

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Patterns of Exchange: Navajo Weavers and Traders. By Teresa J. Wilkins.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2pw0c8br>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 33(1)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Jacob, Connie A.

**Publication Date**

2009

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

and the need for a contemporary renewal of myth and ritual as means of rebuilding connections to other-than-human worlds; as sources of energies that transcend the rational and reconnect with the numinous; as containers for shadow urges toward selfish individualism; and as vehicles for the expression of grief, which “makes hope possible” (156).

*Out of the Shadow* will prove most useful to ecocritics, ecopsychologists (especially those interested in bibliotherapy), and American Indian literary scholars, though West’s careful organization and crystal clear prose, exemplified by excellent summary introductions to the theories and concepts that inform her study, would make this book accessible and fascinating to students and general readers. Scholars in the field of American Indian literary studies will find here provocative new contexts for considering familiar novels and their intertextual interconnections. West’s treatment of Native American fiction is knowledgeable and respectful; her focus on the ways tribal storytelling restores the wisdom of ecological practice deliberately defies the stereotype of the “noble savage” who performs “quick fix” magic through ritual (91). Similar to Joni Adamson’s *American Indian Literature, Environmental Justice, and Ecocriticism: The Middle Place* (2001), a major accomplishment of this work is to bring these novels into conversation with discourse fields outside American Indian literary studies, providing a holistic ground for change.

*Ellen L. Arnold*

East Carolina University

**Patterns of Exchange: Navajo Weavers and Traders.** By Teresa J. Wilkins. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2008. 248 pages. \$34.95 cloth.

Teresa Wilkins’s book on the complex relationship between Navajo weavers and the traders to whom they sold rugs combines several areas of research. She utilizes the seminal work on Southwest weaving by Kate Peck Kent (*Navajo Weaving: Three Centuries of Change*) and her mentor at the University of Colorado, Joe Ben Wheat (“Three Centuries of Navajo Weaving,” *Arizona Highway* and “Early Navajo Weaving,” *Plateau*). She draws on their studies, which delineate the three major stylistic periods—classic (1650–1865), transitional (1865–85), and rug (1895–present)—and her training under Wheat provides her with a solid knowledge of weaving in general and Navajo weaving specifically. Central to this book is Wilkins’s extension of Kent’s discussion of the traders’ role in developing and marketing the Navajo rug. Readers learn the extent of the traders’ role in rebuilding the Navajo economy after they returned from internment at Bosque Redondo. Coming back to their homeland traumatized by memories of internment, devastation, and deaths of loved ones, the Navajo encountered even more hardships: drought, loss of livestock, and a shattered economy.

The extent to which early traders like J. Lorenzo Hubbell and C. N. Cotton at Hubbell’s Trading Post and John B. Moore at Crystal Trading Post helped rebuild their economy has been a topic of great interest to scholars (see Kent;

Sarah Nestor, "The Woven Spirit," in *Harmony by Hand*; Ruth Underhill, *The Navajo*). These traders encouraged the people to trade wool, sheep, and blankets for government commodities. However, with a saturated blanket market by 1900, traders became entrepreneurial by encouraging weavers to create rugs for an Eastern clientele and by initiating a way to market the blankets and other goods through mail-order catalogs (Hubbell 1902; Moore 1903, 1911). With the tastes of their clients in mind, these traders began commissioning and encouraging specific rug styles such as Ganado (Hubbell) and Storm, Crystal, Two Grey Hills, and Teec Nos Pas (Moore).

In chapter 2, Wilkins provides a helpful overview of the rise of the trading post and the patterns of exchange among the people of the Southwest long before the advent of trading posts. Readers might know first-hand accounts of legendary traders through their memoirs: *Tall Sheep: Harry Goulding, Monument Valley Trader* (1992), *Navajo Trader: Gladwell Richardson* (1991), and the Hubbell papers housed at the University of Arizona, which are frequently cited in the literature. Yet there are few such first-hand accounts from the weavers, and one of this book's strengths is the ethnohistory project that Wilkins conducted with weavers and families of weavers in the Ganado area. Here we learn how complex the relationship was between trader and weaver. They had to accommodate each other. In order to be a trusted trading partner, the traders had to adapt to customary Navajo relationships: helping each other, treating others fairly, and establishing a familial role with the other. Successful traders like Hubbell, who spoke Navajo, became an integral part of the Ganado community. Less successful traders like Cotton treated the Navajo poorly and consequently did not last long on the reservation. The weavers also had to accommodate the traders. They did so by weaving the designs the traders wanted, bringing them rugs of heavy weight, which the traders valued, and providing the trader with high-quality rugs, which brought the highest prices. This topic has been well covered in previous literature.

What is most interesting in this book and a new contribution to the field is the extent to which the weavers were not passive workers who allowed traders to dominate their craft but rather were artists who benefited from trader guidance and ultimately created the rugs their way. They used the traders as much as the traders used them. Chapter 6 is the heart of the book as weavers tell their stories and readers learn the various ways in which the weavers accommodated traders' requests while using familial designs and allowing the rug to assume its own shape and design. Each rug has its own particular character and life force, and no trader could ever control this (see chapter 4).

This study has much to recommend. Wilkins includes several helpful appendixes: an index of the Hubbell Blanket Paintings that Hubbell had artist E. A. Burbank (and others) copy from classical Navajo designs. These paintings were essential to reviving a shattered economy and are credited with helping revive the weaving economy. There are three types of paintings: the hybrid drawings that reflect Hubbell's aesthetics, a combination of Hubbell and Navajo ideas of an "authentic" design, and replicated designs from traditional mantas, blankets, and clothing. This chart makes a reader want to take a trip to the Hubbell Trading Post where they hang on the walls. Her map

of the thirty-six communities where Hubbell had trading posts attests to his pivotal role as a trader (44–45). Also helpful is her discussion of the various ways in which early traders helped shape modern rugs: Hubbell insisted on quality of dye, symmetry of design, straight edges, evenly dyed colors, and incorporation of designs that would appeal to an Anglo-buying public; Moore at Crystal Trading Post exploited the buying public's current taste in oriental rugs and asked his weavers to incorporate oriental designs and motifs in their rugs. Interestingly, both he and Hubbell favored the swastika, a design long known in oriental art, which still can be found in contemporary Navajo rugs, although it is known as the "whirling log" and is a symbol featured in many Nightway sand paintings rugs. Also noteworthy is Wilkins's extensive bibliography and eye-catching cover.

However, the book has several weaknesses that detract from Wilkins's interesting topic. The study suffers from poor organization. Key points of discussions, such as Hubbell's contributions to early rug weaving, are repeated throughout the book. Descriptions of Hubbell are found in many areas, and one chapter devoted to him would help centralize her discussion. Using more appropriate cultural terms than *Anasaazi* and *Navajo* would strengthen her credibility. The terms *Ancestral Puebloan* and *Diné* are more widely accepted in the Native community. I was bothered by Wilkins's discussion of Navajo (I will use her term) worldview and cultural values in which she cites only Anglo sources. Perhaps she consulted Navajo elders, who would have been the most appropriate source, but she does not mention them. Native elders should explain their culture, not Anglo scholars, however well intentioned. In her introduction, Wilkins asserts that traders helped create a new Navajo identity. Well, in a way . . . , but the clan system, oral traditions, and cultural values are more central to Navajo identity. Traders clearly helped shape a rug economy, but I wouldn't go so far as to assert that traders played a role in creating a new Navajo identity. Additionally, I was bothered by her consistent use of Marxist theory to explain the relationship between trader and weaver. Applying western European theoretical constructs to a Native worldview is fraught with problems and doesn't translate well. She would be better served if she used Native critical theories, such as the work done by Craig Womack, Robert Warrior, Paula Gunn Allen, or Simon Ortiz. Finally, several authors have published books on the role of the trader and weaver. Kathy M'Closkey (*Swept under the Rug: A Hidden History of Navajo Weaving*) and H. L. James (*Rugs and Posts: The Story of Navajo Weaving and the Role of Indian Trading*) come to mind, and I'd like a discussion in the introduction of the ways in which Wilkins's study differs from these earlier books.

There are several areas she touches on that would make interesting areas for further research. She briefly discusses Fred Harvey's role in helping create a tourist market for Native goods. I would like further discussion of his importance to early Navajo rug trade. Additionally, she brings up the traders' ledgers and what they reveal (and don't reveal) about transactions conducted at various trading posts. This topic could add valuable information to the study of trader/weaver relationships. I was interested in her discussion of the

role of pawn that she brings up in chapter 5 and would like more information about the degree to which pawning influenced early trading. Finally, I was intrigued with Wilkins's assertion that far from using the closest trading post, Navajos often selected a particular post they felt would provide them with the best terms. This is a wonderful topic for further research.

*Patterns of Exchange: Navajo Weavers and Traders* is a valuable contribution to the study of Navajo weaving, traders, evolution of rug designs, the weavers, and the complex intercultural relationships that helped shape modern Navajo rug designs.

Connie A. Jacobs  
San Juan College

**The People Have Never Stopped Dancing: Native American Modern Dance Histories.** By Jacqueline Shea Murphy. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2007. 320 pages. \$75.00 cloth; \$25.00 paper.

With this volume, awarded the Society of Dance History's prestigious de la Torre Bueno Prize in 2008, Jacqueline Shea Murphy makes a major contribution to Native performance studies and transformative scholarship by integrating the study of Native dance into the field of dance. Through extensive ethnographic and archival research and analysis, the book provides an in-depth study of Native American and Aboriginal dance in the United States and Canada from the nineteenth century to the present within the cultural, spiritual, artistic, and political context of the work. In the introduction, Murphy carefully articulates her complex plan for the book as "not just the history of Native dance and dancers, and not just the influence of American Indian dance on modern dance, but especially the interrelations between Native American dance and the history and development of modern dance in America" (4). To address these ambitious goals, the book has an in-depth introduction and three major sections.

The introduction sets up the context for the rest of the book and to me is a must-read in terms of understanding the complex, often oppositional issues raised throughout the volume. Here Murphy presents the thesis exemplified by the book's title, which focuses on the intergenerational continuity and agency of Native peoples to continue their millenniums-old dance and ceremonial traditions during the last two centuries despite ruthless federal bans on dancing in the nineteenth century and later aggressive assimilation policies in the United States and Canada.

The first part of the introduction outlines the theoretical framework that drives the book. Murphy writes that after seeing performances by the American Indian Dance Theatre, directed by Hanay Geiogamah, and Daystar/Rosalie Jones in the 1990s and reading *Chinook Winds: Aboriginal Dance Project*, she began to consider the ways Native dance performances embody theory. She notes that this view is shared by recent dance studies with its emphasis on "the idea that dance theorizes." Although this view remains