UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

Indentured Indian Emigrants to Natal 1860-1902: A Study Based on Ships' Lists.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2xz6s4rw>

Journal

International Migration Review, 27(2)

ISSN

0197-9183

Authors

Leonard, Karen
Bhana, Surendra

Publication Date

1993

DOI

10.2307/2547144

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

research with both first and second generation youth. The young people growing up in the working-class areas of Swedish cities are seen as threats to public order. Conflicts are redefined in cultural terms, as the result of the inadequacy of ethnic backgrounds for a modern society. The problems can thus be solved through a "civilizing process," which means cultural adaptation and "learning to be Swedish" (p. 81).

But culture is clearly a two-sided process. The use of ethnic stereotypes (or "culturalization") through bureaucracies has a dialectical relationship with the use of culture as a resource to develop group identity and resistance by migrants themselves. Culture is both the "cultural baggage" which migrants bring with them and the dynamic process of interaction and change in the new society. Ålund's essay on "wrestling with ghosts" (pp. 89–112) analyzes this interaction of the traditional and the new in the emergence of the transcultural communities of the European cities. She takes up the meaning of vampirism for Wallachians from Serbia (examined in detail in Schierup and Ålund, 1987) and relates it to the debates on subculture, language and community which have played such a role in debates in Britain (Gilroy, Hebdige, Rushdie, etc).

These chapters on culture and ethnicity are compelling reading and make an original contribution to an important debate. However, they leave me somewhat dissatisfied, for they do not show a clear perspective for steering between the Scylla of "culturalization" and the Charbydis of subcultural isolation. Perhaps this is too much to demand: the issue can only be resolved by social practice, as we see unfolding before us in the drama of the new transcultural youth movements.

Schierup does attempt a theoretical resolution in the concluding chapter on "the puzzle of trans-ethnic society," through linking the analysis of migrant culture to a discussion of the role of social movements in postmodern societies. He argues that the Swedish case shows how the static ideas on culture which still prevail even on the left pave the way for technocratic administration of migrants as "social problems." The alternative, for him, is the development of "genuinely democratic and trans-ethnic forms of political action." This is summed up in the concept of "agency, which focuses on the everyday life-world's potential for democratizing the field of repro-

duction" (p. 140). Schierup tries to overcome the compartmentalization of migration research (which, perhaps, reflects the marginalization of its objects) by putting it into the context of contemporary theories of mainstream sociology on the development of society. Tourraine's new social movements approach and Habermas' theory of communicative action play a central role. This is stimulating stuff, though I felt that the original questions get somewhat lost in the multidimensional theoretical debates. It is hard to see what the replacement of ethnic culture by the more dynamic and transcendent category of agency would mean for actual social action and political mobilization among ethnic minorities.

Sadly, there are signs that the Swedish model is running into difficulties. Racism is growing, and in December 1989 the government decided to tighten rules on recognition of refugees. Ålund and Schierup argue that Sweden is being influenced by the current development of a "fortress Europe" mentality, in which there are strong fears of influxes from the impoverished south. Islam is increasingly being seen as a threat to Swedish culture and values. A preference is emerging for using Eastern Europe as a labor reserve and reorientating refugee policy away from purely humanitarian criteria toward considerations of economic usefulness. Ålund and Schierup find that

The moral compact on which Swedish immigrant policy is built is gradually disintegrating, giving way to a culturalist construction of new discriminatory boundaries. . . . The hidden logic of a new common-sense cultural racism . . . finds . . . its way into the language and practices of public servants, professionals and into the everyday common-sense discourses of ordinary people. (p. 10)

This is an imaginative and valuable book which should be read by anyone interested in the growing international debate on ethnic diversity and multiculturalism.

Indentured Indian Emigrants to Natal 1860–1902: A Study Based on Ships' Lists. By Surendra Bhana. New Delhi: Promilla & Co., 1991. Pp. 157. \$20.00

KAREN LEONARD

University of California, Irvine

This was a very ambitious undertaking—the analysis of 91 volumes of 384 ships' lists of 152,184 indentured Indians going to Natal between 1860 and, initially, 1911—and has been rigorously carried out to the best of the researcher's ability. Seriously hampered by the SPSS program utilized and by the sheer volume of the data (presumably the reason the study was cut off at 1902, although shortage of funds for continued analysis may have contributed), Bhana has nonetheless done a remarkable job of microfilming, information retrieval, and analysis. He warns that one needs to be computerwise at the very beginning of one's project, and his data is available to researchers on magnetic tapes and printouts. Because important questions remain unanswered (gender could not be correlated with places of origin, caste or class, and caste and class could not be correlated with places of origin), one hopes that someone will work with this data again.

Bhana has pulled together very detailed information about local conditions in the sending areas for emigrants from the ports of Madras and Calcutta and about employment conditions in Natal for the late nineteenth century, and he has also paid attention to the larger context, the world system and the emigrants from India to other places. The recon-

struction of the recruitment process of indentured laborers is very valuable, covering both government and private recruiters and pointing to misrepresentation and other abuses (problems which ultimately ended this system of labor recruitment for overseas employment in 1917). Eleven graphs break down the passengers to Natal from Calcutta and Madras by sex, age, height, leading places of origin, leading castes/religions and leading employers in Natal; 23 tables spell out the above and add further details—births and deaths on the ships, the numbers of indentured and free Indians in Natal, and a few other matters. Useful maps and a few illustrative photographs are provided.

Bhana clearly worked very hard to present these findings, even trying to correlate the names of passengers with the names listed in the twelve volumes of Natal archival *Registers of Employers for Indentured Indians* (but he comments that there were so many unknowns that his tables of employers are of limited value). One has the impression that here a massive research effort has succeeded in putting out detailed data which need further explanation, especially from historians of the sending areas in India, and further manipulation by a more sophisticated computer program. Bhana raises many significant issues for further exploration, and social scientists will find much to interest them in the work he has produced.