

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

On the Translation of Native American Literatures. Edited by Brian Swann.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2r9853nm>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 18(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hill, Jane H.

Publication Date

1994-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

easily explained as a result of high mortality We may need to rethink our well-established, but perhaps erroneous, beliefs about the connection between socioeconomic status and demographic patterns (pp. 213–14).

For Howard, Navajo fertility and mortality follow a biosocial, cultural strategy. Demographic outcomes are inherent in the biological and cultural pathways present in Navajo society.

With regard to future research, Howard discusses four areas that deserve further attention. The author believes, migration, gender roles, the role of the Indian Health Service in reducing mortality, and methodological issues must be explored fully to analyze the Navajo demographic experience.

Navajo Tribal Demography is a valuable contribution to a growing body of literature about Native American health and demography. The work's strength lies not in its integration of demographic rates with theory or cultural patterns but in the clarity of descriptive presentation. Howard engages the reader with a straightforward style that specialists and nonspecialists will appreciate. Moreover, her findings raise many intriguing questions, providing others with the opportunity to gain a greater understanding of Native American health issues. On a broader level, case studies similar to the one presented for the Navajo may lead to further improvement in native health status.

Gregory R. Campbell
University of Montana

On the Translation of Native American Literatures. Edited by Brian Swann. Washington, D.C. and London: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992. 498 pages. \$45.00 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

In the volume under review, Brian Swann more than lives up to the standards he set in this field with two earlier collections under his editorship, *Smoothing the Ground* and *Recovering the Word* (the latter coedited with Arnold Krupat). It must be noted immediately that no Native American scholars or writers are represented in this collection, in spite of efforts by Swann to recruit contributions from them (p. xix). However, it is still a rich feast of work from a diverse and distinguished group of scholars, including several splendid essays from "big names"

that make the book a fine introduction to major work in the field.

One purpose of the volume, states Swann, is to provide clear and relatively nontechnical essays that might begin the process of returning to indigenous peoples parts of their literatures that have been taken from them. I do not believe the volume is fully successful in this aim. In spite of the obvious efforts of many of the authors to present their work in a nontechnical way, this kind of scholarship simply cannot be accomplished without some technical language and apparatus—native-language transcriptions inevitably use unfamiliar symbols, some grammatical and technical literary terminology is unavoidable, and several papers use specialized notations to reveal poetic and rhetorical structure. So, while the volume can be confidently recommended to college-level readers, it is not going to provide access to Native American literatures for any but the most determined enthusiast with a lesser education. A truly popular presentation would simply have to dispense with the scholarly apparatus that dominates the contributions to this volume—and would probably be a videotape.

The collection succeeds superbly, however, in a second aim, which is to raise the standards for acceptable work on Native American literatures. The group of scholars assembled here nearly all know the languages they are working on very well indeed, and the volume as a whole strongly affirms that such knowledge is a minimal standard for scholarship, precisely as is required in the study of comparative literature in Old World languages. Most of the chapters are by anthropologists and linguists. Perhaps for this reason the volume is notably free of gratuitous “Boas-bashing” (and related attacks on the anthropological tradition). Indeed, such “Boas-bashing” as there is here is detailed and constructive, especially in Judith Berman’s retranslation and reinterpretation—as an off-color story—of the Kwakw’ala myth of Oolachan-Woman’s Robe; this story was originally collected by Boas from Kwakw’ala speakers he grilled during a period of enforced (relative) idleness on a steamship trip. Berman sees Boas as more or less deaf to cultural nuance in Kwakw’ala, in spite of his technical expertise and fluency in the language, and her arguments for her retranslation of the text are models of subtle cultural and linguistic interpretation. This paper is balanced by a contribution from Dale Kinkade on materials from Pentlatch, an extinct Salishan language to which we have access only through Boas’s work. Thus the volume includes an evenhanded assessment of the

contribution of the anthropological and linguistic research tradition to our present knowledge of Native American literatures.

An enormous geographical range of materials is included here. Several chapters focus on diverse dimensions of the literature of the peoples of the Northwest. Judith Berman's and Dale Kinkade's papers have already been mentioned, and a paper by Dell Hymes that includes some Chinookan material will be discussed further below. Nile Robert Thompson treats an enigmatic Twana fragment about Louse, who sweeps (him? her?) self into a pile of dust and disappears forever in what turns out to be (probably) a frantic attempt to prepare a dirty house for a hero's visit. This paper, like several others in the volume, draws on multiple attestations of the same text in order to determine its purposes and shape and is a very sophisticated alternative to the sort of essentialism that tries to find the "correct" version of a story. Toby Langen's discussion of a major Lushootseed narrative focuses on those properties of performance that may have facilitated disciplines of attention on the part of audiences. For the Southwest, two of the papers deal with unusual material: Peter Whitely contributes a very interesting paper on Hopi names as a literary form, emphasizing the amount of thought and care devoted to making the names given to infants (by the women of the father's matriline) both beautiful and historically and genealogically evocative. Donald Bahr's splendid contribution compares a Tohono O'odham original of a legal document—the tribal language policy—with the official "translation" of the document into English legalese, and reveals how the poetic structure of the original is an inextricable component of its local meaning. David L. Shaul contributes a methodologically interesting treatment of a Hopi song, deriving an analysis of its structure by combining close attention to the musical development of the song with evidence from variation in translation. Paul Zolbrod's paper on his fieldwork on Navajo materials over many years is one of the most interesting evocations of "orality" that I have read. Completing the North American section of the volume are a paper on Dakota narratives by Julian Rice and a detailed discussion of vocables in Lakota song by William K. Powers.

The papers on Meso-America are particularly fine. Miguel Leon-Portilla replies to critics who argue that colonial-period texts in the indigenous languages of Mexico cannot represent anything of the pre-Columbian "ancient word," with a splendid and accessible discussion of the role of writing in ancient Meso-

America that proposes that literacy, at least, exhibits substantial continuities across the gulf of the conquest. Louise Burkhart's "The Amanuenses Have Appropriated the Text" translates a Nahuatl hymn to Santiago—patron of the reconquest of Spain from the Moors—that surprisingly centers Meso-American indigenous people in the Christian community constructed through the acts of the saint and locates Santiago himself in the shimmering sacred world of Nahua song. Willard Gingerich's "Ten Types of Ambiguity in Nahuatl Poetry" is an excellent guide to problems of translation from that language. Moving to the south, Kay Sammon's paper on the poetics of a performance of the myth of Homshuk, spirit of maize, provides valuable documentation on performance features in a Zoquean language, Sierra Popoluca of Veracruz. Allan Burns, who was among the first scholars to provide detailed evidence for dialogic features in indigenous narrative performances, incorporates his views on this point into an overview of Yucatec Maya oral literature, which centers on a rendition of the Yucatec narrative that Burns himself mastered in order to contribute to this tradition. Dennis Tedlock's "The Story of Evenadam" is a witty and significant contribution to the study of the way that European stories (in this case, the biblical story of creation) are shaped to indigenous mythic worlds and practical purposes. Joel Sherzer shows how instrumental phonetic methods can be applied to the interpretation of Kuna texts. Finally, Nancy Hornberger provides a richly contextualized translation using Hymes's technique of verse analysis to two versions of a Quechua narrative, working from written prose transcriptions.

While the case studies are very strong both individually and as a group, the introductory overview chapters are also very valuable. In addition to Swann's introduction, Arnold Krupat and William M. Clements both provide historical overviews of translation of North American materials; Krupat's is contextualized within a theoretical discussion of the delicate balance in translation between "Identity and Difference," manifest as "accessibility" and "authenticity" (p. 4). Clements's paper focuses on nineteenth-century materials and contextualizes these elegantly within the racist and nationalist arenas in which early attention to Native American literature emerged. John Bierhorst provides a brief but stimulating overview of the "incorporation of the Native voice" in the work of "the third wave," a group of contemporary writers who shape an indigenous voice to powerful political purposes. Bierhorst's study includes not only indigenous writers such as

Momaday, Silko, and Allen, but several Latin American poets and novelists as well as well-known North Americans like Gary Snyder and W.S. Merwin. Jerome Rothenberg provides an extended overview of his own goals and methods. Dell Hymes's contribution is a rich, rambling advocacy of eclectic method—"Use all there is to use." Hymes is exasperated by arbitrary disciplinary limits on what a scholar might aim for, and by scholars who try to pigeonhole him, vis-à-vis other workers, as "the particle person." His paper includes some attention to Chinookan materials but centers on a beautiful translation of a long narrative by a Tonkawa speaker, John Rush Buffalo. Hymes's chapter is grouped not with the theoretical introductions but with the case studies. Like Rothenberg's paper, however, this would be a superb introduction to Hymes's work and is probably much more accessible than most of the papers in *In Vain I Tried to Tell You* (1981).

In summary, if I were not fortunate enough to have received this volume as a review copy, I would certainly buy it. I have already assigned several chapters in it to students, and I expect to consult it again as a reference. I would regard it as indispensable even to a minimal collection on Native American languages and literatures.

Jane H. Hill
University of Arizona

Orayvi Revisited: Social Stratification in an "Egalitarian" Society. By Jerrold E. Levy, with assistance from Barbara Pepper. Santa Fe, New Mexico: School of American Research Press, 1992. 176 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

The stated aim of *Orayvi Revisited* is an examination of the Hopi system of social stratification as (1) a source of internal contradiction in Hopi social organization and (2) a factor in the disintegration of the village of Orayvi during the early years of the twentieth century. Using previously unexamined field notes by Mischa Titiev, as well as federal census data of 1900, Jerrold Levy provides the first quantitative analysis of the 1906 Orayvi split. As Levy points out, this book is, in many ways, a restudy of Titiev's *Old Oraibi: A Study of the Indians of Third Mesa* (1944). It is more, by virtue of the perspectives afforded by Levy's quantitative analy-