

**UCLA**

**American Indian Culture and Research Journal**

**Title**

Freedom's Frontier: California and the Struggle over Unfree Labor, Emancipation and Reconstruction. By Stacey L. Smith.

**Permalink**

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3ns1v97k>

**Journal**

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 38(4)

**ISSN**

0161-6463

**Author**

Bauer, William J., Jr.

**Publication Date**

2014-09-01

**DOI**

10.17953

**Copyright Information**

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

questions in the New Zealand context, much of the work can be applied to other settler nations as well, specifically Canada, Australia, and the United States. The National Film Board of Canada and Screen Australia have helped to promote indigenous audiovisual production in these nations, bringing worldwide acclaim to such indigenous artists such as Zacharias Kunuk and Warwick Thornton. Of course, government support for filmmaking is virtually nonexistent in the United States; this collection reminds Americans that we are far behind when it comes to valuing the creative output of our indigenous media producers.

*Jennifer L. Gauthier*

Randolph College, Virginia

**Freedom's Frontier: California and the Struggle over Unfree Labor, Emancipation and Reconstruction.** By Stacey L. Smith. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2013. 344 pgs. \$39.95 cloth.

In 1892, an Arizona man wrote to the agent at northern California's Round Valley Indian Reservation. The man explained that in the 1850s or 1860s he had acquired an indentured servant, a Yuki woman from Round Valley named Betty, and that although Betty had continued to live with him in Arizona, she now wanted to return and hoped to acquire an allotment on the Round Valley reservation. Historian Stacey Smith's *Freedom's Frontier*, a political history that places California Indian unfree labor within the context of unfree labor in the United States during the Civil War and Reconstruction eras, helps us to understand such stories.

California Indian historians have long known about the presence of indentured servants and unfree Indian workers like Betty. For example, Albert Hurtado, Michael Magliari, and anthropologist Robert Heizer have detailed the Act for the Government and Protection of the Indians that legalized California Indian indenture, plunging into the dusty recesses of county archives to emerge with elusive sources to better understand unfree California Indian labor. In comparing California Indian unfree workers to other bound California laborers during the antebellum and Civil War eras, Smith argues that, if not outright slavery, unfree labor existed even though state laws had outlawed the practice of chattel slavery—as laws also did in the northern United States. The debates concerning unfree labor in California resulted in providing only uneven levels of freedom for California Indians and other laborers. Indeed, the author argues that the debate over unfree labor led to the creation of laws that prohibited Chinese immigrants from entering the United States. Although

the book offers a helpful view on California Indian unfree labor, the book's primary focus on the political leaves open space for further investigation.

Before the discovery of gold in California, Mexican rancheros used debt servitude, captive raiding, and slavery to secure California Indian workers, as well as wage labor. Natives were not the only unfree workers in the state: Sonorans, Chileans, Hawaiians, Chinese, and African Americans also found themselves in unfree labor systems that ranged from contract servitude to chattel slavery. At the beginning of the Gold Rush, rancheros used bound California Indian workers to search for gold. Such labor arrangements clashed with the free labor sensibilities of many newly arrived white Americans in the diggings, and white Californians excluded California Indian unfree workers. Even if this may be a well-known story by now, Smith's ability to compare of California Indian unfreedom with that of other workers is especially illuminating.

California politicians voted to ban slavery. Smith analyzes how California Indian unfree labor persisted in a free state, pointing out that although California Indian workers were not welcome in the diggings, some California families desired domestic workers. In 1850 California politicians enabled white Californians to indenture California Indians by passing the Act for the Government and Protection of the Indians and several guardianship laws. Here, California Indians found themselves in a situation similar to that of African-American children, who, although not enslaved in California, found themselves appropriated by means of guardianship and indenture laws. As Smith highlights, California judges often accepted Indian children indentured to non-Indian families with little to no evidence. In 1860, California politicians expanded the indenture laws in response to white-Indian violence in north-western California. Politicians believed that indentured labor would preserve peace and assimilate indigenous peoples.

Related to the indenture of Indian children, Smith explores the traffic of California Indian women in the 1850s and 1860s. Smith feelingly animates the narrative of California Indian unfreedom with the story of Lassik Lucy Young, whom white men bought and sold as a domestic servant and concubine. After discussing Young's life, Smith attends to the manner in which California politicians dealt with the trafficking of Indian women. California politicians blamed the nefarious commerce on "squaw men" living on the edges of civilization who stole and lived with California Indian women and had lost their "whiteness." In order to protect California Indian women, Republican politicians recommended that Indians move to reservations far away from white settlement. However, reservations failed to prevent kidnapping and anti-reservation politicians alleged that the reservation system enabled squaw men to abduct Indian women. In addition, Indian women had little legal recourse in comparison to trafficked Chinese women. California politicians argued that Chinese men

and Chinese gender practices led to Chinese women prostituting themselves and blamed Chinese women for their trafficking. Yet Chinese women's voices appear in court records, so Chinese women at least were able to comment on their unfree status. The record of California Indian women voices is thin; Lucy Young's oral history, taken years after her experience as a trafficked woman, is a rare view into California Indian unfreedom.

As elsewhere in the United States, Emancipation and Reconstruction produced uneven freedoms and civil rights. After the Civil War, California ended the apprenticeship system in California, but forced labor endured on reservations run by agents appointed by the Republican Party. Similarly, African Americans and Chinese unfree workers endured only limited freedoms in California. Ultimately, Smith concludes, the effort to eradicate unfree labor in California led to the creation of Chinese exclusion in the 1880s.

Smith writes a compelling political history of unfree labor in California in which the focus is primarily on debates between Republican and Democratic politicians and resulting legislation. In addition, *Freedom's Frontier* examines the machinations of county judges and magistrates to secure unfree Indian workers. Yet, readers lose sight of the unfree workers themselves. One wonders how Betty got from California to Arizona. What were her experiences? What did she think and feel about a life lived, in part, in bondage? Admittedly, this is a difficult topic on which to write because of the lack of sources, but nonetheless future scholarship on captive labor should look for ways to include more California Indian voices into the story. That being said, this book inserts California Indians into a national discussion regarding unfree labor during the mid-nineteenth century and makes the American West integral for understanding the Civil War and Reconstruction.

*William J. Bauer Jr.*

University of Nevada–Las Vegas

**Language Planning and Policy in Native America: History, Theory, Praxis.**  
By Teresa L. McCarty. Bristol: Multilingual Matters, 2013. 269 pages.

*Language Planning and Policy in Native America: History, Theory, Praxis* is a timely and extensively researched book that provides a thorough overview of issues involved in the support and revitalization of the Native languages of North America. The author synthesizes an extensive literature on different aspects of language planning and policy (LPP) in North America, not only engaging with the history and sociopolitical context of the languages themselves and bringing together case studies of language revitalization in practice,