

UC Irvine

UC Irvine Previously Published Works

Title

Understanding Disputes: The Politics of Argument

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3hn7r00z>

Journal

American Anthropologist, 100(1)

ISSN

0002-7294

Author

Maurer, Bill

Publication Date

1998-03-01

DOI

10.1525/aa.1998.100.1.208

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Peer reviewed

and biblical exegesis, could serve together as a singular baseline discipline for integrative research into black culture (pp. 3, 6).

In expounding on the above in the prologue, the author sets the tone for his argument. Because of Spencer's training in both theology and musicology, his prologue is actually a sermon he preached in 1993 to a small black Episcopal church in Greenwood, Mississippi. He addressed the circularity of the sacred, "in heaven," and the secular, "in hell," as idiosyncratic to the blues. For example, the blues singer represents the one who left the church for the profane world (jook joints) but soon physically returns or spiritually revisits the church, as evidenced in the life history of the gospel composer Thomas Dorsey and in such blues singers' expressions as "Lord have mercy" or "Oh Lord," respectively. Hence, Spencer contends that there exists a symbiotic relationship between the sacred and secular in black culture which contributes to its circularity.

Re-Searching Black Music is comprised of six chapters. Chapters 1 and 2 further develop the sacred-secular continuum of black music. Drawing from the historian Sterling Stuckey's work (*Slave Culture: Nationalist Theory and the Foundation of Black America*, Oxford University Press, 1994), Spencer argues in chapter 1 that, although enslaved Africans were forbidden to play their native drums in the New World, African rhythm was sustained through the shuffling of feet and clapping of hands in a religious circular dance called the ring shout. In addition to this African survival in the New World, the author connects the ring shout to the African folk character called the trickster, who is positioned betwixt and between the sacred and the secular in a space known as the crossroads. The cosmology of the ring shout and the theology of the crossroads are permanent fixtures in the hermeneutics of black music research.

Chapter 2, "The Religion," posits that fully comprehending black music "requires theological language to discourse about it" (p. 46). The author applies the theomusicological perspectives of chapters 1 and 2 in the discussion of black folk, popular, and classical music in chapters 3, 4, and 5. Chapter 3 explores the "liberation theology" (p. 52) and "soul theology" (p. 57) concepts as epitomized in both folk spirituals and blues. Spencer finds the latter is comprised of a synchronous duplicity, the sexual and the spiritual, that corroborate the sacred-profane (secular) dualism of the African trickster. Chapter 4 continues with the synchronous duplicity idea in the jazz image of Thelonious Monk, the rhythm and blues music of Marvin Gaye and Prince, and the rap music of 2 Live Crew, Ice T, and Hammer. Chapter 5, "Classical Muse," specifically centers on the music of William Grant Still and the

impact spiritualism had on Still's musical compositions and philosophy.

In chapter 6, "An Ethics," the author notes that what generally sets theomusicology apart from the other musicologies are its explicit concerns for such religious values as human emancipation as a kind of ethical impetus that is requisite yet a corollary of theomusicological research and comprehension (pp. 117-118). In so doing, theomusicology seeks what is termed "soul therapy," a healing mechanism that has roots in both the sacred (the church) and the secular (the blues joint), ritual places of black people where the sounds (rhythms) and meanings of black music merge with and become religion (p. 126).

Re-Searching Black Music continues to advance Spencer's earlier work in a more "integrative" way. In addition to theological and musicological approaches, the author incorporates various theoretical perspectives of ethnomusicology, folklore, cultural anthropology, literary criticism, dance ethnology, and art history in deriving his conclusion. Because of its strong argument for philosophically rethinking black music, I find this work to be a welcome addition to music and cultural criticism, and I would highly recommend *Re-Searching Black Music* as an essential text for scholars and students of black cultural studies. ■

Understanding Disputes: The Politics of Argument. Pat Caplan, ed. Oxford, England: Berg Publishers, 1995. 248 pp.

BILL MAURER

University of California, Irvine

Laura Nader's contribution to this volume opens with the observation that, before the 1960s, anthropologists took established adjudicative forums as evidence for "civilization." Informal norms of negotiation, in the absence of formal adjudication, were evidence that a society was more "primitive" than those with courts. With the profound changes brought on by new social movements in the West and decolonization in the non-West, Western lawyers and legal scholars (as well as nervous diplomats faced with a frightening new world of "natives" who were running their own affairs) emphasized the need for formal courts and "the rule of law" in the Third World as a check against "primitive" passions. At the same time, they discounted the need for such adjudicative procedures in the "civilized" West. To the contrary, the West, which had "proven" its civilization in the colonial era, no longer needed courts. Societies of gentlemanly virtues, Western nation-states could rely on the "civilized" norms of negotiation, settling disputes outside of courts. Nader's article (on international river disputes)

has profound implications for this volume. Dedicated to the work of Philip Gulliver, the book makes much of Gulliver's distinction between adjudication and negotiation, yet Nader, locating this distinction within Western discourses of civilization, casts an ironic light on this collection and the field of legal anthropology itself.

Pat Caplan has assembled ten essays by former students and colleagues of Gulliver. Sally Falk Moore's contrasts Habermas's theory of communicative interaction with Gulliver's theory of disputes as "imperfect communications." Moore argues that Habermas leaves the real world behind; his is a "philosophical scheme of morality and politics," while Gulliver's is a "limited schematic representation of common features extracted from some empirical instances" (p. 18). But that "schematic representation" resonates with the taken-for-granted philosophical scheme of liberalism, with its theories of the strategic negotiations of individual agents acting out of their own interests, and may thus share more with Habermas than Moore suggests.

The other essays are grounded in fieldwork or historical research. Of the latter, Christina Johnson's chapter on tribunals set up to hear corruption cases in London and Lagos in the 1950s is particularly noteworthy; standards of gentlemanly virtue and propriety played out in contradictory ways depending on whether the accused was a well-connected public-school man at the heart of empire or a colonial elite beginning to assert the power of a local bourgeoisie. Elizabeth Colson nicely argues that studies of disputes emphasizing "ritual" tend to overstate the case for dispute settlement as harmony producing and neglect long-standing feelings and the lack of closure of so many arguments. David Parkin's essay on meanings of love and passion among the Giriama of Kenya similarly emphasizes emotion and feeling. Other essays (Marilyn Silverman's on the construction of a "middle class" in 19th-century rural Ireland, Lionel Caplan's on disputes in Nepal, Pat Caplan's on marital disputes in Tanzania, and Aidan Southall's on the courts of death in Uganda) take insight from Gulliver's directive, recently forcefully reiterated by Starr and Collier's *History and Power in the Study of Law* (Cornell University Press, 1989), to attend to the political and economic contexts within which disputing parties come to understand the things they are fighting over and, in the process, come to constitute themselves. Stephen Gaetz's chapter on an Irish youth club beautifully illustrates the ideological work of disputes: disputing practices can lead participants to reproduce hierarchies that constrain them even as they engage in such practices to challenge these hierarchies.

The book contains a helpful introduction by Caplan, a biographical preface on Gulliver by Caplan and Silverman, and a useful bibliography of Gulliver's works. Gulliver's achievement was to direct the anthropological gaze toward informal norms, negotiations, and broader power relationships. This book demonstrates the usefulness of Gulliver's distinction between adjudication and negotiation for rich ethnography and, at the same time, points up the limits of a distinction bound, as Nader suggests, in Western discourses about the West and its others. ■

The Sámi and Their Land. The Sámi versus the Swedish Crown. A Study of the Legal Struggle for Improved Land Rights: The Taxed Mountains Case. Tom G. Svensson. Institute for Comparative Research in Human Culture Series B, 96. Oslo: Novus forlag; Instituttet for sammenlignende kulturforskning, 1997. 213 pp.

MYRDENE ANDERSON
Purdue University

The most substantial legal confrontation to date focusing on aboriginal land claims, the Taxed Mountains Case in Sweden, receives the thorough ethnohistorical and ethnographic documentation it deserves in Svensson's chronicle.

Svensson follows the case through three levels of the Swedish legal system: the District Court (verdict 1973), the Court of Appeals (verdict 1976), and the Supreme Court (verdict 1981). The Saami were not successful in any of these verdicts, but Svensson meticulously points out considerable gains when measured through the attitudes of the courts and through public awareness of the deep cultural-historical issues alongside current ethno-political ones.

Even though ethnohistory, as history, suggests an arrow of time, Svensson opts to present the three main events, their antecedents, and their consequences in a refreshingly nonlinear manner. After a preface, a prelude, and 16 plates (14 figures and two maps; one figure is also a map), the 11 chapters cover an introduction, a brief chronological account of the case, ecology and land rights, the court as an arena and the issue of ethnicity, the legal argumentation, rhetorical devices, the verdicts, the communication of ideas and knowledge, the role of the Saami Ombudsman, the aftermath, and concluding remarks. The slightly redundant organizational warp and the tight, compositional weft draw in the careful reader to share in Svensson's command of a 15-year ordeal, including its front- and backstage complexities. In addition, besides the inevitable (but minimized) bureaucratic abbreviations and a bibliography (of eight pages), there are two appendices—one excerpting the 1751 Codicil (for Saami, a