

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Tales of an Endishodi: Father Berard Haile and the Navajos, 1900-1961.
Edited and transcribed by Father Murray Bodo, O. F. M.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3nj3c8b6>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 23(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Frisbie, Charlotte J.

Publication Date

1999-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

more than the history books give credit for" (p. 40). He goes on to describe several more "Southern" dishes, but reflects no further on the influences of culture, nor of the erasure of the Native, nor the permutations of Oklahoma culture as it evolved. He appears to have no ongoing ties to the Choctaw community. Barnes remarks on his father's "reticence," and what oral tradition the quarter-blood parent possessed ended in the silence that his son recalls (p. 25).

Foremost, *On Native Ground* records the evolution of a fine writer. The book is a chronology of Barnes' education, formal and informal. He recalls childhood adventures, but they are not informed by a larger cultural context. A ghost story about a drowned woman is singular. Neither Choctaw nor Welsh nor Appalachian-culture beliefs about ghosts inform the story. He adds his family stories to his own experience, but larger history is a vague background. The glimpse Barnes provides into Oklahoma life between the world wars derives from his own memory and references to his mother's stories, photographs, newspaper clippings, abandoned masonry, and old trails. And he has his own steady, well-schooled vision.

Denise Low

Haskell Indian Nations University

Tales of an Endishodi: Father Berard Haile and the Navajos, 1900–1961. Edited and transcribed by Father Murray Bodo, O. F. M. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1998. 263 pages. \$45.00 cloth; \$24.95 paper.

This volume is the result of four years of labor by the editor/transcriber with assistance from others, including Franciscan Fathers Cormac Antram and Marcan Hetteberg, Brother Gerald Grantner, and the late Father Simon Conrad who died unexpectedly in June 1998. The book makes available transcriptions of a series of tapes recorded by the well-known Franciscan friar and ethnologist of Navajo culture, Father Berard Haile (1874–1961), the last of the Franciscans initially responsible for the first evangelizing efforts among the Navajos. After two years of pastoral service in Peoria, Illinois, Father Berard was assigned, along with Father Leopold Ostermann, to assist Father Anselm Weber in establishing the Franciscan Center at Cienega, later St. Michaels, Arizona, work that had been started in 1898. Arriving there in October 1900, Haile served the Navajos until he suffered a stroke in 1954. He spent the last seven years of his life as a bedridden hemiplegic, and at the suggestion of his niece, Frances Haile, allowed Frances to record his recollections, between 1957 and 1961, for the family. In late 1991 or 1992, the tapes were donated by a grandniece and grandnephew to the St. Michaels Historical Museum. The 1998 emergence of the transcribed and edited tapes is timely, given the culmination of a year-long Franciscan celebration of one hundred years on the Navajo Reservation at St. Michaels on October 3, 1998.

Readers familiar with Father Berard's numerous scholarly contributions to our understandings of Navajo linguistics, ceremonialism, and other aspects

of Navajo culture, will meet a different person in this volume, and may experience shock, disillusionment, or find the volume lighthearted, chatty, or of questionable value. Thus, it is crucial to understand its *context*: the book consists of the edited remembrances of a person who, in response to a niece's request, is recalling events selected from a fifty-four-year-long career as a friar/scholar on the Navajo reservation. Haile does so with a refreshing mixture of humor and continued dedication to Franciscan and scholarly causes. The tapes reflect what mattered to *him*, when asked for his recollections. There is no point in criticizing the outcome or considering how it might have been different had fellow Franciscans or anthropological colleagues made the request. However, perhaps we should contemplate why no representative from either group did!

In the introduction, Bodo provides a sensitive overview of Father Berard's career as a pioneer in the Navajo world, both as a Franciscan and highly respected linguist/ethnologist. Here, readers are reminded of the larger issues that framed Haile's life, such as pre-Vatican II theology and early twentieth-century anthropology, as well as his own circumstances and deep interest in Navajo linguistics. The importance of issues of audience, circumstances of recording, time lag, and physical condition of the speaker; the challenges of editing and transcribing; and at least some of the now widely discussed problems with anthropological "knowledge" and/or ways of knowing are also brought to the reader's attention. One is reminded that Father Berard was, indeed, ahead of his times in his refusal to impose theology and in his belief that theology needed some anthropology in the sense that one needed to speak the native language and understand native beliefs, practices, and customs *before* embarking on preaching or explaining Christianity. Such stances, of course, led to obstacles and critics within the Franciscan world, just as some of his positions on linguistic matters and his explanations of Navajo beliefs and practices led to criticisms by some American anthropologists.

Bodo has arranged the transcriptions chronologically into twenty-six chapters, fifteen of which are expanded by carefully researched endnotes. Those accompanying the final chapter, which essentially consists of Haile's greetings to his relatives, further explain some of the particulars of the project. In addition to writing the introduction, the editor also selected materials for the eight appendices (pp. 123–235); in general, these include reprints of some hard-to-access and/or famous articles by Father Berard, selected contributions published earlier in the *Franciscan Missions of the Southwest* (an annual publication extant from 1913 until 1922), and other items. Specifically, Appendix I presents Father Byron Witzmann's 1961 bibliography of Father Berard's published and unpublished works (pp. 123–136); Appendices II and III respectively reprint Haile's, "The Story of the Ethnologic Dictionary" (pp. 137–143) and "Navaho or Navajo?" (pp. 145–150). Appendix IV, the longest one (pp. 151–196), opens with Father Edgar Casey's useful 1961 index to authors who published anonymously in the *Franciscan Missions of the Southwest*. It also includes six articles published therein by either Father Berard Haile or Father Anselm Weber; this is where "Mortuary Customs" is reprinted, as well as two articles which will remind those currently concerned

about Navajo cultural landscape issues that in the early 1920s, Father Berard was actively involved in Navajo land questions. Also of interest in Appendix IV, at least to me, are the two articles by Father Anselm Weber, on the opening of St. Michaels School (pp. 179–189) and the Hopi Snake Dance (pp. 189–196), which can be compared with Haile's accounts, respectively on pp. 54–57 and pp. 111–115. Another interesting and somewhat similar editorial decision is Bodo's inclusion of both of Haile's versions of "The Beginnings of Chinle and Lukachukai" in chapter 15, interspersed with an appropriate editorial explanation. Appendix V reprints "Chantways and Ceremonials," while VI includes various articles historically documenting Haile's attempts to get *Blessingway* published during his lifetime. Appendix VII consists of materials written by others in celebration his 1958 60th Jubilee, and VIII, various announcements of Haile's death in 1961. Five of the eight appendices have supporting endnotes. In addition to notes, a glossary, bibliography, and index, the volume contains one map and sixteen historical photographs, many publishable only because of the photographic and research talents and labors of the late Father Simon. These portray not only Father Berard at various times, but also other early Franciscan fathers and brothers, Mother Katharine Drexel, anthropologist Stewart Culin, mission interpreter Frank Walker, Navajo leader Chee Dodge, and Chic Sandoval, former tribal interpreter.

The volume enabled me to enlarge my understandings of a friar and scholar I never had the opportunity to meet. Some of the chapters illustrate Haile's sense of humor, such as recollections of his first bear hunt, his first attempt to drive the St. Michaels automobile (a gift from Lorenzo Hubbell), camping experiences, or baseball games. Mixed with these are recollections that augment understandings of Navajo historical events such as Beautiful Mountain and the Trouble at Round Rock; Gallup mercantilists and early reservation traders (e.g., C. N. Cotton, John Kennedy, Lorenzo Hubbell); Navajo leaders (Manuelito, Chee Dodge); the arrival of the railroad, boarding schools, and wagons; as well as Franciscan connections with some anthropologists (e.g., Stewart Culin, Washington Matthews, Edward Sapir, Clyde Kluckhohn). Of particular interest, at least to some readers, will be Haile's reflective explanations of how he developed his ideas about orthography, where anthropological training fit into his Franciscan endeavors, how the 1910 *Ethnologic Dictionary* attributed to "The Franciscan Fathers" came about and who really contributed to it, and how it was that for a while, St. Michaels had a printing press. Other chapters recall some of the duties of the early priests, be these sick calls, instructing school children, dealing with thieves, or burials. Yet others provide reviews of Franciscan history; explanations of Franciscan organization; and recollections of early days at St. Michaels, Chinle, and Lukachukai. These chapters are well supported by carefully researched endnotes wherein Bodo provides concise summaries of individual Franciscans' lives. In sum, the volume is unique and refreshing, while also sobering in its documentation of turn-of-the-century conditions on the Navajo reservation, and the impact of the next fifty-four years.

Although minimal, some errors need mention; on page 123, 1987 should be 1897, and the difference between Bodo's date of August 1915 (p. xx) and

Haile's of 1914 (pp. 73, 76) for his arrival in Lukachukai needs resolution. Likewise, the anonymously authored statement, published in 1954 and reprinted here (p. 211), that Blessingway is a nine-day ceremonial needs correction as does the fused word "menthey" on the same page. Additionally, a few misspelled words and place and personal names need correction. I would also suggest adding at least two references to appropriate endnotes and the bibliography for Halpern and McGreevy's *Washington Matthews: Studies of Navajo Culture, 1880-1894* and David M. Brugge's *Hubbell Trading Post: National Historic Site*. Finally, it is worth noting that as part of the Franciscans' centennial celebration, it became possible this summer to augment Bodo's intriguing presentation of Father Berard's remembrances with *Laborers of the Harvest* (Gallup: Indian Trader, Inc., 1998), collected essays by Father Cormac Antram, O. F. M., known to many for his Navajo language radio broadcasts.

Charlotte J. Frisbie

Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville

Two-Spirit People: Native American Gender Identity, Sexuality and Spirituality. Edited by Sue-Ellen Jacobs, Wesley Thomas, and Sabine Lang. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press. 331 pages. \$44.95 cloth; \$19.95 paper.

Since the publication of Walter Williams' *The Spirit in the Flesh* (1986), interest in American Indian gender systems, and particularly the role of the so-called "berdache" in those gender systems, has received increasing attention. The publication of *Two-Spirit People: Native American Gender Identity, Sexuality and Spirituality*, edited by Sue-Ellen Jacobs, Wesley Thomas, and Sabine Lang is one of several new books on the topic, and this volume is especially important. With the increasing involvement of American Indian people in academic discourses on Native American gender and the revisionist approaches recently advocated by anthropologists, *Two-Spirit People* represents an important new direction in the study of its subject. The volume contains essays by American Indian and non-Indian contributors and offers some fresh perspectives on the long-acknowledged but misunderstood phenomenon of the so-called berdache in American Indian cultures as well as the role this traditional category plays in the lives of contemporary gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgendered, and other Native American people.

As Jacobs, Thomas, and Lang note in their introduction, "'berdache' is now considered to be an inappropriate and insulting term by a number of Native Americans as well as by anthropologists" (p. 3). It has been replaced by "two-spirit," a term coined by the individuals attending the third Native American/First Nations gay and lesbian conference in Winnipeg in 1990 (p. 2). A 1994 editorial in *American Anthropologist* by Jacobs called for the end of the use of the term *berdache*. Although most contributors to *Two-Spirit People* have accepted the two-spirit designation, others qualify its use—in some cases preferring the individual designations that various tribal languages have for