

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability. Edited by Milton M. R. Freeman et al.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/38k9805q>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 24(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Salvatierra, Delia

Publication Date

2000-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

cultural and multiracial environment. Indeed, substance abuse, violence, criminality, and the urban gang phenomenon are a fact of contemporary life for many of the Indian people of the Puget Sound basin. For an overview of an ongoing approach to preventing substance abuse, violence, gang violence, and school truancy among the Southern Coast Salish and the surrounding multi-tribal urban Indian community of southern Puget Sound, see George M. Guilmet, David L. Whited, Norm Dorpat, and Cherlyn Pijanowski's "The Safe Future Initiative at Chief Leschi Schools: A School-based Tribal Response to Alcohol-Drug Abuse, Violence-Gang Violence, and Crime on an Urban Reservation," published in the *American Indian Culture and Research Journal*, volume 22, number 4 (1998).

Indians in the Making lays out a well-reasoned and detailed argument that draws carefully on a wealth of existing archival materials and contemporary scholarship. She successfully argues that racial and ethnic categories are mutable social constructions and therefore subjects of historical inquiry. Harmon partitions the historical record into eight phases from the first encounters with fur traders and explorers to the fishing rights struggles of the 1970s. While some might wish for an account more focused on the internal identity definition process, the emphasis on external identity construction ties the various chapters of the book together in a coherent way. It introduces an important culture area to a wider readership and focuses reader interest on a crucial contemporary issue of concern for people everywhere: race and ethnic relationships, and individual and cultural identity construction. The book is particularly valuable as an overview and interpretation of the historical record between 1900 and the 1970s, a relatively overlooked period in Puget Sound Indian history. It is a very readable scholarly work that belongs in all library collections supporting interest in ethnicity, race relations, cultural identity, culture change, cultural survival, the effects of culture contact, ethnohistory, and Northwest Coast Indians.

George M. Guilmet

University of Puget Sound

Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability. Edited by Milton M. R. Freeman et al. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press, 1998. 208 pages. \$59.00 cloth; \$24.95 paper.

Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability is a volume in a series edited by Troy Johnson and Duane Champagne entitled *Contemporary Native American Communities: Stepping Stones to the Seventh Generation*. The book is a result of the 1992 Inuit Circumpolar Conference (ICC) general assembly calling upon the ICC executive board to organize a study documenting the significance of whales and whaling to Inuit in their homelands in Canada, Greenland, Russia, and the United States. The book begins with personal testimony from Inuit whalers, community elders, women, and children about how their survival as a sovereign people is inextricably moored to whale hunting. Inuit people argue that too often decisions about sustainable whaling are

made by those living in urban environments far removed from communities intimate with whales and still dependent upon the sea and land for survival. In response, Inuit people use *Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability* as their medium to refocus the dialogue from "Save the Whale" campaigns to their day-to-day subsistence needs, from political agendas to community survival, and from poor communication between them and the industrial Western world to sensitive and meaningful interchange.

Scholarship on Inuit whaling focused on Inuit participation produces several benefits for the Inuit and non-Inuit community. First, the contributing authors to *Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability* validate Inuit peoples experiences by using their personal testimony as a primary resource. This compilation of articles represents exemplary scholarship in Native studies because rather than using Inuit experiences as anecdotes to supplement the author's research, the author uses Inuit concerns expressed during field research to dictate the books content. Second, because the voices of Inuit people resonate throughout the text, the book gives them power to frame the arguments for subsistence whaling in the context of sovereignty inherent to each of the Inuit communities. This arrangement educates the non-Inuit world that to preserve Inuit sovereignty as it has existed for thousands of years, the people must continue to hunt whales to be self-sufficient and culturally unique. An Inuit from Coral Harbour, Angela Gibbons, declares, "If the right to hunt is taken away, the Inuit will die, either physically or emotionally" (p. 39). Inuit people share their special relationship to whales with the industrial Western world to help them understand why whaling is so important to the overall well-being of Inuit society.

The book provides a stage for Inuit people to demystify urban stereotypes about the Inuit way of life. One of the three most common stereotypes is the mistaken assumption that Inuit society is male dominated, leaving women disrespected in the community. However, there are numerous examples in the book showing that Inuit people speak about the importance of women in Inuit society. For example, a Nuiqsut whaling captain, Frank Long, Jr., states that "the women who stay at home with the children and the family along with the whole community are what I call 'callers of whales'" (p. 34). Ernie Frankson, a hunter from Point Hope, adds, "the whale comes to the whaling captain's wife" (p. 34-35). Long and Frankson attest to the pivotal role of women in Inuit society by describing their contribution to the community's most momentous event.

Also, certain Western industrial governments contend that if their practices are truly "traditional" then Inuit whalers do not need to sell surplus whale products, but should remain in a strictly traditional bartering system. Yet, in the previous century, European commercial whaling brought Arctic communities into a market system. This led to the development of a mixed-economy, a system that combines traditional bartering of whale products with selling and buying meat. Timofei Panangye, a whaler from Sireniki, views this criticism as a hypocritical attack: "You [governments] brought us into the market economy, and [now] you are not permitting us to sell anything. This is surprising!" (p.158) Although Inuit people continue to barter for some items, the presence of a mixed econ-

omy persists in the Arctic by non-Inuit and Inuit people.

Finally, environmentalist groups criticize Inuit whalers for using modern technology rather than their traditional tools. Despite harsh conditions in the Arctic, Inuit communities survive because of their resiliency and adaptability to changing environments. When Europeans arrived they offered Inuit whalers more effective hunting tools in exchange for the necessary survival skills they required to live in the Arctic. The improvement of whale-hunting tools continues today. In response to this attack, Inuit people contend that modern technology is a mechanical improvement and does not change the subsistent, cultural, and spiritual reasons they hunt whales. In addition, Inuit whaling practices remain traditional because they are done in a religious and communal way passed down from their ancestors, a trait distinguishing them from people living in urban environments. Through *Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability*, the editors discredit stereotypes about Inuit communities and thereby demonstrate a commitment to dialogue founded in respect and meaning rather than in ignorance.

Inuit people view conflicts over aboriginal sustainable whaling as a result of competing value systems. In 1946 fifteen countries signed the International Whaling Commission (IWC) into action as a management agency to regulate whale hunting by the commercial whaling industry. However, Inuit whalers were exempted from IWC regulations as long as they limited their consumption and distribution of whale products to local use. Inuit whalers view this mandate as an unjust restriction by the IWC because they were forced into the market economy by the commercial whaling industry. Inuit whalers depend on the sell of their surplus whale products in the local and national markets to remain economically self-sufficient. Yet a majority of the IWC members, representing their respective national governments, are strongly opposed to whaling. The member governments' adversarial stances on whaling conflicts with their responsibility under the IWC itself and various other international human rights and environmental treaties that they have pledged to uphold. Inuit people remind the IWC that it was established to manage—not sanction—aboriginal whaling.

The anti-whaling members of the IWC justify their current disregard for the convention by claiming they are not required to observe the 1946 treaty as a result of recent changes in world opinion that now, in their view, opposes the killing of whales. The authors reveal how recent environmental campaigns such as "Save the Whale"—ignorant of the importance of whales and whaling to Inuit society—impede communication between Inuit people and the IWC. As alternatives to the IWC, the book suggests that indigenous whaling communities build stronger relationships with their government's whaling management authority. In addition, the authors encourage co-management agreements among neighboring whaling communities but warn that costs impose limitations on their success. Finally, the authors propose that the ICC take a greater role in managing aboriginal whaling. Inuit and other indigenous whaling communities work diligently to help the Western world unlearn their biased assumptions about aboriginal whaling in the hopes that it will result in mutual respect for one another. As sovereign and economically self-

sustaining communities, Inuit people are determined to continue whaling despite pressure from environmentalist and anti-whaling organizations.

An issue often raised by Inuit whalers and not fully exhausted in the book is the evolution of a mixed economy among Inuit communities. Over a century ago, Europeans and Americans introduced the market economy into the Arctic through large-scale commercial whaling. Consequently, Inuit people incorporated cash sales into their traditional bartering system. Otherwise competing for necessary goods to meet day-to-day subsistence needs would have been more difficult. One of the problems facing Inuit today are attempts by whaling adversaries to ban the sale of edible whale products. Lyudmila Ainana, a Provideniyan whaler argues, "We have practiced barter for hundreds of years. [But] in our times, money has appeared.... Hence I believe that we are entitled to sell some part of the whaling product.... Otherwise how are we going to survive?" (p. 49). Robert A. Caulfield in *Greenlanders, Whales, and Whaling: Sustainability and Self-Determination in the Arctic* addresses this issue in more detail by discussing how a mixed economy has little effect on traditional Inuit culture. However, further research on this subject matter may help the IWC make more informed decisions about subsistence whaling.

Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability fills a void in the literature on contemporary indigenous whaling by telling stories from the Inuit point of view. Although this is often a goal of researchers when writing about indigenous whaling practices, very few succeed. Because of the unique scholarship offered by *Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability*, it is difficult to compare this book to other related works. In an attempt to foster the best scholarship in this field, Champagne and Johnson bring scholars such as Milton L. Freeman, Richard Caulfield, Igor I. Krupnik, and others together in this edited book because their work collectively comprises the best research on Arctic whaling.

Each author provides a list of suggested readings at the end of her or his article. For the purpose of facilitating further research, however, the following is a list of the most commonly cited works by people other than the book's contributing authors: *Arctic Wars: Animals Rights, Endangered Peoples* (1992) by Finn Lynge and *Ancient Land: Sacred Whale. The Inuit Hunt and Its Rituals* (1993) by Tom Lowenstein, "Hunting the Largest Animals: Native Whaling in the Western Arctic and SubArctic" by A. P. McCartney and "The Integrative and Cultural Role of Hunting and Subsistence in Greenland" and "Beluga Hunting in Saqqaq" by J. Dahl. *Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability* adds substantially to the literature on Arctic indigenous whaling because the authors combine valuable field research with a culturally relevant discussion on the importance of whales and whaling to these communities.

"Whaling," says Lyubo Piskunova, a Lorino Inuit, "should be developed today and preserved for the future ... otherwise we shall ... lose our identity.... So whaling is essential to the preservation of the traditional culture; if we continue to whale, dress, sew, and process [whales], we shall retain our uniqueness" (p. 41). Inuit survival in the Arctic has depended on communal whaling for thousands of years. The IWC, easily influenced by environmental lobbying groups living far from Inuit communities, has recently placed limitations on whale hunting. These restrictions threaten the political and economic self-

determination of Inuit people who still depend on whales for day-to-day survival. *Inuit, Whaling, and Sustainability* gains authority over the existing scholarship because the voices of Inuit people resonate throughout the text. Inuit people themselves shift the discussion from non-Inuit issues to Inuit concerns: the whale is their primary food staple and without it the existence of Inuit people is threatened. The people represented in this work give the IWC and industrial Western people an opportunity to engage in culturally relevant and meaningful dialogue.

Delia Salvatierra

University of California, Los Angeles

The Iroquois in the War of 1812. By Carl Benn. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1998. 272 pages. \$19.95 paper.

Carl Benn's book reminds us that the War of 1812 remains a pivotal chapter in Canadian history. Like the battle of Vimy Ridge in World War I, Canadians use the War of 1812 to illustrate their martial ability. Attempting to close "an important gap" in our understanding "of both the Iroquois and War of 1812," Benn produces an interesting work on the Grand River warriors during the war (p. 3). He does this by combining Iroquois war leader John Norton's diary with specialized studies of the war. While the result of such scholarship provides a deeper understanding of the War of 1812, it does not necessarily afford a deep analysis of the Iroquois' part in that war. This book is primarily a military history text—not an ethnohistorical analysis of the Iroquois.

Benn begins his analysis by suggesting that indigenous political and social factors drove Iroquois war decisions. This is true, but one would not know it from reading this work. While Benn discusses the differences between Pine Tree, Village, and War chiefs, he spends little time developing the internal dynamics between them at the time of the war. These chiefs and their goals remain unknown. Throughout the conflict, pro-British, pro-American, or neutralist leaders emerge and disappear at Grand River while the warriors under John Norton's direction are off fighting. The reader has no idea how these factions operated.

More importantly, tantalizing questions remain unexplored. Why, for example, were the pro-British and pro-American factions primarily composed of Mohawks? Who were the neutralist leaders and why did they dominate the communities where Mohawk residents comprised a minority of the community? The Native religious revival led by the Shawnee Tenskwatawa makes its way into the text, but there is no discussion of what separated the Nativists from their Christian neighbors, or how this revival shaped decisions regarding war or peace. As a result, the reader has no sense of the internal political and social dynamics within the various Iroquois or Algonquian communities mentioned.

Take, for example, the John Norton-William Claus struggle. Benn portrays it solely in terms of a contest between the Indian Department and British military for control over the Iroquois. This conflict, however, involved gener-