UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Tecumseh: Shawnee Rebel. By Robert Cwiklik.

Permalink

https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4035b3pg

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal, 18(2)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Hickman, Neal D.

Publication Date

1994-03-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/

specialized warriors who are trained, equipped, and led by a structured hierarchy of leaders. Normally, it means systematic campaigns with planned objectives; occasional raids of a few men in a hit-and-run attack is fighting, not warfare. It is doubtful that true warfare existed among the Kayenta, although fighting no doubt did. But fighting or warfare, there is little doubt that such activity directly affects the organization and behavior of the groups involved.

The authors write as if they believe they originated the idea that hostilities and fighting helped shape the structure and organization of Kayenta society. They seem astonished that living sites in the Kayenta area were so often chosen with defense and line-of-sight visibility as a primary consideration. Yet every tourist who has ever visited the ruins of this area has noted the obvious defensive nature of the setting and structures. Even the most casual visitor to nearby Wupatki or Walnut Canyon cannot help but see that defensive positions, often carefully chosen with remarkable awareness for their observational advantages, are ubiquitous to the region. Of course, it never hurts to quantify such casual observations, but it should be made clear that this is not a new issue.

What answers did the authors find to the theoretical questions raised in this study? If there were any, this report did not reveal them. The authors state that their conclusions about tribal formation in the Kayenta region were "limited." But they did find more questions! They also claim that their work led to new insights regarding both the nature of tribal organization and the evolution of tribal polities. In truth, however, these insights were nothing but speculation. Perhaps the biggest insight gained was that, in attempting to go beyond mere reporting and explore the theoretical issues involved, it is easier to ask questions than to answer them. That is an insight we can all use.

Charles C. Case

Tecumseh: Shawnee Rebel. By Robert Cwiklik. New York: Chelsea House Publishers, 1993. 112 pages. \$18.95.

Tecumseh was one of the most important Indian leaders of the nineteenth century, as well as one of the most misunderstood. In this short work for young people, Robert Cwiklik chronicles the Reviews 265

life of the Shawnee warrior. His book is one of twenty-two in Chelsea House Publishers' "North American Indians of Achievement" series. Although successfully offering a romantic and inspirational portrayal of Tecumseh and his noble achievements, Cwiklik looks at Tecumseh's life and struggle from a non-Indian perspective, and he does not devote enough attention to the interaction between Tecumseh and his brother, Tenskwatawa, or the larger Indian community.

The book begins with a three-page essay entitled "On Indian Leadership," by historian W. David Baird. Baird suggests that Indian leadership is conditioned by culture, time, place, and circumstance. True, the Shawnee warrior, as a social, political, and military leader appropriate to his time, built coalitions among tribes, just as whites built coalitions of states and nations. The historical events in the remainder of the book are organized into the action/adventure form for the video generation. In fact, the eight chapters of the book are replete with archival pictures that illustrate people, places, and events.

The story opens in 1810 with a meeting between Tecumseh and William Henry Harrison at Vincennes. The mid-section of the book involves "character development" of Tecumseh, Harrison, Tenskwatawa, and other historical figures. The pace of events speeds up when Tecumseh takes the reigns of the Indian resistance movement from his brother after the Battle of Tippecanoe. The climax occurs when Tecumseh is killed in battle on the Thames River as the British-Indian alliance, led by British General Henry Proctor and Tecumseh, is defeated by a larger force of American troops, led by Harrison.

A major problem with organizing the history of Tecumseh's life in this way is that action/adventure films inevitably end with the protagonist defeating the antagonist. In this story, Harrison defeats Tecumseh. Thus, it might be argued that the very structure of the book implies that white Americans were the "good" protagonists and the Indians were the "bad" antagonists. The organization of events in *Tecumseh* makes for lively reading, but it is not an accurate portrayal of the Shawnee leader and his world.

Tecumseh is also referred to in the title and text of the book as a "rebel." The word *rebel* has a disobedient connotation. To many Indians, Tecumseh was a patriot. A negative portrayal of Tecumseh was not the intention of the author, however, who points out the many broken treaties and other injustices suffered by the Shawnee leader and his people.

The book ends with a two-page index, a chronology of important developments in Tecumseh's life, and a list of eleven books suggested for further reading. One of the suggested books is Tecumseh and the Quest for Indian Leadership by R. David Edmunds, the best book for serious students of Tecumseh's life. Edmunds suggests that more important than the conflict between Tecumseh and Harrison is the tension between Tecumseh and his younger brother Tenskwatawa—also known as the Shawnee Prophet. This thesis is expanded in another work by Edmunds The Shawnee Prophet. Tecumseh's political and military coalition was made possible by Tenskwatawa's religious vision of tribal alliances. In fact, the Shawnee Prophet was the clear leader of the Indian resistance movement until the Battle of Tippecanoe. The book under review plays down Tenskwatawa's role in Tecumseh's life, while emphasizing tension between Tecumseh and William Henry Harrison. Nevertheless, this is a fast-reading book that will capture the interest of its targeted audience.

Neal D. Hickman University of California, Riverside