UC Berkeley UC Berkeley Previously Published Works

Title

Additive effects of acidification and mineralogy on calcium isotopes in Triassic/Jurassic boundary limestones

Permalink https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4916s0cf

Journal Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems, 18(1)

ISSN 1525-2027

Authors

Jost, Adam B Bachan, Aviv van de Schootbrugge, Bas <u>et al.</u>

Publication Date 2017

DOI

10.1002/2016gc006724

Peer reviewed

Additive effects of acidification and mineralogy on calcium isotopes in Triassic/Jurassic boundary limestones

Adam B. Jost¹*, Aviv Bachan¹, Bas van de Schootbrugge², Shaun T. Brown^{3,4}, Donald J.
DePaolo^{3,4}, and Jonathan L. Payne¹

⁵ ¹Department of Geological Sciences, Stanford University, 450 Serra Mall, Bldg. 320, Stanford,

6 CA 94305 USA. ²Department of Earth Sciences, Utrecht University, Marine Palynology &

7 Paleoceanography Group, Heidelberglaan 2, 3584 CS Utrecht, Netherlands. ³Department of

8 Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California, Berkeley, 307 McCone Hall, Berkeley,

9 CA 94720 USA. ⁴Geochemistry Department, Earth Science Division, Lawrence Berkeley

10 National Laboratory, 1 Cyclotron Rd., Berkeley, CA 94720 USA.

11 Corresponding author: Adam B. Jost (<u>abjost@mit.edu</u>)

12 *Current address: Department of Earth, Atmospheric, and Planetary Sciences, Massachusetts

13 Institute of Technology, 77 Massachusetts Ave. 54, Cambridge, MA 02139 USA.

14 Key Points:

- We observe a large negative calcium isotope excursion above the Triassic/Jurassic boundary.
- Numerical modeling indicates the excursion is too large to be attributed to ocean
 acidification alone.
- Much of the excursion is due to higher proportions of aragonite in our samples, possibly
 favored during recovery from acidification.

21

22 Abstract

The end-Triassic mass extinction coincided with a negative δ^{13} C excursion, consistent with 23 release of ¹³C-depleted CO₂ from the Central Atlantic Magmatic Province. However, the amount 24 of carbon released and its effects on ocean chemistry are poorly constrained. The coupled nature 25 of the carbon and calcium cycles allows calcium isotopes to be used for constraining carbon 26 cycle dynamics and vice versa. We present a high-resolution calcium isotope ($\delta^{44/40}$ Ca) record 27 from 100 m of marine limestone spanning the Triassic/Jurassic boundary in two stratigraphic 28 sections from northern Italy. Immediately above the extinction horizon and the associated 29 negative excursion in δ^{13} C, $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca decreases by ca. 0.8‰ in 20 m of section and then recovers 30 to pre-excursion values. Coupled numerical models of the geological carbon and calcium cycles 31 demonstrate that this $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion is too large to be explained by changes to seawater 32 $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca alone, regardless of CO₂ injection volume and duration. Less than 20% of the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca 33 excursion can be attributed to acidification. The remaining 80% likely reflects a higher 34 proportion of aragonite in the original sediment, based largely on high concentrations of Sr in the 35 samples. Our study demonstrates that coupled models of the carbon and calcium cycles have the 36 potential to help distinguish contributions of primary seawater isotopic changes from local or 37 diagenetic effects on the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca of carbonate sediments. Differentiating between these effects is 38 critical for constraining the impact of ocean acidification during the end-Triassic mass 39 40 extinction, as well as for interpreting other environmental events in the geologic past.

41 **1 Introduction**

42 The end-Triassic mass extinction (ca. 201.6 Ma) was one of the five most severe biotic crises of the Phanerozoic [Raup and Sepkoski, 1982]. Ocean acidification has been invoked as a 43 kill mechanism based on the preferential loss of heavily calcified marine animals [Hautmann, 44 2006; *Kiessling and Simpson*, 2011; *McRoberts et al.*, 2012] and a decrease in CaCO₃ deposition 45 in marine stratigraphic sections [Hautmann, 2004]. The extinction is coeval with the 46 emplacement of the Central Atlantic Magmatic Province (CAMP) [Blackburn et al., 2013], an 47 48 increase in atmospheric pCO₂ [Schaller et al., 2011; Steinthorsdottir et al., 2011], and a negative excursion in the δ^{13} C of CaCO₃ and organic matter [see *Bartolini et al.*, 2012; *Greene et al.*, 49 2012] suggesting the release of CO₂ from CAMP triggered the loss of marine life. However, the 50 amount of carbon released and the extent of resulting ocean acidification remains poorly 51 quantified. Determining the mass and isotopic composition of carbon release during the end-52 Triassic mass extinction is critical both to pinpointing the source of carbon and to quantifying the 53 degree of ocean acidification. 54

Some studies have attempted to constrain release volumes using pCO_2 proxies [*Beerling and Berner*, 2002], but these data have low temporal resolution and may not capture the highest concentrations of pCO_2 that occurred during and immediately after injection. Two recent studies have attempted to accurately replicate the $\delta^{13}C$ record by modeling pulsed releases of CO₂ from CAMP[*Bachan and Payne*, 2015; *Paris et al.*, 2016], but neither study includes model

verification using a second geochemical record. Testing extinction scenarios that are constructed
 to explain carbon isotope data against their predictions for additional isotopes systems is one

62 effective avenue towards better understanding the sequence of events during the Triassic-Jurassic

63 transition.

64 The calcium cycle is linked to the carbon cycle through burial of CaCO₃ and dependency 65 between weathering of Ca-bearing minerals and atmospheric pCO₂. Paired δ^{13} C and $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca

- records can potentially be used to quantify the amount and composition of carbon required for a 66 negative δ^{13} C excursion and to test the hypothesis of ocean acidification [*Pavne et al.*, 2010a; 67 Komar and Zeebe, 2011, 2016; Griffith et al., 2015]. Under acidification, excess volcanic CO₂ 68 dissolves into seawater, shifting the distribution of dissolved carbonate species away from $CO_3^{2^2}$ 69 and decreasing the saturation state of $CaCO_3$ (Ω). CaCO₃ precipitation fractionates calcium 70 isotopes and favors ⁴⁰Ca over ⁴⁴Ca. As a result, a relative decrease in CaCO₃ burial results in less 71 preferential removal of ⁴⁰Ca from seawater and would cause a negative excursion in $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca 72 beginning at the time of carbon release [Payne et al., 2010b]. In addition, increased weathering 73 and seafloor dissolution of CaCO₃ as a consequence of high pCO₂ and reduced Ω , respectively, 74 would add isotopically light calcium to seawater. Similarly, δ^{13} C can be used to place broader 75 constraints on mechanisms underlying $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca variation. Paired data that cannot be explained by 76 any plausible environmental scenario can be used to identify cases in which one or both isotope 77 records are unlikely to represent ancient seawater or atmospheric compositions, but instead 78
- reflect degree of influence from local or diagenetic effects.
- 80 With the goal of better constraining the nature of carbon release and the severity of ocean 81 acidification, we present new $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca data paired with previously published δ^{13} C data [*Bachan et* 82 *al.*, 2012, 2014] from samples collected at two sections spanning the end-Triassic extinction and 83 Early Jurassic recovery from the Lombardy Basin in Italy. We then use numerical simulations of
- ⁸⁴ CO₂ injection into a coupled model of the carbon and calcium cycles to constrain the
- mechanisms responsible for δ^{13} C and $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca variations.



Figure 1. Paleogeographic reconstruction ca. 200 Ma showing the extent of CAMP and the location of Italy. Inset shows the location of the Lombardy Basin in Italy, where the Val Adrara (45°43'29.33"N, 9°57'32.29"E) and

Italcementi (45°46'35.48"N, 9°30'27.09"E) sections are located. Modified from van de Schootbrugge et al. [2008] 89

90 and Bachan et al. [2012].

91 2 Materials and Methods

2.1 Geologic Setting 92

The Val Adrara and Italcementi sections are located in the Lombardy Basin of northern 93 Italy (Fig. 1). The two sections are separated by 35 km, with Val Adrara representing a more 94 distal setting on a shallowly dipping, subtidal ramp. Each section spans approximately 100 m of 95 stratigraphy, including the T/J boundary [Bachan et al., 2012]. Facies successions are similar 96 between the two sections. Both sections have previously been studied for sedimentology. 97 paleontology and δ^{13} C stratigraphy [see *Bachan et al.*, 2012]. 98

Both sections begin in the uppermost Triassic (Rhaetian) Zu limestone, which is 99 composed of algal, molluscan, and coralline packstone and wackestone. Rhaetian fossils, 100 including the Rhaetian pollen taxon *Rhaetipollis germanicus*, last occur in the uppermost Zu 101 102 limestone and are absent from the overlying Malanotte Formation (Fm.) [Galli et al., 2005]. At these sections, the Malanotte Fm. is interpreted as lowermost Hettangian in age based on the 103 acme of *Krauselisporites reissingeri* and the accompanying assemblage of other Hettangian-age 104 pollen taxa [Galli et al., 2007]. The base of the Malanotte Fm. contains a marl interval, followed 105 by thinly bedded limestones and alternating shales transitioning upwards to shallower facies with 106 more abundant bedforms and carbonate grains by the top of the formation [Bachan et al., 2012]. 107 The overlying Albenza Fm. comprises peloidal and oolitic packstone and grainstone with some 108 molluscan material [Bachan et al., 2012]. Correlation between the two sections is anchored by 109 the base of the lowermost Jurassic Malanotte Fm. We refined these correlations based on the 110

biostratigraphy of Galli et al. [2007] and the δ^{13} C data of *Bachan et al.* [2012]. 111

2.2 Geochemical methods 112

We cut limestone samples using a tile saw and drilled micrite from cut faces for $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca 113 and major/trace element analyses using a bench-top drill press equipped with a 0.8 mm dental 114 drill. Carbonate powders were digested overnight in 1 M acetic acid, centrifuged, and separated 115 from the insoluble fraction to avoid contamination from non-carbonate phases such as clavs and 116 organic matter. After separation from the insoluble fraction, carbonate samples were dried and 117 redissolved in 3.0 M HNO₃. Dissolved samples were then spiked with a ⁴²Ca- and ⁴⁸Ca-enriched 118 tracer to allow for correction of mass-dependent fractionation occurring during analysis. Typical 119 42 Ca/ 44 Ca ratios of spiked samples were 2–3. Calcium was purified from the sample matrix using 120 DGA resin (Eichrom). Samples were loaded on the resin in 3 M HNO₃ and the matrix was eluted 121 with subsequent additions of 3 M HNO₃ to the column. Calcium was then eluted using DI H₂O, 122 dried down and treated with concentrated HNO₃ to destroy residual organics from the resin. For 123 each analysis, approximately 3 µg of the purified calcium sample was loaded onto zone-refined 124 Re in a double filament configuration. Samples were run in a Thermo-Fisher Triton multi-125 collector thermal ionization mass spectrometer (TIMS) at the Center for Isotope Geochemistry 126 (CIG), University of California, Berkeley. $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca values are reported relative to Bulk Silicate 127 Earth (BSE) (${}^{40}Ca/{}^{44}Ca = 47.162$ and ${}^{42}Ca/{}^{44}Ca = 0.31221$) in standard δ -notation. NIST SRM-128

- 915a is -1.00% on the BSE scale and seawater is +0.91% [Nielsen et al., 2011]. SRM-915A 129
- averaged -1.03% during this study and the long term reproducibility at CIG is $\sim 0.1\%$. 130

Concentrations of major and trace elements (Ca, Mg, Mn, Sr) were measured with an 131 inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometer (ICP-OES) in the Environmental 132 Measurements Lab at Stanford University. Carbon isotopes from both sections were measured 133 and presented by van de Schootbrugge et al. [2008] and Bachan et al. [2012, 2014]. Bachan et 134 al. [2012] labeled the initial negative excursion (N1), and two subsequent positive excursions 135 (P1 and P2) in the southern Alps. The N1 and P1 excursions are present within both sections in 136 this study (Fig. 2), and the P2 excursion is present at Val Adrara, albeit above our study interval. 137

3 Results 138

The two measured sections exhibit similar records of stratigraphic variation in $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca (Table 1, Fig. 2). At Val Adrara, $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca increases from -0.77‰ at the base of the section to -139

140

0.45% at the Triassic/Jurassic (T/J) boundary. Just above the boundary, $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca decreases as low 141 as -1.17% in the Malanotte Fm. $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca then recovers to -0.39% in the uppermost Malanotte

142 above a stratigraphic gap, and ends at -0.67% in the lower Albenza Fm. At Italcementi, $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca 143

starts at -0.89% at the base of the section, increases to -0.26% before the T/J boundary, and 144

then rapidly decreases to values as low as -1.13% in the lower Malanotte Fm. The record at 145

Italcementi provides more detail in the upper Malanotte Fm., showing a steady recovery from the 146

nadir up to -0.46‰ by the base of the Albenza Fm. The section ends in the lower Albenza at -147

0.68%. In both sections, the onset of the negative $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion coincides with the N1 148

excursion in the δ^{13} C record. The nadir of the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion occurs approximately 5 m above 149

the peak of the P1 excursion in δ^{13} C. 150



Figure 2. The δ^{13} C, $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca, and [Sr] data from each section, exhibiting large excursions immediately above the Triassic/Jurassic boundary. Dark blue is Val Adrara, orange is Italcementi. Val Adrara data are plotted by stratigraphic height, and Italcementi points are minimally adjusted to best match the δ^{13} C at Val Adrara. Errors on $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca are calculated from replicate measurements of the same sample.

Stratigraphic variations in [Sr] are also similar between the two sections (Table 1, Fig. 2).
 Both exhibit uppermost Triassic baseline [Sr] values near 650 ppm (µg/g rock), followed by a

sharp rise to ca. 2800 ppm and a steady decrease back to baseline concentrations in the lower

Albenza Fm. The [Sr] and $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca values are inversely correlated at both locations (Val Adrara:

160 Spearman's $\rho = -0.71$, p = 0.002; Italcementi: $\rho = -0.76$, p = 0.001) (see Table S1 for all

161 correlation coefficients).

162 **4 Discussion**

163 The co-occurrence of the negative $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion with a rapid negative excursion in 164 δ^{13} C and the last occurrences of Triassic fossils and the carbonate-poor boundary marl is 165 consistent with an acidification scenario for the mass extinction event. To explore the extent to 166 which acidification can account quantitatively for the coupled variations in $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca and δ^{13} C, we 167 simulated CO₂ injection using a coupled numerical model of the geological carbon and calcium 168 cycles. Our model, similar to one introduced by Bachan and Payne [2015], uses mass and 169 isotopic fluxes of carbon and calcium in a single ocean-atmosphere reservoir.

170 **Table 1.** Geochemical data from Val Adrara and Italcementi. For full δ^{13} C data, see *Bachan et al.* [2012, 2014]. 2σ 171 values for $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca are calculated from replicate measurements of the same sample. Standard deviations on Ca, Mg,

- 172 Sr, and Mn measurements based on standard replicate measurements are 0.6 wt%, 0.03 wt%, 1 μ g/g rock, and 3 μ g/g
- 173 rock, respectively.

Stratigraphic	δ ¹³ C	δ ¹⁸ 0	Ca	Mg	Sr	Mn	$\delta^{_{44/40}}$ Ca	$\delta^{_{44/40}}$ Ca	$\delta^{_{44/40}}$ Ca	2σ for	n for
height (m)	(‰ VPDB)	(‰ VPDB)	(wt %)	(wt %)	(µg/g rock)	(µg/g rock)	(‰ BSE)	(‰ SRM-915a)	(‰ seawater)	$\delta^{_{44/40}}$ Ca	$\delta^{_{44/40}}$ Ca
Val Adrara											
2.8	1.87	-2.14	31.60	0.66	656	77	-0.77	-1.77	0.14	0.25	3
9.8	2.06	-2.19	31.00	0.57	929	73	-0.80	-1.80	0.11	0.11	2
20.0	1.36	-2.26	31.30	0.67	695	152	-0.39	-1.39	0.52	0.24	2
30.8	1.41	-3.52	29.70	0.66	378	68	-0.60	-1.60	0.31	0.17	2
40.0	2.64	-1.90	32.10	0.47	1204	26	-0.61	-1.61	0.30	0.03	2
46.9	2.54	-2.02	31.40	0.55	727	26	-0.45	-1.45	0.46	0.33	4
57.0	2.76	-2.56	33.67	0.40	2595	126	-0.79	-1.79	0.12	0.21	3
57.9	3.37	-1.68	34.74	0.41	2362	42	-1.02	-2.02	-0.11	0.13	2
64.7	3.79	-2.11	32.30	0.43	2660	74	-1.17	-2.17	-0.26	0.08	2
66.2	3.27	-3.20	35.39	0.32	2386	70	-1.03	-2.03	-0.12	0.16	2
67.7	3.06	-2.94	32.87	0.31	2175	87	-1.01	-2.01	-0.10	0.26	5
71.4	3.37	-2.59	33.20	0.41	1800	54	-1.08	-2.08	-0.17	0.08	2
79.0	3.03	-3.40	35.00	0.56	896	29	-0.39	-1.39	0.52	0.25	3
86.0	3.15	-5.84	35.35	0.66	392	13	-0.51	-1.51	0.40	0.13	2
95.0	4.40	-5.32	34.40	0.16	421	7	-0.51	-1.51	0.40	0.08	2
100.6	4.36	-5.68	33.50	1.29	460	13	-0.67	-1.67	0.24	0.17	2
Italcementi											
7.4	2.44	-1.40	NA	NA	NA	NA	-0.89	-1.89	0.02	0.14	2
23.9	2.50	-1.54	NA	NA	NA	NA	-0.67	-1.67	0.24	0.23	3
35.4	2.51	-1.59	20.30	0.50	507	513	-0.34	-1.34	0.57	0.47	3
41.1	2.68	-4.48	31.03	0.43	623	21	-0.51	-1.51	0.40	0.01	2
43.1	2.42	-2.91	35.98	0.30	433	19	-0.26	-1.26	0.65	0.04	2
45.5	2.58	-1.99	35.79	0.48	341	21	-0.68	-1.68	0.23	0.16	2
47.1	3.49	-1.88	26.08	0.71	624	111	-1.05	-2.05	-0.14	0.11	2
49.9	NA	NA	44.43	0.59	3592	85	-1.08	-2.08	-0.17	0.06	2
53.0	NA	NA	31.09	0.33	2173	38	-1.13	-2.13	-0.22	0.34	2
56.6	3.68	-1.92	39.76	0.41	2531	59	-0.96	-1.96	-0.05	0.11	2
61.0	3.73	-2.19	39.76	0.36	1880	74	-0.99	-1.99	-0.08	0.24	2
65.3	3.79	-2.56	31.26	0.31	1983	47	-0.89	-1.89	0.02	0.23	3
72.9	3.35	-2.14	30.44	0.31	2087	50	-0.70	-1.70	0.21	0.07	2
77.0	3.66	-2.05	35.67	0.59	1257	25	-0.80	-1.80	0.11	0.35	2
86.5	3.83	-2.58	35.76	0.45	687	15	-0.46	-1.46	0.45	0.18	2
93.0	3.93	-3.97	36.52	0.37	543	13	-0.53	-1.53	0.38	0.00	2
98.3	3.88	-6.70	34.89	0.37	748	7	-0.68	-1.68	0.23	0.24	2

175 CAMP likely erupted in four pulses [Schaller et al., 2011] over the early-middle Hettangian (spelae-liassicus zones [Hillebrandt et al., 2013]), or potentially into the late 176 Hettangian (*liassicus–angulata* zones [*Hillebrandt et al.*, 2013]) based on correlation of δ^{13} C in 177 northern Italy with geochronologically constrained sections elsewhere [Bachan and Pavne. 178 2015]. The interval examined in this study encompasses the N1 and P1 excursions, which likely 179 180 corresponds to the first observed increase in pCO_2 . If the N1 and P1 excursions were associated with first rise in CO₂ observed by Schaller et al. [2011, 2012], then our study interval post T/J 181 boundary is likely constrained to 270 kyr. Bachan and Payne [2015] modeled this initial eruptive 182 phase using a two-pulse injection (4200 Pg C at -70‰ and 14,400 Gt C at -5.5‰). In this study, 183

184 we opt for a single pulse of CO_2 for simplicity.

185 4.1 Model construct

We constructed a forward box model of the carbon and calcium cycles to predict the dynamics of these interconnected biogeochemical systems. The ocean is the sole reservoir in our model, in which we track the moles of dissolved inorganic carbon (M_C) , referred to in the text hereafter as *DIC*, dissolved Ca²⁺ (M_{Ca}) , dissolved phosphate (M_P) , and dissolved sulfate (M_S) . The changes in M_C can be expressed in terms of the major inputs and outputs to the

191 ocean/atmosphere carbon reservoir:

192
$$\frac{dM_C}{dt} = F_{w,carb} + F_{w,org} + F_{volc} - F_{b,org} - F_{b,carb}$$
 Eq. 1

where $F_{w,carb}$ and $F_{b,carb}$ are the weathering and burial of calcium carbonate rock, $F_{w,org}$ and $F_{b,org}$ are the weathering and burial of organic carbon, and F_{volc} is the release of volcanic CO₂. We set *DIC* and total alkalinity (*Alk*) to yield an initial *p*CO₂ value ~2000 ppm and a mean saturation state of calcite, $\Omega_{calcite}$ (herein simply Ω) of 1.75 (see Table 2 for a list of parameters). The

197 changes in M_{Ca} can be expressed similarly:

$$\frac{dM_{Ca}}{dt} = F_{w,sil} + F_{w,carb} - F_{b,carb}$$
 Eq. 2

where $F_{w,sil}$ is the weathering of Ca-bearing silicate rock. The initial concentration of Ca²⁺ is set to 17 mM, yielding a residence time of approximately 650 kyr (determined as $M_{Ca}/F_{b,carb}$ during steady state). Using equations from *Berner* [2004], we define the non-carbonate weathering fluxes (Ca-silicates, and organic C) and carbonate fluxes such that they each scale with the atmospheric *p*CO₂:

204
$$F_{w,t} = F_{w,i} (RCO_2)^{GZ} (1 + GZ log(RCO_2))^{0.65}$$
Eq. 3

205
$$F_{w,carb,t} = F_{w,carb,i}(RCO_2)^{GZ_{carb}}(1 + GZlog(RCO_2))$$
Eq. 4

where *G* and *Z* are constant scaling coefficients (see *Berner* [2004]) and RCO_2 is the ratio of CO_2 at time *t* relative to the level at the initial time *i*:

$$RCO_2 = \frac{pCO_{2,t}}{pCO_{2,i}}$$
 Eq. 5

209 pCO_2 is calculated from the total dissolved inorganic carbon (*DIC*), which is determined 210 from M_C :

211
$$DIC = \frac{M_C}{sV_{oc}}$$
 Eq. 6

and alkalinity (*Alk*):

198

213
$$Alk = 2\frac{M_{Ca^{2+}}}{sV_{oc}} - 2\frac{M_{SO_4^{2-}}}{sV_{oc}} + k_{alk}$$
 Eq. 7

where *s* is salinity, V_{oc} is ocean volume, and k_{alk} is a constant representing the remaining components of alkalinity, which we assume to be fixed during the perturbation. Thus, with *Alk* and *DIC* known, we solve for the other parameters of the carbonate system ([CO₃^{2–}], [HCO₃[–]], [H₂CO₃], *p*CO₂, pH) based on the methods outlined in *Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow* [2001]. The burial flux of CaCO₃ scales with Ω :

219
$$\Omega = \frac{[Ca^{2+}][CO_3^{2-}]}{K_{sp}}$$
 Eq. 8

where Ω values <1 imply undersaturation and dissolution, and $\Omega \ge 1$ implies saturation and precipitation. Thus, the burial of carbonate scales with Ω :

222
$$F_{b,carb,t} = F_{b,carb,t} \frac{\alpha_t - 1}{\alpha_t - 1}$$
 Eq. 9

223 Our model does not include a sediment reservoir, so we cannot explicitly dissolve CaCO₃

sediment during an acidification. However, if Ω drops below 1.0, $F_{b,carb}$ will become negative

and become an input into the ocean reservoir. This process simulates dissolution of CaCO₃ in the

absence of a dedicated sediment reservoir.

The burial of organic carbon is dependent on the relative changes in the amount of phosphate (M_P) , a limiting nutrient on geologic timescales, in seawater:

$$F_{b,org,t} = F_{b,org,i} k_{cp}$$
 Eq. 10

where k_{cp} is equivalent to the C:P ratio in ocean sediment:

231
$$k_{cp,t} = k_{cp,i} \left(\frac{M_{PO_4^{2^-},t}}{M_{PO_4^{2^-},i}}\right)^{p_{cp}}$$
Eq. 11

and p_{cp} is a scaling coefficient (assumed to be unity for all scenarios in this study—see *Bachan and Payne* [2015] for other uses). The C:P ratio in sediments is normally Redfieldian (106:1) in oxic conditions, but low oxygen conditions favor release of PO₄³⁻ sorbed on Fe(III) oxides [*Van Cappellen and Ingall*, 1996].

All of the carbon and calcium delivery and removal fluxes can be assigned an average isotopic composition to be used in determining the change in seawater isotopic composition over time:

239
240

$$M_{C}\frac{d\delta_{C}}{dt} = F_{volc}(\delta_{volc} - \delta_{C}) + F_{w,org}(\delta_{w,org} - \delta_{C}) + F_{w,carb}(\delta_{w.carb} - \delta_{C}) - F_{b,org}(\Delta_{org})$$
Eq. 12

241
$$M_{Ca}\frac{d\delta_{Ca}}{dt} = (F_{w,sil} + F_{w,carb})(\delta_{w,riv} - \delta_{Ca}) - F_{b,carb}(\Delta_{carb}) \qquad \text{Eq. 13}$$

where δ_{riv} is the average riverine $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca composition, calculated at each *t* based on the relative contribution of $F_{w,carb}$ and $F_{w,sil}$. We incorporate a carbon injection via a new variable F_{extra} with a δ^{13} C composition δ_{extra} . These are incorporated into Eqs. 1 and 11 such that:

245
$$\frac{dM_C}{dt} = F_{w,carb} + F_{w,org} + F_{volc} - F_{b,org} - F_{b,carb} + F_{extra} \qquad \text{Eq. 14}$$

246
$$M_C \frac{d\delta_C}{dt} = F_{volc}(\delta_{volc} - \delta_C) + F_{w,org}(\delta_{w,org} - \delta_C) + F_{w,carb}(\delta_{w,carb} - \delta_C)$$

247
$$\delta_{C}) - F_{b,org}(\Delta_{org}) + F_{extra}(\delta_{extra} - \delta_{C})$$
 Eq. 15

Initial values and parameters for the model are listed in Table 2. Equations are based on those in *Kump and Arthur* [1999], *Berner* [2004], *DePaolo* [2004], and *Bachan and Payne* [2015]. Select output from a single model run is illustrated in Figure 3.



251

Figure 3. Output from a single model run illustrating the typical geochemical patterns resulting from a CO₂ 252 perturbation in our model. From left to right, rate of CO₂ injection, δ^{13} C, $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca, $\Omega_{calcite}$, and pCO₂. This scenario 253 depicts an injection of 40,000 Pg C with a δ^{13} C value of -15% injected over 25 kyr. The grey lines signify the start 254

and end of the CO₂ injection. 255

4.2 Modeling results and the role of acidification in the excursion

We iteratively modeled a range of CO_2 injection volumes (from 5000 to 50,000 Pg C), 257 δ^{13} C compositions of injected CO₂ (from -5‰ (average mantle) to -60‰ (biogenic CH₄)), and 258 durations of CO₂ release (5 kyr to 50 kyr) assuming seawater [Ca] = 17 mM [*Horita et al.*, 2002] 259 (see supplement for consideration of alternative [Ca] values). We then compared the magnitudes 260 of the modeled negative and positive δ^{13} C excursions to the Val Adrara N1 and P1 δ^{13} C 261 excursions (6.5 below and 2.3% above the first sampled δ^{13} C of 1.9%) to determine the 262 optimum scenario. There are several parameter combinations that can recreate the N1 and P1 263 excursions; the optimum range is roughly 40,000 to 45,000 Pg C at -15‰ in less than 30 kyr 264 (Fig. 4). Importantly, these scenarios result in a negative $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion only slightly larger 265 than 0.1‰. In fact, no model scenario within our entire model parameter space produces a 266 $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion as large as is observed in our records (maximum modeled excursion is – 267 0.14‰) (Fig. 4). Note that we model organic carbon burial with a first order equation $(p_{cp}=1)$, 268 whereas Bachan and Payne [2015] vary p_{cp} between 1 and 3 for different CO₂ pulses. Increasing 269 p_{cp} to 3 would increase the magnitude of the P1 excursion, thereby requiring less CO₂ to yield 270 the same size excursion. Because of this reduction in CO_2 required with increase p_{cp} , as well as 271 the fact that we are modeling this event as a single CO₂ pulse, our optimum CO₂ magnitudes 272 should be viewed as upper limits. According to our simulations, if the observed excursion in 273 $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca is -0.72‰ (based on Val Adrara; it is -0.87‰ at Italcementi), then at most 20% of the 274 observed negative excursion in $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca is attributable to CO₂ release and acidification, leaving 275 the remaining 80% to be explained by local or diagenetic mechanisms. 276

277

278 **Table 2.** Model parameters and initial variables.

Variable	Value	Units	Reference
Т	15	°C	
s	1.035	kg/L	
Voc	2.32 × 10 ²¹	L	
Alk	1.89×10^{-3}	eq/kg	Used to generate correct $p CO_2$ and Ω
DIC	1.90×10^{-3}	mol/kg	Used to generate correct $p CO_2$ and Ω
initial [Ca]	17×10^{-3}	mol/kg	Based on Horita et al. 2002
initial [PO4]	25 × 10 ⁻⁶	mol/kg	
initial [SO4]	28×10^{-3}	mol/kg	
initial Ω	1.75	-	
K _{sp}	4.31×10^{-7}	mol²/kg²	Calculated with Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow (2001)
initial pCO ₂	1893	ppm	Based on Steinthorsdottir et al. 2011
initial k _{alk}	0.0243	_	Solved for based on Alk, [Ca], and [SO ₄ ³⁻]
initial $f_{w,arg}$	0.25	_	
initial $f_{b,org}$	0.25	_	
F _{volc}	16×10^{12}	mol C/yr	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial F _{w,carb}	24 × 10 ¹²	mol CCa/yr	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial F _{w,org}	8 × 10 ¹²	mol C/yr	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial F _{w,st}	12 × 10 ¹²	mol Ca/yr	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial F _{b,carb}	36 × 10 ¹²	mol CCa/yr	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial C:P, k _{cp}	106	-	
initial F _{b,org}	12×10^{12}	mol C/yr	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial F _{w,p}	11.3×10^{10}	mol P/yr	
initial F _{b,p}	11.3×10^{10}	mol P/yr	
G	3.3		Berner (2004)
Z	0.09		Berner (2004)
Z _{carb}	0.07		Berner (2004)
δ_{volc}	-5.5	‰ VPDB	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial $\Delta_{c,arg}$	30	%	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial $\delta_{b,carb}$	2	‰ VPDB	Based on data from this study
initial $\delta_{b,org}$	-28	‰ VPDB	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
$\delta_{w,carb}$	2	‰ VPDB	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
$\delta_{w,arg}$	-28	‰ VPDB	Kump and Arthur 1999, adjusted for steady state
initial Δ_{Ca}	-1.4	%•	Calculated using Ω using Eqs. from DePaolo 2011
initial $\delta_{b,Ca}$	-0.3	‰ BSE	Based on data from this study
δ_{riv}	-0.3	‰ BSE	Calculated from relative contributions of F wcarb and F ws#
$\delta_{w,carb}$	-0.4	‰ BSE	Based on Depaolo 2004, adjusted for steady state
$\delta_{w,sll}$	-0.1	‰ BSE	Based on Depaolo 2004, adjusted for steady state

280

Many processes can influence a $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca record, particularly variation in the magnitude of 281 calcium isotope fractionation ($\Delta^{44/40}$ Ca) during CaCO₃ precipitation due to precipitation rate 282 [Tang et al., 2008; DePaolo, 2011], stoichiometry [Nielsen et al., 2012], mineralogy [Gussone et 283 al., 2005; Blättler et al., 2012], and temperature [Gussone et al., 2005]. Diagenetic processes can 284 also alter the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca of carbonate sediments and rocks [Holmden et al., 2012; Fantle, 2015]. 285 The extent to which one or more of these processes can account for observed $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca variation 286 can be assessed through comparison with predictions under these scenarios. In addition, many 287 scenarios imply predictions for the behavior of other aspects of rock chemistry, such as trace 288 element concentrations. 289

290 Submarine groundwater discharge (SGD) can be ruled out as a cause of the T/J boundary 291 $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion at our study site. SGD during marine regression can cause seawater to mix 292 with ⁴⁴Ca-depleted pore-fluids during precipitation and thereby lower its $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca composition [*Holmden et al.*, 2012]. However, the local sea level history is not compatible with this explanation. The lowest $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca values in our dataset occur in the Malanotte Fm., which represents a transgression in the Lombardy Basin and much of western Europe [*Galli et al.*, 2007]. The subsequent return to higher $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca values coincides with a transition into the lower Albenza Fm. oolites and peloidal grainstones, which reflect local shallowing after the deposition of the Malanotte Fm. Thus, changes in local base level are in the direction opposite to that expected under an SGD scenario.

The magnitude of $\triangle^{44/40}$ Ca is affected by temperature, precipitation rate (*R*), and mineralogy. Temperature can be ruled out as the primary control because the observed $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion would require a temperature decrease of approximately 35 °C (assuming 0.02‰/°C [*Gussone et al.*, 2005]), which is unrealistically large and inconsistent with evidence for increased *p*CO₂ and climate warming [*Schaller et al.*, 2011; *Steinthorsdottir et al.*, 2011].

Precipitation rate is not likely the driver of our $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca record. In laboratory studies, precipitation rates strongly affect the magnitude of $\Delta^{44/40}$ Ca in inorganic calcite [*Lemarchand et al.*, 2004; *Tang et al.*, 2008]. Assuming a constant seawater stoichiometry (Ca²⁺:CO₃²⁻), the

average $\Delta^{44/40}$ Ca observed for CaCO₃ precipitated from modern seawater (ca. 1.4‰) is already

close to maximum observed kinetic value, and thus cannot increase in magnitude by more than ca. 0.2‰ [*DePaolo*, 2011; *Nielsen et al.*, 2012]. Decreasing Ca²⁺:CO₃²⁻ by orders of magnitude

could cause $\Delta^{44/40}$ Ca to increase [*Nielsen et al.*, 2012], however our model only predicts a

 $\frac{1}{12}$ decrease of ~40%. Furthermore, it is unclear exactly how this relationship applies to organisms

313 precipitating biogenic CaCO₃, as it would require them to vary their forward/backward/net

precipitation rates significantly in order to vary $\Delta^{44/40}$ Ca noticeably. It remains unclear whether

precipitation rate and/or seawater stoichiometry affected carbonate sediment $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca

significantly, but given the required assumptions, we view this scenario as unlikely.



318

Figure 4. Model predicted (color) and observed (black) values for (A) the N1 and P1 δ^{13} C excursions and (B) the N1 δ^{13} C and $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion, demonstrating that while the δ^{13} C data can be reconciled with modeled scenarios, the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca data cannot. For the model outputs, symbol size corresponds to the volume of injected CO₂, symbol type corresponds to injection duration, and symbol color corresponds to the δ^{13} C of the injected CO₂. Model excursion magnitudes are relative to the pre-event baseline. Observed δ^{13} C excursion magnitudes are relative to the first sampled δ^{13} C value at Val Adrara. The observed $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion magnitude is relative to the last data point (– 0.45‰) before the excursion. While there is a range of scenarios that can replicate the δ^{13} C data, there are no models that can simultaneously replicate the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca data.

A local increase in the proportion of aragonite (f_a) at our study locations could account for the direction and magnitude of the negative $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion because the $\Delta^{44/40}$ Ca for aragonite is as much as 0.9‰ greater than it is for calcite [*Gussone et al.*, 2005]. The higher [Sr]
 in the Malanotte samples are also consistent with this scenario, as aragonite incorporates more Sr
 than high- or low-Mg calcite does. However, this scenario alone does not account for the

contemporaneous changes in δ^{13} C. A global switch from calcite to aragonite seas is also a possible cause for the excursion in $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca [*Farkaš et al.*, 2007; *Blättler et al.*, 2012], but the

- temporary increase in [Sr] is inconsistent with a permanent shift to aragonite. This scenario is
- also at odds with existing sedimentological and paleontological evidence suggesting the Early
- Jurassic oceans switched from aragonite to calcite seas [*Hautmann*, 2006; *Stanley*, 2006].

The observed changes in [Sr] are roughly compatible with variable f_a , as calcite has lower 337 concentrations (<1000 ppm) than aragonite does (ca. 7000 ppm) [Veizer, 1983]. Predicting how 338 these changes in [Sr] manifested is challenging because f_a (and [Sr]) can vary due to linear 339 mixing of primary aragonite and calcite or due to preferential diagenetic recrystallization of 340 aragonite to calcite (see supplement for an extended consideration of $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca and [Sr] 341 covariation) [Husson et al., 2015]. An upper limit on changing [Sr] can be determined from a 342 linear mixing; using the concentrations above, increasing f_a by 64% would yield a [Sr] increase 343 of 4000 ppm. This value is greater than the observed maximum [Sr], though some may have 344 been additionally lost during diagenesis [Brand and Veizer, 1980]. In either case, all of the 345 CaCO₃ in our samples is assumed to be presently calcite, but aragonitic $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca and [Sr] values 346 could have been preserved if neomorphism occurred in low-porosity closed system conditions 347 during later diagenesis [Husson et al., 2015]. 348

The majority of the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion in our sections likely represents the recovery from 349 the acidification event (when Ω is greater than background), not the acidification event itself 350 (when Ω is less than background) which is likely stratigraphically condensed given the sharpness 351 of the N1 excursion. Other sections are also potentially stratigraphically condensed or even 352 missing this interval given the globally observed decrease in carbonate sedimentation 353 [Hautmann, 2004] and that several localities do not capture the N1 excursion (see Bachan et al. 354 [2012] and *Greene et al.* [2012]. Our model predicts that the nadir of $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca occurs when Ω is 355 at its maximum (Fig. 3). The maximum in Ω would be due to due to increased delivery of Ca²⁺ 356 via continental weathering as a result of higher pCO_2 . Thus it is possible that aragonite would 357 have been more easily preserved shortly above the main extinction level, when Ω was greatest. 358

Of the scenarios listed above, local variation in f_a in T/J boundary sediments is the most 359 compatible with our data. Variable f_a has been proposed, in part, as the cause of a large (ca. 1.2%), regional-scale negative $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion in the Ediacaran-age Wonoka Fm. of south 360 361 Australia [Husson et al., 2015]. The Wonoka samples exhibit an inverse correlation between 362 $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca and [Sr], similarly to the T/J boundary data. However, explaining the T/J boundary 363 $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion only by variation in f_a is incomplete. Local variation in mineralogy alone 364 cannot account for the associated mass extinction, the selective loss of heavily calcified marine 365 animals, the large, globally observed excursions in δ^{13} C, or the temporary increase in 366 atmospheric pCO_2 . The carbon and calcium cycles are connected through the weathering and 367 burial of CaCO₃ and the dependency of weathering on pCO₂. Therefore, if large fluctuations in 368 δ^{13} C during the extinction event were caused by rapid injection of large volumes of CO₂ from 369 CAMP volcanism and the subsequent effects on carbonate saturation and organic carbon 370 production [Hautmann et al., 2008; Greene et al., 2012; Honisch et al., 2012; Martindale et al., 371 2012], it is likely they also affected seawater $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca. Any mineralogical effects on $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca 372 would therefore be *in addition* to primary seawater changes triggered by T/J events. 373

Given that the effects of acidification and changing mineralogy on $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca may be additive, we use our model results to estimate the relative impact of mineralogy on the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion. Assuming -0.14‰ of the observed $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion was from acidification (20% of the full excursion), -0.58‰ would come from increasing f_a . Using an offset of 0.9‰ between calcite and aragonite $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca, this corresponds to a 64% increase in f_a during the negative $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion.

380 **5 Conclusions**

We observe a ca. -0.8% excursion in $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca preserved in the lowermost Jurassic 381 limestone sediments in the Lombardy Basin, northern Italy, immediately above the end-Triassic 382 extinction horizon. Numerical modeling of the coupled carbon and calcium cycles demonstrates 383 that the magnitude of the $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion is too large to have been caused solely by ocean 384 acidification resulting from emission of volcanic CO₂ during CAMP eruptions. Under a scenario 385 that best explains the δ^{13} C record and the associated evidence for increased pCO₂ and mass 386 extinction, roughly 80% of the T/J $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca excursion at our locality is explained by locally 387 higher proportions of aragonite while the remainder reflects the consequences of ocean 388 389 acidification. Our study demonstrates that a coupled model of the carbon and calcium cycles can be used to deconvolve the contributions of primary seawater isotopic changes and local effects 390 on sedimentary $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca. 391

392 Acknowledgments and Data

Information on statistics, additional model scenarios, and diagenetic modeling of Sr and $\delta^{44/40}$ Ca

- are available in the supplement. This study was supported by NASA grant (NNX09AN6767) to
- J.L.P., by funding from Geological Society of America, the American Association of Petroleum
- Geologists, the Paleontological Society, and Stanford University to A.B.J., and by the Director,
- 397 Office of Science, Office of Basic Energy Sciences, Division of Chemical Sciences,
- 398 Geosciences, and Biosciences, of the U.S. Department of Energy under Contract No. DE-AC02-
- 399 05CH11231 to D.J.D. The isotopes used in this research were supplied by the United States
- 400 Department of Energy Office of Science by the Isotope Program in the Office of Nuclear
- 401 Physics. We thank K.V. Lau, G. Li, K. Maher, T.L. Owens, and K.W. Weaver for their
- 402 assistance with laboratory work, and two anonymous reviewers for their constructive feedback
- 403 on this manuscript.

404 **References**

- Bachan, A., and J. L. Payne (2015), Modelling the impact of pulsed CAMP volcanism on pCO2 and δ13C across the
 Triassic–Jurassic transition, *Geol. Mag.*, *153*(June), 1–19, doi:10.1017/S0016756815000126.
- Bachan, A., B. van de Schootbrugge, J. Fiebig, C. A. McRoberts, G. Ciarapica, and J. L. Payne (2012), Carbon cycle
 dynamics following the end-Triassic mass extinction: Constraints from paired δ 13 C carb and δ 13 C org
 records, *Geochemistry, Geophys. Geosystems*, 13(9), n/a-n/a, doi:10.1029/2012GC004150.
- 409 records, Geochemistry, Geophys. Geosystems, 13(9), n/a-n/a, doi:10.1029/2012GC004150.
 410 Bachan, A., B. van de Schootbrugge, and J. L. Payne (2014), The end-Triassic negative δ13C excursion: A
- 410 Bachan, A., B. van de Schootorugge, and J. E. Payne (2014), The end-Trasse negative of Sc excursion. A
 411 lithologic test, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 412, 177–186, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2014.07.027.
- Bartolini, A., J. Guex, J. E. Spangenberg, B. Schoene, D. G. Taylor, U. Schaltegger, and V. Atudorei (2012),
 Disentangling the Hettangian carbon isotope record: Implications for the aftermath of the end-Triassic mass
 extinction, *Geochemistry, Geophys. Geosystems*, *13*(1–11), doi:10.1029/2011GC003807.
- Beerling, D. J., and R. A. Berner (2002), Biogeochemical constraints on the Triassic-Jurassic boundary carbon cycle
 event, *Global Biogeochem. Cycles*, 16(3), 10-1-10–13, doi:10.1029/2001GB001637.
- 417 Berner, R. A. (2004), The Phanerozoic Carbon Cycle: CO2 and O2, Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- 418 Blackburn, T. J., P. E. Olsen, S. A. Bowring, N. M. McLean, D. V Kent, J. Puffer, G. McHone, E. T. Rasbury, and

- M. Et-Touhami (2013), Zircon U-Pb geochronology links the end-Triassic extinction with the Central Atlantic
 Magmatic Province., *Science (80-.).*, *340*(6135), 941–5, doi:10.1126/science.1234204.
- Blättler, C. L., G. M. Henderson, and H. C. Jenkyns (2012), Explaining the Phanerozoic Ca isotope history of
 seawater, *Geology*, 40(9), 843–846, doi:10.1130/G33191.1.
- Brand, U., and J. Veizer (1980), Chemical diagenesis of a multicomponent carbonate system--1: Trace elements, J.
 Sediment. Res., 50(4), 1219–1236.
- Van Cappellen, P., and E. D. Ingall (1996), Redox stabilization of the atmosphere and oceans by phosphorus-limited
 marine productivity, *Science*, 271, 493–6.
- 427 DePaolo, D. J. (2004), Calcium isotopic variations produced by biological, kinetic, radiogenic and nucleosynthetic
 428 processes, *Rev. Mineral. Geochemistry*, 55, 255–288.
- DePaolo, D. J. (2011), Surface kinetic model for isotopic and trace element fractionation during precipitation of
 calcite from aqueous solutions, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 75(4), 1039–1056,
 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.11.020.
- Fantle, M. S. (2015), Calcium isotopic evidence for rapid recrystallization of bulk marine carbonates and
 implications for geochemical proxies, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, *148*, 378–401,
 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2014.10.005.
- Farkaš, J., F. Böhm, K. Wallmann, J. Blenkinsop, A. Eisenhauer, R. Vangeldern, A. Munnecke, S. Voigt, and J.
 Veizer (2007), Calcium isotope record of Phanerozoic oceans: Implications for chemical evolution of seawater and its causative mechanisms, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 71(21), 5117–5134, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2007.09.004.
- Galli, M. T., F. Jadoul, S. M. Bernasconi, and H. Weissert (2005), Anomalies in global carbon cycling and
 extinction at the Triassic/Jurassic boundary: evidence from a marine C-isotope record, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 216(3–4), 203–214, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2004.11.009.
- Galli, M. T., F. Jadoul, S. M. Bernasconi, S. Cirilli, and H. Weissert (2007), Stratigraphy and palaeoenvironmental
 analysis of the Triassic–Jurassic transition in the western Southern Alps (Northern Italy), *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 244(1–4), 52–70, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2006.06.023.
- Greene, S. E., R. C. Martindale, K. A. Ritterbush, D. J. Bottjer, F. A. Corsetti, and W. M. Berelson (2012),
 Recognising ocean acidification in deep time: An evaluation of the evidence for acidification across the
 Triassic-Jurassic boundary, *Earth-Science Rev.*, *113*(1–2), 72–93, doi:10.1016/j.earscirev.2012.03.009.
- Griffith, E. M., M. S. Fantle, A. Eisenhauer, A. Paytan, and T. D. Bullen (2015), Effects of ocean acidification on
 the marine calcium isotope record at the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, *419*,
 81–92, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2015.03.010.
- Gussone, N., F. Böhm, A. Eisenhauer, M. Dietzel, A. Heuser, B. Teichert, J. Reitner, G. Worheide, and W. Dullo
 (2005), Calcium isotope fractionation in calcite and aragonite, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 69(18), 4485–
 4494, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2005.06.003.
- Hautmann, M. (2004), Effect of end-Triassic CO2 maximum on carbonate sedimentation and marine mass
 extinction, *Facies*, 50(2), 257–261, doi:10.1007/s10347-004-0020-y.
- Hautmann, M. (2006), Shell mineralogical trends in epifaunal Mesozoic bivalves and their relationship to seawater
 chemistry and atmospheric carbon dioxide concentration, *Facies*, 52(3), 417–433, doi:10.1007/s10347-0050029-x.
- Hautmann, M., M. J. Benton, and A. Tomašových (2008), Catastrophic ocean acidification at the Triassic-Jurassic
 boundary, *Neues Jahrb. für Geol. und Paläontologie Abhandlungen*, 249(1), 119–127, doi:10.1127/00777749/2008/0249-0119.
- Hillebrandt, A. von et al. (2013), The Global Stratotype Sections and Point (GSSP) for the base of the Jurassic
 System at Kuhjoch (Karwendel Mountains, Northern Calcareous Alps, Tyrol, Austria), *Episodes*, 36(3), 162–
 198.
- Holmden, C., D. A. Papanastassiou, P. Blanchon, and S. Evans (2012), δ44/40Ca variability in shallow water
 carbonates and the impact of submarine groundwater discharge on Ca-cycling in marine environments,
 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta, 83, 179–194, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2011.12.031.
- Honisch, B. et al. (2012), The geological record of ocean acidification, *Science (80-.).*, *335*(6072), 1058–1063,
 doi:10.1126/science.1208277.
- Horita, J., H. Zimmermann, and H. D. Holland (2002), Chemical evolution of seawater during the Phanerozoic:
 Implications from the record of marine evaporites, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 66(21), 3373–3756.
- Husson, J. M., J. A. Higgins, A. C. Maloof, and B. Schoene (2015), Ca and Mg isotope constraints on the origin of
 Earth's deepest δ13C excursion, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, *160*, 243–266, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2015.03.012.
- 474 Kiessling, W., and C. Simpson (2011), On the potential for ocean acidification to be a general cause of ancient reef

- 475 crises, *Glob. Chang. Biol.*, *17*(1), 56–67, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2486.2010.02204.x.
- Komar, N., and R. E. Zeebe (2011), Oceanic calcium changes from enhanced weathering during the PaleoceneEocene thermal maximum: No effect on calcium-based proxies, *Paleoceanography*, 26(3), 1–13,
 doi:10.1029/2010PA001979.
- Komar, N., and R. E. Zeebe (2016), Calcium and calcium isotope changes during carbon cycle perturbations at the
 end-Permian, *Paleoceanography*, (May 2015), 2015PA002834, doi:10.1002/2015PA002834.
- Kump, L. R., and M. A. Arthur (1999), Interpreting carbon-isotope excursions: carbonates and organic matter,
 Chem. Geol., 161, 181–198.
- Lemarchand, D., G. J. Wasserburg, and D. A. Papanastassiou (2004), Rate-controlled calcium isotope fractionation
 in synthetic calcite, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 68(22), 4665–4678, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2004.05.029.
- Martindale, R. C., W. M. Berelson, F. A. Corsetti, D. J. Bottjer, and A. J. West (2012), Constraining carbonate
 chemistry at a potential ocean acidification event (the Triassic–Jurassic boundary) using the presence of corals
 and coral reefs in the fossil record, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, *350–352*, 114–123,
 doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2012.06.020.
- McRoberts, C. A., L. Krystyn, and M. Hautmann (2012), Macrofaunal Response To the End-Triassic Mass
 Extinction in the West-Tethyan Kossen Basin, Austria, *Palaios*, 27(9), 607–616, doi:10.2110/palo.2012.p12-043r.
- Nielsen, L. C., J. L. Druhan, W. Yang, S. T. Brown, and D. J. DePaolo (2011), Calcium isotope as tracers of
 biogeochemical processes, in *Handbook of Environmental Isotope Geochemistry*, edited by M. Baskaran, pp.
 105–124, Springer-Verlag, Berlin Heidelberg.
- Nielsen, L. C., D. J. Depaolo, and J. J. De Yoreo (2012), Self-consistent ion-by-ion growth model for kinetic
 isotopic fractionation during calcite precipitation, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 86, 166–181,
 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2012.02.009.
- Paris, G., Y. Donnadieu, V. Beaumont, F. Fluteau, and Y. Goddéris (2016), Geochemical consequences of intense
 pulse-like degassing during the onset of the Central Atlantic Magmatic Province, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 441, 74–82, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2015.04.011.
- Payne, J. L., A. V Turchyn, A. Paytan, D. J. DePaolo, D. J. Lehrmann, M. Yu, and J. Wei (2010a), Calcium isotope constraints on the end-Permian mass extinction, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*, 107(19), 8543–8548, doi:10.1073/pnas.0914065107.
- Payne, J. L., A. V. Turchyn, A. Paytan, D. J. DePaolo, D. J. Lehrmann, M. Yu, and J. Wei (2010b), Calcium isotope constraints on the end-Permian mass extinction, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*, 107(19), 8543–8548, doi:10.1073/pnas.0914065107.
- Raup, D. M., and J. J. Sepkoski (1982), Mass extinctions in the marine fossil record., *Science (80-.).*, 215(4539), 1501–3, doi:10.1126/science.215.4539.1501.
- Schaller, M. F., J. D. Wright, and D. V Kent (2011), Atmospheric PCO₂ perturbations associated with the Central
 Atlantic Magmatic Province., *Science (80-.).*, *331*(6023), 1404–9, doi:10.1126/science.1199011.
- Schaller, M. F., J. D. Wright, D. V. Kent, and P. E. Olsen (2012), Rapid emplacement of the Central Atlantic
 Magmatic Province as a net sink for CO2, *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.*, 323–324, 27–39,
 doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.12.028.
- van de Schootbrugge, B., J. L. Payne, A. Tomasovych, J. Pross, J. Fiebig, M. Benbrahim, K. B. Föllmi, and T. M.
 Quan (2008), Carbon cycle perturbation and stabilization in the wake of the Triassic-Jurassic boundary massextinction event, *Geochemistry, Geophys. Geosystems*, 9(4), n/a-n/a, doi:10.1029/2007GC001914.
- Stanley, S. M. (2006), Influence of seawater chemistry on biomineralization throughout phanerozoic time:
 Paleontological and experimental evidence, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 232(2–4), 214–236,
 doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2005.12.010.
- Steinthorsdottir, M., A. J. Jeram, and J. C. McElwain (2011), Extremely elevated CO2 concentrations at the Triassic/Jurassic boundary, *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*, 308(3–4), 418–432, doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2011.05.050.
- Tang, J., M. Dietzel, F. Böhm, S. J. Köhler, A. Eisenhauer, and M. Dietzel (2008), Sr2+/Ca2+ and 44Ca/40Ca
 fractionation during inorganic calcite formation: II. Ca isotopes, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 72(15), 3733– 3745, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2008.05.033.
- Veizer, J. A. N. (1983), Chemical diagenisis of carbonates: theory and application of trace element technique, *Stable Isot. Sediment. Geol.*, Ch. 3.
- Zeebe, R. E., and D. A. Wolf-Gladrow (2001), CO2 in seawater: equilibrium, kinetics, isotopes, *Elsevier Oceanogr. Ser.*, *65*(65), 346, doi:10.1016/S0924-7963(02)00179-3.
- 530