

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache. By Keith H. Basso.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3s80d64r>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 21(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Greenfeld, Philip J.

Publication Date

1997-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

sively demonstrated elsewhere that U.S. treaty commissioners and other agents routinely encouraged the use of alcohol before and during treaty negotiations for land cessions, in order to take unfair advantage of the Indians' inebriation.

One of the strengths of this work includes Unrau's unflinching examination of questionable legal, economic, and political activities that defeated the federal government's efforts to keep alcohol out of Indian Country. Unrau carefully catalogues the legislative initiatives and responses that failed to control the introduction of liquor among Native peoples. He points out that this failure occurred largely due to the greed of white traders and the spasmodic responses of the U.S. military and government. Although Unrau omits the viewpoint of Native peoples in his work, he does an excellent job of elucidating the legal and political contortions that characterized white efforts to control the traffic in alcohol. Belief in the creed of entrepreneurial free enterprise and the insatiable quest for the huge profits that rewarded successful elusion of prohibition conspired to defeat governmental and legislative efforts at control. Unrau gives us a close-up view of these efforts and their ineffectiveness. This work will therefore provide a valuable starting point and guide to the legal records, treaties, and official reports in future research on this complex topic.

Donna Akers Whitt
University of California, Riverside

Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache. By Keith H. Basso. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1996. 171 pages. \$40.00 cloth; \$14.95 paper.

I have written a number of book reviews in my academic career, but perhaps never have I been asked to review one that gave me such pleasure when I read it. This book won the Western States Book Award for Creative Nonfiction. Certainly the reason it did is because Basso's ethnographic prose is so vivid that while reading the narrative it seems almost as if you were in the community of Cibecue, perhaps sitting in the yard of Basso's consultant, the late Nick Thompson, and you can see Nick: "He is smoking a Salem cigarette and studying with undisguised approval the shoes on his feet—a new pair of bright blue Nike running shoes trimmed in incandescent orange. He is also wearing a pair of faded green trousers, a bat-

tered brown cowboy hat, and a white T-shirt with 'Disneyland' printed in bold red letters across the front" (p. 42).

Such is the stuff of Basso's description, and it lures the reader into the experiential style that could probably be called post-modernist, the ethnography providing us with a subjective view of Apache notions of history and space, combined with the type of multivocalic statements that this type of contemporary "textual" approach is supposed to contain. This subjective, poetic, humanistic impression is, however, only temporary. As the prose carries you along, you begin to feel as if you really understand reality from a different point of view, not just Basso's as the resident ethnographer, but that of an Apache resident of Cibecue. The perspective is more than interpretative, however; it is explanatory in a scientific sense (as we were told during the ethnoscience craze of the late sixties, an ethnography is a theory of a culture). This book performs at the highest level the integration of the dualism of anthropology: the scientific and the humanistic, the subjective and the objective.

The book consists of but four short chapters, three of which have been published before in slightly different forms. The first chapter, "Quoting the Ancestors," appears in print for the first time in this book. The justification for republishing this material in a single source seems obvious once you have read it. All deal explicitly and in great detail about how place and story inform contemporary Apache values and behavior, and each chapter directly relates to the others and the central themes of the book to form a coherent whole. They also form a public report on research that Basso has been doing on behalf of the White Mountain Apache tribe since 1979.

Although all the chapters are important, especially compelling in this book are two insights into Apache worldview. The first, the subject of "Quoting the Ancestors," deals with history. The contrasts between a Euro-American view of history and a Western Apache view are striking. For Apaches, Basso points out that it is not who did what in what linear sequence, but where an event happened. Furthermore, the historical presentation is in terms of public performance—the recitation of a place name, the story that accompanies or explains it, and/or a song that makes it meaningful. Recounting history is public, social, and interactive. In contrast, history from the Euro-American point of view is private, isolated, and quiet. We read history silently, individually; and we focus on the lineal chain of events and the people who performed them. This distinction

seems to parallel another general distinction that has been noted by a number of people comparing and describing the differences between Indian and Anglo worldview, the fact that the Indian worldview in general is cyclic or non-linear in form, whereas the Euro-American worldview is linear.

A second major insight which is the subject of the final chapter in this remarkable book is how place and myth are linked to a notion of wisdom. The concluding chapter from which the book gets its title centers on a cryptic exchange between several Apache cowboys: "So! You've returned from Trail Goes Down Between Two Hills!... So! You got tired walking back and forth.... So! You've smelled enough burning piss!" (p. 113). This exchange relates to a place and a myth. The myth involves a particular place where the "Trail Goes Down Between Two Hills." It happens to be a place where Old Man Owl had an experience with two young women and was taught a lesson (they wore him out running back and forth between the two hills, and then pissed on him when he tried to get one of them down from a tree) because he could not contain his lust.

Basso's explication of this exchange provides an ingenious introduction to his further exegesis of the Apache concept of "wisdom" (*'igoyä'i*). Basso's explanation seems derived from recent linguistic approaches to semantic analysis which emphasize the importance of metaphor to explain abstract categories. Basso informs us that wisdom and/or the mind where it is found in humans metaphorically has texture, form, shape, location, and density. In this case the mind (*bini'*) is considered to be something like an enclosed space which in order to store wisdom must be "smooth" (*godilkôôh*), "durable or resilient" (*gontl'iz*) like a well-woven basket, and "strong or steady" (*gonldzil*). All these verbs begin with a dietic subject prefix (*go-*)—subject is a space or location—indicating the spatial qualities of the mind, as opposed to the brain which has a separate designation. Furthermore, wisdom is to be found in knowledge of specific locations in the landscape where it "sits" as if it were liquid in an open container, as the phrase *'igoyä'i goz'ää sikää* indicates. The last word in the phrase uses a handling verb stem which means "to carry a liquid in an open container," so the metaphor is one where wisdom is found in particular locations in the landscape where it may be drunk, and as is appropriate to an arid environment like water must be drunk to ensure survival. One acquires wisdom by knowing about these places where wisdom sits, and one lives one's life

well by using this wisdom.

Upon concluding the book, two things struck me based on my own knowledge of Western Apache and the White Mountain Apache reservation. The first is with respect to the particular metaphors used in characterizing wisdom. There is an interesting parallel to how Apaches refer to leaders and wealthy, influential, or distinguished people and families which Basso does not point out. Leaders are people who are considered to be individuals with wisdom and who continually remind people about how to behave; through their "talk" they are referred to as *hááłdzil* ("strong, powerful") or as *'ik'ád ntł'izi* ("wealthy," i.e., hard like jewelry). These are the same two stems (-*dzil* , -*tl'iz*) used to refer to how the mind must be in order to store wisdom. One question that comes to mind is: Are prominent people so called because of their minds, because of their wisdom, or is the use of the same metaphors simply accidental? A second question arises. Upon looking up the Old Man Owl story in Goodwin's *Myths and Tales of the White Mountain Apache*, the version there is much less specific as to location. Would East Fork, Cedar Creek, or North Fork (all other communities populated by descendants of different Western Apache bands and/or local groups) each have their own version of that story or any of the stories so linked to specific places in Cibecue by Cibecue residents?

This short book shines as an example of the best of contemporary ethnography and reflects the depth of understanding that Basso has acquired in his many years of research among the Cibecue Apache.

Philip J. Greenfeld
San Diego State University