

Hamm, Charles. *Leonel Power Complete Works*. Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae, no. 50. Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1969.

Hammerstein, Reinhold. "Über das gleichzeitige Erklingen mehrerer Texte: Zur Geschichte mehrtextiger Komposition unter besonderer Berücksichtigung J.S. Bachs." *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 27 (1970): 257–86.

Hanen, Martha K. *The Chansonnier El Escorial IV. a. 24*. Institute for Mediaeval Music, Musicological Studies, no. 36. Henryville, Ottawa, and Binningen, 1983.

Hull, Kenneth. "Brahms the Allusive: Extra-Compositional Reference in the Instrumental Music of Johannes Brahms." Ph.D. diss., Princeton University, 1989.

Ijsewijn, Jozef. "The Coming of Humanism to the Low Countries." In *Itinerarium italicum. The Profile of the Italian Renaissance in the Mirror of its*

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

European Transformations, edited by Heiko A. Oberman with Thomas Brady, Jr., 193–301. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1975.

Jackson, Roland. "Musical Interrelations Between Fourteenth Century Mass Movements (A Preliminary Study)." *Acta musicologica* 29 (1957): 54–64.

Kristeller, Paul Oskar. "The European Diffusion of Italian Humanism." In *Renaissance Thought and the Arts: Collected Essays*, 69–88. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1965.

______. "Humanism and Scholasticism in the Italian Renaissance." *Byzantion* 17 (1944–45): 346–74; reprinted in Paul Oskar Kristeller, *Renaissance Thought and Its Sources*, edited by M. Mooney, 85–105. New York: Columbia University Press, 1979.

______. "Rhetoric in Medieval and Renaissance Culture." In *Renaissance Eloquence: Studies in the Theory and Practice of Renaissance Rhetoric*, edited by James Murphy, 1–20. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1983.

Litterick, Louise. "The Manuscript Royal 20. A. XVI of the British Library." Ph.D. diss., New York University, 1976.

Lockwood, Lewis. "Aspects of the 'L'homme armé' Tradition." *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association* 100 (1973–74): 97–122.

Long, Michael. "Symbol and Ritual in Josquin's *Missa di Dadi*." This JOURNAL 42 (1989): 1–22.

Maniates, Maria Rika. "Combinative Techniques in Franco-Flemish Polyphony: A Study of Mannerism in Music from 1450–1530." Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1965.

Marsh, David. "Grammar, Method, and Polemic in Lorenzo Valla's 'Elegantiae.'" *Rinascimento* 19 (1979): 91–116.

McManamon, John. *Funeral Oratory and the Cultural Ideals of Italian Humanism*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1989.

Monfasani, John. "Humanism and Rhetoric." In *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, edited by Albert Rabil, Jr., vol. 3, 171–235. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988.

O'Malley, John. *Praise and Blame in Renaissance Rome: Rhetoric, Doctrine, and Reform in the Sacred Orators of the Papal Court, c. 1450–1521*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1979.

Palisca, Claude. *Humanism in Italian Renaissance Musical Thought*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1985.

Panofsky, Erwin. *Early Netherlandish Painting*. 2 vols. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1953.

Pasquali, Giorgio. "Arte allusiva." In *Stravaganze quarte e supreme*, 11–20. Venice: Neri Pozza, 1951. Reprinted in *Pagine stravaganti*, 275–83. Florence: Sansoni, 1968.

Percival, W. Keith. "Renaissance Grammar." In *Renaissance Humanism: Foundations, Forms, and Legacy*, edited by Albert Rabil, Jr., vol. 3, 67–84. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1988.

Perkins, Leeman, and Howard Garey, eds. *The Mellon Chansonnier*. 2 vols. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1979.

Pirrotta, Nino. "Music and Cultural Tendencies in Fifteenth-Century Italy." This JOURNAL 19 (1966): 127–61. Reprinted in Pirrotta, *Music and Culture*

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

in Italy from the Middle Ages to the Baroque. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984: 80–112, and 382–91.
Reynolds, Christopher. "Death or Mercy from the Lamb of God: Allusive Quotations in the Contrapuntal Voices of Polyphonic Masses." Paper read at the Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society, Oakland, California, November 1990.
Schavran, Henrietta. "The Manuscript Pavia, Biblioteca Universitaria, Codice Aldini 362: A Study of Song Tradition in Italy circa 1440–1480." 2 vols. Ph.D. diss., New York University, 1978.
Schrade, Leo. "A Fourteenth Century Parody Mass." *Acta musicologica* 27 (1955): 13–39.
Seigel, Jerrold. *Rhetoric and Philosophy in Renaissance Humanism: The Union of Eloquence and Wisdom, Petrarch to Valla*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1968.
Spitz, Lewis. "The Course of German Humanism." In *Itinerarium italicum. The Profile of the Italian Renaissance in the Mirror of its European Transformations*, edited by Heiko A. Oberman with Thomas Brady, Jr., 371–436. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1975.
Stinger, Charles. *Humanism and the Church Fathers: Ambrogio Traversari (1386–1439) and Christian Antiquity in the Italian Renaissance*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 1977.
Taruskin, Richard, ed., *J'ay pris amours*. Miami: Ogni Sorte Editions, 1982.
Trinkaus, Charles. *In Our Image and Likeness: Humanity and Divinity in Italian Humanist Thought*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970.
Watanabe, Morimichi. "Gregor Heimburg and Early Humanism in Germany." In *Philosophy and Humanism: Renaissance Essays in Honor of Paul Oskar Kristeller*, edited by Edward P. Mahoney, 406–22. New York: Columbia University Press, 1976.
Weiss, Roberto. *The Spread of Italian Humanism*. London: Hutchison, 1964.

Abstract

This study examines the likelihood that the contrapuntal voices of fifteenth-century Masses quoted or alluded to chansons unrelated to the chanson cited in the tenor. Often these melodic quotations or allusions in turn alluded to the unsung chanson text, in order to offer modern interpretive commentary on the sung Mass text or an elaboration of the textual idea expressed in the tenor. Examples come from works of Dufay, Ockeghem, Busnois, Caron, and others. The relationship of this technique to the rhetorical practices of the time is examined. A comparison to earlier musical and rhetorical techniques suggests that northern composers were aware of the rhetorical theories and practices of Italian humanists.

This content downloaded from 128.120.194.194 on Thu, 14 Jan 2016 08:28:02 UTC
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions