UCLA
American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title
The Indian Southwest, 1580-1830: Ethnogenesis and Reinvention. By Gary Clayton Anderson.

Permalink
https://escholarship.org/uc/item/39g9b15f

Journal
American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 25(1)

ISSN
0161-6463

Author
Jacobs, Margaret D.

Publication Date
2001

DOI
10.17953

Copyright Information
This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, availalbe at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

eScholarship.org Powered by the California Digital Library
University of California

The Indian Southwest, 1580–1830: Ethnogenesis and Reinvention. By Gary Clayton Anderson. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1999. 352 pages. $39.95 cloth.

Scholars of American Indian history have been searching for appropriate ways to study cross-cultural contact for many decades. Gary Clayton Anderson's book contributes greatly to this ongoing project through his focus on southwestern Indians as major actors in the history of the Southwest. Until fairly recently, the declension model of cultural interaction held sway in the field of American Indian history. Europeans came to the Americas, bringing with them their diseases, livestock, unfamiliar plants, guns, Bibles, and foreign-market economies. Overwhelmed by biological, political, cultural, and economic imperialism, Native societies succumbed and collapsed. A variation on the theme of declension occurred with the application of dependency theory to Indian-white interactions; Indian tribes were slowly and unevenly but inexorably drawn into bourgeois capitalist market relations. After dabbling in dependency theory, Richard White then innovated the concept of the Middle Ground, a model of cultural interaction he identified in the region of the Great Lakes, in which for a good many years, Europeans and indigenous Americans came together as equal partners in trade and warfare.

Now Anderson steps into the fray, arguing that neither declension nor dependence theory is pertinent to the history of the Southwest. Even the theory of the Middle Ground does not do justice to the dynamic cultural changes that occurred when the Spanish, and later the French and English, arrived on the scene. Instead, he emphasizes "ethnogenesis," a process in which "seemingly disorganized collections of people" came together and "reinvented themselves culturally" in order to maintain power and economic control in the wake of the Spanish *entrada* (p. 4). Anderson argues persuasively that a regional political economy existed on the Southern Plains before and after European contact. Indians did not become integrated into European markets; rather Europeans were incorporated into the Native economy with its precapitalist values and moral principles of exchange. By constantly reinventing themselves to take advantage of shifting economic realities, Indians of the Southwest avoided dependency for over 250 years, according to Anderson.

Although Anderson's subtitle suggests that he is covering all the Southwest, his focus is on the southern plains of present-day Texas. Countering those many scholars who have emphasized Spanish dominance and control in the region through the *encomienda* system and missionization, Anderson argues that Native Americans maintained their independence within and even dominance over the region because of ethnogenesis and cultural reinvention. For example, at the time of the *entrada,* Anderson claims, the most well-known tribe on the Southern Plains was the Jumanos, which had a diversified economy of irrigated agriculture, buffalo hunting, and trade. When the Spanish interfered with their trade with the "saline pueblos" of central New Mexico, the Jumanos simply shifted the focus of their trade to a new location: La Junta on the Rio Grande in present-day west Texas. Disgruntled missionized Indians fled there from the Spanish missions and joined the

Jumanos, inventing a new and reinvigorated tribe. Yet drought and incessant raids weakened the Jumanos and by the 1680s they had become more transient and fragmented. But this did not spell defeat; instead a new ethnic group, led by a man the Spanish called Juan Sabeata, formed out of the remains of the Jumanos.

Anderson's analysis leads him to reevaluate the effectiveness of Spanish missions in Texas. Rather than seeing them as institutions where the Spanish held sway, he sees them as way stations where Indians temporarily sought refuge in times of drought, increased warfare, social breakdown, and changing economies. Very few missions actually converted any Indians and many mature missions often declined when they could find no new Indian labor conscripts to sustain them. By Anderson's account, Indians seemed to come and go at will. Padres had to provide gifts and proof of plentiful crops to lure Indians, but Indians wandered away when the padres failed to deliver their promises. Anderson challenges earlier theories about the Texas missions, arguing that they did not reach the "levels of idyllic prosperity" that Boltonists have suggested. And though missions were repressive, Anderson asserts, Native peoples "maintained considerable control over daily life" within them (p. 77).

Another useful part of Anderson's analysis is his reappraisal of the Apaches, who have so often been portrayed both popularly and academically as cruel and brutal raiders. Anderson asserts that before the Spanish *entrada,* Apaches traded peacefully with the Pueblos, exchanging buffalo meat for corn, blankets, and pottery. The arrival of the Spanish, especially with their *encomienda* system, disrupted the regional economy. To adapt to the changing conditions, the Southern Apaches transformed themselves from buffalo hunters into poachers and raiders. In the process they revived the Native Southwest economy and at the same time stifled European development of the area.

Anderson asks why Spanish colonization floundered in its northern provinces. Other scholars have theorized that the Spanish suffered from administrative malaise and political corruption or only viewed the borderlands as a defensive colony, not a permanent settlement. Anderson argues that first and foremost we must consider the power of Native Americans, especially in their ability to control local economic production. Anderson asserts in his epilogue that it was the coming of American entrepreneurs that dealt a fatal blow to Native control of the Southern Plains economy. As they first did with the eastern Caddos, Americans replaced the Indian system of exchange and reciprocity with a mercantilist orientation. Unfortunately, Anderson does not explain why Native peoples were unable to maintain their control once the Americans arrived on the scene. But he admirably proves in the rest of his book that "it must be remembered that American Indians were prominent actors in the history of the Southern Plains even after the Spanish and French arrived. While declension surely came to all these societies, . . . one after another underwent ethnogenesis and reinvented themselves" (p. 265).

Anderson's book also addresses changing gender relations within the fluid tribes on the Southern Plains. However, his discussion here could be bet-

ter informed by current work on the subject of Native American women and gender. For example, when covering two particular tribes—the Karankawas and the Coahuiltecans—Anderson asserts that both practiced female infanticide, a statement based on Spanish documentation. Yet Anderson fails to analyze why each tribe engaged in this practice, except to say that it was a "technique of population control" (p. 40). Furthermore, given that both the Karankawas and Coahuiltecans suffered from a lack of adult women and a precipitous decline in population in the 1700s, it is mysterious that they would have continued to practice this form of population control. Anderson might have benefited from immersion in Native American women's history to puzzle out why tribes would have persisted in carrying out a practice that so clearly disadvantaged them.

Anderson sometimes makes undocumented and under-theorized statements regarding gender, such as "Since the Hasinai [the westernmost Caddos] historically had placed more emphasis on hunting and gathering, the male-controlled 'village' method of production evolved initially, producing a strong male-dominated political structure" (pp. 43–44). Anderson seems to take for granted that a hunter-gatherer society would naturally evolve toward a male-dominated political structure. The work of Carol Devens on the Montagnais and the volume edited by Laura Klein and Lillian Ackerman on women and power in Native North America complicate Anderson's assumptions about gender in tribal communities that relied on hunting and gathering. Overall, Anderson's book would have been improved through greater engagement with current debates in the growing body of literature on Native American women and gender in the United States, Canada, and Mexico.

Despite my critique of Anderson's analysis of gender, I still highly recommend his book with one caveat. It is a densely packed book that will prove difficult for undergraduate readers. For graduate students and scholars of American Indian history, Anderson's breadth of information and theoretical sophistication will be well worth the difficulty of his text. His concept of shifting tribal identities and their role in shaping economic and political relations between Native Americans and Europeans will undoubtedly influence scholars of indigenous history in other parts of North America.

Margaret D. Jacobs
New Mexico State University

Inigo of Rancho Polsomi: The Life and Times of a Mission Indian. By Laurence H. Shoup and Randall T. Milliken. Novato, CA: Ballena Press, 1999. 182 pages. $29.95 cloth; $19.95 paper.

For anyone familiar with the region just south of San Francisco, it is hard to believe that at one time this densely populated area was ever lush, open space. But for thousands of years, the area was vast and rich enough to sustain the lives and culture of the Ohlone people who made it their home. Even after one hundred years of Spanish encroachment on Ohlone land, there was still