

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

United States-Comanche Relations: The Reservation Years. By William T. Hagan.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3519b1gp>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 14(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Nason, James D.

**Publication Date**

1990-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Gladys Reichard, *Navajo Religion*, Berard Haile, *Head and Face Masks in Navajo Ceremonialism*, and Washington Mathews's account of the Night Chant. This all raises the question of the utility of the book; these particular essays offer no new research or interpretation but, instead, summarize well-known sources, often in affected prose. Perhaps the book was intended to serve as an undergraduate text. I, for one, would rather have my students read Reichard and then would expect them to offer up something like Trafzer's essay as a seminar paper.

Robert E. Wilmot, Phillip Greenfield, and James Griffin provide antidotes to these problems, however. Wilmot's essay about eastern Cherokee Booger masquerades is based on documentary sources but provides cogent and convincing interpretations without sentimentality. Griffin's essay might have ranged a little further with regard to the historical implications of Pascola masquerades and their relations (or not) to Iberian/Pre-Columbian traditions perhaps, but the descriptive analysis seems grounded in solid, firsthand research. Greenfield takes up the historical problem of Apache masquerades and does an admirable job dealing with their probable sources, but I wish he had been more definite about specific occasions of contemporary practice instead of resorting to idealizing characterizations. In general, however, all three essays will prove useful to student researchers.

The most disappointing aspect of the book is the lack of adequate illustrations. While it is possible to appreciate the line drawings of Sarah Moore and Manley Dahkoshay, which introduce each essay, they in no way substitute for photographs of actual specimens or, more to the point, photographs of masks in action. The utility of the volume would increase tenfold with a small portfolio of salient photographic illustrations. As it is, it would be difficult to justify *Gods Among Us* in a student reading list or a professional library. At best, there may be an audience for it among casual enthusiasts of American Indian culture, although they will find much of it dry reading.

*David W. Penney*

**United States-Comanche Relations: The Reservation Years.** By William T. Hagan. Norman and London: University of Oklahoma Press, 1990. 336 pages. \$13.95 Paper.

The history of Euro-American expansion into the Great Plains, with its resulting conflict with the Native American groups there, has now assumed an almost mythic quality. Our ability to comprehend the reality of that conflict and the resulting devastation to Native American life has been degraded through decades of grade B movies, hundreds of Western shoot-'em-up novels, and only the most fleeting and basic accounts in school American history texts. For all of these reasons, this work by William T. Hagan, a professor of history at the University of Oklahoma, stands out as a most valuable and necessary reality check.

When this book was first published in 1976, there were remarkably few historical studies of that short span of time in which the wholly autonomous and proud Plains societies became the militarily defeated residents of reservation plots. Regrettably, there still are all too few major historical works available that explore the transformations that occurred in both Indian and non-Indian societies as a result of this conflict, and most particularly so at the level of one tribal society's experiences.

Hagan reviews this crucial historical period by focusing his attention on the experiences of the Comanches in the period from the Treaty of Medicine Lodge in 1867 through the Dawes Act of 1887 and the Jerome Agreement of 1892. His review of the varied foreign influences and impacts on the Comanches concludes in 1906, when the Comanches and other groups were able to own land fully, as individuals. Hagan's very readable account of this post-Civil War period highlights the complexities of the local and national contexts within which policy decisions were made and implemented. The discussion takes the reader through each significant policy issue that arose in handling the "Indian problem," and acquaints us with most of the key figures in the period, including Indian agents, military officers, Indian commissioners, and others. It also offers some important insights into the actions and decisions of Comanche leaders, especially Quanah Parker, as well as other important individuals among the Kiowa and Kiowa-Apache.

In spite of its age, this book remains an important study that contributes significantly to our history and to our understanding of the reservation "process." It is, moreover, a keystone volume in the history of the Comanches, in common with other works such as the classic ethnographic study *The Comanches*, by

Ernest Wallace and E. Adamson Hoebel (1952), or that fascinating collection of early Spanish records provided by *Forgotten Frontiers*, edited by Alfred B. Thomas (1932). Unfortunately, as Hagan has pointed out in the preface to this paperback edition, what we still lack is a major Comanche history per se, one that would give voice to the still largely silent Indian perspective of these events and their twentieth-century aftermath.

*James D. Nason*  
University of Washington

**The Same As Yesterday: The Lillooet Chronicle the Theft of Their Lands and Resources.** By Joanne Drake-Terry. Lillooet, British Columbia: Lillooet Tribal Council, 1989. 341 pages.

The Lillooet People, or the Stl'atl'imx, live along the Lillooet and Fraser river valleys in the rugged mountains of southern British Columbia. Like native peoples elsewhere in Canada, the United States, and the rest of the world who have lost their ancestral lands, they are lobbying for a land claims settlement.

This book, sponsored and published by the Lillooet Tribal Council, was written as part of that lobbying effort. The subtitle—"The Lillooet Chronicle the Theft of Their Lands and Resources"—makes it clear that this is not intended to be an objective, detached, scholarly treatment of the subject. Rather it is an adversarial document, a condemnation of British Columbia's disregard for Indian rights in the past, and an impassioned plea for justice in the future.

In the introduction the author calls her book "a case study of how various governments have dispossessed generations of the Lillooet and other Indian nations of their unceded lands and resources throughout British Columbia" (p. xiv). Throughout the book, she hammers home the theme of stolen lands.

According to the Lillooets, a "conspiracy of the governments of England, Canada, and British Columbia" enabled whites to steal virtually all the land of British Columbia from its rightful native owners by 1913 (p. 253). By that year the whites had taken the "most productive and desirable parcels of land," as well as "water, fish, game, and other natural resources" from nearly