

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual, & Transgender Myths: From the Arapaho to the Zuni. Edited by Jim Elledge.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/2z8738q3>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 27(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Jacobs, Sue-Ellen

Publication Date

2003

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

again, creatures which are an emblem of a new ecological paradigm for many people. They stretch our vision of what respect for other cultures really entails. They put us to the test: can we create a space in the modern American super-state that genuinely values and respects the reality of another way of being in the world? This fine volume of work reflects in itself the tensions and paradoxes involved in such a project, at the level of policy and legislation; and it makes a genuine and important contribution to the literature, and to the real people that the literature represents.

Arnold Kruger

Gay, Lesbian, Bisexual, & Transgender Myths: From the Arapaho to the Zuni. Edited by Jim Elledge. New York: Peter Lang, 2002. 216 pages. \$29.95 paper.

In this investigative and documentary homage to the work of Will Roscoe, Elledge republishes a selection of thirty of the hundreds of tales cited in Roscoe's "Bibliography of Berdache and Alternative Gender Roles Among North American Indians" (*Journal of Homosexuality* 14, 3/4 (1987): 81–171) and in Roscoe's 1998 book, *Changing Ones: Third and Fourth Genders in Native North America* (St. Martin's Press). The myths are arranged in seven categories: "Origin of the World" (three tales), "Origin of the Two-Spirits" (six tales), "Men Who Become Women" (five tales), "Pregnant Men" (three tales), "Love Between Women" (two tales), "Violence and the Two-Spirits" (four tales), and "Didactic Myths" (six tales). In a ten-page introduction Elledge explains his rationale for the use of the terms "gay, lesbian, bisexual, and transgender" in the title of his book instead of the term "Two-Spirit." The latter term has been used colloquially since the early 1990s by many Native and First Nations individuals to refer to their gender identity and sexuality. He also gives examples of how some indigenous terms, purportedly predating precolonial times, have been put into writing by anthropologists, historians, and others who "collected" ethnographic and mythological stories from indigenous people willing to share aspects of their cultural beliefs with outsiders. The difficulty is that Elledge seems to take the English-language representation of indigenous terms within the myths as evidence of actual gender performance by real, rather than mythic, people. In addition, I am also concerned about lifting mythological stories (and characters) out of context of the full study without providing commentary about that context. Examples follow.

The challenge for this review was to locate a sampling of the original sources in order to check the veracity of Elledge's categorization of the myths and to recontextualize the samples. I began with the two examples from Elsie Clews Parsons' *Tewa Tales* (originally published in 1926 by the American Folk-Lore Society, and republished in 1994 by the University of Arizona Press, Barbara Babcock, editor): "Warrior Girl" (placed by Elledge in his "Origin of the Two-Spirit" category) and "The Hopi Ghost Kills and Gambles" (placed in "Didactic Myths"). Both of these stories are about the Hopi-Tewa of Arizona, sufficiently different in social organization from Upper Rio Grande Tewa that

it is necessary to emphasize the matrilineal (Arizona Tewa) and patrilineal (New Mexico Tewa) structural basis in order to appreciate the fact that the “Warrior Girl” described to Parsons in the early 1920s is still part of the Hopi-Tewa myths and has no cognate in Upper Rio Grande Tewa communities. In Parsons’ retelling of the myth neither she nor the narrator make any claim that the warrior girl described was the “first” girl who was told to go fight the enemy because she preferred not to do female household chores. In fact, the girl in the story flaunts her female sexuality by raising her skirt as she engages the enemy in battle. She is so courageous and successful that she is transformed into a being wearing a special mask. The People pay her high regard during her lifetime and after her death; and her mask is retained by the Cottonwood clan people (for a recent rendition of this story, see Sue-Ellen Jacobs et al., *Two-Spirit People*, Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1997, pp. 32–35).

The second Parson story, “The Hopi Ghost Kills and Gambles,” includes reference to techniques for initiating a cacique (spiritual elder) as he prepares to take his place as both mother and father of the people, as a man who must “think like a woman and a man” (p. 158), which is one of the expected abilities of a Tewa Pueblo leader (cf. Tito Naranjo and Rina Swentzell, “Healing Spaces in the Tewa Pueblo World,” *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 13: 3&4 [1989]: 257–265). Neither of these stories is about sexuality: the former is about blending gender roles (it’s okay for a girl to be a warrior); the latter is about thinking within the paradigm of a balanced gender-dualism in order to fulfill the requirements of becoming a respected and wise spiritual leader. Both stories represent continuing Tewa values.

After looking at Parson’s stories I proceeded to investigate the original sources of some of the other stories. The Crow story, “Red-Woman and Old-Man-Coyote’s Wife,” intrigued me because it appeared to be simply a “homo-social” story about two women of power negotiating, in a simple give-and-take discussion, how to shape the world and who should occupy the various parts of it. But the reason Elledge placed this story in the “origin of the two-spirit” category is revealed well into the narrative: Old-Man-Coyote’s wife tells Red-Woman (whom Lowie assumes to be “. . . identical with Hícictawíã,” see below) that her wish to have all people be all the same will lead to “lots of trouble. We’ll give women a dress and leggings to be tied above the knees so they can’t run, and they shall not be as strong as men.’ [The narrator continues] That is why men are stronger than women. They made a mistake with some, who became half-men, since then we have had bāté (berdaches)” (p. 90—a third gender. If Lowie (who recorded this story) asked for more details, he did not supply any in his original publication from which the story is taken. However, Elledge provides us with part of Lowie’s original footnotes: “1. Doubtless meant to be identical with Hícictawíã” (Lowie, p. 70, in Elledge, p. 91). I read about Hícictawíã in Lowie so I could place this story in the larger context of Crow culture. Red-Woman or Hícictawíã is a central figure in several stories in Lowie’s *Myths and Traditions of the Crow Indians* (New York: American Museum of Natural History Anthropological Papers, vol. 25, part I, 1918). In the stories I read, with the exception of the first story where she and Coyote’s wife create all the people including the “bāté (berdaches),” she is transformed

from a benign woman into an evil old woman who seduces a young boy and binds him to her will, as she makes him build a tipi, hunt for her, and generally take care of her. She usually gets killed horrifically by brothers of the boy. There is no mention of sexuality in any of the stories about Red-Woman. The Crow word *bāté* does not appear anywhere else in the original source. Lowie's parenthetical definition "(berdaches)" is also not repeated elsewhere in the book. It would have been very helpful if Elledge had elaborated on the enigmas associated with the tale he included as evidence of creation of a gay, lesbian, bisexual, or transgender person "bāté." I believe he means for the reader to take the stories at face value: myths in which a third-gendered person (either a woman-man or a man-woman, or someone who is more than a man or woman) is created or otherwise an actor in Native North American societies, as evidence for the acceptance of (or even expectation that there will be) third-gendered people in "real" life.

My last example of contextual disarray comes from Elledge's extraction of the last two lines in the first stanza of Wheelwright's English translation of (Navajo Medicine man) Hasteen Klah's "chant of the meeting and mating of Etsan-ah-tlehay, the Changing woman with Johonah-eh, the Sun" (14, "Why They Saw Each Other" in *Texts of the Navajo Creation Chants*, Peabody Museum, Harvard University, no date, no page). The translated chant reads (emphasis added, indicating the lines Elledge used as an epigram):

The earth is looking at me; it is looking up at me;
 I, I am looking down at it.
I, I am happy, he is looking at me;
I, I am happy, I am looking at him.

In Anglo or non-Native writings about Native American sexualities and genders there is often a realized temptation to selectively procure evidence of homosexual or homoerotic love. The chant chosen here is from a song that is performed to reaffirm the heterosexual union of a mythical woman, in this case Changing Woman, with a mythical male, the Sun. I read this as a living *nadleh* (an androgynous or hermaphroditic) medicine man (Hasteen Klah) singing part of the story of heterosexual creation of life—it is a love song, but the glamour of love is not between two males. "In singing this chant, Hasteen Klah is the mediator between the human world and the spiritual world. He is using this song to explain how the evolution of the earth takes place" (Wesley Thomas, personal communication, 2002).

In contrast to what I perceive to be Elledge's misunderstanding of the Navajo religious chant and the Tewa stories of cultural androgyny, thus misleading readers, other stories I checked are excellent examples of the complexities of human origin stories. For example, the Coos story collected by Frachtenberg in the early 1900s tells how two young men begat the world when one became pregnant (although the narrator suggests that this is a virgin birth by implying that they did not have sex) and delivered a girl-child from whom "all the people took their origin" (p. 4). The two "Arrow Young Men" were the creators of the world.

Jim Elledge has done a favor for those of us who love to read Native North American mythologies by bringing together the thirty tales originally identified by Will Roscoe as indicating aboriginal acknowledgment of multiple genders and sexualities. The stories rarely glorify the position of the “third” or other gendered persons (elaborate discussions of third and other gender characteristics and roles appears in Jacobs et al 1997, but in that book see especially pp. 156–173 for Wesley Thomas’ “Navajo Cultural Constructions of Gender and Sexuality” for a Navajo’s descriptions of five genders), but neither do they disparage such persons. Elledge’s selection is a balanced representation of the diverse tribal myths that deal with this topic. The implication for contemporary two-spirit (gay, lesbian, bisexual, and transgendered) Native North Americans is quite simply further validation for a customarily (albeit mostly “long ago”) acknowledged presence and importance of the talents of third and other gendered people in the oral literature of The People. As for my picky critical remarks above, especially concerning the taking of elements or whole tales out of cultural context: well, that is part of the scholarship in the social science approach to studies of two-spirit people. We want to keep the cultural context at hand when reading, or studying, or even recording mythological and empirical tales. As part of our work we need to be able to return to original sources to be certain that protocols of cultural context are met, and this includes assessing additional footnoted sources (unfortunately not included in Elledge’s bibliography).

I am very grateful for the research assistance provided by Karen Fieland, Malena Pinkham, and Erin Stanley of the HONOR Project, a National Institute of Mental Health (NIMH)-funded Two-Spirit Wellness Study at the University of Washington, School of Social Work; and to Professor Karina Walters, principal investigator of that project, for making her two-spirit research team available to me for this work.

Sue-Ellen Jacobs

University of Washington

Heart of the Rock: The Indian Invasion of Alcatraz. By Adam Fortunate Eagle and Tim Findley. University of Oklahoma Press, 2002. 215 pages. \$29.95 cloth.

The *Heart of the Rock: The Indian Invasion of Alcatraz*, by Adam Fortunate Eagle written in collaboration with Tim Findley, is another valuable firsthand account of the American Indian occupation of Alcatraz, 1969–1971. Fortunate Eagle is a master storyteller, and Findley is an outstanding writer, and as they were actual participants, this book is a must for any serious student of the Alcatraz occupation. The book is highly recommended and is an easy read. It is a welcome addition to my Alcatraz library even with the concerns I express below.

The title *The Indian Invasion of Alcatraz* itself is a misnomer, since the historical event was initially a nonviolent event. Even Adam Fortunate Eagle’s earlier book on the subject was entitled *ALCATRAZ! ALCATRAZ! The Indian*