

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Landscapes of Fraud: Mission Tumacácori, the Baca Float, and the Betrayal of the O'odham. By Thomas E. Sheridan.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2xc321jb>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 31(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Sanders, Jeffrey M.

Publication Date

2007-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

indigenous language and culture at the center of dialogue and planning are key components of exercising sovereignty and autonomy from a colonizing state.

At the beginning of the book the coeditors presented the question: "How can education serve both the needs of the nation-state and also indigenous peoples? Is this a possible task? Who is in control? How is the curriculum created? By whom and for whom?" (7). In my opinion, this volume of essays is an excellent response from diverse perspectives. Indigenous peoples have been and are currently engaged in answering these critical questions, which cannot be confined to the daily operation of schooling within the boundaries of a campus. The questions must be raised in multiple sites where indigenous peoples are engaged in nation building and developing plans for exercising sovereignty.

The value of this book resides in its utility for indigenous peoples who are engaged in the important work of developing a strong connection between sovereignty in all of its manifestations (cultural, political, and economic) and learning. I recommend this book for community organizers who work closely with indigenous nations in developing comprehensive plans of education. In addition, I suggest that educators who work in postsecondary education and in graduate programs add this book to their reading lists. The issues and questions raised throughout this volume are important for both preservice teachers and educators engaged in graduate-level work and professional development. I hope scholarship such as that displayed in the essays will continue to emerge from those places that indigenous peoples talk about.

Glenabah Martinez

University of New Mexico

Landscapes of Fraud: Mission Tumacácori, the Baca Float, and the Betrayal of the O'odham. By Thomas E. Sheridan. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 2006. 303 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

Noted author and scholar Thomas Sheridan's book weaves many academic disciplines into a tapestry that reveals changes that occur to both people and land over time. That land, or space, is the Upper Santa Cruz River Valley of Southern Arizona. The people surveyed and described are the original inhabitants of the land, the O'odham; and then the early Spanish and their missionizing efforts followed by a long line of ranchers, potential miners, land speculators, and glitzy, debauched socialites; and the time-lapse reel of this space ends with the land-hosting retirement villages alongside middle-class folks' homes who work in the Sonoran transborder region of Arizona and Mexico. The changing nature (read production) of space through human efforts is the central theme of this volume.

Sheridan describes how social spaces are destroyed as others are created and how social chemistry evolves when one culture (society) imposes itself on another. The production of new relationships on this space often involves the

exchange of power that each group tries to wield over the other. That in and of itself often creates tensions between the groups and this case is no exception. The reader can readily surmise that what is documented in this volume was often repeated in many other landscapes across North America.

The author asks the rhetorical question, how can space be produced? He then addresses a new perspective on the changing nature and pressures on space as it was inhabited and used first by Tohono O'odham and then through the progression of European entrants into this space. He offers a detailed historical reporting of pre-European O'odham life. From the O'odham who lived in landscapes of community and real reproduction of same, who believed "authority emanated from community" (themselves, the people) and was not coerced from a central source of power (from outsiders, the Spanish and their missions), to Europeans who lived in landscapes of coercion and speculation (fictitious capital of real-estate scams), the author takes us on a time-lapse tour.

To assist on this tour Sheridan combines the keen inquisitiveness of a historian with the eye of a sharp contemporary social commentator. He uses linguistic glottochronological data to demonstrate the shared paths of the Hohokam, Pima, and O'odham indigenous people. Interspersed throughout are O'odham words for their lifeways as well as plants and ethnobotanical practices of the people. He follows by using Spanish terms for many of their practices and thereby demonstrates a basic tenet of the Sapir-Wolf hypothesis that language is culture and is often best described in its own terms.

He is also very good at documenting how geomorphologic changes in landscape influenced Native responses to it and how the basic topography and geology of this part of basin and range land helped influence the European response of viewing the land in terms of commodities and capital. Here we encounter the core differences between the indigenous people and the newcomers. The former viewed the land in terms of community, the latter in terms of commodities. Once these elements entered into the people-land equation, Sheridan introduces us to economic, social, and political factors that were completely changed following the entrance of these new kinds of people that came to inhabit this landscape. He compares perspectives on space, how it was encountered, used, revered, and sustained by the O'odham, and then how the post-European era saw that space in terms of extractive commodities and fictitious capital. He has us think about how a politically determined east-west horizontal international boundary perpendicularly meets with a north-south interstate highway system to overwhelm the natural features of the land. We follow the intensification of human activity in that space particularly during the last century and a half with those activities giving birth to the title of the book.

This book is really more than the sum of its component disciplines. It is truly interdisciplinary and as such his holistic, academically integrated approach is greater than each piece addressed alone and then summarized. Although library scientists may parse the contents of this book into categories such as environmental history, land tenure and land speculation, or Tohono O'odham Indians or Spanish missions, it is much more than any of these.

Sheridan's historical research is exemplary. The publication dates of his references range from 1852 to 2003, and he uses many primary sources. The authors of his other referenced works are some of the leading scholars in their fields of history, anthropology, law and policy, economics, geography and ecology, linguistics, and so forth.

He divides this work into two parts: "Landscapes of Community" (based on O'odham people) and "Landscapes of Fraud" (the others who followed). It is interesting to note that he chose the latter for his main title, with the subtitle, "Mission Tumacácori, the Baca Float, and the Betrayal of the O'odham," actually being a précis of the book. Other scholars have studied indigenous people-land relationships, such as Basso, Cronon, and Nabhan (all of whose works are referenced in this one), yet Sheridan's work here offers a more complete view of this Sonoran space over a longer period of time.

This is the kind of book that should be incorporated in Native American studies courses because its holistic interdisciplinary format is the natural lens through which Native people have viewed their environment. The case study is a general recapitulation of relations between indigenous populations and European colonizers, yet this offers a very intimate view. The authenticity of this work, however, could have been even further enhanced had the author incorporated more direct voices from the O'odham people. If Western-trained scholars speak from their disciplines then Native voices should be heard from within theirs. Sheridan notes that over the years, as the National Park Service obtained the lands around the mission at Tumacácori (first as a national monument now as a national historical park), they did so without input from the O'odham, the original inhabitants. He asks, "Did any of them (federal officials) bother to ask the O'odham about their connections to Mission Tumacácori or its land grant?" If so, perhaps the outcomes might have been different. Sheridan's oversight is nowhere comparable to the egregious actions of those selling and buying the mission lands, yet it should stand as a reminder to all scholars working in a primary way with Indian people to include them in the discourse.

The preceding comment is not meant to detract or belittle the excellent scholarship and writing craftsmanship that went into this work. This is an excellent choice for those interested in following how land influences people and how people in turn influence land.

Jeffrey M. Sanders

Montana State University-Billings

Native Insurgencies and the Genocidal Impulse in the Americas. By Nicholas A. Robins. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2005. 288 pages. \$39.95 cloth.

Nicholas A. Robins has tackled a large and important question. In the convoluted worlds made by Spanish conquest and subsequent colonization in the Americas, Native peoples frequently suffered defeat and genocide at