# **UC Riverside UC Riverside Previously Published Works**

# **Title**

Enhanced weathering strategies for stabilizing climate and averting ocean acidification

**Permalink** <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3hw1h419>

**Journal** Nature Climate Change, 6(4)

**ISSN** 1758-678X

## **Authors**

Taylor, Lyla L Quirk, Joe Thorley, Rachel MS [et al.](https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3hw1h419#author)

**Publication Date** 2016-04-01

### **DOI**

10.1038/nclimate2882

Peer reviewed

# 1 **Enhanced weathering strategies for stabilizing climate and averting**

### 2 **ocean acidification**

- 3 Lyla L. Taylor<sup>1</sup>, Joe Quirk<sup>1</sup>, Rachel M.S. Thorley<sup>1</sup>, Pushker A. Kharecha<sup>2,3</sup>,
- 4 James Hansen<sup>2</sup>, Andy Ridgwell<sup>4,5</sup>, Mark R. Lomas<sup>6</sup>, Steve A. Banwart<sup>7</sup>
- 5 & David J. Beerling<sup>1\*</sup>
- <sup>1</sup> Department of Animal and Plant Sciences, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK
- <sup>2</sup> Earth Institute, Columbia University, 475 Riverside Drive, New York, 10027, USA
- <sup>3</sup> 8 Goddard Institute for Space Studies, NASA, 2880 Broadway, New York, 10025, USA
- 9 <sup>4</sup> Department of Geographical Sciences, University of Bristol, Bristol BS8 1SS, UK
- <sup>5</sup> Department of Earth Sciences, University of California, Riverside CA, 92521, USA
- <sup>6</sup> Department of Mathematics, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK
- 12 <sup>7</sup> Kroto Research Institute, North Campus, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S3 7HQ, UK
- 13
- 14 \*Email d.j.beerling@sheffield.ac.uk

**Chemical breakdown of rocks, 'weathering', is an important but very slow part of the carbon cycle that ultimately leads to CO<sub>2</sub> being locked-up in carbonates on the ocean floor. Artificial acceleration of this carbon sink via distribution of pulverized silicate**  18 rocks across terrestrial landscapes may help offset anthropogenic  $CO_2$  emissions<sup>1-5</sup>. We **show that idealized enhanced weathering scenarios over less than a third of tropical land could significantly drawdown atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> and ameliorate ocean acidification by 2100. Global carbon cycle modelling6-8** 21 **driven by ensemble Representative**  22 Concentration Pathway (RCP) projections of 21<sup>st</sup> century climate change (RCP8.5, **business-as-usual; RCP4.5, medium-level mitigation**<sup>9,10</sup>, indicates that enhanced 24 weathering could lower atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> by 30-300 ppm by 2100 depending mainly on **silicate rock application rate (1 kg or 5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) and composition. At the higher application rate, end-of-century ocean acidification is reversed under RCP4.5 and reduced by about two-thirds under RCP8.5. Additionally, surface ocean aragonite saturation state, a key control on coral calcification rates, is maintained above 3.5 throughout the low latitudes, thereby helping maintain the viability of tropical coral reef ecosystems11-14** 30 **. However, we highlight major issues of cost, social acceptability, and potential unanticipated consequences that will limit utilization and emphasize the need for urgent efforts to phase down fossil fuel emissions<sup>15</sup>.** 

33 In 1992, over 170 nations agreed to limit anthropogenic  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  emissions to avoid 'dangerous'  $34$  human-made climate change<sup>16</sup>, yet massive expansion of fossil fuel extractions, including shale gas and tar sands, is allowing emissions to grow<sup>17</sup>. Avoiding dangerous climate change 36 may therefore require the controversial deployment of Carbon Dioxide Removal (CDR) schemes<sup>4,18</sup>, so called 'negative emissions' strategies whereby  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  is captured and removed 38 from the atmosphere. The Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on 39 Climate Change<sup>12</sup> and the U.S. National Research Council Report<sup>18</sup> both recognized enhanced 40 terrestrial weathering of silicate rocks as an important but poorly constrained CDR approach. 41 Currently, natural weathering of silicate and carbonate rocks consumes  $\sim 0.25$  Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup> of 42 atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>, which is ~3% of fossil fuel emissions<sup>19</sup> (~9–10 Pg C yr<sup>-1</sup>). Artificially 43 accelerating this land-based  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  sink involves the intentional application of pulverised 44 silicate rocks to vegetated landscapes to markedly enhance  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption<sup>1-5</sup>. However, 45 assessments to date have excluded primary drivers of soil mineral weathering, especially 46 terrestrial ecosystem processes and feedbacks from  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and future climate change, limiting 47 our understanding of its capacity to offset fossil fuel  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  emissions<sup>12</sup>.

48 Here we present spatially resolved analyses of enhanced weathering by terrestrial 49 ecosystems as a macro-engineering CDR option based on idealized cases for distributing 50 pulverised silicate rocks in the tropics using multi-model ensemble projections (Coupled 51 Model Intercomparison Project, CMIP5) of  $21<sup>st</sup>$  century climate change<sup>9,10</sup>. Our modelling 52 framework includes climate-plant-soil linkages important for regulating mineral weathering 53 by coupling a detailed weathering model with a dynamic global vegetation model and 54 accounting for land surface hydrology, topography and lithology<sup>6,7</sup> (Methods). We assess 55 effects of enhanced weathering on net CO<sub>2</sub> consumption and examine feedbacks on 56 atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and ocean chemistry over the next century using a suite of five CMIP5 57 general circulation model (GCM) simulations ( $1^{\circ}$ lat.  $\times 1^{\circ}$ lon.)<sup>9,10</sup> for each of two 58 Representative Concentration Pathway scenarios (RCPs): RCP8.5 (business-as-usual), and 59 RCP4.5 (medium-level stabilization of emissions); postscripts (8.5 and 4.5) denote radiative 60 forcing (W m<sup>-2</sup>) in year 2100 relative to year 1750 (Supplementary Information). 61 Assessments are undertaken for various application rates of the igneous rocks dunite (>90% 62 olivine, Mg<sub>2</sub>SiO<sub>4</sub>) (Ref. 3) and harzburgite (50–90% olivine), which are both commercially 63 mined, and basalt for which major resources exist in terrestrial large igneous provinces 64 (LIPs)<sup>20</sup> (Fig. 1). These rates fall within the range adopted in the early 1930s for rejuvenating 65 European forest soils with basalt to encourage tree growth<sup>21</sup>.

Our simulations indicate that terrestrial weathering can be markedly increased by 67 distributing pulverised silicate rocks throughout the tropics  $(30°N \text{ to } 30°S)$ , potentially 68 consuming hundreds of petagrams  $(1\times10^{15} \text{ g})$  of CO<sub>2</sub> by 2100 (Fig. 1). Ensemble median CO2 consumption by terrestrial weathering increases towards a maximum as the total rock applied increases, with olivine-rich dunite and harzburgite being about twice as effective as 71 basalt for equivalent application rates (Fig. 1a–c). We present  $CO_2$  consumption curves assuming mixing depths of 10 cm and 30 cm for each application rate; 10 cm is likely the minimum mixing depth given intense precipitation events, the distribution of macropores and bioturbation by invertebrates in tropical soils down to depths of 30–50 cm (Supplementary 75 Information). In the model,  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption by weathering increases when added rock 76 grains mix deeper in the soil, particularly at the 5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> application rate, because mineral saturation, a chemical brake on weathering, occurs more slowly in a larger soil solution 78 volume. Overall  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption patterns for a particular RCP scenario show a consistently narrow range of variation across the five ensemble GCMs (Fig. 1d–f). For a given application 80 rate, the magnitude of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption is similar for the business-as-usual (RCP8.5) and medium level mitigation (RCP4.5) scenarios (Fig.1d–f), largely because the runoff for the two scenarios is similar (Supplementary Information).

Comparing cumulative end-of-century amounts of pulverised rock added to the tropics with estimated total resources indicates dunite has limited utility for long-term atmospheric  $CO_2$  removal<sup>3</sup> (Fig. 1), whereas sufficient harzburgite and basalt resources exist for the application rates considered here (Fig. 1, Supplementary Information). The rock mass required can be reduced by restricting application to regional intense tropical weathering 'hotspots' (Fig. 1, Supplementary Information). Such optimization reduces the land area 89 required by more than two-thirds, from 69 Mkm<sup>2</sup> to 20 Mkm<sup>2</sup>, and total rock mass by 70%, whilst still achieving ~80–89% of the effect (Fig. 1a–c, symbols). Hotspot land areas are primarily tropical forests except parts of Asia which are croplands. However, basalt can 92 promote crop growth on highly weathered acidic tropical soils<sup>22,23</sup> by increasing soil alkalinity, cation exchange capacity and the availability of growth-limiting phosphorus, with 94 associated reductions in Al and Mn toxicity<sup>23,24</sup>. Ample basalt resources exist within the major LIPs in the tropics (Ethiopian Traps, Deccan Traps and Paraná Traps) to support simulated application rates (Fig. 1) and these sources could exploit existing infrastructure for distribution. Meeting silicate rock demand would require large-scale mining operations, e.g., 98 throughout the major tropical LIPs, with production rates exceeding those for coal and 99 adverse consequences for local ecosystems.

100 As  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  is removed from the atmosphere by enhancement of the weathering carbon sink, 101 the carbon cycle responds by redistributing carbon among surface reservoirs (atmosphere, 102 ocean, soil, and land biosphere), with  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  out-gassing by the ocean in particular offsetting some of the artificial drawdown<sup>17</sup>. There is, consequently, a 'rebound' effect whereby each 104 extra mole of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumed does not translate into the removal of a mole of atmospheric 105  $CO_2$  over time. We therefore estimate the effects of our  $CO_2$  consumption fluxes on the 106 RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  trajectories through the 21<sup>st</sup> century with the well-107 tested GENIE Earth system model<sup>8</sup> that broadly captures these responses. Distributing 1kg m<sup>-</sup> 108  $\frac{2}{3}$  yr<sup>-1</sup> of pulverised silicates across 20 Mkm<sup>2</sup> of tropical weathering 'hotspots' lowers 109 atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations by ~40 ppm (basalt) or ~140 ppm (harzburgite) by year 2100 110 in both the RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 climate change scenarios (Fig. 2a, b). Increasing the 111 application rate to 5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> over the same 20 Mkm<sup>2</sup> 'hotspot' areas lowers the 112 atmospheric  $CO_2$  concentration further by 150–180 ppm under both RCPs (Fig. 2c, d), with 113 an increasing effect at deeper soil mixing depths. For RCP4.5, atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> by 2100 is 114 reduced from 540 ppm to 390–350 ppm (basalt) or 350–250ppm (harzburgite), sufficient to 115 play a major role in stabilizing climate and avoid seeding long-term amplifying climate 116 feedbacks<sup>17</sup> (Fig. 2). For the business-as-usual RCP8.5 scenario, however, the lowest 117 simulated  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration by year 2100 in the high-end weathering scenario is still  $\sim$ 730 118 ppm (basalt) or 690–560 ppm (harzburgite) (Fig. 2d). This suggests even massive 119 intervention in Earth's carbon cycle with basalt is unable to drive atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  down 120 close to the target of 350 ppm by 2100, an estimated requirement for restoring planetary 121 energy balance and stabilizing climate<sup>17</sup>.

122 Future climate warming averted (WA) by engineering  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  removal through enhanced 123 weathering is dependent on climate sensitivity and the actual atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration. 124 Calculated end-of-century 'warming averted' figures for the enhanced weathering scenarios 125 using GENIE, which has a low-to-medium climate sensitivity, are summarized in Table 1. 126 For high application rates, WA ranges from 0.9–2.2°C for RCP4.5 and 0.7–1.6°C for RCP8.5 127 (Table 1). At low application rates, corresponding ranges of WA are 0.2–0.7°C for both 128 RCPs (Table 1). These numbers suggest that, theoretically at least, negative emissions from 129 enhanced weathering could play a role alongside conventional mitigation reducing net  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ 130 emissions in limiting future warming<sup>25</sup>.

131 Unmitigated future increases in atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  will not only drive climate change but 132 also ocean acidification, including reduced saturation of surface waters with respect to aragonite, threatening reef-building coral ecosystems<sup>11-14</sup>. Artificially enhanced tropical 134 weathering increases land-to-ocean fluxes of alkalinity and dissolved inorganic carbon and 135 raises freshwater pH to the upper range of tropical rivers (Supplementary Information). These 136 fluxes, together with reduced atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (Fig. 2), tend to counter the negative impacts 137 on ocean carbonate chemistry (Figs. 3 and 4). Our simulations driven by decreased  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (Fig. 2) and increased alkalinity fluxes show that additions of 1 kg  $m^{-2}$  yr<sup>-1</sup> of harzburgite or basalt 139 across the weathering 'hotspots' can mitigate future ocean acidification by an average of around 0.1 pH units (Fig. 3a, b). A higher silicate application rate (5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) reverses 141 future surface ocean acidification under RCP4.5, restoring global mean surface ocean pH to year 2000 levels or even pre-industrial levels by 2100 (Fig. 3c). Even for RCP8.5, 5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> 143 vr<sup>-1</sup> reduces ocean acidification by approximately two-thirds by year 2100 (Fig. 3d) 144 (Supplementary Information).

145 Coral reef health is linked to the ocean's aragonite saturation state  $(\Omega_a)$ , which affects the 146 rate at which corals can precipitate this crystalline mineral form of calcium carbonate and  $147$  build skeletons<sup>13,14</sup>. Modern coral reefs generally occur where open ocean waters have a value of  $\Omega_a$  above a postulated<sup>14</sup> critical threshold of ~3.5. But under RCP4.5, and especially 149 RCP8.5,  $\Omega_a$  at reef sites drops to <3.5 by 2100 (Fig. 4), potentially threatening them with 150 extinction<sup>14</sup>. In simulations for RCP4.5 and RCP8.5, enhanced weathering with 1 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> 151 of silicates (basalt or harzburgite) and reduced atmospheric  $CO_2$ , generates conditions of  $\Omega_a$ 152 >3.5 across main regions of coral reef occurrence (Fig. 4a–e). Hence, although this low 153 dosage is rather ineffective at reducing global  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  (Fig. 2), it has specific regional advantages 154 in terms of helping protect coral reefs. Applications of either rock at high rates (5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) 155 markedly increase  $\Omega_a$  above 3.5 in both RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 scenarios at low latitudes (Fig. 156 4c,f). Enhanced weathering on land could therefore be more effective at alleviating stressors 157 on coral reef health, including ocean acidification, than enhanced open-ocean dissolution of 158  $\omega$  olivine<sup>26,27</sup>.

Our spatial and temporal analyses incorporate detailed plant-soil-climate interactions regulating soil mineral weathering rates. Driven by detailed geographical variations in 161 projections of  $21<sup>st</sup>$  century climate change and vegetation activity, they indicate the maximum potential of enhanced weathering for climate change mitigation, including amelioration of

ocean acidification. However, our scenarios represent a suite of idealized cases in which application of pulverised silicate rocks over forests is assumed to be achievable over large regions. Consequently, they help define the maximum potential CDR capacity of the approach. Not only will practical barriers to mineral transport and distribution on biodiverse tropical forests limit large-scale deployment, but roll-out on such a large-scale may be undesirable from both conservation and ecosystem services viewpoints. Deployment might be achievable in areas undergoing reforestation/afforestation or on agricultural lands where existing infrastructure could be utilized for rock grain distribution and management. However, well-documented field studies on graded spatial scales are needed prior to any significant implementation.

173 Large-scale geoengineering is ethically fraught<sup>15</sup> and poses dangers of both foreseeable and unforeseen consequences. Enhanced weathering employs naturally occurring minerals and reactions and therefore falls in the category of "soft geoengineering" along with 176 reforestation, and agricultural techniques increasing soil carbon storage<sup>28</sup>. Nevertheless, it still requires comprehensive environmental impact assessments and dust mitigation strategies at production and deployment sites. Additionally, the production and distribution of pulverised rock carries health risks to anyone coming in contact with it because the particle sizes involved are respirable (Supplementary Information). Harzburgite, for example, includes asbestos-related minerals that carry health risks to local populations near application sites. However, carefully implemented, enhanced weathering may have added benefits, including fertilizing ocean and terrestrial  $CO_2$  capture by marine diatoms<sup>3,26,29</sup> and tropical forests, respectively. Such effects, which are not considered here, could help offset energy  $\cos^3$ <sup>3,5</sup> associated with extensive rock mining, grinding and transportation operations that 186 might lower its sequestration capacity by  $\sim$ 8–33%.

Estimated implementation costs (combined capital and operational) for achieving an 188 initial 50 ppm drawdown of atmospheric  $CO_2$  are \$60–600 trillion for mining, grinding and transportation, assuming no technological innovation, with similar associated additional costs for distribution (Supplementary Information). On this basis, costs of enhanced weathering as 191 a 'negative emissions' option exceed an estimate of  $$50-200$  trillion<sup>17</sup> for air capture of 50 ppm CO2, but with the latter being less effective in reducing ocean acidification in important coral reef regions. These issues support calls for the alternative of a rising international 194 carbon fee<sup>17</sup>. We proffer enhanced weathering not as a panacea for erasing impacts of fossil

- fuel burning, but as a sobering indication of actions that may be required if fossil fuel
- emissions are not phased-down rapidly.

### **Methods**

Methods and any associated references are available in the online version of the paper.

#### **References**

- 1 Seifritz, W. CO2 disposal by means of silicates. *Nature* **345**, 486, doi:10.1038/345486b0 (1990).
- 2 Schuiling, R. D. & Krijgsman, P. Enhanced weathering: An effective and cheap tool to sequester CO2. *Clim. Change* **74**, 349-354, doi:10.1007/s10584-005-3485-y (2006).
- 205 3 Köhler, P., Hartmann, J. & Wolf-Gladrow, D. A. Geoengineering potential of artificially enhanced silicate weathering of olivine. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **107**, 20228-20233, doi:10.1073/pnas.1000545107 (2010).
- 4 Hartmann, J. *et al.* Enhanced chemical weathering as a geoengineering strategy to reduce atmospheric carbon dioxide, supply nutrients, and mitigate ocean acidification. *Rev.*

*Geophys.* **51**, 113-149, doi:10.1002/rog.20004 (2013).

- 5 Moosdorf, N., Renforth, P. & Hartmann, J. Carbon dioxide efficiency of terrestrial enhanced weathering. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **48**, 4809-4816, doi:10.1021/es4052022 (2014).
- 6 Taylor, L. L., Banwart, S. A., Leake, J. R. & Beerling, D. J. Modeling the evolutionary rise of ectomycorrhiza on sub-surface weathering environments and the geochemical

carbon cycle. *Am. J. Sci.* **311**, 369-403, doi:10.2475/05.2011.01 (2011).

- 7 Taylor, L. L., Banwart, S. A., Valdes, P. J., Leake, J. R. & Beerling, D. J. Evaluating the effects of terrestrial ecosystems, climate and carbon dioxide on weathering over
- geological time: a global-scale process-based approach. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B-Biol.*
- *Sci.* **367**, 565-582, doi:10.1098/rstb.2011.0251 (2012).
- 221 8 Cao, L. *et al.* The role of ocean transport in the uptake of anthropogenic  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ . *Biogeosciences* **6**, 375-390, doi:10.5194/bg-6-375-2009 (2009).
- 223 9 Hempel, S., Frieler, K., Warszawski, L., Schewe, J. & Piontek, F. A trend-preserving bias correction - the ISI-MIP approach. *Earth Syst. Dynam.* **4**, 219-236, doi:10.5194/esd-4- 219-2013 (2013).
- 10 Taylor, K. E., Stouffer, R. J. & Meehl, G. A. An overview of CMIP5 and the experiment design. *Bull. Am. Met. Soc.* **93**, 485-498, doi:10.1175/BAMS-D-11-00094.1 (2011).
- 11 Caldeira, K. & Wickett, M. E. Anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. *Nature* **425**, 365- 365, doi:10.1038/425365a (2003).
- 12 Ciais, P. *et al.* in *Climate change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on*
- *Climate Change* (eds T. F. Stocker *et al.*) Ch. 6, 465-570 (Cambridge University Press,
- Cambridge, UK and New York, USA, 2013).
- 13 Turley, C. *et al.* The societal challenge of ocean acidification. *Marine Pollution Bull.* **60**, 787-792, doi:10.1016/j.marpolbul.2010.05.006 (2010).
- 14 Ricke, K. L., Orr, J. C., Schneider, K. & Caldeira, K. Risks to coral reefs from ocean carbonate chemistry changes in recent earth system model projections. *Environ. Res. Lett.* **8**, 6, doi:10.1088/1748-9326/8/3/034003 (2013).
- 15 Caldeira, K., Bala, G. & Cao, L. The science of geoengineering. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.* **41**, 231-256, doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-042711-105548 (2013).
- 16 United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, available at http://www.unfccc.int. (1992).
- 17 Hansen, J. *et al.* Assessing "dangerous climate change": required reduction of carbon emissions to protect young people, future generations and nature. *PLoS ONE* **8**, e81648, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0081648 (2013).
- 18 Committee on Geoengineering Climate: Technical Evaluation and Discussion of Impacts;
- Board on Atmospheric Sciences and Climate; Ocean Studies Board; Division on Earth
- and Life Studies; National Research Council, Climate Intervention: Carbon Dioxide
- Removal and Reliable Sequestration, ISBN 978-0-309-30529-7. (National Academy of Sciences, Washington D. C., 2015).
- 251 19 Hartmann, J., Jansen, N., Dürr, H. H., Kempe, S. & Köhler, P. Global CO<sub>2</sub>-consumption by chemical weathering: What is the contribution of highly active weathering regions? *Global Planet. Change* **69**, 185-194, doi:10.1016/j.gloplacha.2009.07.007 (2009).
- 20 Wignall, P. B. Large igneous provinces and mass extinctions. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* **53**, 1-33, doi:10.1016/s0012-8252(00)00037-4 (2001).
- 21 Hilf, H. H. The manuring of poor soils with basalt grit. *Forstarchiv.* **14**, 93-101 (1938).
- 22 de Villiers, O. D. Soil rejuvenation with crushed basalt in Mauritius Part I: Consistent results of world-wide interests. *Int. Sugar J.* **63**, 363-364 (1961).
- 23 Anda, M., Shamshuddin, J. & Fauziah, C. I. Increasing negative charge and nutrient contents of a highly weathered soil using basalt and rice husk to promote cocoa growth under field conditions. *Soil Tillage Res.* **132**, 1-11, doi:10.1016/j.still.2013.04.005
- (2013).
- 24 Gillman, G. P., Burkett, D. C. & Coventry, R. J. Amending highly weathered soils with finely ground basalt rock. *Appl. Geochem.* **17**, 987-1001, doi:10.1016/S0883-
- 2927(02)00078-1 (2002).
- 25 Gasser, T., Guivarch, C., Tachiiri, K., Jones, C. D. & Ciais, P. Negative emissions
- physically needed to keep global warming below 2 °C. *Nat Commun* **6**,
- doi:10.1038/ncomms8958 (2015).
- 26 Köhler, P., Abrams, J. F., Völker, C., Hauck, J. & Wolf-Gladrow, D. A. Geoengineering 270 impact of open ocean dissolution of olivine on atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , surface ocean pH and marine biology. *Environ. Res. Lett.* **8**, 014009 (2013).
- 272 27 Hangx, S. J. T. & Spiers, C. J. Coastal spreading of olivine to control atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ concentrations: A critical analysis of viability. *Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control* **3**, 757- 767, doi:10.1016/j.ijggc.2009.07.001 (2009).
- 28 Royal Society Report Geoengineering the climate: science, governance and uncertainty. Report No. RS1636, (The Royal Society, London, 2009).
- 29 Bernard, C. Y., Dürr, H. H., Heinze, C., Segschneider, J. & Maier-Reimer, E.
- Contribution of riverine nutrients to the silicon biogeochemistry of the global ocean a
- model study. *Biogeosciences* **8**, 551-564, doi:10.5194/bg-8-551-2011 (2011).
- **Supplementary Information** is linked to the online version of the paper at www.nature.com/nature
- **Acknowledgements** We thank Yves Goddéris and Phil Renforth for helpful comments on the
- manuscript, Tim Elliot for earlier discussions, and gratefully acknowledge funding through an ERC
- Advanced grant to D.J.B. (CDREG, 32998). We acknowledge the World Climate Research
- Programme's Working Group on Coupled Modelling, which is responsible for CMIP, and we thank
- the climate modelling groups (Table S1) for producing and making available their model output. For
- CMIP the U.S. Department of Energy's Program for Climate Model Diagnosis and Intercomparison
- provides coordinating support and led development of software infrastructure in partnership with the
- Global Organization for Earth System Science Portals.
- **Author Contributions** D.J.B. conceived the study with input from all co-authors. L.L.T. undertook
- weathering model development and simulations, J.Q. and R.M.S.T. undertook data analyses, P.A.K.
- and A.R. provided model set-up support and advice, M.R.L. analysed the CMIP5 climates. D.J.B. led
- the writing with contributions from all co-authors, especially J.H., A.R., J.Q. and L.L.T.
- **Author Information** Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.
- The authors declare no competing financial interests. Correspondence and requests for materials
- 295 should be addressed to D.J.B.  $(d.i.beerling@sheffield.ac.uk)$ .

#### **Figure Legends**

**Figure 1. Enhanced weathering from pulverised silicate rock additions to the tropics increases**  $CO_2$  **consumption.** End-of-century  $CO_2$  consumption by enhanced terrestrial weathering with (**a**) dunite, (**b**) harzburgite or (**c**) basalt as a function of total rock applied, defined as the product of rate and an increasing treated land area in the tropics (30°S to 30°N). Simulations are shown for the Representative Concentration Pathway (RCP) 8.5; median and range for five climate model simulations for each application scenario. Symbols indicate reductions in  $CO_2$  consumption and total rock applied when application is limited to 20 Mkm<sup>2</sup> of tropical weathering hotspots; symbol shape and fill denotes application rate and mixing depth scenario, respectively, for each curve. Vertical red lines show estimated total resources for each rock type (for basalt, solid, dashed and dot-dashed lines represent basalt resources in each of the Ethiopian, Deccan and Paraná Traps, respectively). The shaded area denotes uncertainty in upper values of global dunite resource availability (Supplementary Information). Panels (**d**) to (**f**) display the corresponding ensemble ranges for high and low application scenarios for each of five climate model simulations for both RCP8.5 and RCP4.5, assuming a mixing depth of 30 cm.

# **Figure 2. Enhanced weathering lowers atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> with projected 21<sup>st</sup> century**

**climate change.** Effects of low additions  $(1 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1})$  of silicate rock to 20 Mkm<sup>2</sup> of tropical weathering hotspots for two mixing depths (10 cm and 30 cm) on the atmospheric CO2 concentration for (**a**) RCP4.5 (medium-level mitigation) and (**b**) RCP8.5 (business-as-316 usual). Panels (c) and (d) show comparable results for the effect of higher additions (5 kg m<sup>-2</sup>  $317 \text{ yr}^{-1}$ ) of silicate rocks to the same areas of the tropics. In all panels, the pale blue line indicates the 'control' run with RCP-driven weathering, without additions of silicate rock. Envelopes and lines (solid 10 cm/dashed 30 cm) show the smoothed (five-year boxcar) ranges and medians, respectively, of results from five climate models for each RCP.

#### **Figure 3. Enhanced weathering ameliorates future ocean acidification caused by**

- **projected 21<sup>st</sup> century increases in atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>.** Effects of increased alkalinity fluxes
- resulting from additions of 1 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> of silicate rock to 20 Mkm<sup>2</sup> of tropical weathering

hotspots mixed to two soil depths on global surface ocean pH for (**a**) RCP4.5 (medium-level

- mitigation) and (**b**) RCP8.5 (business-as-usual). Panels (**c**) and (**d**) show comparable results
- 326 for the effect of higher additions (5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>) of silicate rocks to the tropics on global
- surface ocean pH for RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 respectively. Envelopes and lines (solid 10
- cm/dotted 30 cm mixing depths) show the smoothed (five-year boxcar) ranges and medians,
- respectively, of results from five climate models for each RCP.

#### **Figure 4. Enhanced weathering raises the aragonite saturation state of the ocean by**

- 331 **2100.** Simulated global distribution of the aragonite saturation state  $(\Omega_a)$  of the surface ocean
- 332 in 2100 for RCP4.5 (a) no addition of silicate rocks, 1 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> of (b) basalt and (c)
- harzburgite distributed over the tropics. Corresponding simulations for RCP8.5 are given in
- 334 (**d**), (**e**) and (**f**) for applications of 5 kg m<sup>-2</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. Each panel displays in black the distribution
- of reef-building corals (www.reefbase.org). All simulations are for a mixing depth of 30 cm.

#### **Methods**

**Terrestrial rock weathering modelling**. Terrestrial vegetation delivers the carbon-energy flux in the form of photosynthate to roots and associated mycorrhizal fungal networks which fuels biotic rates of mineral dissolution<sup>30</sup>. In our rock weathering model, the sub-surface organic carbon flux is stoichiometrically coupled to the rate of primary production and the uptake of inorganic nutrient ions by roots and mycorrhizal fungi which regulate the ionic composition and charge balance of the microscopic region of soil pore fluids at the organismmineral interface (the mycorrhizosphere)<sup>6,7</sup>. This balance controls local pore fluid pH and organic ligand concentrations at the reacting mineral surfaces that control the rates of mineral dissolution through well-described reaction mechanisms<sup>31</sup>. We therefore couple an extended 346 version of a previously published rock weathering model<sup>6,7</sup> with the Sheffield Dynamic Global Vegetation Model  $(SDGVM)^{32}$ . Our simulations employed fixed land use patterns<sup>33</sup>. The SDGVM simulates terrestrial carbon, nitrogen and water cycling by vegetation and soils including land surface net primary productivity (NPP), hydrology, autotrophic and  $\mu$  heterotrophic soil respiration, and dissolved organic carbon pools<sup>32</sup>. SDGVM is comparable 351 in its sensitivity of response to  $CO_2$  and climate to other DGVMs<sup>34,35</sup>.

In the extended weathering model, rainwater with an initial pH determined by the 353 partial pressure and solubility of atmospheric  $CO<sub>2(g)</sub>$  and ion charge balance percolates through the soil at a rate determined by the SDGVM runoff. Soil solution chemistry is calculated both within and outside the mycorrhizosphere within the soil profile, which is divided into 10 layers specified at increasing depths, with runoff composition from each layer mixed and advected into the next layer. Mixing of bulk soil and mycorrhizosphere water is conceptualised as, but not explicitly parameterised as, hydrodynamic dispersion and diffusive exchange of bulk soil fluid solutes with the decreasing mycorrhizosphere volume with depth<sup> $6$ </sup>, and pore fluid transport to plant roots for transpiration. The model recalculates the soil solution chemistry of each layer, with the dissolution reaction progress of primary silicate minerals ceasing upon reaching the theoretical saturation state of the fluid with respect to the dissolving mineral. Thermodynamic equilibria constrain both the forward reaction for mineral dissolution (see Eq. 1 below) and the concurrent precipitation of secondary phases including kaolinite, gibbsite and amorphous silica which act as sinks for dissolved Al and Si released by weathering. On carbonate-bearing lithologies, pore fluids are equilibrated with any calcite, dolomite or gypsum which might be present before weathering of any silicate

minerals present takes place. This treatment assumes sufficient carbonates to maintain solubility equilibrium during the simulation time horizon and is not suitable for trace amounts of carbonate minerals which would become completely depleted in non-carbonate lithologies. Soil solution chemistry, therefore, depends on solubility equilibrium with existing carbonate or sulphate minerals, precipitation of secondary phases, including kaolinite and amorphous silica, and weathering of primary silicate minerals.

374 Underlying the weathering model is a rasterised version of the Hartmann  $\&$  Moosdorf<sup>36</sup> 375 lithological map for which we prepared a lithological database giving the proportions of the 376 parent minerals in each rock type. Each rock type has its own mineral assemblage (see  $b$ elow), and each mineral *m* weathers according to the general rate law<sup>37</sup> with mineral-378 specific parameter values for *SA*, *k*, *n* and *E*:

379 
$$
Rate_m = SA_m \sum_{i} \left[ k_{i,m}^{298.15} exp\left[ \frac{-E_{i,m}}{R} \left( \frac{1}{T} - \frac{1}{298.15} \right) \right] a_i^{n_{i,m}} \left( 1 - \left[ \frac{Q_m}{Ksp_m} \right] \right) \right]
$$
 Eq. (1)

380 where *Rate<sub>m</sub>* is given in mol m<sup>-2</sup> mineral s<sup>-1</sup>, *SA* is mineral surface area  $(m^2)$ , *i* is the individual 381 weathering agent, such as  $[H^{\dagger}]$ ,  $k_{i,m}$  is the rate constant,  $E_{i,m}$  is the apparent activation energy (kJ mol<sup>-1</sup>), *R* is the gas constant (kJ mol<sup>-1</sup> K<sup>-1</sup>), *T* is temperature (K),  $a_i$  is the molar activity of 383 weathering agent *i* (mol l<sup>-1</sup>) and  $n_{i,m}$  is the reaction order.  $Q_m = \prod_j a_j^{s_j}$  is the ion activity 384 product of the soil solution, where *aj* is the activity of solute *j* raised to the power of its 385 stoichiometry  $s_i$  on the product side of the chemical equation describing the dissolution of 386 mineral *m* (Tables S2, S3). *Kspm* is the solubility constant for mineral *m* (Table S2). 387 Activities are approximated by concentrations.

The model accounts for changes in mineral surface area due to relief (standard deviation 389 of orography) as described previously<sup>7</sup> and includes an empirical surface area correction for 390 each rock type which accounts for age effects<sup>38</sup>, internal porosity, grain size errors and deviation of particle shape from perfect spheres. Soil water residence times and riverine fluxes depend on run-off calculated by SDGVM. The model calculates monthly fluxes of  $CO_2$  consumption, alkalinity ( $Ca^{2+}$ ,  $Mg^{2+}$ , K<sup>+</sup> and Na<sup>+</sup>) and dissolved inorganic carbon and is verified against water chemistry and discharge data from a global suite of river catchments **Validation.** Simulated terrestrial fluxes of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumed by rock weathering in 42 396 watersheds worldwide<sup>39</sup> using the CRU-3 climate<sup>40</sup> at  $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$  resolution are validated against

397 fluxes derived from catchment-scale estimates based on stream-water chemistry

(Supplementary Information). We generated fluxes for basins in the World Resources Institute's shapefile<sup>41</sup> and compared these to the 45 basins (Table 3 in Ref. 39) where the basin names could be matched. Given the test aims to compare model and observed weathering rates, three catchments were rejected on the basis of markedly different basin areas or runoff (defined as two standard deviations of the mean residual). Therefore, 42 403 basins were retained for validation, except in the case of carbonate  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption, where an additional five basins were excluded due to lack of carbonates in the modelled lithologies.

The response of modelled weathering rates in Iceland to temperature change accords with observed chemical weathering flux responses to climate warming over the past four decades 407 in un-glaciated Icelandic catchments<sup>42</sup>. Regional responses also support the  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and climate change sensitivity of our approach. Adopting a more complex soil weathering module 409 coupled to a DGVM<sup>43</sup>, another group predicted a similar increase in  $CO_2$  consumption in the 410 Mackenzie River arctic watershed from 355 ppm  $CO_2$  and modern climate to 560 ppm  $CO_2$ with an associated warmer climate, based on results from the RCP4.5 simulations (Supplementary Information). Estimated pH values of river run-off calculated from alkalinity 413 fluxes and equilibrated to ambient  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , are comparable to measurements reported for a range of tropical river catchments (Supplementary Information).

**Geoengineering simulations.** For the atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration trajectories defined by the two RCPs considered here (RCP4.5 and RCP8.5), the five General Circulation Models (GCMs) produce monthly temperature, relative humidity and precipitation to drive SDGVM. Monthly climate datapoints closest to the desired coordinates are bilinearly interpolated in space before daily values for the month are estimated using climate statistics. These estimated daily climates force SDGVM. Distributed silicate rock grains are treated as perfect monomineralogical spheres with a nominal starting diameter of 10 µm. Initial total surface areas for the added silicates are calculated for each mineral using the total mass applied, specified diameter, weight fraction for the mineral, mineral specific gravity and the equations for the volume and surface area of a sphere. As weathering progresses, mass is removed and the fractional change in total surface area is estimated using the fractional change in mass raised to the power ⅔. This treatment assumes that each particle is a shrinking sphere. The total mass and surface area for each mineral are increased according to dose rate. No attempt is made to model a particle size distribution for either the starting silicate rock grain size or the individual mineral residues following weathering. Pulverized silicates are mixed with a

specified depth of soil, without modelling bioturbation processes or the transport behaviour of suspended materials in infiltrating water. Soil water residence times and riverine fluxes depend on runoff modelled by SDGVM. Mean reactive surface areas of autochthonous 433 primary soil minerals are corrected for erosion and relief<sup>7</sup>. The model assumes no change in porosity or water movement with depth, and there is no preferential transport of different

435 particle sizes.

**Mineralogy of pulverized silicates.** The mineralogy of each simulated pulverized silicate rock is listed in Table S4. The model basalt silicate mineralogy is based on the normative 438 composition for a normal alkali tholeiitic basalt<sup>44</sup>, neglecting some minor phases such as 439 magnetite. Our dunite composition follows Kogel *et al*.<sup>45</sup>. We use the mineralogy of the Troodos harzburgite, with lizardite rather than chrysotile (asbestos) as this is the dominant 441 serpentine near  $T_{\text{roodos}}^{46}$  and as it is sensible to avoid rocks with a large proportion of asbestos for health reasons. Our results are therefore conservative with respect to the proportion of unserpentinised olivine and the relative amounts of lizardite and chrysotile present.

445 **GENIE Earth system global CO2 and ocean biogeochemistry modelling.** The climate and 446 ocean circulation of the GENIE Earth system model has been calibrated by 2-D reanalysis 447 fields of surface air temperature and humidity and 3-D observational fields of ocean 448 distributions of temperature and salinity<sup>47</sup>. The carbon cycle is calibrated against observed 449 ocean phosphate and alkalinity distributions<sup> $47,48$ </sup>. The resulting marine carbon cycle has been extensively used and evaluated, including against observations of natural (e.g.  $\Delta^{14}C$ ) and 451 perturbed anthropogenic carbon cycling. GENIE is also compatible with observational 452 uncertainty<sup>8</sup> and other (generally higher resolution) carbon cycle model responses to  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ 453 perturbation<sup>49-51</sup>. The version used here is as summarized by Cao *et al.*<sup>8</sup> that includes a 76 m 454 deep surface ocean and the cycling of Fe described by Annan and Hargreaves<sup>52</sup> (except with 455 biological uptake following Doney *et al.*<sup>53</sup>), but lacks a mixed layer scheme. Our results 456 therefore represent a pessimistic case for weathering and in the real world one might have a 457 slightly shallower surface layer with even higher saturation. The addition of Fe co-limitation 458 of marine biological export results in a <1% change in the projected year 1994 anthropogenic 459  $CO_2$  inventory compared to the PO<sub>4</sub>-only model<sup>8</sup>.

460 We simulated the effects of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption by enhanced weathering on atmospheric 461 CO<sub>2</sub> drawdown and ocean biogeochemistry in two steps. First, we diagnosed the annual CO<sub>2</sub>

- emissions compatible with a particular RCP CO<sub>2</sub> concentration projection over the  $21<sup>st</sup>$
- 463 century by prescribing that  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  curve and backing-out emissions. Cross-checking these
- 464 diagnoses by performing forward simulations with annual  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  emissions in the absence of
- 465 enhanced weathering reproduced the RCP4.5 and RCP8.5  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  curves to within 1 ppm. Then,
- 466 for each application scenario, we subtracted the annual  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  consumption due to enhanced
- weathering from the diagnosed RCP emissions and forced GENIE with the remainder.

468 The ocean biogeochemistry simulations incorporate reduced atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and increases in the alkalinity and dissolved inorganic carbon fluxes. In each case, those for 470 2005–2015 and 2089–2099 are transferred to a  $36 \times 36$  global grid, migrating land fluxes on the weathering model continents to the ocean following standard directional paths. GENIE linearly interpolated these flux forcings for intermediate years. All GENIE runs were based on the same starting state, comprising a 10,000-year pre-industrial spin-up followed by a 474 transient experiment forced by historical changes in atmospheric  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  concentration up until 475 year 2006 as described in Cao *et al.*<sup>8</sup> and Ridgwell *et al.*<sup>48</sup>.

- 30 Quirk, J., Andrews, M. Y., Leake, J. R., Banwart, S. A. & Beerling, D. J.
- 478 Ectomycorrhizal fungi and past high  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  atmospheres enhance mineral weathering
- through increased below-ground carbon-energy fluxes. *Biol. Lett.* **10**,

doi:10.1098/rsbl.2014.0375 (2014).

- 31 Brantley, S. L. in *Kinetics of Water-Rock Interaction* (eds Susan L. Brantley, James D. Kubicki, & F. Art White) Ch. 5, 151-210 (Springer, 2008).
- 32 Woodward, F. I. & Lomas, M. R. Vegetation dynamics simulating responses to climatic change. *Biol. Rev.* **79**, 643-670, doi:10.1017/s1464793103006419 (2004).
- 33 Bartholomé, E. & Belward, A. S. GLC2000: a new approach to global land cover
- mapping from Earth observation data. *Int. J. Remote Sens.* **26**, 1959-1977,
- doi:10.1080/01431160412331291297 (2005).
- 34 Friend, A. D. *et al.* Carbon residence time dominates uncertainty in terrestrial vegetation
- responses to future climate and atmospheric CO2. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **111**,
- 3280-3285, doi:10.1073/pnas.1222477110 (2014).
- 35 Sitch, S. *et al.* Evaluation of the terrestrial carbon cycle, future plant geography and climate-carbon cycle feedbacks using five Dynamic Global Vegetation Models
- (DGVMs). *Glob. Change Biol.* **14**, 2015-2039, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01626.x (2008).
- 36 Hartmann, J. & Moosdorf, N. The new global lithological map database GLiM: A
- representation of rock properties at the Earth surface. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosys.* **13**, doi:10.1029/2012gc004370 (2012).
- 37 Palandri, J. L. & Kharaka, Y. K. A compilation of rate parameters of water-mineral interaction kinetics for application to geochemical modeling. Report No. 2004-1068, 1- 64 (U.S. Geological Survey, Menlo Park, California, 2004).
- 38 White, A. F. & Brantley, S. L. The effect of time on the weathering of silicate minerals: why do weathering rates differ in the laboratory and field? *Chem. Geol.* **202**, 479-506, doi:10.1016/j.chemgeo.2003.03.001 (2003).
- 504 39 Gaillardet, J., Dupré, B., Louvat, P. & Allègre, C. J. Global silicate weathering and  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ consumption rates deduced from the chemistry of large rivers. *Chem. Geol.* **159**, 3-30, doi:10.1016/S0009-2541(99)00031-5 (1999).
- 40 Mitchell, T. D. & Jones, P. D. An improved method of constructing a database of monthly climate observations and associated high-resolution grids. *Int. J. Climatology* **25**, 693-712, doi:10.1002/joc.1181 (2005).
- 41 Food Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. FAO GEONETWORK. (FAO, Rome, Italy, 2014).
- 42 Gislason, S. R. *et al.* Direct evidence of the feedback between climate and weathering. *Earth. Planet. Sci. Lett.* **277**, 213-222, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2008.10.018 (2009).
- 43 Beaulieu, E., Godderis, Y., Donnadieu, Y., Labat, D. & Roelandt, C. High sensitivity of the continental-weathering carbon dioxide sink to future climate change. *Nature Clim. Change* **2**, 346-349, doi:10.1038/nclimate1419 (2012).
- 44 Nockolds, S. R. Average chemcal compositions of some igneous rocks. *Geol. Soc. Am. Bull.* **65**, 1007-&, doi:10.1130/0016-7606(1954)65[1007:accosi]2.0.co;2 (1954).
- 45 Kogel, J. E., Trivedi, N. C., Barker, J. M. & Krukowski, S. T. *Industrial minerals and rocks - commodities, markets, and uses*. 7th edn, (Society for Mining, Metallurgy, and Exploration, 2006).
- 46 Magaritz, M. & Taylor, H. P. Oxygen and hydrogen isotope studies of serpentinization in
- Troodos ophiolite complex, Cyprus. *Earth. Planet. Sci. Lett.* **23**, 8-14, doi:10.1016/0012-
- 821x(74)90023-5 (1974).
- 47 Price, A. R., Myerscough, R. J., Voutchkov, I. I., Marsh, R. & Cox, S. J. Multi-objective
- optimization of GENIE Earth system models. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. A-Math., Phys., & Engineer. Sci.* **367**, 2623-2633, doi:10.1098/rsta.2009.0039 (2009).
- 48 Ridgwell, A. *et al.* Marine geochemical data assimilation in an efficient Earth System Model of global biogeochemical cycling. *Biogeosciences* **4**, 87-104, doi:10.5194/bg-4- 87-2007 (2007).
- 49 Archer, D. *et al.* Atmospheric lifetime of fossil fuel carbon dioxide. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.* **37**, 117-134, doi:10.1146/annurev.earth.031208.100206 (2009).
- 50 Eby, M. *et al.* Historical and idealized climate model experiments: an intercomparison of Earth system models of intermediate complexity. *Clim. Past* **9**, 1111-1140,

doi:10.5194/cp-9-1111-2013 (2013).

- 51 Goodwin, P., Williams, R. G., Ridgwell, A. & Follows, M. J. Climate sensitivity to the carbon cycle modulated by past and future changes in ocean chemistry. *Nature Geosci.* **2**, 145-150, doi:10.1038/ngeo416 (2009).
- 52 Annan, J. D. & Hargreaves, J. C. Efficient identification of ocean thermodynamics in a physical/biogeochemical ocean model with an iterative Importance Sampling method. *Ocean Model.* **32**, 205-215, doi:10.1016/j.ocemod.2010.02.003 (2010).
- 53 Doney, S. C., Lindsay, K., Fung, I. & John, J. Natural variability in a stable, 1000-yr
- global coupled climate–carbon cycle simulation. *J. Clim.* **19**, 3033-3054,
- doi:10.1175/JCLI3783.1 (2006).

**Table 1. Projected mean global air temperature and change in temperature at year 2100.**  Values show mean  $\pm$  S.D. of five climate models (CMIP5) for the change in end-of-century mean global temperature simulated with the GENIE Earth system model using revised  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  trajectories associated with each rock type and application rate with an applied rock mixing depth of 30 cm (Figure 2).



<sup>a</sup>Relative to control (no enhanced weathering);  $\mathrm{^{b}R}$ elative to 2005;  $\mathrm{^{c}R}$ elative to 1986 – 2005







