# Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory

**LBL Publications** 

# Title

Nitrogen Availability Dampens the Positive Impacts of CO2 Fertilization on Terrestrial Ecosystem Carbon and Water Cycles

**Permalink** https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2z09d3w3

**Journal** Geophysical Research Letters, 44(22)

**ISSN** 0094-8276

## **Authors**

He, Liming Chen, Jing M Croft, Holly <u>et al.</u>

Publication Date 2017-11-28

# DOI

10.1002/2017gl075981

Peer reviewed

Nitrogen Availability Dampens the Positive Impacts of CO<sub>2</sub>Fertilization on Terrestrial Ecosystem Carbon and Water Cycles

Liming He<sup>1</sup>, Jing M. Chen<sup>1</sup>, Holly Croft<sup>1</sup>, Alemu Gonsamo<sup>1</sup>, Xiangzhong Luo<sup>1</sup>, Jane Liu<sup>1</sup>, Ting Zheng<sup>1</sup>, Ronggao Liu<sup>2</sup>, and Yang Liu<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Geography and Planning, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, <sup>2</sup> China State Key Laboratory of Resources and Environmental Information System, Institute of Geographic Sciences and Natural Resources Research, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China

## Abstract

The magnitude and variability of the terrestrial  $CO_2$  sink remain uncertain, partly due to limited global information on ecosystem nitrogen (N) and its cycle. Without N constraint in ecosystem models, the simulated benefits from CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization and CO<sub>2</sub>-induced increases in water use efficiency (WUE) may be overestimated. In this study, satellite observations of a relative measure of chlorophyll content are used as a proxy for leaf photosynthetic N content globally for 2003–2011. Global gross primary productivity (GPP) and evapotranspiration are estimated under elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and N-constrained model scenarios. Results suggest that the rate of global GPP increase is overestimated by 85% during 2000–2015 without N limitation. This limitation is found to occur in many tropical and boreal forests, where a negative leaf N trend indicates a reduction in photosynthetic capacity, thereby suppressing the positive vegetation response to enhanced CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization. Based on our carbon-water coupled simulations, enhanced CO<sub>2</sub>concentration decreased stomatal conductance and hence increased WUE by 10% globally over the 1982 to 2015 time frame. Due to increased anthropogenic N application, GPP in croplands continues to grow and offset the weak negative trend in forests due to N limitation. Our results also show that the improved WUE is unlikely to ease regional droughts in croplands because of increases in evapotranspiration, which are associated with the enhanced GPP. Although the N limitation on GPP increase is large, its associated confidence interval is still wide, suggesting an urgent need for better understanding and quantification of N limitation from satellite observations.

# 1 Introduction

The global atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration and surface temperature are predicted to keep increasing, due to the rising demand of fissile fuels. With a third of  $CO_2$  emissions absorbed by global terrestrial ecosystems, the buildup of atmospheric  $CO_2$  is abated (Le Quere et al., 2015). Yet the magnitude and regional distribution of the terrestrial carbon (C) sink at elevated  $CO_2$  levels remain uncertain, due to our limited knowledge on vegetation responses to increased  $CO_2$  concentration and nutrient limitation (Bellassen & Luyssaert, 2014; Grassi et al., 2017; Le Quere et al., 2009; Le Quere et al., 2015; Li et al., 2016; Schimel et al., 2015). Light use efficiency (LUE) models do not agree with process terrestrial biosphere models, which are independent or subcomponent of Earth system models (ESMs), on the net magnitude of the  $CO_2$  fertilization effect on the terrestrial C budget (Smith et al., 2016). Nutrient limitation, particularly plant available nitrogen (N), has been hypothesized to limit the projected C sink enhancing mechanisms under climate change and CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization. While there is less debate on the increased plant productivity under elevated  $CO_2$  (Ainsworth & Long, 2005; Leakey et al., 2009; Norby et al., 2005, 2010; Nowak et al., 2004), many studies found that leaf N, and therefore leaf chlorophyll content, are reduced with increasing CO<sub>2</sub>concentration accompanying the increased sequestration of N in long-lived biomass (Ågren & Kattge, 2017; Campo, 2016; Cotrufo et al., 1998; Fisher et al., 2013; Pellegrini, 2016; Reich et al., 2006), especially for young stands (LeBauer & Treseder, 2008), and tropical secondary forests (Davidson et al., 2007, 2004). As a result, potential increases in grass (Obermeier et al., 2016; Reich et al., 2014) and forest (Norby et al., 2010) productivity due to CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization are hampered by N limitation (Franklin et al., 2014).

Contrary findings also exist at the regional scale. Recently, Girardin et al. (2016) found little growth stimulation in Canada's boreal forest under half century of warming and CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization using tree-ring analysis. From C isotope analysis, van der Sleen et al. (2015) suggest that there is no growth stimulation of tropical trees from 150 years of CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization, though water use efficiency (WUE) increased. Some studies suggested that future productivity and C storage are limited by nutrient availability (Cleveland et al., 2013; Smith et al., 2014; Wieder et al., 2015; Zaehle et al., 2015; Zhang et al., 2014). Other observational studies suggest that intact tropical forests may not be limited by N (Hedin et al., 2009; Santiago & Goldstein, 2016) but by phosphorus (Cleveland et al., 2011) because of increased N influx (Liang et al., 2016).

Of the global C cycle, terrestrial gross primary productivity (GPP) is the largest flux (Gitelson et al., 2006; Le Quere et al., 2015). Quantitative estimates of the spatial and temporal distributions of GPP on regional to global scales are critical to understand the climate-C cycle relationship (Xia et al., 2015). Proper representation of the N availability across the globe in ecosystem models is vital to understand the mechanisms of nutrition limitation to CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization (Piao et al., 2013). Plants optimize N allocations within roots, stems, and leaves to adapt to the N availability. While plants prioritize N allocation to structural components in the early growing stage, the allocation of N to photosynthetic components such as chlorophyll and Rubisco is optimized according to environmental conditions. The amount, activity, and kinetics of Rubisco mediates the maximum rate of carboxylation  $(V_{cmax})$ , and chlorophyll is responsible for harvesting light, while leaf N content controls the amount of Rubisco and chlorophyll. Therefore, leaf chlorophyll content is closely related to vegetation photosynthesis capacity (Alton, 2017; Croft et al., 2017; Harris & Dash, 2011; Kattge et al., 2009). The MEdium Resolution Imaging Spectrometer (MERIS) terrestrial chlorophyll index (MTCI) has been shown to be sensitive to vegetation chlorophyll content due to the presence of red edge spectral bands (Alton, 2017; Curran et al., 2007; Dash et al., 2010; Dash & Curran, 2004, 2007; Harris & Dash, 2011; Jin et al., 2012; Zhang & Liu, 2014).

Rather than modeling the complicated N cycles, the objective of this study is to directly utilize the time series (2003–2011) of MERIS MTCI as a proxy of ecosystem photosynthetic N to quantify N-constrained global GPP and evapotranspiration (ET) trends under elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$  conditions.

## 2 Materials and Methods

We obtained the global MERIS MTCI time series over 9 years (2003–2011) and derived the MTCI trend for each pixel (Curran et al., 2007; Dash et al., 2010; Dash & Curran, 2004, 2007; Harris & Dash, 2011; Jin et al., 2012; Zhang & Liu, 2014). The trend is then further extrapolated back to 2000, and forward to 2015. The trend of MERIS chlorophyll information was then used as a proxy of the trend of the maximum rate of carboxylation at 25°C ( $V_{cmax}$ ) <sub>25</sub>) in an ecosystem model named the Boreal Ecosystems Productivity Simulator (BEPS) (Chen et al., 2007, 1999, 2012; He et al., 2014, 2017; Ju et al., 2006; Liu et al., 1997). The MERIS MTCI is derived based on Level 2 data which have been atmospherically corrected (Dash et al., 2010). Nguy-Robertson et al. (2015) found that the chlorophyll content is linear to MTCI values ranging from 2 to 10 for fertilized Maize, suggesting that saturation of MTCI is not a concern. Experimental data show that chlorophyll content is found to be linearly related to  $V_{cmax, 25}$  (Croft et al., 2017; Houborg et al., 2013). BEPS is forced by the Modern-Era Retrospective analysis for Research and Applications, Version 2 (MERRA 2) data (Rienecker et al., 2011) and satellite observed leaf area index (LAI) (Liu et al., 2012) to predict GPP and ET in 1982-2015.

BEPS inherits the Ball-Woodrow-Berry equation to model stomatal conductance (Ball et al., 1987; Frank et al., 2015; Franks & Beerling, 2009). In this study, the stomatal response to rising  $CO_2$  concentration, which is important to explain the WUE change, is illustrated in the supporting information (SI) (Text S2 and Figure S7).

We design three scenarios to simulate the coupled C-water cycles and qualify the N-constrained global GPP trend at elevated CO<sub>2</sub> using BEPS, which is a two-leaf enzyme kinetic terrestrial biosphere model: (1) a BEPS run without CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization and N constraint, (2) a BEPS run with CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization but without N constraint, and (3) a BEPS run with both CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization and N constraint. Global GPP estimates from BEPS are also compared to results from another processed-based model, the Breathing Earth System Simulator (BESS) (Jiang & Ryu, 2016), model tree ensemble from Max Planck Institute for Biogeochemistry (MPI-BGC) (Jung et al., 2011), and a light use efficiency model, Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS) (Mu et al., 2011). The Mann-Kendall test is used for trend analysis in this study. To illustrate the usefulness of MTCI data for GPP simulation, we run BEPS for the same scenarios at the flux tower sites using remote sensed data in moderate resolutions, that is, LAI data in 500 m, and MTCI data in 300 m. The BEPS simulations are compared to eddy covariance data (FLUXNET2015 Dataset in Tier 1; http://fluxnet.fluxdata.org/).

More detailed descriptions of model, data, and design of experiment are listed in SI (Baldocchi, 1994; dePury & Farquhar, 1997; Feng et al., 2007; Friedl et al., 2002; He et al., 2012, 2016; Ju et al., 2010; Liu et al., 2012; Matsushita et al., 2004; Matsushita & Tamura, 2002; Medlyn et al., 1999; Monteith, 1965; Norman, 1982; Sellers et al., 1996; Sitch et al., 2008; Wang et al., 2004).

### 3 Results and Discussion

We describe the trends of MTCI, GPP and ET in the following sections, while their detailed summaries are provided in SI.

## 3.1 MTCI Trend

The largest annual mean MTCI values, as a proxy for leaf photosynthetic N content, appear in the tropical evergreen forests due to their longest growing seasons, followed by temperate forests and croplands (Figure 1a, for year 2003). The annual maximum MTCI values appear in cropland largely due to inputs from fertilizer application. The MTCI trends during 2003–2011 (Figure 1b) differ greatly among regions, with statistically significant increasing trends generally appearing in human managed ecosystems, that is, croplands, whereas neutral or decreasing trends are located in natural ecosystems, for example, tropical and boreal forests, and savannas (sensitivity analysis results are available in the supporting information (SI)). There are also increasing MTCI trends in far east of Russia close to newly developed farmland, consistent with increasing vegetation activity in the area (Gonsamo & Chen, 2016). The maximum positive MTCI trends appear in cereal and broadleaf croplands in Asia and South America. The MTCI trend map reveals enhanced fertilizer application and atmospheric N deposition over China (Liu et al., 2013; Lu et al., 2016) as well as the rest of the world (Reay et al., 2008). The MTCI trends in U.S. and Europe croplands are not as strong as that in Asia due to N mitigation (Zhang et al., 2015) as evidenced by independent satellite observations (Lu et al., 2016). Globally, 56% of the pixels show decreasing trends in MTCI (SI). The steepest decline in MTCI appears in broadleaf forests in South America. Considerable negative MTCI trends in tropical rain forests are related to recent deforestation, which cause N loss in the ecosystems (Deegan et al., 2011; Neill et al., 2006). Decreases in MTCI in tundra vegetation may be related to Arctic "browning" (Phoenix & Bjerke, 2016), where tundra turned into shrubland with longer N turnover times. The Mann-Kendall test shows that LAI, which is derived from an independent satellite sensor the Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS), has different trend patterns from MTCI during

the same period, suggesting that leaf chlorophyll and LAI have different physiological controls (Croft et al., 2014) (SI).



#### Figure 1

The trends of MTCI and global GPP by Mann-Kendall test. (a) The mean value of MTCI in 2003. (b) The relative MTCI trend from 2003 to 2011. Relative MTCI trend is the division of MTCI trend by MTCI mean. (c and d) The global GPP trends in 2000-2015 without and with nitrogen constraint proxied by MTCI are shown, respectively.

3.2 Impacts of CO<sub>2</sub> Fertilization and N Constraint on Global GPP Trend

At the site level, the consideration of N constraint in BEPS explains more interannual variance in simulated GPP by up to 4%, compared to simulations with only  $CO_2$  fertilization (SI). This suggests the usefulness of MTCI in indicating N availability in ecosystems.

Without the consideration of N constraint, global simulations from BEPS suggest that there are both increasing and decreasing trends of GPP in the tropical forests during 2000–2015 (Figure 1c). BEPS simulations have captured the decrease of GPP in tropical forests due to the recent and the strongest El Niño–Southern Oscillation (ENSO) ever recorded. The large patches where GPP increases appear in croplands and forest areas related to regeneration in central Africa and regrowth from mountain pine beetle infestation in western North America. With N constraint (Figure 1d), there are intensified GPP increases in croplands except in Europe and U.S. that may be related to N pollution mitigation (Zhang et al., 2015), while extensive GPP decreasing trends are found in tropical and boreal forests.

With the consideration of  $CO_2$  fertilization (Figure 2a), BEPS simulations suggest that global GPP increased from 116.2 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> in 1982 to 122.6 Pg C  $yr^{-1}$  in 2015, with an increasing trend of 0.2 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> (p = 6.8e-08), or 5.5% in total, which is compatible to the NPP estimate (7.6%, 1982–2011) from an ensemble of Earth system models (ESMs) (Smith et al., 2016). The magnitude of the global GPP simulations from BEPS is similar to those of BESS (Jiang & Ryu, 2016) and MPI-BGC (Jung et al., 2011), while BEPS and BESS GPP estimates share common interannual variations in response to ENSO events as indicated by the multivariate ENSO index (MEI) (Wolter & Timlin, 2011). BEPS global GPP explains 25% (p = 0.0025) of interannual variance in residual C sink (Le Quere et al., 2015). Compared to a net primary production (NPP) derived from an artificial neural network data mining approach with an accuracy 0.72 (Li et al., 2017), the global GPP time series from BEPS can explain 45% (p = 0.0001) of interannual variance in this NPP product. Our result echoes the finding of Yue et al., (2015) which suggests that  $CO_2$  fertilization is the dominant driver of the GPP trend from a 30 year simulation of global GPP.



#### Figure 2

Time series of global (a) GPP and (b) ET estimates from different models and scenarios overlapped with multivariate ENSO index. BEPS-wo, BEPS-w, and BEPS-N indicate that the GPP and ET estimates are simulated without  $CO_2$  fertilization, with  $CO_2$  fertilization only, and with both  $CO_2$  fertilization and N constraint, respectively. MODIS indicates estimation from the MODIS GPP and ET products. MPI-BGC indicates model tree ensemble-based estimate. BESS indicates estimation from the Breathing Earth System Simulator. In Figure 2a, the difference between BEPS-N and BEPS-w indicates the reduced GPP trend with N constraint. In Figure 2b, the difference between BEPS-w and BEPS-wo indicates ET decrease gained from  $CO_2$ -induced WUE increase.

Without CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization, BEPS shows a decrease in GPP by  $-0.08 \text{ Pg C yr}^{-1}$  (p = 0.0058) or -3% over the 34 years; this value is lower

than the estimate of the ensemble ESMs (-1.7% in 1982-2011) since data during the last ENSO event (2014-2015) are included in BEPS. The MODIS GPP estimate (Mu et al., 2011), which does not include an explicit CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization effect, shows lower overall GPP and no significant trend (0.019 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> in 2000-2014, p = 0.43), similar to the trend in BEPS simulation without considering CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization (0.015 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> and p = 0.96during the same period).

Considering both CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization and N limitation as represented by MTCI trends, the global GPP estimates by BEPS are 121.2 and 120.9  $\pm$  1.7 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> in 2015 and 2000-2015, respectively, and the global GPP trend during 2000-2015 is 0.13 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> with confidence interval (CI) in [-0.02, 0.36] (p = 0.079), which is only 54% of the estimated trend (0.24 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup>, p = 0.0034, CI = [0.10, 0.48]) with only CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization in BEPS for the same period. The global GPP estimates with N constraint decreased by 1.4 and 0.5 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> in 2015 and in 2000-2015, respectively, comparing to BEPS simulations considering only CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization without N limitation. Our result is consistent with the finding of Reich and Hobbie (2013) from a long-term open-air CO<sub>2</sub> + N experiments (2001-2010) that the limited ambient N availability will dampen the capacity of terrestrial ecosystems to sequester large amounts of C in the future.

Considering both CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization and N constraint, we find maximum GPP trends in deciduous broadleaf forests in Australia (27.6 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>), Africa (21.2 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>), and Asia (16.7 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>), followed by broadleaf (15.5 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) and cereal (13.1 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) croplands in Asia. Minimum trends are found in Evergreen broadleaf forest (-19.0 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) in South America, and grasslands in Europe (-8.9 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) and South America (-7.4 g C m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) (Table S2 in supporting information).

As suggested by Wieder et al. (2015), consideration of both N and phosphorus limitations may not change the global GPP trend significantly, comparing to only considering N limitation.

3.3 Impacts of  $CO_2$  Fertilization and N Constraint on Global ET and WUE Trends

Global ET from BEPS is similar to that from MPI-BGC ( $64 \times 10^3 \text{ km}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$ ) (Figure 2b). However, their trends differ: MPI-BGC ET shows an increasing trend in 1982–2011 at the rate of  $0.039 \times 10^3 \text{ km}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$  (p = 0.0015), while BEPS shows decreasing trends in 1982–2015 at the rates of  $-0.024 \times 10^3 \text{ km}^3 \text{ yr}^{-1}$  (p = 0.3918, insignificant),

 $-0.054 \times 10^3$  km<sup>3</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (p = 0.0168), and  $-0.057 \times 10^3$  km<sup>3</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> (p = 0.0125) for the three scenarios: (1) without CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization, (2) with CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization only, and (3) with CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization and N constraints, respectively. BEPS ET estimates in the first few years may be positively biased due to uncertainty from model spinning up. Excluding the data in the first 3 years, BEPS shows an ET increase until 1997, followed by a decrease since then, while the ET trends,  $0 \times 10^3$ ,  $-0.001 \times 10^3$ , and  $-0.035 \times 10^3$  km<sup>3</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>, for scenarios 1, 2,

and 3 in 1985–2015 are insignificant with p = 0.5747, 0.1302, and 0.0931, respectively. The average global ET estimates in 1982–2015 from BEPS for the three scenarios are  $62.8 \pm 1.0$ ,  $62.2 \pm 1.0$ , and  $62.2 \pm 1.0 \times 10^3$  km<sup>3</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>, respectively. These estimates fall in the lower boundary of the MPI-BGC model tree ensemble of  $65 \pm 3.0 \times 10^3$  km<sup>3</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in 1982–2008 (Jung et al., 2010). The impact of N constraint on the global ET is less important than on the global GPP. Both BEPS and MPI-BGC show responses to a major ENSO event in 1998 with ET decreasing until 2002 due to soil-moisture anomaly (also see supporting information) (Jung et al., 2010). All models except BESS reveal that global ET increases from a trough in 2002 to a peak in 2010.

There are debates on the global ET trend with much uncertainty from the forcing data sets (Badgley et al., 2015; Dong & Dai, 2017). Positive trends were reported by Zhang et al. (2016) and Mao et al. (2015), while Zeng et al. (2012) showed that the increase in global land ET mainly occurred between the 1980s and the 1990s, and the trend over the 2000s is nonsignificant. During 1992–2005, BEPS simulation with CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization only shows an insignificant global ET trend ( $-0.1341 \times 10^3$  km<sup>3</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>, or -0.2%, p = 0.1253) which is close to 0.1% trend estimated from measured discharge (Knauer et al., 2017). BEPS, with coupled C-water cycle in the leaf level rather than the canopy level, stands out with a nonsignificant trend, which may be associated with increase of WUE.

Recent studies suggest that the ratio of intercellular to ambient  $CO_2$  concentration (Ci/Ca) remains constant at elevated atmospheric  $CO_2$ , and as a result,  $CO_2$ -induced stomatal closure increases the WUE (Frank et al., 2015; Franks et al., 2013; Ito & Inatomi, 2012; Keenan et al., 2013). These effects are captured in BEPS. For the scenario with only  $CO_2$ fertilization, BEPS shows that  $C_a$  increased by 18%, and  $C_i$  in both sunlit and shaded leaves increased by 19%, suggesting a nearly constant  $C_i/C_a$  ratio during 1982–2015; stomatal conductance reduced by 10%, while the WUE increased by the same percentage during the same period. Without considering  $CO_2$  fertilization, BEPS shows no trend of WUE, while the LUEbased MODIS shows increasing WUE trend in 2000–2014.

The CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment and WUE increase are widely expected to counteract crop yield losses due to increasing droughts in this century (Swann et al., 2016). Our results (Figure 3a) show worldwide ET decrease and CO<sub>2</sub>-induced increase in WUE, especially in tropical forests. However, the expected benefits of CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization in WUE could be weakened by intensified N availability (e.g., fertilizer use) at the regional level (Liu et al., 2013; Reay et al., 2008). Due to N application and deposition that increase leaf  $V_{cmax}$  and stomatal conductance and enhance photosynthesis and transpiration, there are substantial ET increases in the croplands that could offset ET decreases due to CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization (Figure 3b). For example, the ET trends in Asian cereal and broadleaf croplands are 3.5 and 3.8 mm yr<sup>-1</sup> in 2000–2015, respectively, if CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization is not considered. Considering CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization only, the corresponding trends are reduced to

3.3 and 3.7 mm  $yr^{-1}$  for the same period. However, the corresponding ET trends are increased to 3.8 and 4.0 mm  $yr^{-1}$ , respectively, if both CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization and N application and deposition are considered.



#### Figure 3

Global ET biases in 2011 due to missing  $CO_2$  fertilization or N constraint.  $ET_{wo_cO2}$ ,  $ET_{w_cO2}$ , and  $ET_{w_cO26N}$  indicate ET estimations simulated by BEPS without  $CO_2$  fertilization, with  $CO_2$  fertilization only, and with both  $CO_2$  fertilization and N constraint, respectively. (a) The ET bias due to  $CO_2$  fertilization. (b) The ET bias due to N availability. ET decrease gained from  $CO_2$ -induced WUE increase can potentially be offset by ET increase accompanied by GPP increase due to N deposition at the regional level.

#### 4 Discussions

In this study, we have compared three scenarios to separate the effects of  $CO_2$  fertilization and N limitation in global ecosystems. The uncertainties from LAI product, the MERRA 2 meteorological forcing data, and other missing drives that may cause effects in capturing the global GPP and ET trends are data source specific, difficult to quantify, and cannot be ruled out. However, all these three scenarios shared the same input data and the only differences among them are the  $CO_2$  concentrations and  $V_{cmax}$  trends; therefore, this enables us to isolate only the effects of  $CO_2$  and N although other factors exist.

Our study highlighted the importance of N in global GPP and ET simulations. Due to the limited length of MERIS mission, only a time series of MTCI in 9 years is available for trend analysis; therefore, the trend of MTCI is not very strong in extensive area. Fortunately, with the launch of Sentinel-3A in 2016, the availability of MTCI data is able to continue in the same bands and spatial resolution for seven more years and more robust MTCI trend analysis is possible in future.

The MTCI trend is used as a proxy of  $V_{cmax, 25}$  trend at the top of canopy. Other  $V_{cmax}$  variations, such as its gradient in canopy profile and temperature response, are still explained by BEPS. Although use of intraannual variation of MTCI can further improve BEPS performance, we still assume that  $V_{cmax}$ ,  $_{25}$  is a constant during a year in this study, in order to keep the three scenarios comparable.

The advantage of our approach is that we use spatially explicit variation of MTCI trend in global scale to constrain N rather than a modeling approach which has to involve many assumptions. The use of MTCI also has limitations because we have assumed that the trend of MTCI is linear and the  $V_{cmax, 25}$ , chlorophyll content and MTCI share the same trend. Although the correlations between  $V_{cmax, 25}$  and chlorophyll content (Croft et al., 2017; Houborg et al., 2013) and between chlorophyll content and MTCI (Nguy-Robertson et al., 2015; Peng et al., 2017) are strong, more studies that directly use of MTCI for GPP modeling, such as Alton (2017), Boyd et al. (2012), Dong et al. (2015), Harris & Dash (2011), and Loozen et al. (2017), will further strengthen the conclusion of this study.

## 5 Conclusions

Estimates of the global terrestrial GPP trend induced considerable debates arising from lack of N constraint in ESMs (Norby et al., 2010; Obermeier et al., 2016; Reich et al., 2014; Santiago & Goldstein, 2016; Schimel et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2016, 2014; Thornton et al., 2007; Wieder et al., 2015; Zaehle et al., 2015; Zhang et al., 2014). Here we make use of a global time series of satellite-observed MTCI vegetation index data to provide a proxy for leaf photosynthetic N content in order to constrain the vegetation photosynthesis capacity in an ecosystem model. The results indicate that there are extensive decreases in photosynthetic capacity in tropical forests and part of boreal forests, and this negative effect on the global vegetation productivity is mostly offset by enhanced N deposition in croplands. With N constraint, the simulated global terrestrial GPP decreased by 1.4 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> in 2015, dampening our expectation for the enhanced CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization. Our result may provide new explanation for the discrepancies between Smith et al. (2016) and De Kauwe et al. (2016) regarding the large divergence of LUEbased and ESMs estimates of global terrestrial CO<sub>2</sub>fertilization. Therefore, the consideration of both LUE increase and reduced CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization under N limitation is necessary for accurate projections of future C-climate feedbacks for different Representative Concentration Pathways.

Allowing N application and deposition to counteract the CO<sub>2</sub>-induced WUE increase could also limit the optimism for reduced water management requirements for crops. We found that the 10% increase of WUE in 1982–2015 from CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization can be offset by ET increase accompanied by enhanced growth due to N fertilizer application in China's croplands. Crop production needs to increase by about 60%–100% from 2007 to 2050 to meet global food demand (Zhang et al., 2015). As the demand on crop yields continues to grow (Sanchez, 2010), especially in developing countries, there will be enhanced N application in agriculture accompanied by expansion of irrigated areas in the future (Fishman et al., 2015), resulting in large modifications to terrestrial nutrient, carbon, and water cycles that have not been considered in most ESMs (Swann et al., 2016).

## Acknowledgments

This study was supported by the Canadian Space Agency grant (14SUSMAPTO). This work used eddy covariance data acquired and shared by the FLUXNET community, including AmeriFlux, AfriFlux, AsiaFlux, CarboAfrica, CarboEuropeIP, CarboItaly, CarboMont, ChinaFlux, Fluxnet-Canada, GreenGrass, ICOS, KoFlux, LBA, NECC, OzFlux-TERN, TCOS-Siberia, and USCCC. The ERA-Interim reanalysis data are provided by ECMWF and processed by LSCE. The FLUXNET data processing and harmonization was carried out by the European Fluxes Database Cluster, AmeriFlux Management Project, and Fluxdata project of FLUXNET, with the support of CDIAC and ICOS Ecosystem Thematic Center, and the OzFlux, ChinaFlux, and AsiaFlux offices. The data used are listed in the supporting information.

# References

Ågren, G. I., & Kattge, J. (2017). Nitrogen productivity and allocation responses of 12 important tree species to increased  $CO_2$ . *Trees*, 31(2), 617–621.

Ainsworth, E. A., & Long, S. P. (2005). What have we learned from 15 years of free-air CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment (FACE)? A meta-analytic review of the responses of photosynthesis, canopy properties and plant production to rising CO<sub>2</sub>. *New Phytologist*, 165( 2), 351– 372. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2004.01224.x

Alton, P. B. (2017). Retrieval of seasonal Rubisco-limited photosynthetic capacity at global FLUXNET sites from hyperspectral satellite remote sensing: Impact on carbon modelling. *Agricultural and Forest Meteorology*, 232, 74–88. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2016.08.001

Badgley, G., Fisher, J. B., Jimenez, C., Tu, K. P., & Vinukollu, R. (2015). On uncertainty in global terrestrial evapotranspiration estimates from choice of input forcing datasets. *Journal of* 

*Hydrometeorology*, 16( 4), 1449– 1455. https://doi.org/10.1175/JHM-D-14-0040.1

Baldocchi, D. (1994). An analytical solution for coupled leaf photosynthesis and Stomatal conductance models. *Tree Physiology*, 14( 7-8-9), 1069–1079. https://doi.org/10.1093/treephys/14.7-8-9.1069

Ball, J., Woodrow, L. E., & Beny, J. A. (1987). A model predicting stomatal conductance and its contribution to the control of photosynthesis under different environmental conditions. In J. Biggins (Ed.), *Progress in photosynthesis research* (pp. 221–224). Dordrecht, Netherlands: Nijhoff. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-0519-6\_48

Bellassen, V., & Luyssaert, S. (2014). Carbon sequestration: Managing forests in uncertain

times. Nature, 506( 7487), 153- 155. https://doi.org/10.1038/506153a

Boyd, D. S., Almond, S., Dash, J., Curran, P. J., Hill, R. A., & Foody, G. M. (2012). Evaluation of Envisat MERIS terrestrial chlorophyll index-based models for the estimation of terrestrial gross primary productivity. *Ieee Geosci Remote* 

S, 9(3), 457-461. https://doi.org/10.1109/LGRS.2011.2170810

Campo, J. (2016). Shift from ecosystem P to N limitation at precipitation gradient in tropical dry forests at Yucatan, Mexico. *Environmental Research Letters*, 11(9). https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/11/9/095006

Chen, B. Z., Chen, J. M., & Ju, W. M. (2007). Remote sensing-based ecosystem-atmosphere simulation scheme (EASS)—Model formulation and test with multiple-year data. *Ecological Modelling*, 209( 2-4), 277– 300. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2007.06.032

Chen, J. M., Liu, J., Cihlar, J., & Goulden, M. L. (1999). Daily canopy photosynthesis model through temporal and spatial scaling for remote sensing applications. *Ecological Modelling*, 124( 2-3), 99– 119. https://doi.org/ 10.1016/S0304-3800(99)00156-8

Chen, J. M., Mo, G., Pisek, J., Liu, J., Deng, F., Ishizawa, M., & Chan, D. (2012). Effects of foliage clumping on the estimation of global terrestrial gross primary productivity. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 26, GB1019. https://doi.org/10.1029/2010GB003996

Cleveland, C. C., Houlton, B. Z., Smith, W. K., Marklein, A. R., Reed, S. C., Parton, W., ... Running, S. W. (2013). Patterns of new versus recycled primary production in the terrestrial biosphere. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 110(31), 12,733–12,737. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.130276811

Cleveland, C. C., Townsend, A. R., Taylor, P., Alvarez-Clare, S., Bustamante, M. M. C., Chuyong, G., ... Wieder, W. R. (2011). Relationships among net primary productivity, nutrients and climate in tropical rain forest: A pantropical analysis. *Ecology* 

*Letters*, 14(9), 939–947. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1461-0248.2011.01658.x

Cotrufo, M. F., Ineson, P., & Scott, A. (1998). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> reduces the nitrogen concentration of plant tissues. *Global Change Biology*, 4(1), 43–54. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2486.1998.00101.x

Croft, H., Chen, J. M., Luo, X. Z., Bartlett, P., Chen, B., & Staebler, R. M. (2017). Leaf chlorophyll content as a proxy for leaf photosynthetic capacity. *Global Change Biology*, 23( 9), 3513–3524. https://doi.org/10.1111/ gcb.13599

Croft, H., Chen, J. M., & Zhang, Y. (2014). Temporal disparity in leaf chlorophyll content and leaf area index across a growing season in a temperate deciduous forest. *International Journal of Applied Earth Observation and* 

*Geoinformation*, 33, 312– 320. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jag.2014.06.005

Curran, P. J., Dash, J., Lankester, T., & Hubbard, S. (2007). Global composites of the MERIS terrestrial chlorophyll index. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 28(17), 3757–3758. https://doi.org/10.1080/01431160600639685

Dash, J., & Curran, P. J. (2004). The MERIS terrestrial chlorophyll index. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 25(23), 5403–5413. https://doi.org/10.1080/0143116042000274015

Dash, J., & Curran, P. J. (2007). Evaluation of the MERIS terrestrial chlorophyll index (MTCI). *Advances in Space* 

Research, 39(1), 100-104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asr.2006.02.034

Dash, J., Curran, P. J., Tallis, M. J., Llewellyn, G. M., Taylor, G., & Snoeij, P. (2010). Validating the MERIS Terrestrial Chlorophyll Index (MTCI) with ground chlorophyll content data at MERIS spatial resolution. *International Journal of Remote* 

Sensing, 31( 20), 5513- 5532. https://doi.org/10.1080/01431160903376340

Davidson, E. A., de Carvalho, C. J. R., Figueira, A. M., Ishida, F. Y., Ometto, J. P. H. B., Nardoto, G. B., ... Martinelli, L. A. (2007). Recuperation of nitrogen cycling in Amazonian forests following agricultural abandonment. *Nature*, 447(7147), 995–998. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature05900

Davidson, E. A., de Carvalho, C. J. R., Vieira, I. C. G., Figueiredo, R. D., Moutinho, P., Ishida, F. Y., ... Saba, R. T. (2004). Nitrogen and phosphorus limitation of biomass growth in a tropical secondary forest. *Ecological Applications*, 14(4), S150–S163.

De Kauwe, M. G., Keenan, T. F., Medlyn, B. E., Prentice, I. C., & Terrer, C. (2016). CORRESPONDENCE: Satellite based estimates underestimate the effect of  $CO_2$  fertilization on net primary productivity. *Nature Climate Change*, 6(10), 892–893. https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate3105

Deegan, L. A., Neill, C., Haupert, C. L., Ballester, M. V. R., Krusche, A. V., Victoria, R. L., ... de Moor, E. (2011). Amazon deforestation alters small stream structure, nitrogen biogeochemistry and connectivity to larger

rivers. *Biogeochemistry*, 105(1-3), 53–74. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-010-9540-4

dePury, D. G. G., & Farquhar, G. D. (1997). Simple scaling of photosynthesis from leaves to canopies without the errors of big-leaf models. *Plant, Cell & Environment*, 20( 5), 537–557. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-3040.1997.00094.x

Dong, B., & Dai, A. (2017). The uncertainties and causes of the recent changes in global evapotranspiration from 1982 to 2010. *Climate Dynamics*, 49(1–2), 279–296.

Dong, T. F., Meng, J. H., Shang, J. L., Liu, J. G., & Wu, B. F. (2015). Evaluation of chlorophyll-related vegetation indices using simulated Sentinel-2 data for estimation of crop fraction of absorbed photosynthetically active radiation. *Ieee J-Stars*, 8( 8), 4049–4059.

Feng, X., Liu, G., Chen, J. M., Chen, M., Liu, J., Ju, W. M., ... Zhou, W. (2007). Net primary productivity of China's terrestrial ecosystems from a process model driven by remote sensing. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 85( 3), 563–573. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2006.09.0 21

Fisher, J. B., Malhi, Y., Torres, I. C., Metcalfe, D. B., van de Weg, M. J., Meir, P., ... Huasco, W. H. (2013). Nutrient limitation in rainforests and cloud forests along a 3,000-m elevation gradient in the Peruvian Andes. *Oecologia*, 172(3), 889–902. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-012-2522-6

Fishman, R., Devineni, N., & Raman, S. (2015). Can improved agricultural water use efficiency save India's groundwater? *Environmental Research Letters*, 10(8). https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/10/8/084022

Frank, D. C., Poulter, B., Saurer, M., Esper, J., Huntingford, C., Helle, G., ... Weigl, M. (2015). Water-Use Efficiency and Transpiration across European Forests during the Anthropocene. *Nature Climate Change*, 5( 6), 579–583. https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate2614

Franklin, O., Nasholm, T., Hogberg, P., & Hogberg, M. N. (2014). Forests trapped in nitrogen limitation—An ecological market perspective on ectomycorrhizal symbiosis. *New* 

*Phytologist*, 203(2), 657–666. https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.12840

Franks, P. J., Adams, M. A., Amthor, J. S., Barbour, M. M., Berry, J. A., Ellsworth, D. S., ... von Caemmerer, S. (2013). Sensitivity of plants to changing atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration: From the geological past to the next century. *New Phytologist*, 197(4), 1077–1094. https://doi.org/10.1111/ nph.12104

Franks, P. J., & Beerling, D. J. (2009). Maximum leaf conductance driven by  $CO_2$  effects on stomatal size and density over geologic time. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of* 

*America*, 106( 25), 10,343– 10,347. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.090420910 6

Friedl, M. A., McIver, D. K., Hodges, J. C. F., Zhang, X. Y., Muchoney, D., Strahler, A. H., ... Schaaf, C. (2002). Global land cover mapping from MODIS: Algorithms and early results. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 83( 1-2), 287–302. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0034-4257(02)00078-0

Girardin, M. P., Bouriaud, O., Hogg, E. H., Kurz, W., Zimmermann, N. E., Metsaranta, J. M., ... Bhatti, J. (2016). No growth stimulation of Canada's boreal forest under half-century of combined warming and CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 113(52), E8406–E8414. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1610156113

Gitelson, A. A., Vina, A., Verma, S. B., Rundquist, D. C., Arkebauer, T. J., Keydan, G., ... Suyker, A. E. (2006). Relationship between gross primary production and chlorophyll content in crops: Implications for the synoptic monitoring of vegetation productivity. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 111, D08S11. https://doi.org/10.1029/2005JD006017

Gonsamo, A., & Chen, J. M. (2016). Circumpolar vegetation dynamics product for global change study. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 182, 13–26. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2016.04.022

Grassi, G., House, J., Dentener, F., Federici, S., den Elzen, M., & Penman, J. (2017). The key role of forests in meeting climate targets requires science for credible mitigation. *Nature Climate* 

Change, 7(3), 220-226. https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate3227

Harris, A., & Dash, J. (2011). The potential of the MERIS Terrestrial Chlorophyll Index for carbon flux estimation (vol 114, pg 1856, 2010). *Remote Sensing of* 

Environment, 115( 2), 340- 342. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2010.09.005

He, L., Chen, J. M., Liu, J., Bélair, S., & Luo, X. (2017). Assessment of SMAP soil moisture for global simulation of gross primary production. *Journal of Geophysical Research:* 

Biogeosciences, 122(7), 1549-1563. https://doi.org/10.1002/2016JG003603

He, L., Chen, J. M., Liu, J., Mo, G., Bélair, S., Zheng, T., ... Barr, A. G. (2014). Optimization of water uptake and photosynthetic parameters in an ecosystem model using tower flux data. *Ecological Modelling*, 294, 94–104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2014.09.019

He, L., Chen, J. M., Pisek, J., Schaaf, C. B., & Strahler, A. H. (2012). Global clumping index map derived from the MODIS BRDF product. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 119(0), 118–130. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2011.12.008

He, L. M., Liu, J., Chen, J. M., Croft, H., Wang, R., Sprintsin, M., ... Zhang, Y. (2016). Inter- and intra-annual variations of clumping index derived from the MODIS BRDF product. *International Journal of Applied Earth Observation*, 44, 53– 60. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jag.2015.07.007 Hedin, L. O., Brookshire, E. N. J., Menge, D. N. L., & Barron, A. R. (2009). The nitrogen paradox in tropical forest ecosystems. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and* 

*Systematics*, 40(1), 613–635. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.37.09 1305.110246

Houborg, R., Cescatti, A., Migliavacca, M., & Kustas, W. P. (2013). Satellite retrievals of leaf chlorophyll and photosynthetic capacity for improved modeling of GPP. *Agricultural and Forest* 

*Meteorology*, 177, 10–23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2013.04.006

Ito, A., & Inatomi, M. (2012). Water-use efficiency of the terrestrial biosphere: A model analysis focusing on interactions between the global carbon and water cycles. *Journal of* 

*Hydrometeorology*, 13( 2), 681– 694. https://doi.org/10.1175/JHM-D-10-05034.1

Jiang, C., & Ryu, Y. (2016). Multi-scale evaluation of global gross primary productivity and evapotranspiration products derived from reathing arth ystem imulator (BESS). *Remote Sensing of* 

*Environment*, 186, 528– 547. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2016.08.030

Jin, J. X., Jiang, H., Zhang, X. Y., & Wang, Y. (2012). Characterizing spatialtemporal variations in vegetation phenology over the north-south transect of Northeast Asia based upon the MERIS terrestrial chlorophyll index. *Terrestrial, Atmospheric and Oceanic* 

Sciences, 23( 4), 413- 424. https://doi.org/10.3319/TAO.2012.03.12.01(A)

Ju, W., Chen, J. M., Black, T. A., Barr, A. G., Liu, J., & Chen, B. (2006). Modelling multi-year coupled carbon and water fluxes in a boreal aspen forest. *Agricultural and Forest Meteorology*, 140(1-4), 136–151. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agrformet.2006.08.008

Ju, W., Wang, S., Yu, G., Zhou, Y., & Wang, H. (2010). Modeling the impact of drought on canopy carbon and water fluxes for a subtropical evergreen coniferous plantation in southern China through parameter optimization using an ensemble Kalman

filter. *Biogeosciences*, 7(3), 845-857. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-7-845-2010

Jung, M., Reichstein, M., Ciais, P., Seneviratne, S. I., Sheffield, J., Goulden, M. L., ... Zhang, K. (2010). Recent decline in the global land evapotranspiration trend due to limited moisture

supply. *Nature*, 467(7318), 951-954. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature09396

Jung, M., Reichstein, M., Margolis, H. A., Cescatti, A., Richardson, A. D., Altaf Arain, M., ... Williams, C. (2011). Global patterns of land-atmosphere fluxes of carbon dioxide, latent heat, and sensible heat derived from eddy covariance, satellite, and meteorological observations. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 116, G00J07. https://doi.org/10.1029/2010JG001566 Kattge, J., Knorr, W., Raddatz, T., & Wirth, C. (2009). Quantifying photosynthetic capacity and its relationship to leaf nitrogen content for global-scale terrestrial biosphere models. *Global Change Biology*, 15(4), 976–991. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01744.x

Keenan, T. F., Hollinger, D. Y., Bohrer, G., Dragoni, D., Munger, J. W., Schmid, H. P., & Richardson, A. D. (2013). Increase in forest water-use efficiency as atmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations

rise. Nature, 499( 7458), 324- 327. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature12291

Knauer, J., Zaehle, S., Reichstein, M., Medlyn, B. E., Forkel, M., Hagemann, S., & Werner, C. (2017). The response of ecosystem water-use efficiency to rising atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentrations: Sensitivity and large-scale biogeochemical implications. *New* 

*Phytologist*, 213( 4), 1654–1666. https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.14288

Le Quere, C., Moriarty, R., Andrew, R. M., Canadell, J. G., Sitch, S., Korsbakken, J. I., ... Zeng, N. (2015). Global Carbon Budget 2015. *Earth System Science Data*, 7( 2), 349– 396. https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-7-349-2015

Le Quere, C., Raupach, M. R., Canadell, J. G., & Marland, G. (2009). Trends in the sources and sinks of carbon dioxide. *Nature Geoscience*, 2(12), 831–836. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo689

Leakey, A. D. B., Ainsworth, E. A., Bernacchi, C. J., Rogers, A., Long, S. P., & Ort, D. R. (2009). Elevated CO<sub>2</sub> effects on plant carbon, nitrogen, and water relations: Six important lessons from FACE. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 60(10), 2859–2876. https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/erp096

LeBauer, D. S., & Treseder, K. K. (2008). Nitrogen limitation of net primary productivity in terrestrial ecosystems is globally distributed. *Ecology*, 89( 2), 371– 379. https://doi.org/10.1890/06-2057.1

Li, P., Peng, C., Wang, M., Li, W., Zhao, P., Wang, K., ... Zhu, Q. (2017). Quantification of the response of global terrestrial net primary production to multifactor global change. *Ecological Indicators*, 76, 245–255. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2017.01.021

Li, W., Ciais, P., Wang, Y., Peng, S., Broquet, G., Ballantyne, A. P., ... Pongratz, J. (2016). Reducing uncertainties in decadal variability of the global carbon budget with multiple datasets. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 113(46), 13,104–13,108. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.160395611 3

Liang, J. Y., Qi, X., Souza, L., & Luo, Y. Q. (2016). Processes regulating progressive nitrogen limitation under elevated carbon dioxide: A metaanalysis. *Biogeosciences*, 13(9), 2689–2699. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-13-2689-2016 Liu, J., Chen, J. M., Cihlar, J., & Park, W. M. (1997). A process-based boreal ecosystem productivity simulator using remote sensing inputs. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 62( 2), 158–175. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0034-4257(97)00089-8

Liu, X. J., Zhang, Y., Han, W., Tang, A., Shen, J., Cui, Z., ... Zhang, F. (2013). Enhanced nitrogen deposition over China. *Nature*, 494(7438), 459–462. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature11917

Liu, Y., Liu, R. G., & Chen, J. M. (2012). Retrospective retrieval of long-term consistent global leaf area index (1981–2011) from combined AVHRR and MODIS data. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 117, G04003. https://doi.org/10.1029/2012JG002084

Loozen, Y., Rebel, K. T., Karssenberg, D., Wassen, M. J., Sardans, J., Peñuelas, J., & de Jong, S. M. (2017). Regional detection of canopy nitrogen in Mediterranean forests using the spaceborne MERIS Terrestrial Chlorophyll Index. *Biogeosciences Discussions*, 1– 32. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-2017-228.

Lu, X. H., Jiang, H., Zhang, X. Y., Liu, J. X., & Jin, J. X. (2016). Estimating 40 years of nitrogen deposition in global biomes using the SCIAMACHY NO<sub>2</sub> column. *International Journal of Remote Sensing*, 37(20), 4964–4978. https://doi.org/10.1080/01431161.2016.12251 78

Mao, J. F., Fu, W., Shi, X., Ricciuto, D. M., Fisher, J. B., Dickinson, R. E., ... Zhu, Z. (2015). Disentangling climatic and anthropogenic controls on global terrestrial evapotranspiration trends. *Environmental Research Letters*, 10(9). https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/10/9/094008

Matsushita, B., & Tamura, M. (2002). Integrating remotely sensed data with an ecosystem model to estimate net primary productivity in East Asia. *Remote Sensing of* 

*Environment*, 81(1), 58–66. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0034-4257(01)00331-5

Matsushita, B., Xu, M., Chen, J., Kameyama, S., & Tamura, M. (2004). Estimation of regional net primary productivity (NPP) using a process-based ecosystem model: How important is the accuracy of climate data? *Ecological Modelling*, 178( 3-

4), 371- 388. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolmodel.2004.03.012

Medlyn, B. E., Badeck, F. W., de Pury, D. G. G., Barton, C. V. M., Broadmeadow, M., Ceulemans, R., ... Jstbid, P. G. (1999). Effects of elevated [CO<sub>2</sub>] on photosynthesis in European forest species: A metaanalysis of model parameters. *Plant, Cell & Environment*, 22(12), 1475–1495. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-3040.1999.00523.x

Monteith, J. L. (1965). Evaporation and environment. *Symposia of the Society for Experimental Biology*, 19, 205–234.

Mu, Q., Zhao, M., & Running, S. W. (2011). Improvements to a MODIS global terrestrial evapotranspiration algorithm. *Remote Sensing of Environment*, 115(8), 1781–1800. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rse.2011.02.019

Neill, C., Piccolo, M. C., Cerri, C. C., Steudler, P. A., & Melillo, J. M. (2006). Soil solution nitrogen losses during clearing of lowland Amazon forest for pasture. *Plant and Soil*, 281(1-2), 233–245. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-005-4435-1

Nguy-Robertson, A., Peng, Y., Arkebauer, T., Scoby, D., Schepers, J., & Gitelson, A. (2015). Using a simple leaf color chart to estimate leaf and canopy chlorophyll a content in maize (*Zea mays*). *Communications In Soil Science And Plant* 

Analysis, 46( 21), 2734– 2745. https://doi.org/10.1080/00103624.2015.10936 39

Norby, R. J., DeLucia, E. H., Gielen, B., Calfapietra, C., Giardina, C. P., King, J. S., ... Oren, R. (2005). Forest response to elevated  $CO_2$  is conserved across a broad range of productivity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of* 

*America*, 102( 50), 18,052– 18,056. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.050947810 2

Norby, R. J., Warren, J. M., Iversen, C. M., Medlyn, B. E., & McMurtrie, R. E. (2010). CO<sub>2</sub> enhancement of forest productivity constrained by limited nitrogen availability. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 107(45), 19,368–19,373. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1006463107

Norman, J. M. (1982). Simulation of Microclimates. In H. Jerry (Ed.), *Biometeorology in integrated pest management* (pp. 65– 99). New York: Academic Press. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-332850-2.50009-8

Nowak, R. S., Ellsworth, D. S., & Smith, S. D. (2004). Functional responses of plants to elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>—Do photosynthetic and productivity data from FACE experiments support early predictions? *New Phytologist*, 162( 2), 253– 280. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2004.01033.x

Obermeier, W. A., Lehnert, L. W., Kammann, C. I., Müller, C., Grünhage, L., Luterbacher, J., ... Bendix, J. (2016). Reduced CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization effect in temperate C3 grasslands under more extreme weather conditions. *Nature Climate Change*, 7( 2), 137–141. https://doi.org/10.1038/nclimate3191

Pellegrini, A. F. A. (2016). Nutrient limitation in tropical savannas across multiple scales and

mechanisms. *Ecology*, 97(2), 313–324. https://doi.org/10.1890/15-0869.1

Peng, Y., Nguy-Robertson, A., Arkebauer, T., & Gitelson, A. A. (2017). Assessment of canopy chlorophyll content retrieval in maize and soybean: Implications of hysteresis on the development of generic algorithms. *Remote Sensing*, 9(3). https://doi.org/10.3390/rs9030226

Phoenix, G. K., & Bjerke, J. W. (2016). Arctic browning: Extreme events and trends reversing arctic greening. *Global Change Biology*, 22(9), 2960–2962. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13261

Piao, S. L., Sitch, S., Ciais, P., Friedlingstein, P., Peylin, P., Wang, X., ... Zeng, N. (2013). Evaluation of terrestrial carbon cycle models for their response to climate variability and to  $CO_2$  trends. *Global Change Biology*, 19(7), 2117–2132. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.12187

Reay, D. S., Dentener, F., Smith, P., Grace, J., & Feely, R. A. (2008). Global nitrogen deposition and carbon sinks. *Nature Geoscience*, 1(7), 430–437. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo230

Reich, P. B., & Hobbie, S. E. (2013). Decade-long soil nitrogen constraint on the  $CO_2$  fertilization of plant biomass. *Nature Climate Change*, 3(3), 278–282.

Reich, P. B., Hobbie, S. E., Lee, T., Ellsworth, D. S., West, J. B., Tilman, D., ... Trost, J. (2006). Nitrogen limitation constrains sustainability of ecosystem response to

CO<sub>2</sub>. *Nature*, 440( 7086), 922– 925. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature04486

Reich, P. B., Hobbie, S. E., & Lee, T. D. (2014). Plant growth enhancement by elevated CO<sub>2</sub> eliminated by joint water and nitrogen limitation. *Nature Geoscience*, 7(12), 920–924. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo2284

Rienecker, M. M., Suarez, M. J., Gelaro, R., Todling, R., Bacmeister, J., Liu, E., ... Woollen, J. (2011). MERRA: NASA's Modern-Era Retrospective Analysis for Research and Applications. *Journal of Climate*, 24(14), 3624–3648. https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-11-00015.1

Sanchez, P. A. (2010). Tripling crop yields in tropical africa. *Nature Geoscience*, 3(5), 299–300. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo853

Santiago, L. S., & Goldstein, G. (2016). Is photosynthesis nutrient limited in tropical trees? In G. Goldstein & L. S. Santiago (Eds.), *Tropical tree physiology: Adaptations and responses in a changing environment* (pp. 299– 315). Cham: Springer International Publishing. https:// doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-27422-5\_14

Schimel, D., Stephens, B. B., & Fisher, J. B. (2015). Effect of increasing CO<sub>2</sub> on the terrestrial carbon cycle. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 112(2), 436–441. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1407302112

Sellers, P. J., Randall, D. A., Collatz, G. J., Berry, J. A., Field, C. B., Dazlich, D. A., ... Bounoua, L. (1996). A revised land surface parameterization (SiB2) for atmospheric GCMs. 1. Model formulation. *Journal of* 

*Climate*, 9( 4), 676– 705. https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0442(1996)009<0676:ARLSPF>2.0.CO;2

Sitch, S., Huntingford, C., Gedney, N., Levy, P. E., Lomas, M., Piao, S. L., ... Woodward, F. I. (2008). Evaluation of the terrestrial carbon cycle, future plant geography and climate-carbon cycle feedbacks using five Dynamic Global Vegetation Models (DGVMs). *Global Change Biology*, 14(9), 2015–2039. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01626.x

Smith, B., Warlind, D., Arneth, A., Hickler, T., Leadley, P., Siltberg, J., & Zaehle, S. (2014). Implications of incorporating N cycling and N limitations on primary production in an individual-based dynamic vegetation model. *Biogeosciences*, 11(7), 2027–2054. https://doi.org/10.5194/bg-11-2027-2014

Smith, W. K., Reed, S. C., Cleveland, C. C., Ballantyne, A. P., Anderegg, W. R. L., Wieder, W. R., ... Running, S. W. (2016). Large divergence of satellite and earth system model estimates of global terrestrial  $CO_2$  fertilization. *Nature Climate Change*, 6(3), 306–310.

Swann, A. L. S., Hoffman, F. M., Koven, C. D., & Randerson, J. T. (2016). Plant responses to increasing  $CO_2$  reduce estimates of climate impacts on drought severity. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of* 

*America*, 113( 36), 10,019– 10,024. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.160458111 3

Thornton, P. E., Lamarque, J. F., Rosenbloom, N. A., & Mahowald, N. M. (2007). Influence of carbon-nitrogen cycle coupling on land model response to CO<sub>2</sub> fertilization and climate variability. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, 21, GB4028. https://doi.org/10.1029/2006GB002868

van der Sleen, P., Groenendijk, P., Vlam, M., Anten, N. P. R., Boom, A., Bongers, F., ... Zuidema, P. A. (2015). No growth stimulation of tropical trees by 150 years of  $CO_2$  fertilization but water-use efficiency increased. *Nature Geoscience*, 8(1), 24–28.

Wang, Q., Tenhunen, J., Falge, E., Bernhofer, C., Granier, A., & Vesala, T. (2004). Simulation and scaling of temporal variation in gross primary production for coniferous and deciduous temperate forests. *Global Change Biology*, 10(1), 37–51. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2003.00716.x

Wieder, W. R., Cleveland, C. C., Smith, W. K., & Todd-Brown, K. (2015). Future productivity and carbon storage limited by terrestrial nutrient availability. *Nature* 

Geoscience, 8( 6), 441- 444. https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo2413

Wolter, K., & Timlin, M. S. (2011). El Niño/Southern Oscillation behaviour since 1871 as diagnosed in an extended multivariate ENSO index

(MEI.ext). International Journal of Climatology, 31(7), 1074–1087. https://doi.org/10.1002/joc.2336

Xia, J. Y., Niu, S., Ciais, P., Janssens, I. A., Chen, J., Ammann, C., ... Luo, Y. (2015). Joint control of terrestrial gross primary productivity by plant phenology and physiology. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of* 

*America*, 112(9), 2788–2793. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1413090112

Yue, X., Unger, N., & Zheng, Y. (2015). Distinguishing the drivers of trends in land carbon fluxes and plant volatile emissions over the past 3 decades. *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics*, 15( 20), 11,931–11,948. https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-15-11931-2015

Zaehle, S., Jones, C. D., Houlton, B., Lamarque, J. F., & Robertson,

E. (2015). Nitrogen availability reduces CMIP5 projections of twenty-firstcentury land carbon uptake. *Journal of* 

*Climate*, 28( 6), 2494–2511. https://doi.org/10.1175/JCLI-D-13-00776.1

Zeng, Z. Z., Piao, S. L., Lin, X., Yin, G. D., Peng, S. S., Ciais, P., & Myneni, R. B. (2012). Global evapotranspiration over the past three decades: Estimation based on the water balance equation combined with empirical models. *Environmental Research Letters*, 7(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1748-9326/7/1/014026

Zhang, Q., Wang, Y. P., Matear, R. J., Pitman, A. J., & Dai, Y. J. (2014). Nitrogen and phosphorous limitations significantly reduce future allowable CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 41(2), 632–637. https://doi.org/10.1002/2013GL058352

Zhang, S., & Liu, L. Y. (2014). The potential of the MERIS terrestrial chlorophyll Index for crop yield prediction. *Remote Sensing Letters*, 5(8), 733–742. https://doi.org/10.1080/2150704X.2014.963734

Zhang, X., Davidson, E. A., Mauzerall, D. L., Searchinger, T. D., Dumas, P., & Shen, Y. (2015). Managing nitrogen for sustainable development. *Nature*, 528( 7580), 51– 59. https://doi.org/10.1038/nature157 43

Zhang, Y. Q., Peña-Arancibia, J. L., McVicar, T. R., Chiew, F. H., Vaze, J., Liu, C., ... Wang, Y. (2016). Multi-decadal trends in global terrestrial evapotranspiration and its components. *Scientific Reports*, 6(1), 6. https://doi.org/10.1038/srep19124