

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Planning for Balanced Development: A Guide for Native American and Rural Communities. By Susan Guyette.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2wb4s121>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 20(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Mallick, Ross

Publication Date

1996-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

sources, equally historicized, of Annie York's texts is a delight; for many of these tellers we have memories and no other recordings.

That the book makes us aware of areas that could be expanded upon by more fieldwork and publications from past work is a measure of its strength. The translations are excellent, but they stoke a reader's desire to see the native language texts themselves . . . and to hear the tapes!

I issue a warning and an invitation to those unused to working with community-based materials: There is little explication of cultural interface here. For example, the history of residential schools' devastating impact on native cultures is referred to briefly several times, resonating richly for those of us who know this history but not for those who do not. Statements like Mabel Joe's, "I don't know if that's the whole story, but that's what I know of it. . ." sound like a trip back home for some, but raise questions about the authority of the speaker for others. Similarly, some storytellers punctuate their tellings with comments that evidently draw the people with the tape recorder into the story but leave "us" on the sidelines, as if we are overhearing. And the tribal council includes an anecdote about spiritual warning signs in their conclusion that may distance those with no experience in such "tellings." To get comfortable with this book, we have to get comfortable with the unanswered questions it raises in us. And we have to recognize other peoples' intimacies as connections we see only traces of. "We" outsiders are not part of this, but we are given the position of being welcome visitors. The stories' sequencing does suggest a quality of conversation, with some of the tellers telling about the others, and we the readers can begin to be drawn into the weave of exchange, begin to recognize a community of recollection that belongs to these Nlha7kapmx people.

Crisca Bierwert
University of Michigan

Planning for Balanced Development: A Guide for Native American and Rural Communities. By Susan Guyette. Santa Fe, New Mexico: Clear Light Publishers, 1996. 312 pages. \$22.95 cloth; \$14.95 paper.

Numerous academic books have been published dealing with aboriginal economic development and cultural affirmation, and

an even larger number of small business guides have been produced, but those that attempt to combine aboriginal culture and small business development in a primer for indigenous communities are virtually nonexistent. In undertaking this task, Susan Guyette has performed a very useful service to aboriginal communities that are looking for ways to reaffirm their traditional culture while taking advantage of the business opportunities provided by the dominant society.

Although this is not a scholarly monograph, a number of academically interesting observations can be drawn from the recommended guidelines and from the project case study for which the author is a planner. However, this scholarship is incidental to the purpose of the book, which is to introduce communities to business opportunities that are compatible with cultural retention and affirmation. *Planning for Balanced Development* eschews the debate over the suitability of promoting indigenous integration in world markets, as advocated by Cultural Survival over the objections of Survival International, in favor of assuming that indigenous culture can be retained and indeed reaffirmed in the process of developing better business opportunities. Part of this confidence may come from Guyette's work with an aboriginal community in the American West that is already highly integrated in the dominant culture.

The only major business opportunity that Guyette discusses in detail is tourism. This is understandable, since tourism is the only significant business that most rural aboriginal communities have some prospect of developing successfully. The unique experience that aboriginals can offer is the promotion of their culture, generally in its more exotic and traditional form rather than the contemporary "westernized" reality. The promotion of traditional culture—which is what the tourists are perceived to be looking for—may turn the communities toward historical projections of themselves for tourists and may lead aboriginals themselves to believe in these representations. For some communities in the lower forty-eight states that have largely lost their traditional skills and language, tourism may be a major avenue of business opportunity.

The idea of using tourism as a way of reaffirming a culture is central to Guyette's book. How well this would work in a community that is trying to retain its traditional culture despite the inroads of tourism is not explored. Having grown up in a community that was making the transition from hunting and trapping to

welfare dependency, I am less sanguine about the possibility of using ethnotourism as a means of cultural reaffirmation in relatively unassimilated communities. More traditional northern communities are more likely to interact with tourists as fishing and hunting guides, which means they are marketing their environment as ecotourism rather than marketing their culture as ethnotourism. Communities without an environment that offers fish and game potential have only themselves to market as cultural models. This may be why ecotourism is hardly dealt with in a book that comes out of the New Mexico experience.

As someone who has tried to come up with business development schemes for isolated aboriginal communities, I understand the interest in tourism and its centrality to the book. The precautions for maintaining the community's privacy from tourists, however, will likely distance tourists from authentic contemporary experience and create further cultural misrepresentations. I would suggest that, rather than the separation between the contemporary and the historically authentic, a more realistic and fulfilling tourist experience would be an integration of the two, with the Indians not being required to take the role of actors. The idea that native culture will be reaffirmed through the business provided by tourists places survival and legitimacy in tourist, rather than aboriginal, hands and threatens to distort the evolution of contemporary aboriginal culture. Maintaining the tourist trade then becomes dependent on a positive public image in the dominant society, which may be lost if aboriginals exceed what the dominant society conceives as proper. Thus, although welfare subsidization may be replaced by public relations management, dependency on the dominant society continues. In this age of globalization there is no real alternative to dependency, but these limits should be understood by the community from the beginning, particularly in an industry that is as fickle as tourism.

Guyette's book deals with these issues by insisting that communities determine what is appropriate for tourist consumption, and what is private or sacred. The probable outcome, however, is that "authentic" Indians will be presented to tourists, while the real Indians watch American television in the privacy of their homes, as I have seen in South America. The Indians then act out a role tourists expect them to fulfill, which does not bear any relation to the way they live their lives.

The real dilemma for aboriginals is that if they are to remain as communities, tourism is probably the only nonsubsidy dependent

activity they can now pursue. Given this premise, the book does an admirable job of showing how tourism can be promoted. Unlike the academic works that are not easily accessible to community organizers, or the general business guides that lack any community perspective, *Planning for Balanced Development* combines business and community development teaching in understandable, nontechnical language. For those who want more detailed and advanced information, each chapter ends with a bibliography describing the contents of recommended supplementary reading on the chapter's subject. However, because of the lack of a significant literature on practical aboriginal business management, many of these additional readings are conventional academic studies or business management texts that may be beyond the interest of most readers. For those already involved in aboriginal businesses, much of the information may be redundant, but suggestions are included from which even experienced managers could learn.

The importance of punctuality and regionally integrated tourism development is sometimes lost on business leaders who expect tourists to live on indigenous terms and who fail to see the advantages of cross-community coordination. In an age when relatively distant places such as Alaska, with only 560,000 residents, have 700,000 tourists annually, the potential for aboriginal tourism is significant if publicity can be coordinated. Even in Alaska, where native corporations own some of the most exclusive and expensive tourist accommodations, ecotourism is now being supplemented with plans for aboriginal ethnotourism. In the light of this seemingly irresistible trend toward the marketing of aboriginal culture, the book provides useful tips about how to go about the process, with such suggestions as establishment of aboriginal museums.

Planning for Balanced Development is profusely illustrated with photos, charts, checklists, and case study inserts, which lend themselves to marginal note-taking and introductory business courses. It emphasizes the importance of obtaining community consent and determining needs and interests, concluding with advice about grantsmanship and proposal writing. Although it is based on western American experience, Guyette's book has applications to many indigenous situations in the developed world. The provision of such a basic text should demystify the business development process and should help tribes avoid hiring unscrupulous consultants charging exorbitant rates for undertaking project proposals that are inappropriate to the communities they

serve. When aboriginal communities acquire the expertise to develop their own proposals, they will have gone some way toward overcoming the local-level dependency that has led to so many business failures and so much inappropriate development. Because the book contains sound advice about how to obtain community consent, a nonelitist business development project should be able to avoid many of the top-down schemes and promote the voluntarism that will enable many otherwise marginal projects to be successful and competitive.

Planning for Balanced Development is meant as a how-to business primer for aboriginal people intent on cultural retention and sustainable employment opportunities. For this purpose it is faultless and is unlikely to be equaled soon. Despite the qualms that social scientists may have about ethnotourism, the importance of assisting people who want to preserve their communities through business development cannot be responsibly ignored. In producing this book and offering the royalties to her community project, Susan Guyette has provided aboriginal communities with an exemplary service, which more scholars could emulate productively.

Ross Mallick

The Pueblo Revolt of 1680, Conquest and Resistance in Seventeenth-Century New Mexico. By Andrew L. Knaut. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1995. 248 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

Currently a large part of the allure of the Pueblo Indians is their past history. Apparently, the author of yet another book on the Pueblo Revolt of 1680 was fascinated by the tribes' history. In his prologue Knaut describes the revolt very succinctly, making the reader believe that this is going to be a comprehensive account of the events leading to the revolt as well as of the days and years following. However, a historian will discover quickly that the book is not historically inclusive; it covers only highlights of the famous event in the Pueblos' past.

Knaut's book is divided into three parts, which are then subdivided into chapters. Part I begins with the early contacts between Pueblo people and Spaniards, describing the Europeans' mission and accomplishments, both positive and negative. A question arises here about the book's accuracy in relation to the difficulties experienced by the first European representative, Esteban, at