

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Imagining Native America in Music. By Michael V. Pisani.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2q82s0zw>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Browner, Tara

Publication Date

2007-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

narrative, the implications of identity with a half-black/half-Indian protagonist, and the role of women in American Indian fiction. The novel invites thematic comparisons with James Welch's protagonist in *Winter in the Blood*, with the burdened Rayona of Michael Dorris's *Yellow Raft in Blue Water*, with the conflicted Tayo in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Ceremony*, and many more.

Elsie's Business is the fifth title in the new series, *Native Stories: A Series of American Narratives*, published by the University of Nebraska Press and edited by Gerald Vizenor and Diane Glancy. Judging from the high quality of this novel, the series attracts the best Native literary and cultural contributors of our time. Gerald Vizenor described this novel for the book jacket as "an outstanding, original, engaging narrative of a native community and survivance." I fully agree.

Louise Cummings Maynor
North Carolina Central University

Imagining Native America in Music. By Michael V. Pisani. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2005. 422 pages. \$48.00 cloth.

Academic interest in Western composers who have used Native North American themes and imagery has been on the upswing in recent years, in large part because the burgeoning subfield of American music studies has begun to make itself heard in the broader discipline of musicology. In many ways "Americanists" (as they often refer to themselves) took to discussing musical expression outside of the typical canon of "Great Works" because, according to the disciplinarily approved definition, Europeans wrote essentially all Great Works. Americanists also tend to do the small stuff and in doing so often uncover larger themes in music and culture that would be lost by simply studying minor composers. Essentially this is exactly what Michael Pisani has done with this text, and, by exploring the theme of "Indianness" in Western music, he has brought to light the often strange collaborations of composers, ethnographers, crusaders for social justice, and commercial interests in producing a musical genre that, while failing to catch on as art, remains with us today in various popular styles including musical theater and film scores.

Pisani wrote his dissertation on this topic (as did this author) and uses (and graciously credits) the theoretical framework I created in the mid-1990s for this newer study that, after Charles Peirce's semiotic schema, categorizes compositions as symbolic (Native inspired), indexical (drawing in some way from Native culture), or iconic (using sound materials derived in some way from Native music, usually through mediated transcribed sources). This framework rests upon the relationship of the musical work to the "authentic," which in this case means the actual Native song, oral text, or other cultural expression, often filtered multiple times, first through the process of transcription into Western notation and then by "idealization" (that is, changing the pitches), in order to make the melody easier to harmonize. Idealization was most often done by a group of composers who were writing

from about 1890–1925. Because they purposefully sought out and used actual (transcribed) Native melodies in their works, they were generically referred to as “Indianists.” But for many others—before and after the Indianists—much of what is considered “Indian” in their compositions is in reality Western simulation of Native culture and bears no relationship beyond an imaginary one to anything genuinely Native, either traditional or acculturated. This Pisani recognizes, hence the term *imagining* in the title, but readers should understand that the primary focus of the text is on the many forms of Euro-American–constructed “Indianness” and not on how indigenous peoples view themselves through musical expression.

The text is organized historically, with the chronology beginning in the 1550s and ending in the late 1990s. Topic areas break down nicely into three broad sections encompassing early, essentially simulated “Native” music and characters; music from Indianist composers; and music from film, Tin Pan Alley, and the Broadway stage. Pisani’s knowledge of these repertoires is encyclopedic, and the level of detail at times is almost overwhelming as he lists piece after piece (there are extensive lists in both the main text and various appendices). Ultimately, what the lists illustrate, through their sheer numbers of works, is just how important Indian themes have been to Western composers of all stripes, whether they are writing for the European court or the Hollywood screen.

From the standpoint of a generalized American Indian studies/Native studies readership, the book has a few drawbacks. Because it was written for a fairly specialized audience, the text includes fairly large amounts of musical analysis of the type that demands the reader be conversant in advanced-level Western-style music theory. Without that background and training, roughly 10 percent of the text is inaccessible, and an additional 10 percent or so requires the ability to read music, although not the skill set to analyze it. That said, a large enough part of the narrative is potentially coherent for the interested reader without these skills that the book is still worthwhile, especially the sections detailing the relationships between early ethnographers and composers (terrain also recently covered by Philip Deloria in *Indians in Unexpected Places*, 2004) and the discussions of music for theater and film. In the earlier chapters of the book, perhaps the most valuable insights are those relating to the development of musical stereotypes of Natives by Westerners—and these same musical simulations are heard today in such “songs” as the “Tomahawk Chop.”

Pisani’s prose is clear and often elegant, and he held this reader’s attention throughout—but I am a trained musicologist. The larger question, which is whether or not this book can inform a more generalized Native studies audience, is not one that I can answer. But with material this rich, I dearly hope that Pisani (and his publisher) consider taking the time to create nonspecialist versions of the chapters on ethnography, Indianist music, and film and theater music and make them available in some form suitable for a course reader, so that a larger audience can appreciate his insights on this little-known chapter in music history.

Tara Browner

The University of California, Los Angeles