

UCLA

American Indian Culture and Research Journal

Title

The Seminole. By Merwyn S. Garbarino.

Permalink

<https://escholarship.org/uc/item/4ds45041>

Journal

American Indian Culture and Research Journal , 12(4)

ISSN

0161-6463

Author

Kersey, Harry A., Jr.

Publication Date

1988-09-01

DOI

10.17953

Copyright Information

This work is made available under the terms of a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, available at <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

Frank Lindeman's *Plenty Coups* (Crow) and John Neihardt's classic *Black Elk Speaks* (Sioux), being among the best. Although Lindeman and Neihardt's book are biographies and Welch's work is a novelized biography, *Fools Crow* excels the other works in historicity and artistry. Welch is a compelling storyteller and an honest, methodical scholar.

Based on all the reading I have done on Blackfeet life (James Willard Schulze, George Bird Grinnell, Walter McClintock, John Ewers, and others), Welch is the master of Blackfeet history and life.

Fools Crow is an excellent choice for anthropology courses on Plains Indian ethnology, culture contact and history; it would be equally important in literature courses on the Western frontier. Readers will enjoy English renderings of Blackfeet terms for animals, human beings, Blackfeet guardian and protector spirits and the United States cavalry. Furthermore, the descriptions and meanings of dreams, the accounts of frequent, suspenseful battles among tribes and the final and crushing Blackfeet accommodations to white military, demographic and technical domination are transporting and tragic.

We are all fortunate that some one of James Welch's immense talent has produced one of the most important works on Plains Indian life.

Lynn A. Robbins

Western Washington University, Bellingham

The Seminole. By Merwyn S. Garbarino. New York: Chelsea House Publishers. 112 pages. \$16.95 Cloth.

At the outset let me express my biases. I have long been an appreciative user of professor Garbarino's previous works dealing with the Florida Seminole people. Although she has published relatively little on the Seminoles, her 1972 monograph *Big Cypress: A Changing Seminole Community* was a tightly structured ethnography based on field work conducted on the Big Cypress reservation. It remains one of the best studies of tribal decision making and leadership among the contemporary Florida Indians. Therefore I was eager to review her latest work. Perhaps because I expected too much, I was a bit disappointed.

The Seminole is a well written, nicely illustrated little work which provides a general overview of the tribe. Unfortunately, the constricted format of the Chelsea House series "Indians of North America" has allowed Garbarino slightly more than 100 pages in which to treat the entire sweep of Seminole history. This precludes any extended analysis of complex issues; thus the work necessarily tends to superficiality—and this is unfair to an experienced scholar. The lack of footnoting and a very attenuated bibliography definitely removes it from consideration as a work for use by ethnohistorians. One can only conclude that the book is intended for a very general audience.

Even working on this assumption there are still problem areas which should be addressed. I have no particular quarrel with the way in which Garbarino has presented Seminole history in straightforward chronological sequence—Origin of the Tribe (1715-1830), War and Retreat (1830-1900), Making a New Life (20th century), etc.—but there are some points within the chapters which, if not technically incorrect, are nevertheless somewhat misleading. For example, although the United States Army received orders to take punitive action against the Seminoles in 1817 (page 41)—the author's use of the term "declared war" implies congressional action—Andrew Jackson's campaign and virtually all of the fighting in Florida occurred during 1818, and that is the generally accepted date for the First Seminole War. Moreover, there is no mention of the significant role played by the Seminole Negroes in that encounter, which was a precursor of things to come. In another place it was stated that the great Seminole war leader Osceola "taught the Indians how to use ambush and withdrawal to surprise the enemy and how to hide in wilderness that was difficult for the army to penetrate" (page 47). I would submit that the Seminoles, many of whom were experienced fighters from the Creek Wars of 1813-14, did not have to be taught these traits. In fact, as the author points out (page 51), Osceola was not even present at perhaps the most famous Seminole ambush which destroyed Major Francis L. Dade's command in 1835; only three of over 120 officers and men survived. Also, the Second Seminole War was officially declared at an end on August 14, 1842 by Col. William J. Worth, the Army commander in the field, not by Maj. Ethan Allen Hitchcock as implied in the text (page 53). It was Worth, not Hitchcock, who was breveted to General for his role in ending the conflict.

In dealing with the post-war and removal Seminole culture which developed in the period between the Civil War and 1900, Garbarino provides an excellent summarization of Indian adaptation for survival in the subtropical lower Florida peninsula. The large villages gave way to widely scattered family camps; Indian homes were open-sided, thatched-roof *chikees* perfectly adapted to the climate; small scale subsistence agriculture was supplemented by trapping and hunting pelts, plumes and hides for sale to white storekeepers; the Indians utilized the dugout canoe for travel in the Everglades, while lightweight clothing replaced the buckskins formerly worn in north Florida—although the Seminole “plain shirts” of this period were not “kilts” as stated in the text (page 57).

Ultimately, the independent Seminole life-style ended with the arrival of railroads and settlers in South Florida at the turn of the century. They no longer had unrestricted access to the wetlands in and near the Everglades; moreover, the market for their pelts and hides collapsed with the onset of World War I. Although federal authorities had begun to acquire parcels of land for reservations in the 1890s—an Executive Order of 1911 (page 62) did not initiate this process; it only increased the holdings—most Seminoles refused to live on government land. Even in the Great Depression of the 1930s only a few moved there seeking employment and health care. A number of Seminoles also lived at commercial tourist villages in cities which catered to tourists. Garbarino is correct in pointing out that activities such as alligator wrestling were not traditional Seminole pastimes and developed because of the money that tourists were willing to pay to view such spectacles. However, to say that the extension of a federal highway across the Everglades in 1928 “followed the old Indian route, Tamiami Trail” (page 77) is misleading. True, the roadway in places followed Indian trails through the region, but the name Tamiami was simply an abbreviation for Tampa-to-Miami.

In a final chapter, “The Seminole Today,” the author touches on a broad range of issues affecting contemporary Indian communities in Florida and provides a sensitive portrayal of cultural conflicts experienced by individuals. Yet, one could have wished for more than a brief paragraph on the most significant development among the Seminole people in recent years: the operation of unregulated high stakes bingo games and the sale of tax-free cigarettes on the reservations. These have far-reaching economic,

social, and political implications for the future of the Seminole Tribe.

Merwyn Garbarino is an anthropologist who has shown that she can produce first-rate work if given the appropriate vehicle. I still look forward to the Seminole ethnology that she is capable of writing.

Harry A. Kersey, Jr.
Florida Atlantic University

The Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West. By Patricia Nelson Limerick. New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1987. \$17.95 Cloth.

The Legacy of Conquest: The Unbroken Past of the American West offers new insight into the history of the American West. Arguing against Turner's "end of the frontier" analogy for understanding Western history, Limerick describes a continuing and enduring history of exploitation of resources and peoples, a Western "land grab" which saw Anglo occupation and economic dominance of resources despite other claims to the land, and the evolution of the West as a land of cultural diversity in which people remain "strangers," unable to bridge stereotypes to establish legitimate and lasting relationships as equal and legitimate "heirs" to the West.

Limerick's work is of special interest to those concerned with Native American culture and community in the West. The overall theme provides a more appropriate context than the "closing frontier" model for understanding past and contemporary Native American issues. Moreover, her specific treatment of Native Americans in Chapter 6, "The Persistence of Natives" (pages 179-221) and Section II of Chapter 10, "The Burdens of Western American History" (pages 330-338), offer keen insight into the critical issues of Native American identity, political autonomy (in tribal government) and sovereignty, and in the persistent denial and opposition of legitimate Native American claims by whites. This is not a typical chronology of the exploitation of Native Americans, but rather a well conceived identification of key issues which have shaped the history of white and Indian relations in the West.