

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

The Shoshoni-Crow Sun Dance. By Fred W. Voget.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2z39h3d7>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 9(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Clemmer, Richard O.

**Publication Date**

1985-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

In conclusion, despite some discrepancies and limitations, McLoughlin's work makes a valuable contribution not only to "Indian" history but to understanding American political history during the first six decades of the nineteenth century. It is well written and full of interesting characters and events. It would not be surprising to see this work become a standard reference for Cherokee history in the years to come.

*Michael J. Mullin*

University of California, Santa Barbara

**The Shoshoni-Crow Sun Dance.** By Fred W. Voget. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press. 347 pp. \$19.95 Cloth.

Illustrated with the author's photographs, this well-written account discusses much more than the modern Crow Sun Dance and its diffusion from the Wind River Shoshoni. Voget's association with the Crow spans the years 1939-1975. Thus, the book represents the results of a longitudinal study of nearly 40 years. Although cast in an ethnohistorical framework, the book is not merely an ethnographic history; it also constitutes an important statement on the origins of religion and the role of individuals in cultural change.

The book's central questions are: What is the modern Crow Sun Dance, how did it get that way, and why does it persist? In order to elucidate these questions, the author proceeds first to a short history of the Crow people, then to an excellent synopsis of traditional Crow culture based on salvage ethnographies of the pre-1930 period, punctuating the discussion with anecdotes from Frank Linderman's (1930) biography of Plenty Coups, from Robert Lowie's many articles and monographs, and from other works. Clans, kinship, medicine lodges and warrior sodalities, reciprocal obligations, chieftainship, residence patterns, prestige indicators, and the complexities of social life and its political and legal parameters are all covered succinctly and authoritatively. An entire chapter is devoted to the traditional Crow Sun Dance, which was abandoned in 1875, and to the symbolism and mythology concerning it. Another two chapters cover the Crow cultural innovators, who disseminated the Sun

Dance—William Big Day, Robert Yellowtail, Barney Old Coyote, and Joseph Hill—and Shoshoni John Truhajo, the “cultural broker” who introduced the Sun Dance to the Crow in 1941.

These personal portraits are followed by a description and interpretation of the modern Crow Sun Dance and its symbolism and a concluding chapter. This concluding chapter seems to have two purposes: 1) to recapitulate the data base substantiating a cultural-historical explanation of the modern Crow Sun Dance; and, 2) to connect many of the personal factors presented in the chapters on individuals to the general attributes of Crow culture summarized in the second, third, and sixth chapters within the context of the history and evolution of reservation life. This concluding chapter is not a theoretical capstone brimming with explanation; rather, its effect is to affirm that contemporary Crow culture has continued to evolve separately from Euro-American culture, despite being profoundly influenced by it.

Although buried on pages 140–141, the central assumption of the book, which seems to have provided the primary motivation for assembling most of the narrative, is that native religion is both a “proving ground for retention of an Indian identity versus change to an identity molded by the alien white man” and “a base for reorganizing and reaffirming a sense of cultural identity.” Thus *The Shoshoni-Crow Sun Dance* constitutes a two-fold argument for the power of ideology as a driving force in culture history, and for admitting the impact which specific individuals may have in molding the culture of a whole people.

Pursuit of this argument—however subtly it may have been stated—has led Voget into two basic lines of inquiry: 1) What factors led William Big Day, a Crow, to espouse the Shoshoni Sun Dance and promote its performance among the Crow? and, 2) What factors led to the Crows’ adoption and institutionalization of the Sun Dance? To the first question, Voget posits an eloquent and well-supported assertion (p. 134): “For their timely appearance, cultural situations have a way of drawing together the strands of a career that appears to drift between dream and reality.” Thus, the explanation for William Big Day’s adoption of the Sun Dance is pragmatic and multicausal, but ultimately psychological. The explanation for many Crows’ acceptance of the Sun Dance as a legitimate and effective religion is the same as that for their acceptance of Peyote and of fundamentalist Christianity,

and also rests in the realm of pragmatic psychology (pp. 277-278): "The Crow approach opened the way to the use of any instrument, Christian or tribal, that promised success, especially when it was validated by a dream." This psychological functionalism is also evident when we learn (p. 140) that psychologist B. F. Skinner's "behavior modification" model, in which the individual adapts to circumstances by choosing behavior that elicits a favorable response from the environment, constitutes the primary framework for explaining a Crow's espousal of the Shoshoni Sun Dance.

Voget has long been concerned with the position of the individual in culture. However, his approach in *The Shoshoni-Crow Sun Dance* seems to represent a change in Voget's thinking, and this change may be of interest to psychological anthropologists. In one of his earlier attempts to make sense of the intracultural diversity within Native American societies (*American Anthropologist* 1951, pp. 230-231), Voget generated a model of differential acculturation that assumed an initial classification of individuals into various acculturative categories such as "Native-modified," "American-marginal," etc.

In this latest work, however, Voget has evidently abandoned the acculturative framework as an explanatory model, replacing it with a culture-historical framework, within which the individual modifies his or her behavior in accordance with rewards or sanctions provided by the cultural context and the march of events. Voget explicitly rejects the idea that an individual's early experiences necessarily condition cultural choices later in life (p. 140), pointing out that individuals' decisions to disseminate the Shoshoni Sun Dance among the Crow could not have been predicted, for example, on the basis of those individuals' previous exposure to Christianity, Peyotism, or other religions.

Voget's approach contrasts with Joseph Jorgensen's approach in *The Sun Dance Religion* (1972). Jorgensen cites the psychological effect of individuals' participation in the Sun Dance as only one of four factors contributing to adoption and maintenance of the Sun Dance. One important factor, avers Jorgensen, is the sheer beauty, vitality, drama, and brilliance of the Sun Dance ritual itself. Jorgensen does not, however, dwell on this factor either. By far, the bulk of Jorgensen's study is devoted to a political-economic history of the four reservations under study in pursuit of establishing the fact that it is *more* than just in-

dividual psychological factors and aesthetic beauty that is responsible for the existence of the Sun Dance. Rather, the political-economic machinery of the reservation situation and the absolute poverty and feelings of deprivation resulting from its operation are equal in importance to the aesthetic and ideological components of the religious experience.

Certainly it cannot be assumed that all Indians have had parallel experiences in the reservation period. Nonetheless, it is curious that Voget neither reviews Jorgensen's explanatory framework nor even hints at conditions approximating a neo-colonial context. Although Voget cites studies linking the institutionalization of particular religions with relative deprivation among other American Indian groups, he does not adopt an explanatory framework that utilizes the concept, and instead, stresses the role of prophets who used dreams and revelations to reorganize and reaffirm a sense of cultural continuity among their people.

Voget's approach and data are not irreconcilable with an approach that posits a model of relative deprivation based on political-economic history. Nor can an author be expected to say all that can be said about a subject in just one volume. But Jorgensen and Voget differ so widely in what they seem to regard as important for explaining the Sun Dance that a reader might well ask: Does a discussion of the psychology of individuals and of culture history constitute an adequate explanation of culture change? Or would the purposes of cross-cultural comparison be better served by searching also for evidence of a neocolonial reservation context and examining the Sun Dance as a variable of the degree to which that context of relative deprivation can be documented?

Aside from methodological considerations, Voget's focus on particular individuals results in many revelations concomitant to the story of the Crow Sun Dance. For example, the importance of years-long rivalries between religious leaders is revealed at Wind River as well as at Crow, and a good sketch of political maneuverings within Crow society in a transition period is provided. Moreover, it is clear that, unlike the Ute Sun Dances, for example, the Crow Sun Dance is not so much a tribal event as it is a religious ceremony sponsored by individuals from a particular district, under the guidance of a specific religious leader. While leaving the economic and structural coordinates of Crow

life to others, Voget has written an impressive narrative that elucidates much of Crow history and provides rare revelations of the unique pace and configuration of reservation life. *The Shoshoni-Crow Sun Dance* is an important contribution toward an appreciation of the historical, cultural, and personal dimensions of cultural diffusion, cultural innovation, cultural change, and the origins of religion.

Richard O. Clemmer  
University of Denver

**Native People in Canada: Contemporary Conflicts.** By James S. Frideres. Scarborough: Prentice-Hall Canada Inc., 1983. viii + 344 pp. \$11.95 Paper.

**Home and Native Land: Aboriginal Rights and the Canadian Constitution.** By Michael Asch. Toronto: Methuen, 1984. vii + 156 pp. \$14.95 Paper.

Professor Frideres has done all interested in the Native peoples a great service by enlarging the second edition of his popular *Native People in Canada*, especially by including a section on the Métis. However, it is regrettable that he did not seize the opportunity to revise substantially the first three chapters dealing largely with the historical background and settings. Much recent scholarship in the field could have been incorporated. Similarly Olmsted's chapter on the Métis is somewhat disappointing because it incorporates none of the recent scholarship in that domain.

Historians will always deplore the paucity of historical perspective when social scientists grapple with such matters as treaty revisions, land claims, demographic trends, social problems, urbanization, and native organizations. To be sure, Frideres handles the contemporary issues well but the long range nature of these issues is too often ignored. One is left with the impression, for example, that native organizations began to acquire some importance only after World War II. There is no mention of important or influential organizations in previous decades, or indeed in previous centuries. The sub-title of the study is "Contemporary Conflicts" so such an omission, however frustrating,