1 Enhanced weathering strategies for stabilizing climate and averting

2 ocean acidification

- 3 Lyla L. Taylor¹, Joe Quirk¹, Rachel M.S. Thorley¹, Pushker A. Kharecha^{2,3},
- 4 James Hansen², Andy Ridgwell^{4,5}, Mark R. Lomas⁶, Steve A. Banwart⁷
- 5 & David J. Beerling^{1*}
- 6 ¹Department of Animal and Plant Sciences, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK
- 7 ²Earth Institute, Columbia University, 475 Riverside Drive, New York, 10027, USA
- 8 ³Goddard Institute for Space Studies, NASA, 2880 Broadway, New York, 10025, USA
- 9 ⁴Department of Geographical Sciences, University of Bristol, Bristol BS8 1SS, UK
- 10 ⁵Department of Earth Sciences, University of California, Riverside CA, 92521, USA
- ⁶Department of Mathematics, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK
- 12 ⁷Kroto Research Institute, North Campus, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S3 7HQ, UK
- 13
- 14 *Email d.j.beerling@sheffield.ac.uk

Chemical breakdown of rocks, 'weathering', is an important but very slow part of the 15 carbon cycle that ultimately leads to CO₂ being locked-up in carbonates on the ocean 16 17 floor. Artificial acceleration of this carbon sink via distribution of pulverized silicate rocks across terrestrial landscapes may help offset anthropogenic CO₂ emissions¹⁻⁵. We 18 show that idealized enhanced weathering scenarios over less than a third of tropical land 19 could significantly drawdown atmospheric CO₂ and ameliorate ocean acidification by 20 2100. Global carbon cycle modelling⁶⁻⁸ driven by ensemble Representative 21 Concentration Pathway (RCP) projections of 21st century climate change (RCP8.5, 22 business-as-usual; RCP4.5, medium-level mitigation)^{9,10}, indicates that enhanced 23 weathering could lower atmospheric CO₂ by 30-300 ppm by 2100 depending mainly on 24 silicate rock application rate (1 kg or 5 kg m⁻² yr⁻¹) and composition. At the higher 25 application rate, end-of-century ocean acidification is reversed under RCP4.5 and 26 27 reduced by about two-thirds under RCP8.5. Additionally, surface ocean aragonite saturation state, a key control on coral calcification rates, is maintained above 3.5 28 throughout the low latitudes, thereby helping maintain the viability of tropical coral reef 29 ecosystems¹¹⁻¹⁴. However, we highlight major issues of cost, social acceptability, and 30 potential unanticipated consequences that will limit utilization and emphasize the need 31 for urgent efforts to phase down fossil fuel emissions¹⁵. 32

In 1992, over 170 nations agreed to limit anthropogenic CO₂ emissions to avoid 'dangerous' 33 human-made climate change¹⁶, yet massive expansion of fossil fuel extractions, including 34 shale gas and tar sands, is allowing emissions to grow¹⁷. Avoiding dangerous climate change 35 36 may therefore require the controversial deployment of Carbon Dioxide Removal (CDR) schemes^{4,18}, so called 'negative emissions' strategies whereby CO_2 is captured and removed 37 from the atmosphere. The Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on 38 Climate Change¹² and the U.S. National Research Council Report¹⁸ both recognized enhanced 39 terrestrial weathering of silicate rocks as an important but poorly constrained CDR approach. 40 Currently, natural weathering of silicate and carbonate rocks consumes ~0.25 Pg C yr⁻¹ of 41 atmospheric CO₂, which is \sim 3% of fossil fuel emissions¹⁹ (\sim 9–10 Pg C yr⁻¹). Artificially 42 accelerating this land-based CO₂ sink involves the intentional application of pulverised 43 silicate rocks to vegetated landscapes to markedly enhance CO₂ consumption¹⁻⁵. However, 44 45 assessments to date have excluded primary drivers of soil mineral weathering, especially terrestrial ecosystem processes and feedbacks from CO₂ and future climate change, limiting 46 our understanding of its capacity to offset fossil fuel CO_2 emissions¹². 47

48 Here we present spatially resolved analyses of enhanced weathering by terrestrial ecosystems as a macro-engineering CDR option based on idealized cases for distributing 49 pulverised silicate rocks in the tropics using multi-model ensemble projections (Coupled 50 Model Intercomparison Project, CMIP5) of 21st century climate change^{9,10}. Our modelling 51 52 framework includes climate-plant-soil linkages important for regulating mineral weathering 53 by coupling a detailed weathering model with a dynamic global vegetation model and accounting for land surface hydrology, topography and lithology^{6,7} (Methods). We assess 54 effects of enhanced weathering on net CO₂ consumption and examine feedbacks on 55 atmospheric CO_2 and ocean chemistry over the next century using a suite of five CMIP5 56 general circulation model (GCM) simulations $(1^{\circ}lat. \times 1^{\circ}lon.)^{9,10}$ for each of two 57 Representative Concentration Pathway scenarios (RCPs): RCP8.5 (business-as-usual), and 58 RCP4.5 (medium-level stabilization of emissions); postscripts (8.5 and 4.5) denote radiative 59 forcing (W m⁻²) in year 2100 relative to year 1750 (Supplementary Information). 60 Assessments are undertaken for various application rates of the igneous rocks dunite (>90% 61 olivine, Mg_2SiO_4) (Ref. 3) and harzburgite (50–90% olivine), which are both commercially 62 mined, and basalt for which major resources exist in terrestrial large igneous provinces 63 (LIPs)²⁰ (Fig. 1). These rates fall within the range adopted in the early 1930s for rejuvenating 64 European forest soils with basalt to encourage tree growth 21 . 65

66 Our simulations indicate that terrestrial weathering can be markedly increased by distributing pulverised silicate rocks throughout the tropics (30°N to 30°S), potentially 67 consuming hundreds of petagrams $(1 \times 10^{15} \text{ g})$ of CO₂ by 2100 (Fig. 1). Ensemble median 68 CO₂ consumption by terrestrial weathering increases towards a maximum as the total rock 69 applied increases, with olivine-rich dunite and harzburgite being about twice as effective as 70 71 basalt for equivalent application rates (Fig. 1a-c). We present CO₂ consumption curves assuming mixing depths of 10 cm and 30 cm for each application rate; 10 cm is likely the 72 73 minimum mixing depth given intense precipitation events, the distribution of macropores and bioturbation by invertebrates in tropical soils down to depths of 30–50 cm (Supplementary 74 Information). In the model, CO₂ consumption by weathering increases when added rock 75 grains mix deeper in the soil, particularly at the 5 kg m^{-2} yr⁻¹ application rate, because mineral 76 saturation, a chemical brake on weathering, occurs more slowly in a larger soil solution 77 78 volume. Overall CO_2 consumption patterns for a particular RCP scenario show a consistently 79 narrow range of variation across the five ensemble GCMs (Fig. 1d-f). For a given application 80 rate, the magnitude of CO₂ consumption is similar for the business-as-usual (RCP8.5) and medium level mitigation (RCP4.5) scenarios (Fig.1d-f), largely because the runoff for the two 81 scenarios is similar (Supplementary Information). 82

Comparing cumulative end-of-century amounts of pulverised rock added to the tropics 83 with estimated total resources indicates dunite has limited utility for long-term atmospheric 84 CO_2 removal³ (Fig. 1), whereas sufficient harzburgite and basalt resources exist for the 85 86 application rates considered here (Fig. 1, Supplementary Information). The rock mass required can be reduced by restricting application to regional intense tropical weathering 87 'hotspots' (Fig. 1, Supplementary Information). Such optimization reduces the land area 88 required by more than two-thirds, from 69 Mkm² to 20 Mkm², and total rock mass by 70%, 89 whilst still achieving ~80-89% of the effect (Fig. 1a-c, symbols). Hotspot land areas are 90 primarily tropical forests except parts of Asia which are croplands. However, basalt can 91 promote crop growth on highly weathered acidic tropical soils^{22,23} by increasing soil 92 alkalinity, cation exchange capacity and the availability of growth-limiting phosphorus, with 93 associated reductions in Al and Mn toxicity^{23,24}. Ample basalt resources exist within the 94 major LIPs in the tropics (Ethiopian Traps, Deccan Traps and Paraná Traps) to support 95 96 simulated application rates (Fig. 1) and these sources could exploit existing infrastructure for 97 distribution. Meeting silicate rock demand would require large-scale mining operations, e.g., throughout the major tropical LIPs, with production rates exceeding those for coal andadverse consequences for local ecosystems.

As CO₂ is removed from the atmosphere by enhancement of the weathering carbon sink, 100 the carbon cycle responds by redistributing carbon among surface reservoirs (atmosphere, 101 ocean, soil, and land biosphere), with CO_2 out-gassing by the ocean in particular offsetting 102 some of the artificial drawdown¹⁷. There is, consequently, a 'rebound' effect whereby each 103 extra mole of CO₂ consumed does not translate into the removal of a mole of atmospheric 104 CO_2 over time. We therefore estimate the effects of our CO_2 consumption fluxes on the 105 RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 atmospheric CO₂ trajectories through the 21st century with the well-106 tested GENIE Earth system model⁸ that broadly captures these responses. Distributing 1kg m⁻ 107 ² yr⁻¹ of pulverised silicates across 20 Mkm² of tropical weathering 'hotspots' lowers 108 109 atmospheric CO₂ concentrations by ~40 ppm (basalt) or ~140 ppm (harzburgite) by year 2100 in both the RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 climate change scenarios (Fig. 2a, b). Increasing the 110 application rate to 5 kg m^{-2} yr⁻¹ over the same 20 Mkm² 'hotspot' areas lowers the 111 atmospheric CO₂ concentration further by 150–180 ppm under both RCPs (Fig. 2c, d), with 112 113 an increasing effect at deeper soil mixing depths. For RCP4.5, atmospheric CO₂ by 2100 is reduced from 540 ppm to 390-350 ppm (basalt) or 350-250ppm (harzburgite), sufficient to 114 play a major role in stabilizing climate and avoid seeding long-term amplifying climate 115 feedbacks¹⁷ (Fig. 2). For the business-as-usual RCP8.5 scenario, however, the lowest 116 simulated CO_2 concentration by year 2100 in the high-end weathering scenario is still ~730 117 118 ppm (basalt) or 690-560 ppm (harzburgite) (Fig. 2d). This suggests even massive 119 intervention in Earth's carbon cycle with basalt is unable to drive atmospheric CO_2 down close to the target of 350 ppm by 2100, an estimated requirement for restoring planetary 120 energy balance and stabilizing climate¹⁷. 121

122 Future climate warming averted (WA) by engineering CO₂ removal through enhanced weathering is dependent on climate sensitivity and the actual atmospheric CO₂ concentration. 123 124 Calculated end-of-century 'warming averted' figures for the enhanced weathering scenarios 125 using GENIE, which has a low-to-medium climate sensitivity, are summarized in Table 1. 126 For high application rates, WA ranges from 0.9-2.2°C for RCP4.5 and 0.7-1.6°C for RCP8.5 (Table 1). At low application rates, corresponding ranges of WA are $0.2-0.7^{\circ}$ C for both 127 RCPs (Table 1). These numbers suggest that, theoretically at least, negative emissions from 128 enhanced weathering could play a role alongside conventional mitigation reducing net CO₂ 129 emissions in limiting future warming 25 . 130

Unmitigated future increases in atmospheric CO₂ will not only drive climate change but 131 132 also ocean acidification, including reduced saturation of surface waters with respect to aragonite, threatening reef-building coral ecosystems¹¹⁻¹⁴. Artificially enhanced tropical 133 weathering increases land-to-ocean fluxes of alkalinity and dissolved inorganic carbon and 134 raises freshwater pH to the upper range of tropical rivers (Supplementary Information). These 135 fluxes, together with reduced atmospheric CO₂ (Fig. 2), tend to counter the negative impacts 136 on ocean carbonate chemistry (Figs. 3 and 4). Our simulations driven by decreased CO₂ (Fig. 137 2) and increased alkalinity fluxes show that additions of 1 kg m^{-2} yr⁻¹ of harzburgite or basalt 138 across the weathering 'hotspots' can mitigate future ocean acidification by an average of 139 around 0.1 pH units (Fig. 3a, b). A higher silicate application rate (5 kg $m^{-2} vr^{-1}$) reverses 140 future surface ocean acidification under RCP4.5, restoring global mean surface ocean pH to 141 year 2000 levels or even pre-industrial levels by 2100 (Fig. 3c). Even for RCP8.5, 5 kg m⁻² 142 yr⁻¹ reduces ocean acidification by approximately two-thirds by year 2100 (Fig. 3d) 143 (Supplementary Information). 144

145 Coral reef health is linked to the ocean's aragonite saturation state (Ω_a), which affects the rate at which corals can precipitate this crystalline mineral form of calcium carbonate and 146 build skeletons^{13,14}. Modern coral reefs generally occur where open ocean waters have a 147 value of Ω_a above a postulated¹⁴ critical threshold of ~3.5. But under RCP4.5, and especially 148 RCP8.5, Ω_a at reef sites drops to <3.5 by 2100 (Fig. 4), potentially threatening them with 149 extinction¹⁴. In simulations for RCP4.5 and RCP8.5, enhanced weathering with 1 kg m⁻² yr⁻¹ 150 of silicates (basalt or harzburgite) and reduced atmospheric CO₂, generates conditions of Ω_a 151 >3.5 across main regions of coral reef occurrence (Fig. 4a-e). Hence, although this low 152 dosage is rather ineffective at reducing global CO_2 (Fig. 2), it has specific regional advantages 153 in terms of helping protect coral reefs. Applications of either rock at high rates (5 kg m^{-2} yr⁻¹) 154 markedly increase Ω_a above 3.5 in both RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 scenarios at low latitudes (Fig. 155 4c,f). Enhanced weathering on land could therefore be more effective at alleviating stressors 156 on coral reef health, including ocean acidification, than enhanced open-ocean dissolution of 157 olivine^{26,27}. 158

Our spatial and temporal analyses incorporate detailed plant-soil-climate interactions regulating soil mineral weathering rates. Driven by detailed geographical variations in projections of 21st century climate change and vegetation activity, they indicate the maximum potential of enhanced weathering for climate change mitigation, including amelioration of

ocean acidification. However, our scenarios represent a suite of idealized cases in which 163 164 application of pulverised silicate rocks over forests is assumed to be achievable over large 165 regions. Consequently, they help define the maximum potential CDR capacity of the approach. Not only will practical barriers to mineral transport and distribution on biodiverse 166 tropical forests limit large-scale deployment, but roll-out on such a large-scale may be 167 undesirable from both conservation and ecosystem services viewpoints. Deployment might 168 be achievable in areas undergoing reforestation/afforestation or on agricultural lands where 169 existing infrastructure could be utilized for rock grain distribution and management. 170 However, well-documented field studies on graded spatial scales are needed prior to any 171 172 significant implementation.

Large-scale geoengineering is ethically fraught¹⁵ and poses dangers of both foreseeable 173 and unforeseen consequences. Enhanced weathering employs naturally occurring minerals 174 and reactions and therefore falls in the category of "soft geoengineering" along with 175 reforestation, and agricultural techniques increasing soil carbon storage²⁸. Nevertheless, it 176 still requires comprehensive environmental impact assessments and dust mitigation strategies 177 178 at production and deployment sites. Additionally, the production and distribution of pulverised rock carries health risks to anyone coming in contact with it because the particle 179 sizes involved are respirable (Supplementary Information). Harzburgite, for example, 180 181 includes asbestos-related minerals that carry health risks to local populations near application sites. However, carefully implemented, enhanced weathering may have added benefits, 182 including fertilizing ocean and terrestrial CO₂ capture by marine diatoms^{3,26,29} and tropical 183 184 forests, respectively. Such effects, which are not considered here, could help offset energy costs^{3,5} associated with extensive rock mining, grinding and transportation operations that 185 might lower its sequestration capacity by ~8-33%. 186

187 Estimated implementation costs (combined capital and operational) for achieving an initial 50 ppm drawdown of atmospheric CO₂ are \$60–600 trillion for mining, grinding and 188 189 transportation, assuming no technological innovation, with similar associated additional costs for distribution (Supplementary Information). On this basis, costs of enhanced weathering as 190 a 'negative emissions' option exceed an estimate of \$50–200 trillion¹⁷ for air capture of 50 191 ppm CO₂, but with the latter being less effective in reducing ocean acidification in important 192 coral reef regions. These issues support calls for the alternative of a rising international 193 carbon fee¹⁷. We proffer enhanced weathering not as a panacea for erasing impacts of fossil 194

- 195 fuel burning, but as a sobering indication of actions that may be required if fossil fuel
- 196 emissions are not phased-down rapidly.

197 Methods

198 Methods and any associated references are available in the online version of the paper.

200 **References**

- 201 1 Seifritz, W. CO₂ disposal by means of silicates. *Nature* 345, 486, doi:10.1038/345486b0
 202 (1990).
- Schuiling, R. D. & Krijgsman, P. Enhanced weathering: An effective and cheap tool to
 sequester CO₂. *Clim. Change* 74, 349-354, doi:10.1007/s10584-005-3485-y (2006).
- Köhler, P., Hartmann, J. & Wolf-Gladrow, D. A. Geoengineering potential of artificially
 enhanced silicate weathering of olivine. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* 107, 20228-20233,
 doi:10.1073/pnas.1000545107 (2010).
- 4 Hartmann, J. *et al.* Enhanced chemical weathering as a geoengineering strategy to reduce
 atmospheric carbon dioxide, supply nutrients, and mitigate ocean acidification. *Rev.*

210 *Geophys.* **51**, 113-149, doi:10.1002/rog.20004 (2013).

- Moosdorf, N., Renforth, P. & Hartmann, J. Carbon dioxide efficiency of terrestrial
 enhanced weathering. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 48, 4809-4816, doi:10.1021/es4052022
 (2014).
- Taylor, L. L., Banwart, S. A., Leake, J. R. & Beerling, D. J. Modeling the evolutionary
 rise of ectomycorrhiza on sub-surface weathering environments and the geochemical

216 carbon cycle. *Am. J. Sci.* **311**, 369-403, doi:10.2475/05.2011.01 (2011).

- Taylor, L. L., Banwart, S. A., Valdes, P. J., Leake, J. R. & Beerling, D. J. Evaluating the
 effects of terrestrial ecosystems, climate and carbon dioxide on weathering over
- 219 geological time: a global-scale process-based approach. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B-Biol.*
- *Sci.* **367**, 565-582, doi:10.1098/rstb.2011.0251 (2012).
- 221 8 Cao, L. *et al.* The role of ocean transport in the uptake of anthropogenic CO₂.
 222 *Biogeosciences* 6, 375-390, doi:10.5194/bg-6-375-2009 (2009).
- Hempel, S., Frieler, K., Warszawski, L., Schewe, J. & Piontek, F. A trend-preserving bias
 correction the ISI-MIP approach. *Earth Syst. Dynam.* 4, 219-236, doi:10.5194/esd-4219-2013 (2013).
- Taylor, K. E., Stouffer, R. J. & Meehl, G. A. An overview of CMIP5 and the experiment
 design. *Bull. Am. Met. Soc.* 93, 485-498, doi:10.1175/BAMS-D-11-00094.1 (2011).
- 228 11 Caldeira, K. & Wickett, M. E. Anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. *Nature* 425, 365229 365, doi:10.1038/425365a (2003).
- 230 12 Ciais, P. et al. in Climate change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of
 231 Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on

- 232 *Climate Change* (eds T. F. Stocker *et al.*) Ch. 6, 465-570 (Cambridge University Press,
- 233 Cambridge, UK and New York, USA, 2013).
- Turley, C. *et al.* The societal challenge of ocean acidification. *Marine Pollution Bull.* 60,
 787-792, doi:10.1016/j.marpolbul.2010.05.006 (2010).
- Ricke, K. L., Orr, J. C., Schneider, K. & Caldeira, K. Risks to coral reefs from ocean
 carbonate chemistry changes in recent earth system model projections. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 8, 6, doi:10.1088/1748-9326/8/3/034003 (2013).
- 239 15 Caldeira, K., Bala, G. & Cao, L. The science of geoengineering. *Annu. Rev. Earth Planet.* 240 *Sci.* 41, 231-256, doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-042711-105548 (2013).
- 241 16 United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, available at
 242 <u>http://www.unfccc.int</u>. (1992).
- Hansen, J. *et al.* Assessing "dangerous climate change": required reduction of carbon
 emissions to protect young people, future generations and nature. *PLoS ONE* 8, e81648,
 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0081648 (2013).
- 246 18 Committee on Geoengineering Climate: Technical Evaluation and Discussion of Impacts;
 247 Board on Atmospheric Sciences and Climate; Ocean Studies Board; Division on Earth
- 248
 and Life Studies; National Research Council, Climate Intervention: Carbon Dioxide
- Removal and Reliable Sequestration, ISBN 978-0-309-30529-7. (National Academy of
 Sciences, Washington D. C., 2015).
- Hartmann, J., Jansen, N., Dürr, H. H., Kempe, S. & Köhler, P. Global CO₂-consumption
 by chemical weathering: What is the contribution of highly active weathering regions? *Global Planet. Change* 69, 185-194, doi:10.1016/j.gloplacha.2009.07.007 (2009).
- 254 20 Wignall, P. B. Large igneous provinces and mass extinctions. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 53, 1-33,
 255 doi:10.1016/s0012-8252(00)00037-4 (2001).
- 256 21 Hilf, H. H. The manuring of poor soils with basalt grit. *Forstarchiv.* 14, 93-101 (1938).
- de Villiers, O. D. Soil rejuvenation with crushed basalt in Mauritius Part I: Consistent
 results of world-wide interests. *Int. Sugar J.* 63, 363-364 (1961).
- Anda, M., Shamshuddin, J. & Fauziah, C. I. Increasing negative charge and nutrient
 contents of a highly weathered soil using basalt and rice husk to promote cocoa growth
 under field conditions. *Soil Tillage Res.* 132, 1-11, doi:10.1016/j.still.2013.04.005
- 262 (2013).
- 263 24 Gillman, G. P., Burkett, D. C. & Coventry, R. J. Amending highly weathered soils with
 264 finely ground basalt rock. *Appl. Geochem.* 17, 987-1001, doi:10.1016/S0883-
- 265 2927(02)00078-1 (2002).

- 266 25 Gasser, T., Guivarch, C., Tachiiri, K., Jones, C. D. & Ciais, P. Negative emissions
- 267 physically needed to keep global warming below 2 °C. *Nat Commun* **6**,
- 268 doi:10.1038/ncomms8958 (2015).
- 269 26 Köhler, P., Abrams, J. F., Völker, C., Hauck, J. & Wolf-Gladrow, D. A. Geoengineering
 270 impact of open ocean dissolution of olivine on atmospheric CO₂, surface ocean pH and
 271 marine biology. *Environ. Res. Lett.* 8, 014009 (2013).
- 272 27 Hangx, S. J. T. & Spiers, C. J. Coastal spreading of olivine to control atmospheric CO₂
 273 concentrations: A critical analysis of viability. *Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control* 3, 757274 767, doi:10.1016/j.ijggc.2009.07.001 (2009).
- 275 28 Royal Society Report Geoengineering the climate: science, governance and uncertainty.
 276 Report No. RS1636, (The Royal Society, London, 2009).
- 277 29 Bernard, C. Y., Dürr, H. H., Heinze, C., Segschneider, J. & Maier-Reimer, E.
- 278 Contribution of riverine nutrients to the silicon biogeochemistry of the global ocean a
- 279 model study. *Biogeosciences* **8**, 551-564, doi:10.5194/bg-8-551-2011 (2011).
- 280 Supplementary Information is linked to the online version of the paper at www.nature.com/nature
- 281 Acknowledgements We thank Yves Goddéris and Phil Renforth for helpful comments on the
- 282 manuscript, Tim Elliot for earlier discussions, and gratefully acknowledge funding through an ERC
- Advanced grant to D.J.B. (CDREG, 32998). We acknowledge the World Climate Research
- 284 Programme's Working Group on Coupled Modelling, which is responsible for CMIP, and we thank
- the climate modelling groups (Table S1) for producing and making available their model output. For
- 286 CMIP the U.S. Department of Energy's Program for Climate Model Diagnosis and Intercomparison
- 287 provides coordinating support and led development of software infrastructure in partnership with the
- 288 Global Organization for Earth System Science Portals.
- **Author Contributions** D.J.B. conceived the study with input from all co-authors. L.L.T. undertook
- 290 weathering model development and simulations, J.Q. and R.M.S.T. undertook data analyses, P.A.K.
- and A.R. provided model set-up support and advice, M.R.L. analysed the CMIP5 climates. D.J.B. led
- the writing with contributions from all co-authors, especially J.H., A.R., J.Q. and L.L.T.
- 293 Author Information Reprints and permissions information is available at www.nature.com/reprints.
- 294 The authors declare no competing financial interests. Correspondence and requests for materials
- should be addressed to D.J.B. (<u>d.j.beerling@sheffield.ac.uk</u>).

Figure Legends

296

297 Figure 1. Enhanced weathering from pulverised silicate rock additions to the tropics 298 increases CO_2 consumption. End-of-century CO_2 consumption by enhanced terrestrial 299 weathering with (a) dunite, (b) harzburgite or (c) basalt as a function of total rock applied, defined as the product of rate and an increasing treated land area in the tropics (30°S to 30°N). 300 301 Simulations are shown for the Representative Concentration Pathway (RCP) 8.5; median and range for five climate model simulations for each application scenario. Symbols indicate 302 reductions in CO₂ consumption and total rock applied when application is limited to 20 Mkm² 303 of tropical weathering hotspots; symbol shape and fill denotes application rate and mixing 304 305 depth scenario, respectively, for each curve. Vertical red lines show estimated total resources 306 for each rock type (for basalt, solid, dashed and dot-dashed lines represent basalt resources in 307 each of the Ethiopian, Deccan and Paraná Traps, respectively). The shaded area denotes 308 uncertainty in upper values of global dunite resource availability (Supplementary 309 Information). Panels (d) to (f) display the corresponding ensemble ranges for high and low application scenarios for each of five climate model simulations for both RCP8.5 and RCP4.5, 310 assuming a mixing depth of 30 cm. 311

Figure 2. Enhanced weathering lowers atmospheric CO₂ with projected 21st century

climate change. Effects of low additions (1 kg m⁻² yr⁻¹) of silicate rock to 20 Mkm² of 313 314 tropical weathering hotspots for two mixing depths (10 cm and 30 cm) on the atmospheric CO₂ concentration for (a) RCP4.5 (medium-level mitigation) and (b) RCP8.5 (business-as-315 usual). Panels (c) and (d) show comparable results for the effect of higher additions (5 kg m^{-2} 316 yr⁻¹) of silicate rocks to the same areas of the tropics. In all panels, the pale blue line indicates 317 the 'control' run with RCP-driven weathering, without additions of silicate rock. Envelopes 318 319 and lines (solid 10 cm/dashed 30 cm) show the smoothed (five-year boxcar) ranges and 320 medians, respectively, of results from five climate models for each RCP.

321 Figure 3. Enhanced weathering ameliorates future ocean acidification caused by

- 322 projected 21st century increases in atmospheric CO₂. Effects of increased alkalinity fluxes
- resulting from additions of 1 kg m⁻² yr⁻¹ of silicate rock to 20 Mkm² of tropical weathering
- hotspots mixed to two soil depths on global surface ocean pH for (a) RCP4.5 (medium-level
- 325 mitigation) and (b) RCP8.5 (business-as-usual). Panels (c) and (d) show comparable results
- for the effect of higher additions (5 kg $m^{-2} yr^{-1}$) of silicate rocks to the tropics on global
- 327 surface ocean pH for RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 respectively. Envelopes and lines (solid 10
- 328 cm/dotted 30 cm mixing depths) show the smoothed (five-year boxcar) ranges and medians,
- respectively, of results from five climate models for each RCP.

Figure 4. Enhanced weathering raises the aragonite saturation state of the ocean by

- **2100.** Simulated global distribution of the aragonite saturation state (Ω_a) of the surface ocean
- in 2100 for RCP4.5 (**a**) no addition of silicate rocks, $1 \text{ kg m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ of (**b**) basalt and (**c**)
- harzburgite distributed over the tropics. Corresponding simulations for RCP8.5 are given in
- 334 (d), (e) and (f) for applications of 5 kg m⁻² yr⁻¹. Each panel displays in black the distribution
- of reef-building corals (www.reefbase.org). All simulations are for a mixing depth of 30 cm.

336 Methods

Terrestrial rock weathering modelling. Terrestrial vegetation delivers the carbon-energy 337 338 flux in the form of photosynthate to roots and associated mycorrhizal fungal networks which fuels biotic rates of mineral dissolution³⁰. In our rock weathering model, the sub-surface 339 organic carbon flux is stoichiometrically coupled to the rate of primary production and the 340 341 uptake of inorganic nutrient ions by roots and mycorrhizal fungi which regulate the ionic composition and charge balance of the microscopic region of soil pore fluids at the organism-342 mineral interface (the mycorrhizosphere)^{6,7}. This balance controls local pore fluid pH and 343 organic ligand concentrations at the reacting mineral surfaces that control the rates of mineral 344 dissolution through well-described reaction mechanisms³¹. We therefore couple an extended 345 version of a previously published rock weathering model^{6,7} with the Sheffield Dynamic 346 Global Vegetation Model (SDGVM)³². Our simulations employed fixed land use patterns³³. 347 The SDGVM simulates terrestrial carbon, nitrogen and water cycling by vegetation and soils 348 including land surface net primary productivity (NPP), hydrology, autotrophic and 349 heterotrophic soil respiration, and dissolved organic carbon pools³². SDGVM is comparable 350 in its sensitivity of response to CO_2 and climate to other DGVMs^{34,35}. 351

In the extended weathering model, rainwater with an initial pH determined by the 352 partial pressure and solubility of atmospheric $CO_{2(g)}$ and ion charge balance percolates 353 through the soil at a rate determined by the SDGVM runoff. Soil solution chemistry is 354 355 calculated both within and outside the mycorrhizosphere within the soil profile, which is 356 divided into 10 layers specified at increasing depths, with runoff composition from each layer 357 mixed and advected into the next layer. Mixing of bulk soil and mycorrhizosphere water is 358 conceptualised as, but not explicitly parameterised as, hydrodynamic dispersion and diffusive exchange of bulk soil fluid solutes with the decreasing mycorrhizosphere volume with depth⁶, 359 360 and pore fluid transport to plant roots for transpiration. The model recalculates the soil 361 solution chemistry of each layer, with the dissolution reaction progress of primary silicate 362 minerals ceasing upon reaching the theoretical saturation state of the fluid with respect to the 363 dissolving mineral. Thermodynamic equilibria constrain both the forward reaction for 364 mineral dissolution (see Eq. 1 below) and the concurrent precipitation of secondary phases 365 including kaolinite, gibbsite and amorphous silica which act as sinks for dissolved Al and Si released by weathering. On carbonate-bearing lithologies, pore fluids are equilibrated with 366 any calcite, dolomite or gypsum which might be present before weathering of any silicate 367

minerals present takes place. This treatment assumes sufficient carbonates to maintain
solubility equilibrium during the simulation time horizon and is not suitable for trace amounts
of carbonate minerals which would become completely depleted in non-carbonate lithologies.
Soil solution chemistry, therefore, depends on solubility equilibrium with existing carbonate
or sulphate minerals, precipitation of secondary phases, including kaolinite and amorphous
silica, and weathering of primary silicate minerals.

Underlying the weathering model is a rasterised version of the Hartmann & Moosdorf³⁶ lithological map for which we prepared a lithological database giving the proportions of the parent minerals in each rock type. Each rock type has its own mineral assemblage (see below), and each mineral *m* weathers according to the general rate law³⁷ with mineralspecific parameter values for *SA*, *k*, *n* and *E*:

379
$$Rate_{m} = SA_{m} \sum_{i} \left[k_{i,m}^{298.15} exp\left[\frac{-E_{i,m}}{R} \left(\frac{1}{T} - \frac{1}{298.15} \right) \right] a_{i}^{n_{i,m}} \left(1 - \left[\frac{Q_{m}}{Ksp_{m}} \right] \right) \right] \quad \text{Eq. (1)}$$

where $Rate_m$ is given in mol m⁻² mineral s⁻¹, SA is mineral surface area (m²), *i* is the individual 380 weathering agent, such as $[H^+]$, $k_{i,m}$ is the rate constant, $E_{i,m}$ is the apparent activation energy 381 (kJ mol⁻¹), R is the gas constant (kJ mol⁻¹ K⁻¹), T is temperature (K), a_i is the molar activity of 382 weathering agent *i* (mol l⁻¹) and $n_{i,m}$ is the reaction order. $Q_m = \prod_i a_i^{s_j}$ is the ion activity 383 product of the soil solution, where a_i is the activity of solute *i* raised to the power of its 384 stoichiometry s_i on the product side of the chemical equation describing the dissolution of 385 mineral *m* (Tables S2, S3). *Ksp_m* is the solubility constant for mineral *m* (Table S2). 386 Activities are approximated by concentrations. 387

The model accounts for changes in mineral surface area due to relief (standard deviation 388 of orography) as described previously⁷ and includes an empirical surface area correction for 389 each rock type which accounts for age effects³⁸, internal porosity, grain size errors and 390 deviation of particle shape from perfect spheres. Soil water residence times and riverine 391 fluxes depend on run-off calculated by SDGVM. The model calculates monthly fluxes of 392 CO_2 consumption, alkalinity (Ca^{2+} , Mg^{2+} , K^+ and Na^+) and dissolved inorganic carbon and is 393 verified against water chemistry and discharge data from a global suite of river catchments 394 Validation. Simulated terrestrial fluxes of CO₂ consumed by rock weathering in 42 395 watersheds worldwide³⁹ using the CRU-3 climate⁴⁰ at $1^{\circ} \times 1^{\circ}$ resolution are validated against 396

397 fluxes derived from catchment-scale estimates based on stream-water chemistry

(Supplementary Information). We generated fluxes for basins in the World Resources
Institute's shapefile⁴¹ and compared these to the 45 basins (Table 3 in Ref. 39) where the
basin names could be matched. Given the test aims to compare model and observed
weathering rates, three catchments were rejected on the basis of markedly different basin
areas or runoff (defined as two standard deviations of the mean residual). Therefore, 42
basins were retained for validation, except in the case of carbonate CO₂ consumption, where
an additional five basins were excluded due to lack of carbonates in the modelled lithologies.

405 The response of modelled weathering rates in Iceland to temperature change accords with observed chemical weathering flux responses to climate warming over the past four decades 406 in un-glaciated Icelandic catchments⁴². Regional responses also support the CO₂ and climate 407 change sensitivity of our approach. Adopting a more complex soil weathering module 408 coupled to a DGVM⁴³, another group predicted a similar increase in CO₂ consumption in the 409 Mackenzie River arctic watershed from 355 ppm CO₂ and modern climate to 560 ppm CO₂ 410 with an associated warmer climate, based on results from the RCP4.5 simulations 411 412 (Supplementary Information). Estimated pH values of river run-off calculated from alkalinity fluxes and equilibrated to ambient CO₂, are comparable to measurements reported for a range 413 414 of tropical river catchments (Supplementary Information).

415 **Geoengineering simulations.** For the atmospheric CO_2 concentration trajectories defined by 416 the two RCPs considered here (RCP4.5 and RCP8.5), the five General Circulation Models (GCMs) produce monthly temperature, relative humidity and precipitation to drive SDGVM. 417 418 Monthly climate datapoints closest to the desired coordinates are bilinearly interpolated in 419 space before daily values for the month are estimated using climate statistics. These 420 estimated daily climates force SDGVM. Distributed silicate rock grains are treated as perfect 421 monomineralogical spheres with a nominal starting diameter of 10 µm. Initial total surface 422 areas for the added silicates are calculated for each mineral using the total mass applied, 423 specified diameter, weight fraction for the mineral, mineral specific gravity and the equations for the volume and surface area of a sphere. As weathering progresses, mass is removed and 424 425 the fractional change in total surface area is estimated using the fractional change in mass 426 raised to the power $\frac{2}{3}$. This treatment assumes that each particle is a shrinking sphere. The 427 total mass and surface area for each mineral are increased according to dose rate. No attempt 428 is made to model a particle size distribution for either the starting silicate rock grain size or 429 the individual mineral residues following weathering. Pulverized silicates are mixed with a

specified depth of soil, without modelling bioturbation processes or the transport behaviour of
suspended materials in infiltrating water. Soil water residence times and riverine fluxes
depend on runoff modelled by SDGVM. Mean reactive surface areas of autochthonous
primary soil minerals are corrected for erosion and relief⁷. The model assumes no change in
porosity or water movement with depth, and there is no preferential transport of different
particle sizes.

Mineralogy of pulverized silicates. The mineralogy of each simulated pulverized silicate 436 rock is listed in Table S4. The model basalt silicate mineralogy is based on the normative 437 composition for a normal alkali tholeiitic basalt⁴⁴, neglecting some minor phases such as 438 magnetite. Our dunite composition follows Kogel et al.⁴⁵. We use the mineralogy of the 439 Troodos harzburgite, with lizardite rather than chrysotile (asbestos) as this is the dominant 440 serpentine near Troodos⁴⁶ and as it is sensible to avoid rocks with a large proportion of 441 asbestos for health reasons. Our results are therefore conservative with respect to the 442 proportion of unserpentinised olivine and the relative amounts of lizardite and chrysotile 443 444 present.

445 **GENIE Earth system global CO₂ and ocean biogeochemistry modelling.** The climate and ocean circulation of the GENIE Earth system model has been calibrated by 2-D reanalysis 446 447 fields of surface air temperature and humidity and 3-D observational fields of ocean distributions of temperature and salinity⁴⁷. The carbon cycle is calibrated against observed 448 ocean phosphate and alkalinity distributions^{47,48}. The resulting marine carbon cycle has been 449 extensively used and evaluated, including against observations of natural (e.g. Δ^{14} C) and 450 perturbed anthropogenic carbon cycling. GENIE is also compatible with observational 451 uncertaintv⁸ and other (generally higher resolution) carbon cycle model responses to CO₂ 452 perturbation⁴⁹⁻⁵¹. The version used here is as summarized by Cao *et al.*⁸ that includes a 76 m 453 deep surface ocean and the cycling of Fe described by Annan and Hargreaves⁵² (except with 454 biological uptake following Doney et al.⁵³), but lacks a mixed layer scheme. Our results 455 456 therefore represent a pessimistic case for weathering and in the real world one might have a slightly shallower surface layer with even higher saturation. The addition of Fe co-limitation 457 458 of marine biological export results in a <1% change in the projected year 1994 anthropogenic CO_2 inventory compared to the PO₄-only model⁸. 459

We simulated the effects of CO₂ consumption by enhanced weathering on atmospheric
CO₂ drawdown and ocean biogeochemistry in two steps. First, we diagnosed the annual CO₂

- 462 emissions compatible with a particular RCP CO_2 concentration projection over the 21^{st}
- 463 century by prescribing that CO₂ curve and backing-out emissions. Cross-checking these
- 464 diagnoses by performing forward simulations with annual CO₂ emissions in the absence of
- enhanced weathering reproduced the RCP4.5 and RCP8.5 CO₂ curves to within 1 ppm. Then,
- 466 for each application scenario, we subtracted the annual CO_2 consumption due to enhanced
- 467 weathering from the diagnosed RCP emissions and forced GENIE with the remainder.

The ocean biogeochemistry simulations incorporate reduced atmospheric CO₂ and 468 469 increases in the alkalinity and dissolved inorganic carbon fluxes. In each case, those for 2005-2015 and 2089-2099 are transferred to a 36×36 global grid, migrating land fluxes on 470 471 the weathering model continents to the ocean following standard directional paths. GENIE 472 linearly interpolated these flux forcings for intermediate years. All GENIE runs were based 473 on the same starting state, comprising a 10,000-year pre-industrial spin-up followed by a 474 transient experiment forced by historical changes in atmospheric CO₂ concentration up until year 2006 as described in Cao et al.⁸ and Ridgwell et al.⁴⁸. 475

476

- 477 30 Quirk, J., Andrews, M. Y., Leake, J. R., Banwart, S. A. & Beerling, D. J.
- 478 Ectomycorrhizal fungi and past high CO₂ atmospheres enhance mineral weathering
- through increased below-ground carbon-energy fluxes. *Biol. Lett.* **10**,

480 doi:10.1098/rsbl.2014.0375 (2014).

- 31 Brantley, S. L. in *Kinetics of Water-Rock Interaction* (eds Susan L. Brantley, James D.
 Kubicki, & F. Art White) Ch. 5, 151-210 (Springer, 2008).
- Woodward, F. I. & Lomas, M. R. Vegetation dynamics simulating responses to climatic
 change. *Biol. Rev.* 79, 643-670, doi:10.1017/s1464793103006419 (2004).
- 485 33 Bartholomé, E. & Belward, A. S. GLC2000: a new approach to global land cover
- 486 mapping from Earth observation data. *Int. J. Remote Sens.* **26**, 1959-1977,
- 487 doi:10.1080/01431160412331291297 (2005).
- 488 34 Friend, A. D. et al. Carbon residence time dominates uncertainty in terrestrial vegetation
- responses to future climate and atmospheric CO₂. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* **111**,
- 490 3280-3285, doi:10.1073/pnas.1222477110 (2014).
- 35 Sitch, S. *et al.* Evaluation of the terrestrial carbon cycle, future plant geography and
 climate-carbon cycle feedbacks using five Dynamic Global Vegetation Models

- 493 (DGVMs). *Glob. Change Biol.* 14, 2015-2039, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2008.01626.x
 494 (2008).
- 495 36 Hartmann, J. & Moosdorf, N. The new global lithological map database GLiM: A
- representation of rock properties at the Earth surface. *Geochem. Geophys. Geosys.* 13,
 doi:10.1029/2012gc004370 (2012).
- Palandri, J. L. & Kharaka, Y. K. A compilation of rate parameters of water-mineral
 interaction kinetics for application to geochemical modeling. Report No. 2004-1068, 164 (U.S. Geological Survey, Menlo Park, California, 2004).
- White, A. F. & Brantley, S. L. The effect of time on the weathering of silicate minerals:
 why do weathering rates differ in the laboratory and field? *Chem. Geol.* 202, 479-506,
- 503 doi:10.1016/j.chemgeo.2003.03.001 (2003).
- Gaillardet, J., Dupré, B., Louvat, P. & Allègre, C. J. Global silicate weathering and CO₂
 consumption rates deduced from the chemistry of large rivers. *Chem. Geol.* 159, 3-30,
 doi:10.1016/S0009-2541(99)00031-5 (1999).
- Mitchell, T. D. & Jones, P. D. An improved method of constructing a database of
 monthly climate observations and associated high-resolution grids. *Int. J. Climatology*25, 693-712, doi:10.1002/joc.1181 (2005).
- 510 41 Food Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. FAO GEONETWORK. (FAO,
 511 Rome, Italy, 2014).
- Gislason, S. R. *et al.* Direct evidence of the feedback between climate and weathering. *Earth. Planet. Sci. Lett.* 277, 213-222, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2008.10.018 (2009).
- 43 Beaulieu, E., Godderis, Y., Donnadieu, Y., Labat, D. & Roelandt, C. High sensitivity of
 the continental-weathering carbon dioxide sink to future climate change. *Nature Clim. Change* 2, 346-349, doi:10.1038/nclimate1419 (2012).
- 517 44 Nockolds, S. R. Average chemcal compositions of some igneous rocks. *Geol. Soc. Am.*518 *Bull.* 65, 1007-&, doi:10.1130/0016-7606(1954)65[1007:accosi]2.0.co;2 (1954).
- Kogel, J. E., Trivedi, N. C., Barker, J. M. & Krukowski, S. T. *Industrial minerals and rocks commodities, markets, and uses.* 7th edn, (Society for Mining, Metallurgy, and
 Exploration, 2006).
- 46 Magaritz, M. & Taylor, H. P. Oxygen and hydrogen isotope studies of serpentinization in
- 523 Troodos ophiolite complex, Cyprus. *Earth. Planet. Sci. Lett.* 23, 8-14, doi:10.1016/0012-
- 524 821x(74)90023-5 (1974).

- 525 47 Price, A. R., Myerscough, R. J., Voutchkov, I. I., Marsh, R. & Cox, S. J. Multi-objective
- optimization of GENIE Earth system models. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. A-Math., Phys., & Engineer. Sci.* 367, 2623-2633, doi:10.1098/rsta.2009.0039 (2009).
- 48 Ridgwell, A. *et al.* Marine geochemical data assimilation in an efficient Earth System
 Model of global biogeochemical cycling. *Biogeosciences* 4, 87-104, doi:10.5194/bg-487-2007 (2007).
- 49 Archer, D. *et al.* Atmospheric lifetime of fossil fuel carbon dioxide. *Annu. Rev. Earth*532 *Planet. Sci.* 37, 117-134, doi:10.1146/annurev.earth.031208.100206 (2009).
- 50 Eby, M. *et al.* Historical and idealized climate model experiments: an intercomparison of
 Earth system models of intermediate complexity. *Clim. Past* 9, 1111-1140,

535 doi:10.5194/cp-9-1111-2013 (2013).

- 536 51 Goodwin, P., Williams, R. G., Ridgwell, A. & Follows, M. J. Climate sensitivity to the
 537 carbon cycle modulated by past and future changes in ocean chemistry. *Nature Geosci.* 2,
 538 145-150, doi:10.1038/ngeo416 (2009).
- 52 Annan, J. D. & Hargreaves, J. C. Efficient identification of ocean thermodynamics in a
 physical/biogeochemical ocean model with an iterative Importance Sampling method. *Ocean Model.* 32, 205-215, doi:10.1016/j.ocemod.2010.02.003 (2010).
- 542 53 Doney, S. C., Lindsay, K., Fung, I. & John, J. Natural variability in a stable, 1000-yr
- global coupled climate–carbon cycle simulation. *J. Clim.* **19**, 3033-3054,
- 544 doi:10.1175/JCLI3783.1 (2006).

Table 1. Projected mean global air temperature and change in temperature at year 2100. Values show mean \pm S.D. of five climate models (CMIP5) for the change in end-of-century mean global temperature simulated with the GENIE Earth system model using revised CO₂ trajectories associated with each rock type and application rate with an applied rock mixing depth of 30 cm (Figure 2).

	Warming at 2100 (°C)		Warming averted at 2100 (°C) ^a	
	RCP 4.5	RCP 8.5	RCP 4.5	RCP 8.5
Control (no enhanced weathering) ^b	1.4 ± 0.01	3.0 ± 0.01	n/a	n/a
IPCC range of projected warming ^c [Ref.12]	1.1 – 2.6	2.6 – 4.8	n/a	n/a
Enhanced weathering scenario				
Harzburgite (1 kg m ⁻² yr ⁻¹)	0.8 ± 0.04	2.5 ± 0.04	0.7 ± 0.04	0.5 ± 0.04
Harzburgite (5 kg m ⁻² yr ⁻¹)	-0.77 ± 0.2	1.4 ± 0.1	2.2 ± 0.2	1.6 ± 0.1
Basalt (1 kg m ⁻² yr ⁻¹)	1.21 ± 0.02	2.8 ± 0.01	0.2 ± 0.02	0.2 ± 0.01
Basalt (5 kg m ⁻² yr ⁻¹)	0.5 ± 0.05	2.25 ± 0.05	0.9 ± 0.05	0.7 ± 0.05

^aRelative to control (no enhanced weathering); ^bRelative to 2005; ^cRelative to 1986 – 2005







