UC San Diego
Reports and Studies

Title

Information Literacy Combined Rubric: Mapping the ACRL Framework to the AAC&U VALUE Rubric (Final Report of the Information Literacy Rubric Task Force)

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3d44c80m

Authors

Goldman, Crystal
Heskett, Karen
Turnbow, Dominique

Publication Date

2020-08-31

Copyright Information

Information Literacy Combined Rubric: Mapping the ACRL Framework to the AAC&U VALUE Rubric

Final Report of the Information Literacy Rubric Task Force
Crystal Goldman, Karen Heskett, & Dominique Turnbow
UC San Diego Library, August 2020

The University of California, San Diego is accredited by the Western Association of Schools and Colleges (WASC) Senior College and University Commission (WSCUC), and was undergoing review to reaffirm accreditation during the library's rubric project. Since the university's previous review in 2010, WSCUC has introduced information literacy as a core competency to be included in "an integrated course of study of sufficient breadth and depth to prepare…[students] for work, citizenship, and life-long learning" (WSCUC, 2013). Additionally, "for each core competency, the institution may set a specific level of performance expected at graduation and gather evidence of the achievement of that level of performance (which can be based on sampling) using the assessment methods of its choice" (WSCUC, 2013). Information literacy instruction and assessment has long been at the core of academic library services, so it made sense for the library to partner with campus to help set the standard of performance expected of undergraduate students for information literacy.

Within the same 2010-2020 timeframe, the Association of College and Research Libraries (ACRL) replaced their long-standing *Information Literacy Competency Standards for Higher Education* (2000) with the *Framework for Information Literacy for Higher Education* (2016). However, the WSCUC's 2013 handbook mentions the use of Association of Colleges & Universities (AAC&U) VALUE rubrics, and the *Information Literacy VALUE Rubric* (n.d.) is based on the now-outdated ACRL Standards. Therefore, UC San Diego librarians needed to find a way to align the new accreditation core competencies with their new professional standards. To do so, a library task force combined the two documents by mapping the ACRL Framework onto the existing structure of the AAC&U rubric. However, there were several aspects of the ACRL Framework that did not directly relate to the AAC&U rubric, so the task force made two significant additions: 1) when the knowledge practices or dispositions described in the ACRL Framework were more basic or foundational than the "Benchmark" (i.e., scoring a 1) category on the rubric, the task force included the additional column of "Foundation" (i.e., scoring a 0) to indicate that without this fundamental knowledge, a learner would have difficulty reaching the "Benchmark," and 2) when the knowledge practices or dispositions described in the ACRL Framework did not fit into the pre-existing rubric rows (i.e., labelled with the ACRL Standards), the task force found that adding the row "Understand How Information is Organized" would encapsulate the remaining, uncategorized knowledge practices and dispositions of the ACRL Framework.

The UC San Diego Library's ultimate goal for this combined rubric is to provide the foundation for creating an in-house online database that instruction librarians can use to create appropriate information literacy learning outcomes for their workshops or courses, paving the way for designing deep learning and creating appropriate formative and summative assessments.

References
American Association of Colleges & Universities. (n.d.). *Information literacy VALUE rubric*. https://www.aacu.org/value/rubrics/information-literacy
American Library Association Institutional Repository. (2000). *Information literacy competency standards for higher education*. https://alair.ala.org/handle/11213/7668
Association of College & Research Libraries. (2016). *Framework for information literacy for higher education*. http://www.ala.org/acrl/standards/ilframework
Western Association of Colleges and Schools Senior College and University Commission. (2013). *Handbook of accreditation 2013 revised*.
    https://www.wscuc.org/resources/handbook-accreditation-2013

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

Legend

AAC&U Rubric Description	Research as Inquiry
Authority is Constructed and Contextual	Scholarship as Conversation
Information Creation as Process	Searching as Strategic Exploration
Information Has Value	No AAC&U Rubric or ACRL Framework item

	Capstone	Milestones		Benchmark	Foundation*
	4	3	2	1	0
A. Determine the extent of information needed	*Effectively defines the scope of the research question or thesis. Effectively determines key concepts. Types of information (sources) selected directly relate to the concepts to answer research question.*	*Defines the scope of the research question or thesis completely. Can determine key concepts. Types of information (sources) selected relate to concepts or answer research question.*	*Defines the scope of the research question or thesis incompletely (parts are missing, remains too broad or too narrow, etc.) Can determine key concepts. Types of information (sources) selected partially relate to concepts to answer research question.*	*Has difficulty defining the scope of the research question or thesis. Has difficulty determining key concepts. Types of information (sources) selected do not relate to concepts or answer research question.*	
	Match information needs and search strategies to appropriate search tools.	Deal with complex research by breaking complex questions into simple ones, limiting the scope of investigations.	Determine an appropriate scope of investigation.	Assess the fit between an information product's creation process and a particular information need.	
	Design and refine needs and search strategies as necessary, based on search results.	Identify interested parties, such as scholars, organizations, governments, and industries who might produce information about a topic.	Determine the initial scope of the task required to meet their information needs.		

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

	Capstone 4	Milestones 3	Milestones 2	Benchmark 1	Foundation* 0
B. Access the needed information	*Accesses information using effective well-designed search strategies and most appropriate information sources.*	*Accesses information using variety of search strategies and some relevant information sources. Demonstrates ability to refine search.*	*Accesses information using simple search strategies, retrieves information from limited and similar sources.*	*Accesses information randomly, retrieves information that lacks relevance and quality.*	Acknowledge they are developing their own authoritative voices in a particular area and recognize the responsibilities this entails, including seeking accuracy and reliability, respecting intellectual property, and participating in communities of practice.
	Match information needs and search strategies to appropriate search tools.	Use various research methods, based on need, circumstance, and type of inquiry.		Recognize issues of access or lack of access to information sources.	
	Design and refine needs and search strategies as necessary, based on search results.	Determine how to access information.			
		Utilize divergent (e.g. brainstorming) and convergent (e.g. selecting the best source) thinking when searching.			
		Use different types of searching language (e.g. controlled vocabulary, keywords, natural language) appropriately.			
C. Evaluate Information and its Sources Critically	*Chooses a variety of information sources appropriate to the scope and disciple of the research question. Selects sources after considering the importance (to the researched topic) of the multiple criteria used (such as relevance to the research question,*	*Chooses a variety of information sources appropriate to the scope and discipline of the research question. Selects sources using multiple criteria (such as relevance to the research question, currency, and authority).*	*Chooses a variety of information sources. Selects sources using basic criteria (such as relevance to the research question and currency).*	*Chooses a few information sources. Selects sources using limited criteria (such as relevance to the research question).*	Understand that many disciplines have Acknowledged authorities in the sense of well-known scholars and publications that are widely considered "standard," and yet, even in those situations, some scholars would

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

	Capstone 4	Milestones 3	Milestones 2	Benchmark 1	Foundation* 0
	currency, authority, audience, and bias or point of view).				challenge the authority of those sources.
	Monitor the value that is placed upon different types of information products in varying contexts.	Use research tools and indicators of authority to determine the credibility of sources, understanding the elements that might temper this credibility.	Define different types of authority, such as subject expertise (e.g. scholarship), societal position (e.g. public office or title), or special experience (e.g. participating in an historic event).	Recognize that information may be perceived differently based on the format in which it is packaged.	Acknowledge they are developing their own authoritative voices in a particular area and recognize the responsibilities this entails, including seeking accuracy and reliability, respecting intellectual property, and participating in communities of practice.
		Articulate the traditional and emerging processes of information creation and dissemination in a particular discipline.	Articulate the capabilities and constraints of information developed through various creation processes.	Assess the fit between an information product's creation process and a particular information need.	
	Decide where and how their information is published.	Understand how the commodification of their personal information and online interactions affects the information they receive and information they produce or disseminate online.	Monitor gathered information and assess for gaps or weaknesses.		
		Make informed choices regarding their online actions in full awareness of issues	Recognize that a given scholarly work may not represent the only or even the majority		

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

	Capstone	Milestones		Benchmark	Foundation*
	4	3	2	1	0
	Synthesize ideas gathered from multiple sources.	related to privacy and the commodification of personal information.	perspective on the issue.		
	Draw reasonable conclusions based on the analysis and interpretation of information.	Formulate questions for research based on information gaps or on reexamination of existing, possibly conflicting, information			
	Critically evaluate contributions made by others in participatory information environments.	Identify the contribution that particular articles, books, and other scholarly pieces make to disciplinary knowledge.			
D. Use Information Effectively to Accomplish a Specific Purpose	*Communicates, organizes and synthesizes information from sources to fully achieve a specific purpose, with clarity and depth.*	*Communicates, organizes and synthesizes information from sources. Intended purpose is achieved.*	*Communicates, organizes and synthesizes information from sources. The information is not yet synthesized, so the intended purpose is not fully achieved.*	*Communicates information from sources. The information is fragmented and/or used inappropriately (misquoted, taken out of context, or incorrectly paraphrased, etc.) so the intended purpose is not achieved.*	
	Decide where and how their information is published.	Develop, in their own creation processes, an understanding that their choices impact the purposes for which the information product will be used and the message it conveys			
	Transfer knowledge of capabilities and constraints to new	Formulate questions for research based on information gaps or on reexamination of			

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

	Capstone	Milestones		Benchmark	Foundation*
	4	3	2	1	0
	types of information products.	existing, possibly conflicting, information.			
	Draw reasonable conclusions based on the analysis and interpretation of information.	Identify barriers to entering scholarly conversation via various venues.			
	Contribute to scholarly conversation at an appropriate level, such as local online community, guided discussion, undergraduate research journal, conference presentation/poster session.				
	Summarize the changes in scholarly perspective over time on a particular topic within a specific discipline.				
E. Access and Use Information Ethically and Legally	*Students use correctly all of the following information use strategies (use of citations and references; choice of paraphrasing, summary, or quoting; using information in ways that are true to original context; distinguishing between common knowledge and ideas requiring attribution) and*	*Students use correctly three of the following information use strategies (use of citations and references; choice of paraphrasing, summary, or quoting; using information in ways that are true to original context; distinguishing between common knowledge and ideas requiring attribution) and*	*Students use correctly two of the following information use strategies (use of citations and references; choice of paraphrasing, summary, or quoting; using information in ways that are true to original context; distinguishing between common knowledge and ideas requiring attribution) and*	*Students use correctly one of the following information use strategies (use of citations and references; choice of paraphrasing, summary, or quoting; using information in ways that are true to original context; distinguishing between common knowledge and ideas requiring attribution) and*	Acknowledge they are developing their own authoritative voices in a particular area and recognize the responsibilities this entails, including seeking accuracy and reliability, respecting intellectual property, and participating in

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

	Capstone 4	Milestones 3	Milestones 2	Benchmark 1	Foundation* 0
	demonstrate a full understanding of the ethical and legal restrictions on the use of published, confidential, and/or proprietary information.	*demonstrate a full understanding of the ethical and legal restrictions on the use of published, confidential, and/or proprietary information.*	*demonstrate a full understanding of the ethical and legal restrictions on the use of published, confidential, and/or proprietary information.*	*demonstrate a full understanding of the ethical and legal restrictions on the use of published, confidential, and/or proprietary information.*	communities of practice.
	Articulate the purpose and distinguishing characteristics of copyright, fair use, open access, and the public domain.			Understand that intellectual property is a legal and social construct that varies by culture.	
				Recognize issues of access of lack of access to information sources.	
	Manage searching processes and results effectively.			Give credit to the original ideas of others through proper attribution and citation.	
				Cite the contributing work of others in their own information production.	
F. Understand How Information is Organized*	Monitor the value that is placed upon different types of information products in varying contexts.	Understand how the commodification of their personal information and online interactions affects the information they receive and information they produce or disseminate online.		Recognize the implications of information formats that contain static or dynamic information.	Recognize that authoritative content may be packaged formally or informally and may include sources of all media types.

Information Literacy Combined Rubric

	Capstone	Milestones		Benchmark	Foundation*
	4	3	2	1	0
	Decide where and how their information is published.	Make informed choices regarding their online actions in full awareness of issues related to privacy and the commodification of personal.		Recognize that information may be perceived differently based on the format in which it is packaged.	Understand the increasingly social nature of the information ecosystem where authorities actively connect with one another and sources develop over time.
		Organize information in meaningful ways.			Understand how information systems (i.e. collections of recorded information) are organized in order to access relevant information.