

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

Public Indians, Private Cherokees: Tourism and Tradition on Tribal Ground. By Christina Taylor Beard-Moose.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4cw8b1w8>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 34(1)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Bsumek, Erika

Publication Date

2010

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Harney, we are ruining the world and ignoring that reciprocal relationship. We must change, for without the healing powers of nature we won't survive. We need to understand where our medicine comes from before we lose it altogether, then sing our songs of appreciation and pass on that traditional knowledge to another generation.

In essence, this was Harney's intent for the book—to explain and pass along an awareness of what spiritual power is, how it manifests itself, and how it should be treated. Throughout *The Nature Way*, Harney reiterates that nature chooses individuals (human or otherwise) to doctor their own kind and each other, but that each has to be able to hear that calling and discover their songs and the power to heal, and that each has to be asked and then thanked for their help. Healing isn't just about personal health but about social and environmental health as well. In the end, Harney's message is about healing nature, particularly from the catastrophic impacts of nuclear weapons testing and nuclear power generation and waste disposal. Harney's observations on these issues comprise the final section of this book, just as they served as foci for his efforts as healer and spiritual leader in later life.

It is easy to see *The Nature Way* as a spiritual and cultural guidebook, transmitted autobiographically in the tradition of older narratives by and about elders and spiritual leaders such as Nicholas Black Elk, Maria Chona, Thomas Yellowtail, Pretty-shield, or John Lame Deer. Harney's narrative is shorter and more limited than these, but it shares the same "as told to" feeling and organization, albeit with a modern activist sensibility and self-consciousness, or sometimes a lack thereof. It's less about him specifically than about his desire to raise awareness of pressing issues. What makes this narrative particularly worthwhile are its Western Shoshone and Great Basin focus, ethnological contributions, and very personal metaphysical formulation of a larger universe of Native belief and behavior that (in a pan-Indian sense) transcends place, group, or time. It joins a growing number of Native meditations on the health of the environment as an indicator of our collective spiritual state and the tyranny of an industrial colonial culture. Its answers are as spare and enduring as Harney's beloved Great Basin landscape, and as simple as his quiet but persistent message—we're all in this together; we are bound in nature's way; we need to listen and work together as one.

David Rich Lewis

Utah State University

Public Indians, Private Cherokees: Tourism and Tradition on Tribal Ground.

By Christina Taylor Beard-Moose. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 2009. 296 pages. \$50.75 cloth; \$29.95 paper.

The aptly titled *Public Indian, Private Cherokees* by Christina Taylor Beard-Moose introduces readers to one of the key dilemmas regarding indigenous engagement with the tourist industry: when Indian identity becomes a commodity, which aspects of their lives do indigenous people choose to make public, and

which ones do they keep private? Drawing on fieldwork among the Eastern Band of the Cherokee Nation from 1996 to 1998 and 2006, Beard-Moose details the ways that the tourist industry has created unique opportunities and specific problems for Cherokees. One of the key dilemmas that frame her scholarship is how to differentiate “real” Cherokee identity from “performed” identity. She leaves little doubt that Eastern Cherokee performers, various audiences who consume Cherokee-made goods and shows, and scholars—who are consumers of a different sort—struggle as they confront what it means to embrace the devil’s bargain that is tourism.

Beard-Moose approaches the topic of tourism with a good deal of caution. Beginning with neither the premise that tourism automatically destroys a culture, nor that it automatically enhances a community, Beard-Moose asserts that “tourism . . . has both its ups and its downs for the Eastern Cherokee” (2). After laying out a basic history of Cherokee-white relations in the eighteenth century, Beard-Moose then traces the roots of tourism to Cherokee country in the late nineteenth century. She identifies the role of the Bureau of Indian Affairs in developing tourism-related industries as well as the role that state and local governments played in the early 1930s as the boundaries of the Great Smoky Mountains National Park were established. Subsequently, thousands of tin-can tourists flooded the Cherokee Nation looking for Cherokee-made products and exotic experiences. It didn’t take long before local tour guides sought to profit, bringing “small groups to private [Cherokee] homes” (26). Although it’s unclear if the tour guides in question were members of the Eastern Band or not, Beard-Moose’s interviews with those whose homes and lives were the objects of curiosity are valuable, even if their response to tourism reflects an all-too-familiar refrain among indigenous peoples worldwide. The Welche sisters, for example, noted that it was generally “OK” to have tourists buying Cherokee pottery from the family store, but they also complained that tourists always wanted “to pay as little as possible” for their wares (26). Others more fully embraced tourists and their dollars. Chiefing, described as the practice of dressing up like a generic Indian chief, posing for pictures with tourists, and providing them with information, was (and remains) an activity that provided income for Cherokee men and their families. “Chiefs” consider themselves to be street performers who are well aware that Cherokees never dressed in such costumes (85).

Beyond describing practices such as guiding and chiefing, Beard-Moose details the various venues where Cherokee history is played out for the benefit of visitors. She notes that the *Unto These Hills* performance, very loosely based on a factual account of Cherokee Removal, became a favorite tourist attraction beginning in the 1950s and continues to draw audiences. But she also tells us that although many residents supported the play into the 1990s, many members of the Eastern Band initially found it distasteful. When it was first read to local Cherokees, presumably by the white authors who wrote it, for instance, Cherokees objected to its historical inaccuracies and misuse of ceremonies. Beyond noting local criticism to the play, which was recently rewritten by members of the Eastern Band of the Cherokee Nation, Beard-Moose charts the role that tour guides play—and have played—in selling and keeping

private different aspects of Cherokee identity. She describes the different ways that crafts have evolved as gender-based enterprises and notes that historic Cherokee villages have been physically reproduced for hands-on exploration. Beard-Moose contends that what many Cherokee once found objectionable, like the historical inaccuracies associated with the *Unto These Hills* drama, numerous Cherokee tacitly came to accept by the 1990s, asserting that at least some Eastern Band members had become numb to the misrepresentation of their history and instead believed “whatever the tour guide scripts say as tradition and fact” (41). This discovery is not only revealing, but also it presents a missed opportunity for analysis. Why did so many accept as fact what previous generations identified as fiction? More importantly, what is it about tourism that engenders such desensitizing? Finally, although it is clear that something led to the entire reconfiguration of the drama between 1996 and 2006, Beard-Moose never fully explains what led to this shift of local control.

In the chapter “Academic Perspectives on Tourism and the Case of Cherokee, North Carolina,” Beard-Moose gives us a sense of the many scholars who have studied Cherokees and the contradictions they have identified regarding authenticity and identity. Consciously shunning an either overly positive or negative assessment of tourism, Beard-Moose tries to “explore the interstitial space between the two poles” (55). To do that, she recounts her first trip to the nation as a field-worker turned tourist, splicing academic assessments of tourism into descriptions of her personal experiences at restaurants, coffee shops, museums, and theaters. Although this tracking back and forth between her own experiences and her assessment of scholarship is somewhat distracting, she manages to convey the persistent problem of racism as part of the mass tourist experience. Certainly her decision to include the insensitive questions tourists ask Cherokee residents helps her make her point. She includes a list of the incredibly insensitive, if not dehumanizing, questions that tourists have asked. Many of these are similar to the following: “When do Cherokee boys begin to grow their feathers?” (60). She then moves on to describe some longer and more specific interactions between Indians and whites and concludes with an especially problematic episode in which a blonde-haired four-year-old girl threw a tantrum because she believed all Indian women looked like Pocahontas. Shana Bushyhead, a performer and guide working in the historic village, is then put in the awkward position of either appeasing the girl by pretending to be Pocahontas or asking the family to leave the tour. After “playing” Pocahontas, Beard-Moose notes how distressed Bushyhead became. She then concludes that the “story reveals the tip of the iceberg of misunderstanding and miseducation of non-Indian America concerning the myriad lifeways of American Indian peoples” (68). Although a true-enough statement, Beard-Moose misses an opportunity to reflect upon the fact that Bushyhead had actually willingly, if uncomfortably, participated in the perpetuation of a myth based on the very miseducation she criticizes, and it’s one that is seemingly perpetuated by practices such as chiefing. A discussion of how mythmaking and moneymaking are mutually reinforcing categories that bind indigenous peoples as much as the profits from tourism liberate them would have been greatly appreciated.

In the final three chapters, “Eastern Cherokee Ingenuity,” “Disneyfication on the Boundary,” and “Mass Tourism’s Effects,” Beard-Moose recounts the ways that Cherokees have adapted to and attempted to control the effects of tourism. Throughout these chapters, Beard-Moose makes additional points about the miseducation of white tourists and its effects on the Cherokee with whom they come into contact. As these chapters unfold one has to wonder why, when spending so much time discussing the ways in which tourists act, Beard-Moose never actually seeks to explain what motivates tourists to visit the Eastern Band of the Cherokee Nation. Who are these miseducated folk? Where do they come from? Where do their ideas regarding Indians come from? Although it is easy to extrapolate and answer that last question, at least some discussion of shifting tourist motivations, especially now that a casino draws in unprecedented number of tourists, is warranted.

As an anthropologist, Beard-Moose encourages her readers to think about the public conception of Indianness, imploring us to pay close attention to what non-Indian Americans *think* they know about Indians. She largely succeeds in this endeavor even if she fails to explore the origins of such impressions fully. Like other indigenous people working in tourist industries, members of the Eastern Band of the Cherokee Nation struggle to maintain a profitable public persona while also preserving their culture, private lives, and dignity at the same time.

Erika Bsumek

University of Texas

Searching for My Destiny. By George Blue Spruce Jr., as told to Deanne Durrett. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. 336 pages. \$45.00 cloth.

Considering one’s path in life can certainly be viewed as a destiny unfolding. For Dr. George Blue Spruce Jr., his life’s path became a mixture of the old and the new, barriers and enlightenment, hardship and satisfaction. Raised in Santa Fe, New Mexico, Blue Spruce was sent to a regional Indian boarding school (Santa Fe Indian School) where he obtained his initial education. Meeting other Indian children at the school did not deter him from his dreams of a career—rather, it became his starting point for pursuing an education and for reaching his goals. Rather than resentment, Blue Spruce flourished as he joined sports, academic, and socialization events associated with the school. Seeking a larger venue, Blue Spruce found himself on a path to becoming a dentist, an educator, an administrator, and a leader. These various steps in his career ladder were a mixed blessing, as he received much satisfaction and praise for his accomplishments; however, the Indian in him was never far from his heart.

Searching for My Destiny is a history book, a cultural awareness book, and is certainly inspiring. As Blue Spruce told the story of his life to writer Deanne Durrett, the storytelling evolved into a picture that few could replicate. The authors attempted, most successfully, to paint a picture of early Indian life