

# UCLA

## UCLA Historical Journal

### Title

I. S. Robinson, *The Papacy 1073-1198: Continuity and Innovation*, Cambridge Medieval Textbooks, Cambridge University Press, 1990. xvi, 555 pp.

### Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3bb245dj>

### Journal

UCLA Historical Journal, 10(0)

### Author

Diehl, Peter D.

### Publication Date

1990

### Copyright Information

Copyright 1990 by the author(s). All rights reserved unless otherwise indicated. Contact the author(s) for any necessary permissions. Learn more at <https://escholarship.org/terms>

Peer reviewed

## BOOK REVIEWS

I. S. Robinson, *The Papacy 1073-1198: Continuity and Innovation*, Cambridge Medieval Textbooks, Cambridge University Press, 1990. xvi, 555 pp.

This fine book meets an important need in medieval historiography in English and makes a distinguished addition to the Cambridge Medieval Textbooks. Like other books in this series, it provides not an elementary introduction but rather a thorough treatment and a perceptive assessment of the state of scholarship on its subject. Its audience will undoubtedly consist primarily of graduate students and established scholars working the ecclesiastical and institutional history of the eleventh and twelfth centuries, but given the central role of the papacy in medieval life, people in other areas of medieval studies and the history of religion will also find it rewarding. Until now, English-language scholarship has lacked a work of this sort. One has had to rely on short and unsatisfactory surveys of the papacy during the entire Middle Ages, on general histories of the medieval Church, or else on highly specialized monographs and articles which cover some but not all aspects of the medieval papacy. Scholarship in other languages makes good this lack in English, but even those with a thorough knowledge of German, French, and Italian research on the papacy will find fresh interpretations here. Robinson has an exemplary command of the relevant scholarship; the guide through the labyrinth of German work on the papacy and the medieval Empire which his footnotes provide would alone be worth the price of the book. But it offers much more, providing an

analysis of the papacy's evolution in a crucial period of the institution's history.

Robinson divides the book into two main sections. The first of these, "The Papal Government," discusses the institutional structure of the papacy in seven chapters which cover the secular lordship of the popes in Rome and central Italy, the college of cardinals, papal councils, legates, papal justice and litigation, relations with bishops and the religious orders, and papal finances. These chapters provide a coherent picture of the institutional underpinnings of the papacy and its role in ecclesiastical governance. The lengthy chapter on the college of cardinals (pp. 33-120) provides a particularly valuable discussion of the multitude of roles played by the cardinals in this period. These seven chapters convey both the increasing centralization of ecclesiastical authority in the papacy and the considerable power still exercised by local figures.

The second main section, "The Papacy and the Secular Powers," treats the role of the papacy in the secular politics of the period. The first of the four chapters in this section describes the political theories of the popes beginning with Gregory VII. The next chapter depicts the papal role in the genesis of the crusade movement and the efforts of later popes to control later crusades and the crusader states. Both of these chapters provide useful sketches, though the latter might have profited from recent scholarship on Christian-Muslim relations in Spain. The final two chapters concern the complicated relations between the papacy and its two most troublesome neighbors, the Norman principalities of southern Italy (unified as a kingdom in the early twelfth century) and the German emperors, who as Kings of Italy wielded extensive powers and pressed even more extensive claims in northern and central Italy. Rome and the papal domains in central Italy lay between these two powers, and much of the papal history of the period revolved around protecting these lands and often the pope himself from the Emperor or the Norman princes. These chapters, and particularly the immense final chapter, "Papacy and Empire" (pp. 398-524), furnish balanced, masterly narratives of the papal role in the power politics of the Italian peninsula from the beginnings of the Investiture Controversy through the imperial conquest of the Kingdom of Sicily in the 1190s. The present reviewer knows of no other work which covers this subject as judiciously in the relatively short space of about 150 pages.

One must note some shortcomings in the book. Robinson's choice of 1073 as a starting point constitutes a serious flaw in the substance of the book. The author contends (p. ix and *passim*) that the accession of Gregory VII in this year marked the beginning of a new papal reform movement, distinct from the reforms begun with imperial sponsorship in the mid-eleventh century. This contention has considerable merit; at the very least, Gregory pursued a new and radical approach to reform in his attacks on lay investiture. Nonetheless, one cannot fully understand the import of Gregory's program without some grounding in the reforms from 1046 onward. Robinson necessarily refers back to this earlier reform movement at various points, but his discussion of Gregory's impact would have benefitted from more treatment of his immediate antecedents and early career.

The other deficiencies of the book arise in connection with its role as a textbook, or more properly as a reference work for scholars and advanced students. Most notably, one must lament the lack of an annotated bibliography, a helpful feature of some other volumes in the Cambridge Medieval Textbooks. Graduate students in particular would find a description of the principal primary sources useful. The footnotes, it is true, constitute a sweeping guide to the sources and scholarly literature, but they do not lend themselves to quick searching, particularly since the index does not include secondary authors. A fuller table of contents, listing subheads within chapters as well as titles would also ease the task of finding particular subjects and references.

These minor reservations notwithstanding, this book will prove invaluable to scholars in many areas of medieval studies. Robinson's text reads well, and he explains the many scholarly controversies which surround the history of the papacy with fairness to all parties. Cambridge University Press deserves praise for offering the book in paperback at a price (\$16.95) affordable to students (also available in hardcover). All in all, Robinson has performed a valuable service to medieval scholarship and made an excellent addition to a worthy series.

Peter D. Diehl  
University of California, Los Angeles