UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

To Remain an Indian: Lessons in Democracy from a Century of Native American Education. By K. Tsianina Lomawaima and Teresa L. McCarty.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2rw04417

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(2)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Fields, Alison

Publication Date
2007-03-01

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at
https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

routinely sung church hymns eventually become "bargaining chips" between him and the imposed Christian deity. Cook-Lynn unabashedly reveals manipulative aspects of religious dogma when she writes that "because he had some notion of how frail and tenuous his existence was, he sang the song. . . . You see, he couldn't take the chance of *not* singing it" (55).

The Power of Horses and Other Stories adds fuel to the continuing recovery efforts of Native American and First Nations people. Elizabeth Cook-Lynn's work reflects what Linda Tuhiwai Smith terms as "twenty-five indigenous projects" in *Decolonizing Methodologies* (1999). Instead of perpetuating what Paula Gunn Allen cautions as a "progressive fallacy," a nontruth that "allows American Indians victim status only" (5), Cook-Lynn uses remembering, revitalizing, writing, restoring, and returning (to name a few) as tools to convey Crow-Creek-Sioux survivance. Although Cook-Lynn's Sioux characters may fall victim to the many forms of oppression, as well as temporarily succumb to intergenerational grief, it is through this process of recovery that the Dakotapi (The People) triumphantly emerge as autonomous individuals and as an autonomous indigenous nation. *The Power of Horses and Other Stories* beckons readers to see, feel, and hear the pulse of a living people, like the man "whose feet had touched this sacred ground *as long ago as memory and imagination could distinguish*" (65, italics added). Moreover, just as the Dakotapi ceremonial dancers move "in and out of the line like feeding and discharging tributaries, converging and separating along the course of the major stream" (65), so too do Dakotapi bear witness and survive.

Monique Ramune Jonaitis
University of California, Davis

To Remain an Indian: Lessons in Democracy from a Century of Native American Education. By K. Tsianina Lomawaima and Teresa L. McCarty. New York: Teachers College Press, 2006. 213 pages. $70.00 cloth; $29.95 paper.

In the mid-1920s, the Institute for Government Research funded an investigation into claims of corruption and mismanagement within the Office of Indian Affairs. The resulting Meriam Report produced a blistering critique of a range of governmental services but became best known for its severe indictment of Indian boarding schools. In *To Remain an Indian* the authors claim that the Meriam Report also put forth an often overlooked yet unprecedented possibility: "He who wants to remain an Indian and live according to his old culture should be aided in doing so" (65). While the Meriam Report did not attempt to challenge existing federal policies of assimilation, it made a radical suggestion for its time: that Native people had the right to choose how they wished to live.

Throughout *To Remain an Indian,* Lomawaima and McCarty outline how such choice played out in the rhetoric of policy, in practice, and in the lived experience of Native people. This three-tiered approach points out the gaps and inconsistencies between rhetorical ideals and their translation

into action. Lomawaima and McCarty suggest that patterns in policy emerge over time, therefore necessitating the book's broad scope. Covering the last century of American Indian education, *To Remain an Indian* moves from instruction in Native homes, to federally sanctioned modes of colonial education, to state-supervised public schools, to shared power with Native tribes and communities. Over this historical progression, Lomawaima and McCarty foreground the efforts of Native people to shape their learning environments in accordance with indigenous educational practices.

Over the last hundred years, changes in federal policy have directly impacted the structure of American Indian education. Although many scholars have examined these shifting policies, Lomawaima and McCarty move beyond the oft-cited "swings of a pendulum" metaphor, which suggests a simple wavering between tolerance and intolerance. Instead the authors claim that "each generation was working out, in a systematic way, its notion of a safety zone, an area where dangerously different cultural expressions might be safely domesticated and thus neutralized" (xxii). Lomawaima and McCarty propose the safety zone as a theoretical framework to explain changes in federal educational policies and practices over the last century. As boundaries of "safe" and "dangerous" cultural expression were negotiated, educational policy took on varying, and sometimes contradictory, forms.

While such battles occurred over official discourse, Native people continually sought to assert educational self-determination. Because of this, it was often the case that teachings within perceived safety zones had unexpected consequences. In the early twentieth century, the safety zone of allowable cultural difference was determined along gender lines. In the American West, anxieties emerged that Indian males would encroach upon developing economic activities. As a result, school curriculums focused on domesticated women's work, such as basketry and beadwork. However, when Native women were brought in to teach young girls these arts at federal boarding schools, they exposed schoolchildren to just the kind of tribal authority that the school wished to undermine.

In the 1940s, attempts were made to preserve the "worthy" characteristics of Native cultures and language. Native languages were made "safe" by placing control of translation and transmission into the hands of non-Native educators. However, these educators failed to recognize the potential of these languages to serve as a vitalizing force for American Indian cultures in the future. Bilingual education efforts carried on in Native communities long after the terms of this particular safety zone had changed. Such an example shows that, as educational policy went through periods of transition, windows of opportunity opened for Native educators to indigenize schools and educational materials creatively.

What is at stake in rereading the history of American Indian education through the framework of the safety zone? According to Lomawaima and McCarty, this narrative offers the tools to reshape a vision of democracy. Embedded in educational policies and real-life practice, lessons about choice, self-determination, and strength in diversity emerge. Ultimately, Lomawaima and McCarty argue that true "danger" lies in standardization and

homogenization. Although clearly outlining the efforts of many Native individuals and communities to assert educational self-determination, the authors suggest that many challenges still lie ahead. The book brings us up to the present day, with a grim look at the No Child Left Behind Act of 2001. This act places "minority" languages firmly outside of the safety zone and, through standardized testing, enforces just the sort of homogenization Lomawaima and McCarty warn against. Only when we cease to see cultural difference as a threat to nationhood, the authors claim, may lived experience begin to live up to the rhetorical ideals of democracy.

Lomawaima and McCarty's work is remarkable in both its breadth of scope and clarity of purpose. Making use of the initial chapters to spell out their theoretical framework and provide detailed definitions of key terms, the authors' arguments build upon a solid foundation. In their work, Lomawaima and McCarty draw upon a wide variety of sources, including federal documents, archival papers, life histories, and firsthand ethnographic research. Although chapters 2 through 5 derive largely from Lomawaima's teaching and research and chapters 6 through 8 from McCarty's ethnographic and oral history research, the writing of the two authors blends seamlessly. The authors recognize the difficulty of writing a "balanced" history of American Indian education, and strive to excavate and rehabilitate a story that previously has been suppressed.

To Remain an Indian is an important addition to scholarship on American Indian education. For further research in this area, key texts include Margaret Szasz's *Education and the American Indian: The Road to Self-Determination since 1928* (1999) and Gregory Cajete's *Look to the Mountain: An Ecology of Indigenous Education* (1993). For texts dealing with specific tribes and schools, Amanda Cobb's *Listening to Our Grandmothers' Stories: The Bloomfield Academy for Chickasaw Females, 1852–1949* (2000) and Clyde Ellis's *To Change Them Forever: Indian Education at the Rainy Mountain Boarding School, 1893–1920* (1996) are particularly helpful.

Alison Fields
University of New Mexico

Scientists and Storytellers: Feminist Anthropologists and the Construction of the American Southwest. By Catherine J. Lavender. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2006. 256 pages. $34.95 cloth.

In this thoroughly researched book, Catherine Lavender examines the lives and careers of four interconnected women anthropologists, who all carried out research in the American Southwest during the first four decades of the twentieth century. Ruth Benedict, Elsie Clews Parsons, Gladys Reichard, and Ruth Underhill were all trained at Columbia University under Franz Boas, and their work and lives intersect in many other respects.

Lavender is a historian, not an anthropologist, and this book is primarily a contribution to the history of anthropology rather than a source of ethno-