

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Tradition and Change on the Northwest Coast: The Makah, Nuu-Chah-Nulth, Southern Kwakiutl and Nuxalk. By Ruth Kirk./ The Hopi Photographs: Kate Cory: 19051912. By Barton Wright, Marnie Gaede and Marc Gaede.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/3ss0f33k>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 13(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Gidley, Mick

Publication Date

1989

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

The volume deals with many aspects of Navajo history that pertains to the reservation at large. Although some of the book examines Indian policies and governance by the Bureau of Indian Affairs, this is not the major focus of the work. In a short amount of space, McPherson thoroughly examines one area of the Navajo Reservation that has been largely ignored by scholars. He uses excellent documents drawn from many sources. He utilizes oral histories, books, and articles. He weaves a work as unique and beautiful as a Navajo rug, one which should receive the serious consideration of anyone interested in the tribe's history. The book is well researched and tightly written. Perhaps others will follow the example of this work and write other regional histories of the Navajo Reservation.

Clifford E. Trafzer
San Diego State University

Tradition and Change on the Northwest Coast: The Makah, Nuu-Chah-Nulth, Southern Kwakiutl and Nuxalk. By Ruth Kirk. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1986. 256 pages. \$19.95 Cloth.

The Hopi Photographs: Kate Cory: 1905–1912. By Barton Wright, Marnie Gaede and Marc Gaede. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. 164 pages. \$35.00 Cloth. \$19.95 Paper.

At a time when increased understanding of Native American life-ways by members of the dominant culture is as necessary as ever, the avowed concept behind the production of *Tradition and Change on the Northwest Coast* is most worthwhile. Yorke Edwards' Foreword informs us that it was intended to be a popular book—"good science well written for the public," "accurate information" conveyed with "enjoyment"—and to this end Ruth Kirk, well known for her natural history works and western guide books, was approached to cooperate with a team of scholars from the British Columbia Provincial Museum in Victoria. Moreover, while the text is haunted now and again by a wisp of a ghost of the notion that pre-contact cultures were somewhat static and purer in their Indianness—time begins to "flow," then

fly, with the arrival of whites—its controlling philosophy emphasizes the continuity of Indian identities and cultures in and through change, the specific dynamics understood and valued in themselves.

Ruth Kirk was also encouraged to consult older folk among the Kwakwaka'wakw, Makah, Nootka, and Bella Colla speaking tribes featured in *Tradition and Change* so that the book could serve as "partly an Indian account of being Indian." Thus the book deploys recorded comments and memories of many present day and deceased elders—particularly in the first part, called "Today's Elders," but also intermittently throughout—that, taken together, give a sense of both the dislocations endured by Northwest Coast peoples and the profound connections between yesterday and today. Yesterday is then quite fully described in part two of the book, "The World that Was," and today in part three, "Time's Flow." Also, "The World that Was" is not made to end at some precisely chosen midnight, and "Time's Flow" is not seen as beginning at a similar juncture, whether the fateful approach of explorers' ships, the holocaust wrought by disease, or the implementation of destructive policies. Rather, the title is exact: tradition *and* change, throughout.

The author herself was clearly aware of the theoretical (and practical) problems of representing at all adequately the cultures of the selected peoples—indeed, as she says, "culture comes from human convictions and experiences; it fits only partially onto paper." The book is richer rather than poorer because of this awareness. It imparts in vivid form much valuable information on the Northwest Coast distilled from a wealth of previous accounts—including such well known resources as Franz Boas, the "anthropologist's anthropologist" George Hunt, and *The Autobiography of James Sewid*—and, in its personal testimony, an imaginatively coherent sense of ongoing life there. Culture also fits "only partially" onto engraving plates and film, and while the book sometimes seems to accept pictures at their face value, so to speak, as if they were totally unproblematic documents, it is further enriched by its array of historical and present day illustrations, many of them in color. I hope that *Tradition and Change* will reach both the wide readership for which it was written and the more specialist one that it also deserves.

While the illustrations are a significant component of Ruth Kirk's book, they are the whole *raison d'être* of *The Hopi Photo-*

graphs. They were made by a relatively obscure painter, Kate Cory, who moved from the East to the Hopi mesas in 1905, lived there for a number of years, then settled in Prescott until her death in 1958. It is not known whether Cory took them as an *aide memoire* for her painting, as a record of her own experiences at Walpi, or, perhaps together with her vocabularies of the Hopi language, as part of a larger anthropological effort. The compilers of this collection, reprinted from their small press publication of two years earlier, do not state what documentation survived with the 642 negatives they were able to choose from, but Marc Gaede does give a graphic account of the painstaking feat pulled off in their restoration and printing. Many of the pictures are beautiful objects in their own right, capable of giving aesthetic pleasure to anyone with an eye to see. Also, insofar as data as such is valuable, all of them are good to have and it may well be true, as the compilers claim, that Hopi elders could find in them information on traditions now lost.

However, as I have written at some length in an earlier issue of the *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* (9:3, 1985, 37-47) in looking at Indian photographs it is important to consider special problems caused by the persistence of convictions about the supposed transparent realism of photography as a medium, the sheer plenitude of Indian images, and the significance(s) of the context(s) in which they were and are produced and disseminated. Confronting *The Hopi Photographs* with such notions in mind the first thing to notice is that its author is not Kate Cory, but the team of compilers. The story that Barton Wright and the Gaedes have chosen to tell is almost wholly that of "a moment frozen in time, when change"—time's flow again—"had not yet overwhelmed the enduring Hopi." The 68 images which represent that moment largely depict, in chronological order, aspects of the Hopi ceremonial year. They are juxtaposed, collage-like, to a series of quotations culled from an impressive range of previous accounts of the practices they depict. In sum—despite the reproduction of a rare image of the internal violence that occurred when Oraibi fragmented in 1906—this is a representation of Hopi culture as exotic, timeless, and whole. This representation, through the work of Edward S. Curtis and others (in *The Hopi Photographs* adversely compared to Cory) is in turn already familiar to us. I suggest that the reasons for its prevalence are to be found not primarily in Hopi life, despite all its undoubted

complexity and power, but in the nature of the dominant culture. Perhaps we will eventually see a searching study of the history of this representation, and of the needs it obviously still meets.

Mick Gidley
University of Exeter

The Oneida Indian Experience: Two Perspectives. Edited by Jack Campisi and Laurence M. Hauptman. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1988. 223 pages, three maps, index. \$29.95 Cloth. \$14.95 Paper.

What factors and forces have contributed to the survival of Native American communities? Some scholars assign great importance to the role of land, that is, the preservation of a homeland today held in trust. While land may represent the locus of tribal lifestyles, the calculus of survival must include a collective tenacity to overcome adversity. Many tribes have struggled to sustain indigenous culture by reaffirming tradition and by inculcating in their youth the value as well as timeliness of knowing their native tongue. In fact, philosopher Orville Clark poignantly identifies this critical concern: "A tribe without a language of its own is seen as more vulnerable to federal threats to its sovereignty, to accusations that its members have assimilated to the majority culture" (141). It can be shown that the loss of particular culture traits or universals, such as language and native leadership, may indeed be the undoing of a tribe even if the landbase, in part, remains in trust. The book under review does not stand alone in identifying the critical mix of tradition and adopted culture that makes it work for a given tribe. Yet *The Oneida Indian Experience* speaks for countless tribes.

Land, culture change and tribal survival form the focus of this collective enterprise, which grew out of an Oneida-sponsored conference in 1986. Some two dozen authors—about equally divided between Indian and non-Indian—have come together to provide both a retrospect and prospect of the Oneida, focusing on members of the nation in Wisconsin but dealing with the entire nation in the historic narrative from the time of contact. Jack Campisi (anthropologist) has co-edited two other books on the Iroquois and other Northeast Indians and is well identified as an