

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Language Planning and Policy in Native America: History, Theory, Praxis. By Teresa L. McCarty.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4951c8jz>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 38(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Thornes, Tim

Publication Date

2014-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

and Chinese gender practices led to Chinese women prostituting themselves and blamed Chinese women for their trafficking. Yet Chinese women's voices appear in court records, so Chinese women at least were able to comment on their unfree status. The record of California Indian women voices is thin; Lucy Young's oral history, taken years after her experience as a trafficked woman, is a rare view into California Indian unfreedom.

As elsewhere in the United States, Emancipation and Reconstruction produced uneven freedoms and civil rights. After the Civil War, California ended the apprenticeship system in California, but forced labor endured on reservations run by agents appointed by the Republican Party. Similarly, African Americans and Chinese unfree workers endured only limited freedoms in California. Ultimately, Smith concludes, the effort to eradicate unfree labor in California led to the creation of Chinese exclusion in the 1880s.

Smith writes a compelling political history of unfree labor in California in which the focus is primarily on debates between Republican and Democratic politicians and resulting legislation. In addition, *Freedom's Frontier* examines the machinations of county judges and magistrates to secure unfree Indian workers. Yet, readers lose sight of the unfree workers themselves. One wonders how Betty got from California to Arizona. What were her experiences? What did she think and feel about a life lived, in part, in bondage? Admittedly, this is a difficult topic on which to write because of the lack of sources, but nonetheless future scholarship on captive labor should look for ways to include more California Indian voices into the story. That being said, this book inserts California Indians into a national discussion regarding unfree labor during the mid-nineteenth century and makes the American West integral for understanding the Civil War and Reconstruction.

William J. Bauer Jr.

University of Nevada–Las Vegas

Language Planning and Policy in Native America: History, Theory, Praxis.
By Teresa L. McCarty. Bristol: Multilingual Matters, 2013. 269 pages.

Language Planning and Policy in Native America: History, Theory, Praxis is a timely and extensively researched book that provides a thorough overview of issues involved in the support and revitalization of the Native languages of North America. The author synthesizes an extensive literature on different aspects of language planning and policy (LPP) in North America, not only engaging with the history and sociopolitical context of the languages themselves and bringing together case studies of language revitalization in practice,

but also developing a theoretical framework for understanding language policy. One of the key lessons of this book lies in the importance of youth and young adults as the main movers when it comes to LPP—playing the roles of teachers, learners, and activists in their communities and among their peers. The author’s extensive background in indigenous education and experience with diverse Native American communities on language issues gives the work a great deal of authority. The book is outstanding in the way it blends the truly impressive research that supports it with the vast personal experience that enriches it.

Following a foreword by Richard E. Littlebear, the author’s preface spells out a perspective that adopts four key assumptions: (1) “linguistic and cultural diversity is an inherently enabling condition” for all concerned, a value that favors, and supports, linguistic diversity (xviii); (2) LPP must be community-driven, particularly where revitalization efforts are involved; (3) “schools and educators have a strategic role” in promoting the status and revitalization of Indigenous languages (xx); and (4) “language issues are . . . ‘people’ issues” and that LPP is really about “self-determination . . . social justice, and the restoration of personal and communal well-being” (xx). The preface’s exposure of the problems implicit in counting remaining speakers and, by implication, measuring language status, is a welcome addition. The author synthesizes the key problems inherent in such enumeration strategies, not the least of which lies in identifying how *speaker* is defined by a particular community.

The issue of ranking languages by level of endangerment is further taken up in chapter 1, together with a summary of cultural and linguistic diversity in the United States. Perhaps the most enlightening portions of this chapter appear under the heading “Contemporary Native American language use in public and communal spaces,” in which the author explores language vitality in four broad domains: (1) tribal government; (2) community religious life; (3) literature and other media; and (4) schools. Each of these domains is exemplified and brought into focus under the light of tribal sovereignty. The chapter is rich both in its discussion of tribal linguistic rights and current information on the status of Native North American languages.

Chapter 2 lays more of the conceptual groundwork needed to clarify the author’s perspective on LPP in Native America, and, by extension, elsewhere. In it, key terminological and situational differences between language revival, language revitalization, and reversing language shift are explored, alongside distinctions in individual and political orientations with respect to language. Key to the chapter is its amplification of “safety zone theory,” which attempts to accommodate and explain the ebb and flow of Native American LPP historically as a matter of resistance and accommodation on the part of official policy.

What underlies these policy oscillations, the author argues, are changing perceptions of threat and benefit with respect to cultural differences. The third chapter provides a concise description of the political ebb and flow of repression and support of language as a fundamental right of indigenous peoples. The author outlines a brief colonial history of Native American LPP from the early Spanish mission period to 2010, when the White House drafted and issued an executive order for an initiative on Native American language revitalization.

Further contextualizing Native American LPP, chapter 4 offers an historical summary and case study of Navajo, arguably the most vital indigenous language in the United States and one with a long and multifaceted history of status, corpus, and acquisition planning. The overview is fascinating and enlightening in itself while also serving to underscore one of the main points the author makes throughout the book: namely, that LPP is better understood from the perspective of the communities, families, and individuals who enact it. Particularly powerful here is the assessment of the demonstration school at Rough Rock, which symbolizes the “20th-century fight for Native-American self-determination” (78). Its groundbreaking bilingual-bicultural program clearly illustrates the benefits for both student achievement and community empowerment.

The author refers to chapter 5 as the “heart of the book” (xxv). This chapter deepens the discussion with the details of work done by language activists in their communities in five distinct contexts. The first two described, the Myaamia and the Wôpanaâak language projects, have involved efforts at language regeneration—that is, work accomplished after the passing of the last known native speakers—and, in the Wôpanaâak case, long after. These discussions are followed by a description of the widely known California Master-Apprentice Language Learning Program, developed specifically for contexts where native speakers are few, and usually elderly, as a means of increasing language abilities in the younger generation. Regeneration efforts are also taking place in California, bolstered by the Breath of Life program, which is also modelled elsewhere in the country. The last three sections highlight immersion programs, with discussions of Mohawk, Hawai‘ian, and Navajo language revitalization.

These detailed and informative contextualizations of Native American LPP in practice provide the reader with a solid grounding in what is necessary for success in language revitalization. Although the programs highlighted differ greatly in terms of the nature and extent of resources available to their development (number of native speakers, written materials, and institutional supports), at the core of each are deeply committed individuals from within the community who have been instrumental in demonstrating what is possible to their families and communities and in helping to bring about an ideological shift among them.

Chapter 6, “Language in the Lives of Indigenous Youth,” is coauthored with Mary Eunice Romero-Little, Larisa Warhol, and Ofelia Zepeda and is perhaps the most groundbreaking chapter. It explores the results of a longitudinal multi-site study involving heritage language usage patterns and the perceived impact of language endangerment on youth. Here, the perspectives of the younger generation give voice to the common core of success emerging from the programs chapter 5 describes. Those voices appear ideologically prepared to have language play an increasing role in daily life, and—once these voices commit to action—bring hope to the entire language revitalization effort.

The final chapter of the book once more draws on safety zone theory to look at how shifting national ideologies outside indigenous communities can create a backlash that impacts Native American LPP in ways that undermine indigenous rights. The author clarifies how English-only movements and anti-immigration laws that vilify cultural and linguistic “difference” impose directly upon the safety zone to the detriment of linguistic and educational sovereignty. However, the book’s tone remains hopeful even here, as again we are reminded that, despite current and historical threats to tribal sovereignty, there continues to be a growing undercurrent of understanding and awareness of the positive benefits of indigenous language and culture programs for students, communities, and society as a whole.

Within the context of the general literature on LPP this book is a welcome addition, as it applies LPP principles and theory to a particular group of languages and communities. That, in my view, is an important part of what makes the work accessible, since Native American languages have by and large been impacted by the same history of official policy and neglect. Further, despite the bleak picture often painted of Native American language survival, the book is infused with a hopefulness that, rather than seeming artificially optimistic, is supported by the facts and buttressed by firsthand testimony. This book reminds the reader again and again of the indomitability of cultural identity and the tenacity with which grassroots activism serves to sustain language as a vital element in structuring that identity.

Although the book is written in a dense style that occasionally, perhaps, is more academic than some potential readers might prefer, this book provides a tremendous service. It is both an exhaustive resource on LPP in Native America and a source of inspiration to those involved in language revitalization programs at all levels. It is not a “how-to” manual, but rather provides a clear rationale for continuing this important work with clarity and purpose.

Tim Thornes
Boise State University