

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

One Hundred Years of Old Man Sage: An Arapaho Life. By Jeffrey D. Anderson.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3ks7x3th>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 27(3)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Johnson, Thomas H.

**Publication Date**

2003-06-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

This book offers a brief Euro-American-oriented gloss of some important aspects of indigenous Native American cultures that can provide a good beginning text for most undergraduate courses. It can lead students to a few good classic secondary selections, such as the Francisco, Walters, and Beck texts mentioned in this review, or to such primary sources as Vine Deloria's *God Is Red* or the new anthology *American Indian Thought*. I would not cite it as a research source.

Anne Waters

State University of New York, Binghamton

**One Hundred Years of Old Man Sage: An Arapaho Life.** By Jeffrey D. Anderson. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2003. 140 pages. \$35.00 cloth.

*One Hundred Years of Old Man Sage: an Arapaho Life* tells the life story of an Arapaho man, Sherman Sage, who lived between about 1844 and 1943. This is an unusually long life for anyone, but especially for someone who took an active part in the life of a Native American tribe during a period of war, strife, increasing poverty, and disease.

Sage was born at Pumpkin Creek in western Nebraska at the very conclusion of the era of relative peace, prosperity, and freedom for Plains Native people, just before the migration of Mormons to Utah and the ever-accelerating migration to gold fields in California. Arapaho territories were defined by the first Laramie Treaty of 1851, which Sage says he witnessed as a seven-year-old (although other sources place his year of birth in that same year). In a useful chronology at the end of the book, Anderson summarizes the major events of Sage's life (pp.123–125).

However, the life of Sherman Sage within the covers of this book was not told to the author, Jeffrey Anderson. Except for several interviews with Sage's grandson, Joseph (died 2003), Marie Behan, an adopted granddaughter, and others in 1999 and 2000, who remembered him, the book offers a compilation of materials written about Sage by other authors who had collected information about Arapaho culture and lifeways during Sage's life. Thus, in chapter one, "The East," chapter two, "Names," and chapter three, "Out of the Cradleboard Walking," as much as half of the chapter consists of direct quotes from these sources. A major source for the material on Sage's childhood is Sister M. Inez Hilger's *Arapaho Child Life and Its Cultural Background* (1952). Hilger is quoted extensively throughout the book, as she obtained much of her material from Sage, whom she considered one of the oldest and best informed Arapaho when she did field work in 1936 and 1940. Hilger's material gives us a valuable insight into the pre-reservation life of the Arapaho.

Similarly, chapter five, "The Lodges," provides valuable information about the Offerings Lodge (otherwise called by its American name, the Sun Dance). However, virtually all of this information comes from A.L. Kroeber,

who interviewed Sage in 1900 (A.L. Kroeber, 1904; 1916). The reconstruction of Sage's life continues in chapter six, "For Education is a Very Good Thing," which quotes another major source on the life of Sage Oliver W. Toll (O.W. Toll ms. 1914). In 1914 Toll and several other whites enlisted the aid of Sage and two other older Arapaho men, Gun Griswold and Tom Crispin, in an expedition to what they hoped might become a national park, the parklands in the Rockies west of Denver. The Arapaho had lived in this region, perhaps for hundreds of years, and the Toll party wanted to learn what they knew about the area, including Arapaho names for locations. These Colorado men were building a good case for the establishment of a Rocky Mountain National Park, and their farsighted inclusion of the Arapaho in this expedition is commendable. Many quotations from Toll's manuscript, which remains unpublished, are found through Anderson's book.

Chapter seven, "I Killed a Little Buffalo Calf," which again quotes Sage in Hilger, recounts his first buffalo kill, when he was about fifteen or sixteen. Chapter eight, "Moving North," talks about the need for food, which drove the Arapaho north into Wyoming, as the range of the buffalo shrank. By 1863, the "year of hunger," the desperation that would increasingly be the lot of the Arapaho became painfully clear. Sage recalled the failed 1866 Treaty, which tried to gain permission from the Sioux, Cheyenne, and Arapaho for building the Bozeman Trail from Casper to gold fields in Montana (A.F.C. Greene ms, 1941). The Battle of Little Bighorn was one result of this hastily conceived treaty. In the late 1860s, as Sage married and began a family, tensions increased between Native peoples and whites. His marriage is recounted in chapter eight, with liberal quotations from Hilger. Sage's first marriage, which lasted until his first wife Beaver's death in 1890, indicates that he was a man full of wisdom for his years, who understood the meaning of the "good way" of the Arapaho—a way of patience, nonviolence, and wisdom. Sage did not believe in polygyny, even though the male/female ratio was unevenly balanced toward females. Although he was never a chief, and did not become one of the ritual leaders, he was respected as a healer and medicine man in his later years. Several of his children died in epidemics in the 1890s, and only one, Ed, survived into old age. Sage's opposition to the treatments of Western allopathic medicine and hospitals is easy to understand after these deaths. Arapaho medicine men continued to retain the confidence of many Arapaho through Sage's long life.

The Sage allotments, on the western edge of Arapaho homesteads near Ethete, were retained after the allotment era, even though they were largely unproductive, and provided an attractive homestead for Joseph, Ed's surviving son, and an adopted grandson, Allison.

Returning to Sage's history and that of his people, chapter eleven, "The Indian Struggle," and chapter twelve, "Finding a Place," recount the struggle of the Northern Arapaho bands to find a reservation in the 1870s. After the disastrous battle on Nowood Creek in 1874 near Thermopolis, where Captain Alfred E. Bates led sixty cavalry and 160 Shoshone warriors to attack a camp of "hostiles," twenty Arapahos died (p. 56). After this, Sage and others had enlisted as scouts at Camp (later Fort) Robinson in Nebraska from 1876 to

1878. This was soon after the Battle of the Little Big Horn during attempts to pacify the remaining Cheyenne and Lakota. Sage was at Camp Robinson when Crazy Horse was captured in 1877.

The Arapaho were still without a reservation. Anderson relates that “even though the Northern Arapahos never received the reservation General Crook had promised, they were able to find a better place at Wind River later on because of these relationships formed at Camp Robinson” (p. 56). This final statement is enigmatic, since the placement of the Northern Arapaho at Wind River was to become a major bone of contention for many years. Anderson states several times in the book that, despite the fact that the Shoshone or Wind River Reservation was originally given to the Shoshones in their 1868 treaty, the Arapaho tried hard to maintain their place of residence there. The author fails to mention that the Arapaho were finally placed there officially by an executive order by President Hayes. The Shoshone might have been ignorant of the clause in their treaty that allowed presidents to settle other Indians on their lands by executive order. As a result, the Shoshone always considered the placement of the Arapaho on their reservation illegal. As early as 1913 the Shoshone lobbied hard to get Congress to pass an enabling act to allow them to sue the government for placing the Arapaho on their reservation—an act which finally passed Congress in 1927 (T. H. Johnson, 1975, p. 407). Such claims were not easy to file until the Indian Claims Commission was established in 1946. Finally in 1938, the Shoshone received compensation for the placement of the Arapaho on their reservation, but had to agree to cede half of the reservation and its assets to the Arapaho in order to obtain compensation. During the 1950s, under the 1946 Court of Claims, the Arapaho sued the government and received monetary compensation for not having been given a reservation. These long overdue settlements of government errors were costly to both tribes, and the political fallout from government errors created unfriendly relations between the two. The Shoshone knew the government had committed errors, yet were angry that the Arapaho remained; at the same time, the Arapaho could not be blamed for holding on to what little they had, for fear of losing everything. This created the need for survival strategies on the part of the Arapaho, which are not suggested or developed by Anderson. The wider political picture and its effects on the culture of the Arapaho need further exploration; this was also a time of religious experimentation when the Native American Church tried to bridge gaps between Shoshone and Arapaho.

Sage’s involvement in this, and in the Ghost Dance, is revealing, since he organized a large delegation of Arapahos, Shoshones, Cheyennes, and Lakotas to visit the prophet Wovoka in 1889 to 1890. Anderson’s inclusion of the long discussion by Tim McCoy of the delegation’s reactions to meeting Wovoka needs more interpretation and substantiation than this book gives (pp. 62–66). Anderson suggests that Sage and other Arapaho did not necessarily accept Wovoka’s vision that the dance would bring the power to remove the white man and restore the earth to its aboriginal fullness. Rather, Anderson argues that “for the Northern Arapaho people, the connection to Wovoka as a medicine man who provided medicines, along with the dance

and songs, outlasted the message of the end of the world. They kept the ceremony or parts of it some years after the prophesied date of the apocalypse had passed and after the massacre of Lakota Ghost dance followers at Wounded Knee in 1890" (p. 66). However, the Wind River Shoshone also continued to perform the Ghost Dance covertly until the 1940s, and the Ghost Dance has been revived recently after the conclusion of the Bannock Creek Sun Dance (Shoshone: *Standing in Thirst*) near Fort Hall, Idaho (T. H. Johnson, field notes 2002). As with other religions with apocalyptic content, such as Christianity, it is often difficult to separate promises of healing from apocalyptic prophecies. Why wouldn't it have been possible that the apocalyptic vision of the Ghost Dance continued to contain these prophetic elements for the Arapaho, as it apparently did and still does for some Shoshone?

Chapter fourteen, "Working at Wind River," recounts Sage's career as a member of the business council member and tribal policeman in the early 1900s, as well as his service to the expedition to the Rockies in 1914. His modesty, knowledge, and amiability had won him the respect of all. By the 1920s, when he was given a pension from his years of service as a scout, Sage was one of the most highly regarded Arapaho. Family members counted on this pension at a time when most Arapaho had next to nothing.

The remaining chapters of the book are very short, often less than two pages, and of varying quality. The chapters are of a topical nature and offer references to Sage from the same sources cited above that describe him: Toll, Greene, and Hilger. Chapter fifteen, "History," could have been enlivened with some reference to the discussion of Arapaho land claims in the Court of Claims in the 1950s. For example, chapter twenty-one, "Many Roads," could have provided a more comprehensive treatment of the Arapaho leaders' acceptance of the Jesuit mission at St. Stephens during the political and religious turmoil of the 1880s to the early 1900s. Any discussion of missions must consider the Jesuits' support of Arapaho claims against both the government and the Shoshone, in the period between the passage of the Dawes Severalty Act of 1887 and the McLaughlin cession and agreement of 1904. Evidence indicates that the Jesuit missionaries were probably the only group of whites who supported Arapaho claims to the reservation in the critical years between the 1880s and 1930s; the Shoshone and their missionary, Episcopalian John Roberts, eager for a settlement of the issue of the placement of the Arapaho, had reasons for siding with the United States. Records of cessions between the 1890s and 1904 indicate that the Shoshone were deeply divided, and the murder of leader George Terry in 1907 might have stemmed from this division. One reason for Shoshone ambivalence might have been their perception that they needed the government to side with them and against the Arapaho. The role of Arapaho Episcopal missionary Sherman Coolidge is not clear. For Arapaho leaders, making room for Roman Catholic Christianity in addition to the sacred traditions of the Offerings Lodge and others, as well as peyote, must have been deliberate, involving the most important alliance the Arapaho could have made with non-Indians outside their culture in this highly stressful period. The Lakota seer, Black Elk, seems to have made similar decisions at about the same time.

Chapter twenty-one is the book's most baffling because it fails to mention the history of the migration of Plains tribes from our first knowledge of them as early as 1741, when the Chevalier de la Verendrye named several of those tribes in western South Dakota and Wyoming before the intrusion of the Lakota (Pierre Margry, ed. 1888). Verendrye was the first white man to have visited this region. Shimkin's discussion of the Shoshone on the Plains in the eighteenth century, and their retreat in the face of Blackfeet and other tribal intrusions in volume eleven of the Smithsonian *Handbook of North American Indians* (D. B. Shimkin 1986), and George Hyde's discussion of the dominant position of the "Padoucas" and "Ietan" (possibly the Apache and Comanche) needs to play a part in the discussion of Arapaho presence in the Front Range and eastern Colorado before the coming of the horse in the late seventeenth century (G. Hyde 1959). Although the parks area was apparently a zone of conflict between Apache, Ute, and Arapaho, tribal movements during the past half millenium are difficult to reconstruct. As Anderson notes, it is certainly true that the Arapaho have been generally neglected as early denizens of the Rockies and high Plains, and their migratory history needs more careful investigation. Did the Arapaho migration follow that described by Hoebel for the Cheyenne, their later close allies, who have been traced back to North Dakota in the eighteenth century, and to Minnesota in the seventeenth century? Lakota migration onto the high Plains might well have come after that of the Arapaho. A careful editing of Toll's manuscript could clarify these issues.

Chapter twenty-two, "Working Together," brings tribal politics during the 1930s New Deal era into perspective, as Sage spoke eloquently against the Indian Reorganization Act of 1934. His innate conservatism prevailed, and helped protect both the Arapaho and Shoshone from giving up customary political arrangements in favor of the kind of government and constitution that the United States thought best for Indians. The Shoshone and Arapaho voted not to accept the act, allowing them greater flexibility in self-government. This chapter, including references to the joint business councils and leaders of the time, could have been placed after chapter fourteen, and would have been a fitting coda to Anderson's book. The remaining chapters provide information that could easily have been valuable if Toll's entire manuscript were edited.

This book combines several important published and unpublished sources that give us information about an Arapaho who lived an exemplary and long life. However, Anderson's apparent goal of presenting Sage as a representative of his culture during a turbulent period of change might have been better served by editing the primary sources, much as James Ronda did with the journals of Lewis and Clark in *Lewis and Clark among the Indians* (J. P. Ronda 1984). Toll's manuscript, Hilger's unpublished field notes, and perhaps even the unpublished manuscript of Greene should see the light of day as edited and published materials instead of a series of excerpts compiled by the author of this book, who never met Sherman Sage.

*Thomas H. Johnson*

University of Wisconsin–Stevens Point